

**ISL**

文学跨学科研究

Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature

Vol. 8, No. 4, December 2024

ISSN 2520-4920(Print)

ISSN 2616-4566(Online)

# Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature

文学跨学科研究

Volume 8, Number 4  
December 2024



Published by  
Knowledge Hub Publishing Company Limited  
Hong Kong

# **Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature**

文学跨学科研究

Volume 8, Number 4  
December 2024

## **Editor**

Nie Zhenzhao, Guangdong University of Foreign Studies

## **Associate Editors**

Yang Gexin, Zhejiang University

Liu Maosheng, Guangdong University of Foreign Studies

## **Directors of Editorial Office**

Yang Gexin, Zhejiang University

Ren Jie, Zhejiang University

## **Published by**

Knowledge Hub Publishing Company Limited

Hong Kong



**About:** *Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature* (“ISL”) is a peer-reviewed journal sponsored by Guangdong University of Foreign Studies and Zhejiang University and published by Knowledge Hub Publishing Company (Hong Kong) in collaboration with the International Conference for Ethical Literary Criticism. With a strategic focus on literary, ethical, historical and interdisciplinary approaches, ISL encourages dialogues between literature and other disciplines of humanities, aiming to establish an international platform for scholars to exchange their innovative views that stimulate critical interdisciplinary discussions. ISL publishes four issues each year in both Chinese and English.

International Conference for Ethical Literary Criticism (ICELC, since 2012) is an annual international conference for academics and research-oriented scholars in the area of literature and related disciplines. ICELC is the flagship conference of the International Association for Ethical Literary Criticism which is an international literary and cultural organization aiming to link all those working in ethical literary criticism in theory and practice and to encourage the discussions of ethical function and value in literary works and criticism.

*Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature* is registered with ISSN 2520-4920(print) and 2616-4566(online), and is indexed by Arts and Humanities Citation Index. It is also included in EBSCO, MLA International Bibliography and Annual Bibliography of English Language and Literature.

**Submissions and subscription:** As the official journal of International Association for Ethical Literary Criticism (IAELC), *Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature* publishes articles only from members of IAELC, and their submissions presented in the annual convention and forums will be accepted for publication in priority. Those authors who are not members of IAELC are encouraged to apply for membership of the association before their submissions. All submissions must include a cover letter that includes the author’s full mailing address, email address, telephone numbers, and professional or academic affiliation. The cover letter should indicate that the manuscript contains original content, has not previously been published, and is not under review by another publication. Submissions or subscription should be addressed to: [isl2017@163.com](mailto:isl2017@163.com).

**Contact information:** Editorial office, *Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature*, 6 East Building, Zijingang Campus, Zhejiang University, 866 Yuhangtang Rd, Hangzhou 310058, P.R. China. Tel:+86-571-8898-2010

Copyright ©2017 by *Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature*. All rights reserved. No copy shall be made without the permission of the publisher.

# Advisory Board

**Massimo Bacigalupo** / Università di Genova, ITA

**Michael Bell** / University of Warwick, UK

**Charles Bernstein** / University of Pennsylvania, USA

**Vladimir Biti** / University of Vienna, AT

**Marshall Brown** / University of Washington, USA

**Wu Di** / Zhejiang University, CHN

**Stefan Collini** / University of Cambridge, UK

**Khairy Douma** / Cairo University, EGY

**Luo Liangong** / Central China Normal University, CHN

**Byeongho Jung** / Korea University, KOR

**Anne-Marie Mai** / University of Southern Denmark, DEN

**John Rathmell** / University of Cambridge, UK

**Claude Rawson** / Yale University, USA

**Wang Yong** / Zhejiang University, CHN

**Joshua Scodel** / University of Chicago, USA

**Shang Biwu** / Shanghai Jiaotong University, CHN

**Igor Shaytanov** / Problems of Literature, RUS

**Inseop Shin** / Konkuk University, KOR

**Su Hui** / Central China Normal University, CHN

**Galin Tihanov** / Queen Mary University of London, UK

**Wang Songlin** / Ningbo University, CHN

**Zhang Xin** / Guangdong University of Foreign Studies, CHN

# Contents

## Thematic Studies on Du Di's Academic Contribution

- 591-604 The Social Function of Literary Researches: An Interview with Wu Di  
*Zhou Min*
- 605-614 "The Second Birth" Crafting Insights from Others: A Comprehensive Review of Wu Di's Academic Thoughts  
*Fu Shouxiang*
- 615-627 New Realm, New Vision, New Opinion: Wu Di's Expansion and Innovation on the Frontiers of Foreign Literature Studies  
*Zhou Qichao*
- 628-642 Classical Regeneration and Cultural Inheritance: Wu Di's Intermedia Communication Research  
*Long Diyong*  
*Han Wenwen*
- 643-651 The Fusion of Boundaries: A Review of the Legal Literary Criticism Advocated by Wu Di  
*Chang Liching*
- 652-663 Building a Solid Bridge between Chinese and Western Cultures: Commentary on Wu Di's Comparative Studies in Poetry  
*Zhang Ruwen*
- 664-671 Historical Facts of Literature and Academic Personality: Wu Di's Contribution to the Study of Russian Literary History  
*Zhang Jie*  
*Yao Tingting*
- 672-691 Is the Divine Model of Literary Creation Obsolete? Ironies, Paradoxes, and Insights  
*Gu Mingdong*

- 692-701 An Interpretation of John Donne's "The Flea" from the Perspective of Marriage and Love Ethics  
*Li Zhengshuan*  
*Xu Tongxin*
- 702-713 The Review of "Koreans in Japan" Novels Through the Lens of Ethical Literary Criticism: Lee Yangji's *Nabi T'aryŏng and Other Stories*  
*Inseop Shin*
- 714-732 A Study of Heterogeneous Similarities in Poetics between Pre-Qin China and Ancient Greece from the Perspective of Ethical Literary Criticism  
*Zhang Baike*  
*Tian Junwu*
- 733-741 The Ethical Dilemma in *The Uniting of Human and Divine*  
*Qin Xuan*  
*Wang Yongqiang*
- 742-752 The Cognitive Framework of Zeugma from a Dynamic Perspective  
*Hong Zhengyi*
- 753-764 A Comparative Study of Poems by AI Poet and Human Poet: In the Case of *Poetry Has No Future Unless It Comes to Its End: Poetry of Artificial Intelligence*  
*Feng Yi*
- 765-773 Sandro Jung's New Breakthrough in the Transmedial Study of Literary Illustrations  
*Fang Kairui*
- 774-781 Towards the Construction of Critical Poetics for Afro-American Female Poetry: A Study on *Poetic Life and World Reflection of Black Venus: A Study of Rita Dove*  
*Li Baojie*
- 782-788 A New Research Paradigm of the Twentieth-Century British Drama: A Review of *British Drama of the Twentieth Century*  
*Fan Yiting*

# 目 录

## 吴笛学术思想研究专栏

- 591-604 文学研究的社会功能：吴笛访谈录  
周 敏
- 605-614 “第二次诞生”铸造他山之石：吴笛学术思想综论  
傅守祥
- 615-627 新境界、新视界、新见解：吴笛对外国文学研究疆域的拓展与创新  
周启超
- 628-642 经典再生与文化遗产：吴笛的跨媒介传播研究  
龙迪勇  
韩文文
- 643-651 跨界的融合：评吴笛倡导的文学法律批评  
张丽卿
- 652-663 构筑中西文化交流的坚实桥梁：吴笛的中西诗歌比较研究  
章汝雯
- 664-671 文学史实与创作个性：吴笛对俄罗斯文学史研究的贡献  
张 杰  
姚婷婷
- 672-691 神性文学创作模式过时了吗？相关争论的反讽、悖论与洞见  
顾明栋
- 692-701 约翰·邓恩《跳蚤》的婚恋伦理观解析  
李正栓  
徐童歆
- 702-713 文学伦理学批评视角下的“在日朝鲜人”小说评论：以李良枝《纳比·塔里昂及其他故事》为例  
申寅燮

- 714-732 文学伦理学批评视域下的先秦和古希腊诗学比较研究  
张柏柯  
田俊武
- 733-741 《冥合天人》中的伦理困境书写  
秦璇  
王咏蔷
- 742-752 动态视角下轭式搭配的认知框架  
洪峥怡
- 753-764 人工智能诗歌和人类诗歌比较研究：以《诗歌只有走到尽头才有未来：人工智能诗歌》为例  
冯溢
- 765-773 桑德罗·荣格的文学插图跨媒介研究的新突破  
方开瑞
- 774-781 非裔女性诗歌批评诗学建构：论《黑色维纳斯的诗艺人生与世界观照：丽塔·达夫研究》  
李保杰
- 782-788 创新英剧研究范式，书写百年剧场华章——评《英国 20 世纪戏剧研究》  
范一亭

# The Social Function of Literary Researches: An Interview with Wu Di

**Zhou Min**

**Abstract:** Wu Di is a renowned Chinese scholar of foreign literature and an esteemed literary translator. He has not only written extensively, but also actively leads academic organizations, serving as president of the Chinese Association for Comparative Studies of Languages and Cultures, vice president of the English Literature Committee of the Chinese Association for Foreign Literature Studies, and honorary president of Zhejiang Provincial Association for Comparative Literature and Foreign Literature. His body of work includes 16 academic monographs, such as *Studies in English Metaphysical Poetry* and *History of Russian Fiction*, over 30 literary translations, including *Tess of the d'Urbervilles* and *The Complete Lyric Poems of Percy Bysshe Shelley*, as well as more than 80 edited volumes, such as *Studies in the Formation and Dissemination of Foreign Literature Classics* (8 volumes) and *The Complete Works of Alexander Pushkin* (10 volumes). His outstanding contributions to literary research have earned him numerous accolades from both the Zhejiang Provincial Administration and the Chinese Ministry of Education. This article presents an interview between Zhou Min and Wu Di, focusing on the social function of literary research. The discussion revolves around three key aspects: 1) the social function of literary research within the broader historical mission of literary scholars; 2) its role in interdisciplinary studies; and 3) its embodiment in the practice of literary translation. Professor Wu Di asserts that, despite the challenges posed by artificial intelligence to the humanities, literary research retains an irreplaceable social function, one that profoundly influences human experience by engaging with the depth of emotions and thought. He emphasizes that literary research not only focuses on textual analysis but also embraces interdisciplinary approaches, including ethical literary criticism, legal literary criticism, as well as the intersections between literature and economics, ecological criticism, and intermedia studies. Moreover, Wu Di underscores the critical role of literary translation within the broader scope of literary studies. Translation, he argues, serves as a vital conduit for cultural exchange and the communication of ideas and emotions, and it plays a key role in the creation and evolution of world literature. While acknowledging that AI technology may serve

as a helpful tool in translation, Wu Di firmly maintains that human translators, with their creativity and nuanced understanding of emotional complexity, are irreplaceable.

**Keywords:** Wu Di; literary researches; interdisciplinary approaches to literary researches; literary translation; artificial intelligence

**Author:** **Zhou Min** is Professor of the School of International Studies, Hangzhou Normal University (Hangzhou 311121 China), mainly engaged in contemporary English and American literature, cultural theory, and Caribbean literature research (Email: mindyzhou@126.com).

**标题:** 文学研究的社会功能：吴笛访谈录

**内容摘要:** 吴笛是中国著名的外国文学研究专家和文学翻译家。他不仅著述甚丰，而且积极主导学术组织，担任（中国）中外语言文化比较学会会长、中国外国文学学会英国文学分会副会长，以及浙江省比较文学与外国文学学会名誉会长等多种学术职务。著有《英国玄学派诗歌研究》《俄国小说发展史》等 16 部学术专著，《苔丝》《雪莱抒情诗全集》等 30 多部文学译著，以及《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》《外国诗歌鉴赏辞典》《普希金全集》等 80 多部编著。他的研究成果多次获得浙江省和教育部的优秀科研成果奖。本文是周敏对吴笛的访谈，主要探讨文学研究的社会功能。访谈从三个方面展开：1、文学研究的社会功能在于文学学者的社会使命；2、文学研究的社会功能体现于文学跨学科研究；3、文学研究的社会功能体现于文学翻译的实质。吴笛教授认为，尽管人工智能对人文学科构成挑战，文学研究仍具有不可替代的社会功能，它通过情感和思想深度影响人类。文学研究不仅关注作品本身，还与跨学科研究相结合，如文学伦理学批评和文学法律批评，以及文学与经济、生态、媒介的互融共通。吴笛强调，文学翻译也是文学研究的重要组成部分，它促进了文化交流和思想感情的沟通，是世界文学产生和发展的关键。他指出，尽管 AI 技术在翻译中起到辅助作用，但人工翻译因其创造性和对情感的深刻理解，无法被机器取代。

**关键词:** 文学研究；文学跨学科研究；文学翻译；人工智能

**作者简介:** 周敏，杭州师范大学外国语学院教授，主要从事当代英美文学、文化理论和加勒比文学研究。本文为国家社科基金重大项目“加勒比文学史研究（多卷本）”【项目批号：21&ZD274】的阶段性生活成果。

## I. The Social Function of Literary Researches Reflected in the Historical Mission of Literary Scholars

**Zhou Min** (hereinafter referred to as Zhou): In the current context, characterized

by the decline of the humanities and the growing impact of artificial intelligence, there is considerable debate and disagreement regarding the social function of foreign literature. Through several interviews conducted by other scholars, we have gained valuable insights into your distinguished academic career, your extensive research on foreign literature, and your significant contributions to literary translation. In this interview, I would like to ask you, Mr. Wu, as an esteemed literary critic and translator with a long-standing career, what are your perspectives on the future of literary researches?

**Wu Di** (hereinafter referred to as Wu): The current challenges facing foreign language and literary studies are, in many ways, unsurprising. It is often said that while literature originates in reality, it also transcends it, with emphasis here on the idea that literature is elevated above everyday experience. This transcendence suggests that literature maintains a certain distance from the practicalities of real life. Although literary texts convey information, it is not of a purely practical information. Literature distinguishes itself through its portrayal of events; however, these portrayals are not simple narrations but rather crafted expressions shaped by intellect and imagination. This is especially true in forms like poetry, where an element of pseudo-representation is often present. As a foundational discipline, the study of foreign literature may not directly influence societal or economic progress. Nonetheless, regardless of our social context or the rapid advancements in artificial intelligence, literature's subtle impact on human thought and emotion remains irreplaceable. Therefore, the future of foreign literature research is promising, and the mission of literary scholars continues to hold profound significance.

**Zhou:** You're absolutely correct! While literature may not provide practical information or directly influence economic or social development, it remains indispensable. Though it transcends reality, literature nonetheless has the capacity to critique life. Literary creation and research respond to the rhythms of their time, engaging with contemporary issues and often offering insights into the future. In his novel *Machines Like Me*, British author Ian McEwan writes about the age of artificial intelligence, using fiction to imaginatively explore the potential consequences and ethical dilemmas that arise when robots integrate into human daily life—even into intimate relationships.

**Wu:** I have read your review of the novel *Machines Like Me* by McEwan in *Foreign Literature Studies*, where you assert that the central theme of this novel is to explore the cultural and ethical issues arising from the coexistence of humans and

machines.<sup>1</sup> Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein*, which you mentioned in your article, also reflects the cultural and ethical dilemmas of her time. In *Frankenstein*, Mary Shelley conveys, in a gothic manner, the anxieties of her era regarding creation being beyond the control of its creator. These anxieties are the concern about the ethics of science and technology. While literary scholars may not possess the ability to create scientific innovations or robots like Adam in the novel *Machines Like Me*, they can use their literary imagination to explore how the main character, Charlie, and other members of humanity might create what you refer to as a "human-machine community" with Adam. This approach could help mitigate human-machine conflicts and serves as a reflection on the ethics of science and technology in the age of AI.

**Zhou:** Excellent writers should also be thinkers, and critics even more so. The principle of "cultivating moral integrity," which is often emphasized in teaching practice, is actually always reflected in literary creation and literary research.

**Wu:** Indeed. Literary scholars serve as critical thinkers, using their insights to positively influence others and contribute to societal well-being. Literature's mission, fundamentally, is to establish moral values and to educate. One of the vital functions of literature is its capacity for ethical instruction. Professor Nie Zhenzhao's advocacy for "ethical literary criticism" has garnered international scholarly attention because it addresses one of literature's core attributes. While aesthetic pleasure remains significant, the social function of literature is equally indispensable. A novel like *Machines Like Me* transcends the concept of a mere "小说" (literally "small talk" in Chinese) and instead embodies profound reflections on humanity's fate in the era of science and technology.

**Zhou:** Reflecting on your insight, I now see that the "novels" I study are far from the "small talk" implied in the Chinese term; rather, they hold significant educational value. Yet, if literature serves an ethical teaching function, one might ask: what distinguishes literary works from educational texts?

**Wu:** The distinction between literary works and educational texts largely lies in the realm of imaginative thinking. The educational function of literature arises from its rich imagination, expressed through metaphorical language and vibrant literary techniques. As the renowned literary scholar Vladimir Nabokov remarked, "There are three points of view from which a writer can be considered: he may

---

<sup>1</sup> See Zhou Min, "The Imagination of a Human-Machine Community in *Machines Like Me*," *Foreign Literature Studies* 3 (2020): 75.

be considered as a storyteller, as a teacher, and as an enchanter. A major writer combines these three—storyteller, teacher, enchanter—but it is the enchanter in him that predominates and makes him a major writer” (Nabokov 5). For Nabokov, the writer’s role as an “enchanter” is rooted in his mastery of language and technique.

**Zhou:** The “enchanter’s” artistry arises from the writer’s unique wisdom, a fusion of creativity and imagination. What artificial intelligence lacks is the distinct creativity and vision required by an individual writer to craft a singular work. As Einstein once noted, Logic will take you from A to B, but imagination will take you anywhere. While AI excels in logic and rule-based processes, literature depends far more profoundly on imagination and emotional depth.

**Wu:** Literary creation is inextricably tied to emotion; works devoid of emotional resonance and depth of thought seldom connect with readers. Likewise, literary research cannot exist apart from feeling, as literature frequently serves as a bridge between human souls. Literary creation allows authors to share or explore their innermost reflections with others. Foreign literary scholars and translators in China act as cultural emissaries, playing an essential role in facilitating cultural exchange between China and the world. Without such emissaries, the vision of a global cultural community would be challenging to achieve. In the field of Caribbean literature, for example, you serve as an irreplaceable cultural mediator—a role that no AI technology could replicate. This function of bridging cultures is at the heart of literary studies and embodies their critical social purpose.

**Zhou:** Thank you, Mr. Wu, for acknowledging my research in Caribbean literature. Indeed, we have successfully bridged literary studies and regional studies by leveraging literature as a medium to foster positive relations with the Caribbean. Through initiatives such as inviting Caribbean dignitaries—including the Prime Minister of Antigua and Barbuda—to deliver lectures and engage in exchanges at our Center for Caribbean Studies, and by practicing civil diplomacy through academic scholarship, we have made meaningful strides. In September of this year, we welcomed seven ambassadors from Latin America and the Caribbean to inaugurate the Center, marking a significant leap from literary studies to area studies. In recent years, “country and region studies,” now one of the five core disciplines within the foreign language and literature field in China, has seen substantial growth. Your research on foreign literature, encompassing the literature and culture of various countries—including Great Britain, the United States, and Russia—has achieved remarkable results. What are your views on integrating

“country and region studies” within foreign language and literature studies? Do you see potential synergy between “foreign literature studies” and “country and region studies” and what factors should we consider to better fulfill the social role of literary studies?

**Wu:** Although “country and regional studies” may seem to belong to different academic fields, they have long been integral to “foreign literature studies.” Today, when we discuss “country and regional studies,” we often emphasize its ties to international politics, economics, and world history. However, these studies are fundamentally intertwined with global literary studies. Literary research uniquely reveals the spiritual essence of a region—a depth of understanding that political, economic, and historical studies often cannot attain, as the cultural and artistic works of a country or area frequently encapsulate its core spirit. By paying closer attention to the social conditions reflected in literary research, we can better understand literature’s social role. The current emphasis on “country and region studies” highlights the essential social function that literary studies fulfill.

## **II. The Social Function of Literary Researches Reflected in the Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature**

**Zhou:** I have observed that over the past two years, you have made significant contributions to the field with publications such as *History of Old Rus’ and Early Modern Russian Poetry*, *Researches on Frontier Issues in Foreign Literature*, and *Essays on Foreign Literary Classics*, among others. Additionally, this year you have published numerous articles, including “Film and Television ‘Translations’ of Literary Classics,” “A Study of Legal Ethics in Scott’s *The Heart of Midlothian*,” “A Study of Unfair Trials and the Legal Ideal in Scott’s Novels,” “A Study of the Scientific Spirit and Enlightenment Influence in Russian Neoclassical Poetry,” “The Trends and Translingual Qualities in Russian-American Literature,” and “The Possibility of Economical Literary Criticism.” These works encompass not only literary analysis but also interdisciplinary approaches to literature. In your view, does interdisciplinary study enhance the social role of literary research?

**Wu:** The social function of literary research is to broaden the boundaries of literature, with Professor Nie Zhenzhao’s theory and practice of ethical literary criticism serving as a notable example. I, too, aim to explore the interdisciplinary field of literature, particularly drawn to the concept of “Sphinx factors” in ethical literary criticism. As Nie explains, “The Enigma Sphinx is often used as a metaphor for complex, mysterious, and difficult-to-understand issues, but it contains a

deeper meaning: the quest for the definition of human existence” (Nie 275). In the area of legal literary criticism, my recent articles on the British author Walter Scott emphasize literature’s social role. Many works, such as Dickens’ *A Tale of Two Cities* and Lewis Carroll’s *Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland*, also serve as excellent models for legal education. Legal literary criticism not only provides insight into legal principles but also enhances our understanding of the literary work itself. For instance, in Scott’s writings, we can explore themes of injustice, critique the irrational legal systems and trial procedures of his time, and examine the psychological struggles of suspects caught in ethical dilemmas. Through his portrayals of wrongful imprisonment and critiques of flawed judicial practices, Scott’s work embodies literature’s ethical teaching function and its pursuit of justice in the face of unfair trials.

**Zhou:** In addition to ethical and legal literary criticism, in “Film and Television ‘Translations’ of Literary Classics,” you explore the adaptation of literary works for film and television through the lens of translation studies. You argue that these adaptations not only enable the inheritance and renewal of the source text but also provide essential plot structures and creative inspiration for the film and television industry. This process embodies the social function of literary research, as literary classics offer invaluable cultural capital to the film and television sectors.

**Wu:** Indeed, literary classics not only serve as valuable cultural assets and sources for the film and television industry, but they also act as effective mediums for sharing content across different forms of media. Their inherent appeal allows adaptations to engage audiences on a deeper level, often reigniting interest in the original works. In this way, adaptations help popularize literary classics and the cultural heritage they embody, enhancing the transmission and appreciation of these works.

**Zhou:** Exactly. In your article, “The Possibility of Economical Literary Criticism,” you emphasize the relationship between literature and economics. Do you believe literature can meaningfully contribute to a country’s economic development?

**Wu:** While literature may not have a direct influence on a nation’s economic development, its subtle ideological impact is undeniably significant. In modern society, the connection between literature and economics has become increasingly evident. Literary scholars are not only “engineers of the human soul” but also creators of intellectual goods. For literary works to function as commodities and cultural capital, they must enter into circulation, much like any other product.

Similarly, literary translation carries not only intellectual and cultural attributes but also economic value, facilitating cross-cultural exchange. In the global marketplace, national literatures are positioned as commodities, leading to a discourse on world literature shaped by economic foundations. Literature acts as a “superstructure” intrinsically linked to the “economic foundation” that supports it. Even “ecocriticism” inherently contains an aspect of “economic criticism,” reflecting both interdisciplinary cultural critique and the essential principles of ecological civilization. In our material world, literature relies on economic support, with its evolution closely tied to economic growth and social progress. Goethe’s advocacy of “world literature” in the early 19<sup>th</sup> century, for example, was deeply rooted in historical and cultural legacies as well as economic exchanges among nation-states. Therefore, “literature possesses the ability to guide economic development, the imagination of literature can inspire economic progress, and literary representations of economic activity can offer insights for real-world economic practices” (Wu, “The Possibility of Economical Literary Criticism” 5).

**Zhou:** In your article, “A Study of the Ecological Ethical Thoughts in Ted Hughes’s Poems,” you note that poets employ poetry to “provide the necessary moral warnings for humanity to live in harmony with nature and to pursue sustainable development” (Wu, “A Study of the Ecological Ethical Thoughts in Ted Hughes’s Poems” 14). How effective do you believe such moral imperatives from literature can be in our modern, “accelerated” society?

**Wu:** In modern society, where efficiency prevails—embodied in phenomena like “fast food” and “clocking-in”—traditional literature is evolving alongside shifting social patterns. For instance, short story writer Alice Munro received the Nobel Prize in Literature, and Lydia Davis, known for her concise prose, won the Booker International Prize, highlighting the emergence of an “accelerated” literary form. In this fast-paced world, shorter forms like short poems and flash fiction may indeed see a resurgence. Furthermore, literature is no longer solely the domain of a select group of elite writers; its creation now involves more individuals than ever before. While literary reading has traditionally been class-based and thus never fully universal, it is arguably now as widely accessible as it has ever been. With the rise of social media, any literate person can readily access prose or poetry on their cell phone. This unprecedented accessibility means that, for the first time, literature can deliver its moral imperatives in new and far-reaching ways. Ecological literature and other socially conscious texts are now widely shared across social media, amplifying their impact on public awareness in ways that cannot be overlooked.

**Zhou:** You previously discussed the state of literature in the social media era, which brings to mind a lecture you gave about 20 years ago at the “Zhejiang Humanities Lecture Hall” titled “World Literature in Intermedia Perspective: From the Movie *Tess of the d’Urbervilles*.” Among your Ph.D. students, many are now emerging scholars engaged in “intermedia literary criticism.” In this age of information overload and social media, the social impact of literature confronts an increasingly complex cultural landscape. Is this complexity one of the factors you considered in advocating for “intermedia literary criticism”?

**Wu:** Media is indeed an essential element in literary studies. The scope of “intermedia literary criticism” is extensive, encompassing not only the relationship between text and image but also examining the impact of visual media on literary creation, among other areas. Western scholars have made significant contributions to the study of visual culture within their literary traditions, and intermedia criticism has also gained notable attention and recognition in China. Additionally, “intermedia literary criticism” intersects closely with fields such as communication studies and art history, fostering opportunities for interdisciplinary synergy and mutual reinforcement.

**Zhou:** The role of literature in enriching other disciplines is evident, and the social function of interdisciplinary literary studies further underscores the value of literary research.

**Wu:** The social function of literary studies is best realized through interdisciplinary approaches, which broaden the scope of literary research and allow scholars to engage in the evolution of social thought. An interdisciplinary perspective enables literary scholars to add depth and breadth to their analyses. For instance, when we read Francesco Petrarca’s “Sonnet 302,” “I Raised Myself in Thought to Where I Found Her,” an understanding of the historical and cultural dimensions behind its emotions enriches our interpretation. On the surface, it may appear as a beautiful lyrical poem about the separation of lovers. However, by immersing ourselves in the poem’s dreamlike world and the lyrical hero’s desire for spiritual union with Laura’s soul—expressed in divine images such as “innocent and happy in this third sphere” (Petrarch 271)—we uncover deeper layers of meaning. This longing for eternity reflects the tradition of Dante’s *Divine Comedy* and themes from *La Vita Nuova*, traditions that Petrarca reinterprets in *Il Canzoniere*. Similarly, in Goethe’s “The Wanderer’s Night-Song” and “The Hunter’s Even-Song,” the expression of “peace” at the end of both poems may seem unremarkable when considered in isolation.

Yet, when we take into account Goethe's role in the *Sturm und Drang* movement, his bureaucratic responsibilities in the Duchy of Saxe-Weimar, and his religious sensibilities, we move beyond individual introspection to grasp the universal emotional power conveyed in these poems. These historical and cultural contexts are vital to understanding poetry. As the Russian critic Victor Zhirmunsky observed, "Every poet requires a degree of historical interpretation. If we compare Pushkin with Fyodor Tyutchev, Nikolay Nekrasov, and Alexander Blok, each poem reveals a unique world of experience, each poet embodying a distinctive poetic personality and style" (20).

### III. The Social Function of Literary Researches Embodied in the Substance of Literary Translation

**Zhou:** In addition to publishing over fifteen books on literary research, you are also an accomplished translator and have been honored with the title of "Senior Translator" by the China Translators Association. Do you believe that literary translation fulfills the social function of literary research?

**Wu:** Literary translation stands as a unique form of literary scholarship and fully embodies the social function of literature. In my monograph *Researches on the Art of Translation of Zhejiang Writers*, I assert that

literary translation is a crucial means of cultural exchange and serves as a conduit for communicating thoughts and emotions across nations. The rise and development of literary translation not only reflect the blending of foreign and national literatures but are also closely linked to societal development and the progress of specific eras. Indeed, it is through literary translation and translated literature that world literature emerges. Therefore, the history of world literature can also be viewed as the history of translated literature and international cultural exchange. (*Researches on the Art of Translation of Zhejiang Writers* 1)

To eliminate cultural barriers and promote mutual understanding among nations, exchanges between different cultures are essential, and literary translation remains an indispensable mode of such exchange. It not only facilitates intercultural communication but also serves as a vehicle for transmitting world culture. The translation is a crucial process for breathing new life into source texts, allowing masterpieces from literary history to gain renewed relevance. From ancient Egyptian

and Babylonian works to the classics of Greece and Rome, translation has played a key role in the endurance of these texts. Without the act of translation, many source texts would fade alongside their original languages. It is the translation that sustains intercultural communication and gives it substance and permanence.

**Zhou:** Literary translation plays a vital role in cultural exchange between nations. It is through the Chinese translation of foreign literary works that the window to world literature and international cultural exchange has opened, enabling China to learn about, connect with, and engage with the world. This connection has been instrumental in fostering China's comprehensive development and integration on the global stage.

**Wu:** Indeed, a review of the history of literary translation in China reveals a clear synchronization between the country's socio-economic development and the progress of literary translation. When literary translation thrives, China's development appears to accelerate; conversely, when translation efforts face setbacks or stagnation, national progress seems similarly impeded.

**Zhou:** There are also many misconceptions surrounding translation. In defining poetry, Robert Frost famously remarked that "poetry is what gets lost in translation."

**Wu:** When Robert Frost remarked that "poetry is what gets lost in translation," he was likely alluding to the notion that the musicality of poetry cannot be easily translated. However, for the translator of poetry, preserving the musicality of the source text is an essential academic pursuit. The role of a poetry translator goes beyond merely conveying cultural elements; it also involves maintaining key attributes of the original text, including its musical qualities, in the translated language. In this sense, we might amend Frost's famous saying to read: "Poetry should be something that is preserved in translation." Musicality, too, can be artfully rendered in the target language, as demonstrated by Professor Fei Bai's translations of Paul Verlaine's *Romances sans paroles* (*Songs Without Words*) and other works. Beyond musicality, the primary purpose of literary translation is cultural transmission. When Edward Fitzgerald translated the *Rubaiyat of Omar Khayyam* in the nineteenth century, he captured the elegance of the original text in a newly vitalized English version, sparking a revival of Persian poetry among English-speaking audiences. This illustrates that great works exist in a state of perpetual transformation and translation, underscoring the importance of the translator's role. A translator is not merely a "matchmaker," but a life-giving creator, and the process

of translation is one of ongoing creative renewal. The Latin proverb “traduttore, traditore” (meaning “the translator is a traitor”) implies that translation betrays the original text. Yet we might say instead that the translator is a transmitter. Translation is a dynamic process that breathes new life into literature, and translated works represent the rebirth of the original. Thus, rather than being a “traitor,” the translator is a “transmitter” of literary vitality.

**Zhou:** I note that in your monographs *Studies in the Formation and Dissemination of Foreign Literature Classics*, which received the National Award for Outstanding Achievements in Scientific Research, and *Researches on the Art of Translation of Zhejiang Writers*, you focus significantly on issues in literary and translation studies from an ethnic perspective. Do translated literary works with this “new life” also contribute to the formation of what Benedict Anderson terms an “imagined community,” continuously shaping a renewed national culture and national spirit?

**Wu:** Translated works hold a distinctive role in shaping national culture and spirit. As you know, translated literature has profoundly influenced the emergence and growth of modern Chinese literature, significantly advancing the development of national aesthetics, psychological style, and collective spirit. From the selection of source texts to the publication of translated works, translators—despite lacking a direct connection to the original authors—contribute to forming an “imagined community,” a process in which AI can never replace human insight or creativity.

**Zhou:** From a technological perspective, has the role of translation been diminished in the AI era, and could human translation ultimately be replaced by machine translation?

**Wu:** The digital revolution is driving remarkable advancements across science and technology, transforming our lives in previously unimaginable ways and poised to further reshape society further in the coming decades. Artificial intelligence will intensify the economic and social changes set in motion by the first wave of digitization. However, the core function of translation remains steadfast. Neural networks, composed of interconnected neurons, process and analyze data far more rapidly than individual human nervous systems. While AI technology developed by natural scientists provides significant support to literary translation, it is unlikely to replace human translators in this field. As AI continues to advance, translation tools have improved, offering innovative ways to enhance the translation process. For instance, I recently translated passages from the 2024 book *Generative Artificial*

*Intelligence: What Everyone Needs to Know*. AI accurately rendered the word “Introduction” as “导言” in Chinese, yet it failed to correctly interpret the new term “Outroduction” (Kaplan 188), which means “Conclusion” or “Epilogue,” translating it instead as “生产.” This misinterpretation occurred because the term is novel and absent from existing databases, highlighting the limitations of AI in handling unique or nuanced expressions. While AI excels in information processing and syntax, it lacks the capacity for the nuanced emotional experiences central to literary translation. The process of literary translation is inherently creative, and although AI possesses strong processing and generalization abilities, it lacks originality and ultimately can only imitate rather than create. Moreover, AI operates primarily within data and logic, falling short in perceiving and interpreting emotions, beauty, and other sensory experiences as the human mind does. Consequently, AI may serve as a valuable tool in literary translation, but it cannot replace the depth and artistry of human translators.

**Zhou:** I could not agree more with you Mr. Wu. There is no need for us to fear AI replacing human translation, as translation transcends the mere conversion of words. Similarly, we need not fear AI’s encroachment on literary creation and criticism. While AI may indeed produce literary texts and contribute to critical discourse, it remains fundamentally incapable of creating true masterpieces. Every masterpiece is an aesthetic articulation born of the unique, often serendipitous interaction between the author’s inner life and the world, and it is precisely this element of unpredictability that establishes an insurmountable divide between AI and human creativity. AI-generated literary criticism may tend towards superficiality, yet high-caliber criticism emerges from the complex engagement and negotiation between the critic’s personal experience and the textual world. It is through this dynamic interaction with society and culture that the social value of literary criticism is most fully realized. It has been a pleasure to conduct this dialogue with you. Thank you very much for your insights and time.

### Works Cited

- Kaplan, Jerry. *Generative Artificial Intelligence: What Everyone Needs to Know*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2024.
- Nabokov, Vladimir. *Lectures on Literature*. Boston: Mariner Books, 2002.
- 聂珍钊: 《文学伦理学批评导论》。北京: 北京大学出版社, 2014年。
- [Nie Zhenzhao. *Introduction to Ethical Literary Criticism*. Beijing: Peking UP, 2014.]
- Petrarch, Francesco. *Sonnets and Shorter Poems*, translated by David R. Slavitt. Cambridge: Harvard

UP, 2012.

吴笛：“论休斯诗中的生态伦理思想”，《外国文学》3（2023）：14-23。

[Wu Di. “A Study of the Ecological Ethical Thoughts in Ted Hughes’s Poems.” *Foreign Literature* 3 (2023): 14-23.]

——：“文学经济学批评的可能性”，《中国社会科学报》2024年8月26日：A05。

[—.“The Possibility of Economical Literary Criticism.” *Chinese Social Sciences Today* 26 August 2024: A05.]

——：《浙籍作家翻译艺术研究》。杭州：浙江大学出版社，2009年。

[—.*Researches on the Art of Translation of Zhejiang Writers*. Hangzhou: Zhejiang UP, 2009.]

Жирмунский, В. М. *Введение в литературоведение: Курс лекций*. СПб.: Издательство Санкт-Петербургского государственного университета, 1996.

[Zhirmunsky, V. M. *Introduction to Literary Studies: A Course of Lectures*. St. Petersburg: St. Petersburg UP, 1996.]

周敏：“人机共同体想象：以《像我一样的机器》为例”，《外国文学研究》3（2020）：73-86。

[Zhou Min. “The Imagination of a Human-Machine Community in *Machines Like Me*.” *Foreign Literature Studies* 3 (2020): 73-86.]

# “第二次诞生”铸造他山之石：吴笛学术思想综论

## “The Second Birth” Crafting Insights from Others: A Comprehensive Review of Wu Di’s Academic Thoughts

傅守祥（Fu Shouxiang）

**内容摘要：**作为通晓中西文学的人文学者，吴笛既是才思敏捷的译界才子，又是沉潜灵通的学界达人；他通过卓越的译介会通让外国文学经典在中国大地得以重生，通过敏锐的“学”“问”兴致让外国文学经典在中国大地得以扎根。吴笛懵懂间超越大时代的“荒谬”，拜大师聚胆识跃然而成一家，通晓英俄双语、据守诗歌小说，旋为译界俊杰。更可贵的是，他能读书识理且与时俱进、经世致用且勇立潮头，他熟谙最近40多年中国翻译文学的出版市场，更是“拿得出手”“走得进去”的跨文化沟通的亲善大使。吴笛不但能将外来先进及时介绍给国人助力中国式现代化，同时以自己的学术形象向国际社会展现中国的进步和中国学人的思考，是有效践行文明互鉴的模范。

**关键词：**人文学术；文明互鉴；吴笛；外国文学经典；跨文化交流

**作者简介：**傅守祥，新疆大学“天山学者”讲座教授、博士生导师，新疆“天池英才”特聘教授，湖州师范学院跨文化研究中心主任、二级教授，浙江省“钱江学者”特聘教授，研究方向为文化哲学与区域国别研究。本文为国家社科基金重大招标项目“世界文学基本文献的整理、翻译与研究”【项目批号：24&ZD242】阶段性成果之一。

**Title:** “The Second Birth” Crafting Insights from Others: A Comprehensive Review of Wu Di’s Academic Thoughts

**Abstract:** As a humanities scholar who is well versed in both Chinese and Western literature, Wu Di is both a genius in translation and an expert in academia; he has reborn the classics of foreign literature on Chinese soil through his excellent translation and communication, and rooted the classics of foreign literature on the Chinese soil through his keen interest in “learning” and “questioning.” Wu Di transcended the “absurdity” of the big time in his unconscious, inspired by his mentors and driven by courage and insight, to become a unique scholar proficient in both English and Russian, specializing in poetry and novels, and quickly rising as an outstanding figure in the translation world. What is even more valuable is his ability

to read, understand, and keep abreast of the times, applying knowledge to practical use and bravely standing at the forefront of trends. He has been familiar with the publication market of Chinese translated literature for the last 40 years and is one of the earliest scholars in mainland China to proficiently use computers and the Internet. He is also goodwill ambassadors skilled in cross-cultural communication who is both “capable” and “approachable.” Wu Di not only promptly introduces advanced foreign ideas to Chinese people to facilitate China’s modernization but also presents China’s progress and the thoughts of Chinese scholars to the international community through his academic image, serving as a model for effectively practicing mutual learning among civilizations.

**Keywords:** humanities scholarship; mutual appreciation of civilizations; Wu Di; foreign literary classics; cross-cultural communication

**Author:** **Fu Shouxiang** is Guest Professor and Doctoral Supervisor of the “Tianshan Scholar” Program at Xinjiang University (Urumqi 830046, China), and Specially Appointed Professor of the “Tianchi Talent” Program in Xinjiang, Director of the Cross-Cultural Research Center and Second-Tier Professor at Huzhou University (Huzhou 313000, China), Specially Appointed Professor of the “Qianjiang Scholar” Program in Zhejiang Province. His research interests are cultural philosophy and regional country studies (Email: fux323@126.com).

作为通晓中西文学的人文学者，吴笛既是才思敏捷的译界才子，又是沉潜灵通的学界达人；他通过卓越的译介会通让外国文学经典在中国大地得以重生，通过敏锐的“学”“问”兴致让外国文学经典在中国大地得以扎根。吴笛懵懂间超越了特殊的“荒谬”时代，拜大师聚胆识跃然而成一家，他通晓英俄双语、据守诗歌小说，旋为译界俊杰。更可贵的是，他能读书识理且与时俱进、经世致用且勇立潮头，他熟谙最近40多年中国翻译文学的出版市场，是中国大陆最早一批熟练使用电脑软件，运用互联网资源的学者，也是最早一批全身体验中国经济成长的人文学者，更是最早一批“拿得出手”“走得进去”的跨文化沟通的亲善大使，以时代先进践行中西文明互鉴。可以说，吴笛是当今中国学界少见的、全能的“六边形战士”，更是能吸引、培养学科发展人才的卓越领袖。吴笛的人文学术工作，不但能将外来先进及时介绍给国人助力中国式现代化，同时以自己的学术形象向国际社会展现中国的进步和中国学人的思考，有形有效地践行新时代的中外人文交流和文明互鉴。

### 一、掌握源语一手材料与译界名家铸双语名译

吴笛的人文学术最鲜明的特点就是从掌握源语文学的第一手材料出发，将外国文学作品翻译与研究紧密结合并拓展开掘。熟悉吴笛的人都知道，他不

但能够同时翻译英、俄两种语言的外国文学作品，而且他的汉译作品往往有令原作焕发新生的功力。吴笛的早期译作《最后的炮轰》（1983年翻译出版）便是最好的例证。苏联当代作家尤里·邦达列夫（Юрий Бондарев/Yuri Bondarev）的名作《最后的炮轰》（*The Last Bombardment*）发表于20世纪50年代，是以小说家在反法西斯卫国战争期间的真实经历为模板写就，被称作“战壕真实派”的代表作，曾在苏联文学界引起争论，对以后苏联文学的发展产生了深远的影响，是研究苏联文学绕不开的一部作品。我国迟迟没有将之翻译过来，是受到20世纪六七十年代中苏交恶的国际政治影响。到70年代末，受“文化大革命”影响一度终止的外国文学翻译事业开始复苏，人们强烈渴望通过外国文学作品重新认识世界，中文译本《最后的炮轰》在众人的期待声中诞生，1983年一经出版便收获了大批读者，80年代的很多中国人是噙着泪读完它的。吴笛的译本用生动的语言、贴切的表述，为读者勾勒出一位血肉丰满的诺维科夫连长，并让他引领读者一起历经残酷的战争，体味生命个体在硝烟弥漫的战场上的心路历程。作为最细心的读者和译者，吴笛认为这部作品具备50年代中期以后苏联文学的一些突出特点：以白描的手法呈现战争的恐怖和残酷、表现英雄行为、描绘一个活生生的普通人的心灵真实，重点突出人道主义、描写人性美、宣传尊重人的生命。由此可见，译介这样一部时代经典对我们研究苏联20世纪五六十年代作品的主题及其反映出的社会意识形态大有裨益。

当有人问起吴笛选择翻译文本有没有什么特殊的要求和讲究时，他坦言：一个是兴趣，二是这个作家的重要性。如果说苏联作家邦达列夫的小说《最后的炮轰》符合他选择的第二要义，那么英国文豪狄更斯的最后一部小说《艾德温·德鲁德之谜》（*The Mystery of Edwin Drood*）就正好契合了他的第一条要求。

英国维多利亚时代最伟大的作家狄更斯，其长篇小说《艾德温·德鲁德之谜》被西方世界誉为“文学史中的不见天日之书、西方犯罪心理描写的先声”（吴笛，“《狄更斯全集》等后记三篇”185），1870年开始创作并分卷发表，一问世便获得了巨大的成功。同年6月，狄更斯患脑溢血离世；随着大师的逝去，小说的结局成为了一个真正的谜团。狄更斯去世后的许多年里，各种零散的新证据都没有办法证明他对《艾德温·德鲁德之谜》的意图。一百多年来，西方文坛围绕这部小说出版的续作、揭秘、研究不胜枚举。此书虽在国外备受青睐，国内读者却并鲜有耳闻。作为这部小说在中国的首位译者，吴笛认为《艾德温·德鲁德之谜》“东冷西热”的根源在于“狄更斯在中国长期被视作批判现实主义作家，广大读者只知其一，而《艾德温·德鲁德之谜》明显带有早期侦探文学的特色和某些类型小说的特点，国内主流文学观念长期对这样的作品缺乏关注，这也造成了我们对这部作品的忽略”（“《狄更斯全集》等后记三篇”186）。他同时指出，狄更斯“在真实与梦境的结合，梦

幻的巧妙运用，人物性格的刻画，尤其是双重性格的刻画，对后世，特别是对瑞典的斯特林堡和俄国的陀思妥耶夫斯基有较深的影响”（“《狄更斯全集》等后记三篇”186）。此小说的中文译作出版后，在读者群中引起不小的震动，甚至有读者给吴笛写信，询问译者对于小说结局的意见。

2012年，正值狄更斯诞辰200周年，浙江工商大学出版社出版了《狄更斯全集》，将吴笛的《艾德温·德鲁德之谜》中文译作收入其中，并当成“国礼”被时任国家领导人李长春先生馈赠给英国政府、大英图书馆和牛津大学。如今回忆起翻译这本书时的情形，吴笛的激动、兴奋之情难掩。开始着手翻译《艾德温·德鲁德之谜》的时候，他刚刚在安徽师大执教不久，每天如学生一样，拿着饭盒去食堂打饭，去食堂一路上都在思考如何翻译，有时想到了，饭也不在食堂吃，匆匆赶回宿舍，要先把路上想到的译出来，再开始吃饭。他自觉当时译得很认真，而且进入状态以后，大脑也比较好使。如果想不出好的表述，会去书店里找相关的书来看，还看多义词词典和有助于提高文学表达能力的书。这本译作2012年再版时，编辑让吴笛校对一遍，结果连一个“的”字都没法改出来。<sup>1</sup>这足以说明译者当年是如何的才思敏捷、认真仔细。

如果说19岁那年就读外语系是吴笛与外国文学缔结缘分的开端，那么杭州大学世界文学专业研究生的录取通知书，则是他与外国文学缔结终生盟约的证明。读研之后的吴笛，没有了教学的羁绊，全身心地专注于他所钟爱的翻译事业，一边勤奋苦读一边笔耕不辍。正是读研的这段时间，他陆续翻译了英、美、俄等国多位诗人的诗作。

其后，吴笛相继翻译了英国作家哈代（Thomas Hardy）、劳伦斯（David Herbert Lawrence）、夏洛蒂·勃朗特（Charlotte Brontë）以及俄罗斯大诗人帕斯捷尔纳克（Борис Леонидович Пастернак）的诗歌作品，出版了《劳伦斯诗选》（漓江出版社1988年）、《含泪的圆舞曲——帕斯捷尔纳克诗选》（浙江文艺出版社，1988年）、《野天鹅——20世纪外国抒情诗100首》（黑龙江人民出版社，1988年）、《外国现代女诗人诗选》（漓江出版社，1990年）、《泰戈尔散文诗选》（浙江文艺出版社，1991年）、《梦幻时刻——哈代抒情诗选》（中国文联出版公司，1992年）、《雪莱抒情小诗》（浙江文艺出版社，1992年）、《雪莱抒情诗全集》（浙江文艺出版社，1994年）、《夏洛蒂·勃朗特诗全集（下）》（河北教育出版社，1996年）、《第二次诞生》（上海人民出版社，2013年）、《灵船》（上海人民出版社，2013年）、《时光的笑柄——哈代抒情诗选》（河南大学出版社，2014年）、《黑夜的天使——20世纪欧美抒情诗选》（河南大学出版社，2014年）等诗歌译作，并译有《反死亡联盟》（浙江文艺出版社，1990年）、《苔丝》（浙江文艺出版社，1991年）、《对另一种存在的烦恼：俄罗斯白银时代短篇小说选》（云南人民出版社，1998年）、《街上的面具》（河南大学出版社，2014年）、《白夜：陀思妥耶夫

1 参见吴笛，“《狄更斯全集》等后记三篇”，《中文学术前沿》1（2012）：185。

斯基中短篇小说选》（敦煌文艺出版社，2014年）、《红字》（西安交通大学出版社，2015年）、《愿望的实现》（浙江文艺出版社，2019年）等多部长篇和中篇小说。

同样，作为“名家名译”的一份子，英国作家、诗人哈代的代表小说《苔丝》（*Tess of the d'Urbervilles*, 1981）的吴笛汉译本备受推崇。有读者曾这样评价：“哈代小说《德伯家的苔丝》，诸多中译本中，我认为吴笛翻译得既优美且忠实，毫无翻译小说或多或少的硬涩感。当你对原著某一段落句子只能意会而不能言传时，参看吴的译本时，将会被译文那精准达意又富艺术感染的演绎叫绝”（哈代 附录1）。

《含泪的圆舞曲》诞生于中俄文化交流尚不通畅以及国内没有帕斯捷尔纳克中文译本的前提下，辗转得来的两卷集俄文本《帕斯捷尔纳克诗集》（*Коллекция поэзии Пастернака*）对于译者来说珍贵异常。出版后，受到学界和读书界的广泛好评。诗人桑克在报刊上发文：“《含泪的圆舞曲》的译者是力冈和吴笛，我享受恩惠十四年了，在这行字里我向你们鞠躬”（第6版）。能得到诗歌创作界如此评价，是对译者最高的褒奖。这本诗集在2014年再版之后，为了保持译诗风格的统一，没有收入力冈先生的译诗。在保留原诗集中数首吴笛的译诗基础上，重新选译了帕斯捷尔纳克部分小说中的诗篇和部分早期诗作，在选译时，尽量避免与力冈先生前一个版本中所译的篇目重复，所以，再版的诗集以《第二次诞生》命名，一方面交代了译诗集的来龙去脉，另外一方面，也寄予了译者对新译本的期望。

在接受媒体采访时，吴笛坦言他的大部分译作都是在35岁之前完成的。35岁之后，尤其是担任浙江大学世界文学与比较文学研究所所长和博士生导师之后，由于教学、科研繁忙，他不得不暂时放下自己热爱的这项工作。作为一名才华横溢、技艺超群的翻译家，吴笛凭着扎实的英语、俄语功底和卓越的汉语言文学表达能力，经过长期勤勤恳恳的翻译实践的历练，光芒四射地闪耀在我国外国文学翻译领域。

## 二、文学翻译的中外交流与翻译学的文化重生

除了大量的翻译实践工作，吴笛对于翻译在外国文学经典生成与传播中的历史使命也有深入的思考。他认为，翻译是应对语言的隔阂而产生的。外国文学经典的生成与传播，离不开翻译的作用。外国文学经典得以代代流传，与文学作品的翻译活动和翻译实践是密不可分的。文学经典正是从不断的翻译过程中获得再生、获得流传。同时，文学翻译是世界各个民族和各个国家之间进行文化交流、情感沟通和思想会通的重要途径。文学经典的产生和发展，不仅体现了外国文学与本民族文学的融合，而且与社会发展和时代进步具有紧密的关联。正是有了广泛而深入的文学翻译活动，世界性范围的文学、世界性水平的文学才得以产生，一部世界文学史在一定意义上也是一部翻译文学

史和文化交流史。所以，翻译承担的使命就是真正意义上的文化遗产的使命。<sup>1</sup>

吴笛认为，翻译是应对语言的隔阂而产生的。根据神话传说，人类最初的语言是一致的，但是上帝害怕人类因语言一致而导致思想一致，从而联合起来对付他，因此便将人类的语言变乱，使人类不能共享信息<sup>2</sup>，而翻译让人类共享信息的行为，使受到时空限定的文学作品成为人类的共同财富。因此，外国文学经典得以代代流传，与文学作品的翻译活动和翻译实践是密不可分的。可以说，没有文学翻译，就不可能存在外国文学经典。文学经典正是从不断的翻译过程中获得再生，获得流传。譬如，古代罗马文学就是从翻译开始的，正是有了对古希腊文学的翻译，古罗马文学才有了对古代希腊文学的承袭。同样，古希腊文学经典通过拉丁语的翻译，获得新的生命，以新的形式，渗透在其他文学经典中，并得以流传下来。至于古罗马文学，如果没有后来其他语种的不断翻译，也就必然随着拉丁语成为死的语言而失去自己的生命。因此，要正确认识文学翻译的历史使命，我们必须重新认知和感悟文学翻译的特定性质和基本定义。文学翻译既是一门艺术，也是一门科学。作为一门艺术，译者充当着作家的角色，因为他需要用同样的形式、同样的语言来表现原文的内容和信息。文学翻译不是机械的语言转换，而是需要译者根据原作的内含，通过富有才情的创造性劳动，用另一种语言再现原作的精神和风采。<sup>3</sup>

特别可贵的是，吴笛擅长翻译却没有停留于翻译，他的译介工作指向了更长远文学新生和能为中华民族现代文明助力的文明互鉴，因此，早在20多年前，吴笛便能够辩证看待文学翻译与翻译文学的关系。他认为，文学翻译承载的重要历史使命是建构翻译文学，翻译文学是文学翻译的目的和使命。尽管吴笛特别重视外国文学研究中的翻译实践和外文文献，但是，他认为文学翻译的着眼点是文本，即原文向译文的转换，强调的是准确性。文学翻译也是媒介学范畴上的概念，是世界各个民族和各个国家之间进行交流和沟通思想感情的重要途径、重要媒介。翻译文学的着眼点则是读者对象和翻译结果，即翻译的文本在译入国的意义和价值，强调的是接受与影响。与文学翻译相比较，翻译文学不只是词语位置的调换，而是研究视角的变更；它能使“外国文学”不再是“外国的文学”，而是本国民族文化的有机组成部分；它能将外国文学从文学翻译研究的词语对应中解救出来，从而审视并系统反思外国文学经典生成与传播中的精神基因、生命体验和文化遗产。因此，翻译文学是文学翻译的目的和使命，属于“世界文学-民族文学”这一范畴的概念，是民族文化建设的有机整体，将所翻译的文学作品看成是我国民族文

---

1 参见吴笛：“翻译在外国文学经典生成与传播中的历史使命”，《中国社会科学报》2019年9月10日，第5版。

2 参见《圣经旧约》“创世记”。

3 参见吴笛：“翻译在外国文学经典生成与传播中的历史使命”，《中国社会科学报》2019年9月10日，第5版。

化事业的重要组成部分。<sup>1</sup>譬如，就莎士比亚戏剧的中文翻译而言，与英文教授梁实秋的汉译本相比，朱生豪译本的典范性在于其以中文为主体、中文的典雅优美和文学性压倒了英文对译中的“信”与“达”。因此，作为翻译文学，朱生豪译本成为首屈一指的经典。

回望整个 20 世纪，面对两次世界大战以及其后的“核恐怖”威胁、消费主义日盛的社会现状，人们对诗甚至对文学的命运感到了困惑。在这样一个总体上缺少诗意的“散文时代”，笔者认为，诗歌仍然以自己特别的视觉造型、“事件化存在”点缀生活、说明生活、探索生活和赋能生活，世界诗坛与文坛正以多思潮、多视觉、多元化的趋势发展着凝结人类语言和思想精髓的诗歌艺术与文学艺术。起起伏伏的文学、潮起潮落的诗歌，经历了新时期文学十余年的高峰期，当今中国的诗坛与文坛正处在蛰伏期和沉潜期，就像世界诗坛与文坛为了适应新的时代发展，人们借助学术性的诗歌研究和文学研究进行着很多富有成效的探索并积蓄着文学力量。正是有了吴笛这样一批译者和学人的坚守，才使中外文学、中外诗歌得以跨境流传，才给了日益“小众”的文学艺术存续并成长的空间，也间接守护了人类“诗意栖居”的精神家园。

### 三、文明互鉴的跨学科视野与世界文学的全球意识

毫无疑问，吴笛特别擅长基于翻译实践的外国文学研究。对英俄双语的精熟和几十部外国文学经典的翻译实践积累，使吴笛掌握了大量一手资料和阅读心得，这使他的欧美诗歌与文学、俄罗斯诗歌与文学的研究工作游刃有余。吴笛的学术研究硕果累累，不仅出版有专著《哈代研究》《哈代新论》《英国玄学派诗歌研究》《比较视野中的欧美诗歌》《浙江翻译文学史》《浙籍作家翻译艺术研究》《外国名诗欣赏》《外国文学经典散论》《俄罗斯小说发展史》《古罗斯与近代诗歌发展史》等，还有《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》（8 卷集 / 主编）、《新世纪中西文学论丛》（5 卷集 / 主编）、《外国文学前沿问题研究》《外国文学作品与史料选》《外国名诗鉴赏辞典·古代卷》《夏衍全集·译著卷》（3 卷集 / 合作主编）、《多维视野中的百部经典》《经典传播与文化遗产》等大量学术编著，以及《普希金全集》（10 卷集 / 合作主编）、《想经典丛书》（18 卷集 / 主编）、《世界中篇小说名著精品》（10 卷集 / 主编）等多种外国文学作品集。进入新世纪，他主持完成了国家社科基金重大招标项目、重点项目、后期资助重点项目、一般项目以及国家社科基金重大项目子课题近 10 项，并主持省部级重大和重点项目多项，还获得国家出版基金项目多项。

仔细盘点吴笛的人文学术研究成果，不但数量多而且质量高，主要集中在三大领域：一是单独的作家作品研究，譬如持续几十年的哈代研究，代表

<sup>1</sup> 参见 吴笛：“翻译在外国文学经典生成与传播中的历史使命”，《中国社会科学报》2019 年 9 月 10 日，第 5 版。

性成果是学术专著《哈代研究》《哈代新论》及其相关论文；二是文学流派—家族与国别文学、文学文体研究，譬如国家社科基金重点项目“俄罗斯小说发展史”、后期资助重点项目“俄罗斯古代诗歌发展史”、一般项目“英国玄学派诗歌研究”以及浙江省社科规划项目“浙江翻译文学史”“浙籍作家翻译艺术研究”等，代表性成果是同名学术专著及其相关论文；三是外国文学经典的综合研究和跨学科研究，譬如国家社科基金重大招标项目兼国家出版基金项目“外国文学经典生成与传播研究”等，代表性成果是同名的八卷本学术系列专著及其大量相关论文。

仔细分析吴笛的人文学术研究成果，他们具有三大特点：一是擅长填补空白，譬如他的新出版等专著《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》、1994年出版的专著《哈代研究》、2009年出版的《浙籍作家翻译艺术研究》以及哈代、劳伦斯、夏洛蒂·勃朗特、帕斯捷尔纳克等小说家的诗作研究、戏剧家夏衍的译著等这些少人注意的领域，在中国发表与出版的当时属于地地道道的填补空白，至今仍是前贤奠基之作。二是能够与时俱进，譬如从1994年的《哈代研究》到2009年的《哈代新论》以及相关译介、研究论文，体现的是吴笛对于英国作家、诗人哈代持续40多年的深沉热爱、追踪思考和研究拓展。三是自觉融通世界，吴笛自觉秉承经典传播与文化传承之心，对内对外广结文学良缘，切实推动国家人文思想库建设，并不计利害地适时当面表明态度，化解中美分歧、减缓文明冲突。

除了涉猎广泛、数量巨大的外国文学译介和研究，更能可贵的是，吴笛在其近50年的人文学术研究过程中，或一以贯之或与时俱进地贯彻了两大理念：

一是既重视基于翻译实践的外国文学研究又重视外国文学研究的跨学科方法。随着外国文学传播的深入和中西文化交流的发展，吴笛从译者和研究者的角度强调文学研究的跨学科视野，以及多语种翻译实践对于外国文学研究的意义。他认为，文学翻译实践是感悟文学经典魅力的重要途径，也是把握文学经典精髓、激发文学研究创新思维的理想途径。如今，学术研究的跨学科视野已经渗透到人文社会科学研究方方面面，探究各个学科之间的关联以及共同的规律和价值取向，无疑是人文社会科学研究捕捉热点问题以及选择恰当的研究方法的重要内涵。而外国文学研究，一直是体现跨学科视野的重要领域。早在13年前，吴笛就提出：“外国文学经典研究应从原有的文本研究转向文本生成渊源考证与生成要素的研究；应从文学翻译研究转向翻译文学研究；应从纸质文本的单一媒介流传转向音乐美术、影视动漫、网络电子的复合型的跨媒体流传；更应从‘外向型’研究转向关注中外文化交流和民族文化身份建构与民族形象重塑”（“翻译在外国文学经典生成与传播中的历史使命” 5）。当前，学界熟知的文学跨学科批评就有文学伦理学批

评<sup>1</sup>、生态批评、法律批评、经济学批评等跨学科研究方向。

在当代中国，社会历史批评作为文学批评的主线，经历了政治学批评、经济学批评和身体美学批评三个阶段，并相应凝聚为三种批评范式。经济话语规模化进入文学批评场域，与马克思主义艺术生产理论的召唤、文学及其批评现场经济要素的参与、市场经济规则的体制化运作等密不可分。文学经济学批评的动态生成，主要受制于三大机制：一是客体的经济生活是实现文学经济学批评的前提条件，二是创作与消费双重主体是达成文学经济学批评的内在动因，三是文学传播中的媒介因素成为文学经济学批评的运行中介。辩证地看，文学经济学批评既有积极的方法论价值，但也存在自身局限。<sup>2</sup>吴笛认为，随着社会的进步和经济的发展以及基于经济活动的全球化进程，文学与经济的关联越发紧密，使得“文学经济批评”成为可能。文学经典的经济批评研究范围极为宽广，而且具有多方面的功能，能够帮助我们更加深入地理解作家的创作思想以及文学经典的艺术魅力，探讨文学作品除了审美价值之外所具有的文献价值和认知功能，更能服务于“共同富裕”等国家战略决策。<sup>3</sup>

二是注重文学研究的世界文学意识和全球视野。吴笛认为，外国文学研究中的前沿性与跨学科学术问题涉及诸多方面，随着时间的更替和学术语境的发展而不断变化和更新。<sup>4</sup>然而，作为外国文学学科研究的中国学者，为建构自己的学术家园，无论面对什么样的前沿问题，世界文学意识是必须尊崇和巩固的一个重要的学术根基。有了世界文学意识，才能更好地理解民族文学与世界文学之间的关系。只有充分理解民族文学与世界文学的辩证关系，才能清晰地理解各个民族之间的文化交融和文明互鉴。其中，国别文学之间的互文关系尤为典型，在研读外国各语种文学经典的时候，关注这种互文关系，不仅可以整体把握文学经典的精髓，而且能够深入认知文学经典的生成。其实，这种文学研究中自觉性的世界文学意识，正是当下人们耳熟能详的文明互鉴行为，也是已经进入世界舞台中心并继续扩大开放的中国提倡和遵循的根本原则。

其实，强调世界文学整体，也就是强调文学研究的全球意识和国际视野，因此，研究方法必然发生相应的变更。世界文学意识促使文学研究方法发生变更的，不仅体现在文学内部的影响研究等方面，而且更多地体现在跨学科研究、跨媒介批评、后人类主义理论在内的多种批评理论。另一方面，随着世界文学格局的形成，以整体联系的视角进行文学批评，不但能拓展我们的视野、扩充我们的知识结构，并且使外国文学研究与我国本土文化意识的建构发生关联。同时，跨学科的知识背景，能够将文学研究与其他学科如语言学、历史学、社会学、人类学甚至各种自然科学相结合，更新研究方法和理论视

1 参见 聂珍钊：《文学伦理学批评导论》，北京：北京大学出版社，2014年，第1页。

2 参见 龚举善：“文学经济学作为批评范式的可能性”，《中外文论》2（2016）：20-33。

3 参见 吴笛：“文学经济批评的可行性”，《中国社会科学报》2024年8月26日，第6版。

4 参见 吴笛：“绪论”，《外国文学前沿问题研究》，北京：中国社会科学出版社，2023年。

角，以适应不断变化的学术环境和时代变迁，使文学的探索和研究更加具有科学性。可以说，外国文学研究的全球意识和国际视野在全球化的推动下，正朝着更加开放、多元和批判性的方向发展。这不仅为文学研究提供了新的理论和方法，也为全球文化的交流和理解提供了重要的平台。

人们常习惯性地认为，人文学术之路只有青灯黄卷和冷板凳。不可否认，这种生命状态可能是不少学者的真实写照；也不可否认，还有一种学者生涯如吴笛者。时势造英雄，“大转型”造就了一批当代英雄，他们的崛起也一定推动时代车轮滚滚向前，形成了传说中的“英雄造时势”，进而“时势”与“英雄”形成良性互动。

### Works Cited

- 龚举善：“文学经济学作为批评范式的可能性”，《中外文论》2（2016）：20-33。  
 [Gong Jushan. “The Possibility of Literary Economics as a Paradigm of Criticism.” *The Literary Theory of Chinese and Foreign* 2 (2016): 20-33.]
- 托马斯·哈代：《苔丝》，吴笛译。北京：中国书籍出版社，2005年。  
 [Hardy, Thomas. *Tess of the d’Urbervilles*, translated by Wu Di. Beijing: China Book Press, 2005.]
- 聂珍钊：《文学伦理学批评导论》。北京：北京大学出版社，2014年。  
 [Nie Zhenzhao. *Introduction to Ethical Literary Criticism*. Beijing: Peking UP, 2014.]
- 桑克：“泥水噗噜噗噜响”，《南方都市报》2002年6月13日，第6版。  
 [Sangke. “The Mud Puffed.” *Southern Metropolis Daily* 13 June 2002: 6.]
- 吴笛：“《狄更斯全集》等后记三篇”，《中文学术前沿》1（2012）：184-186。  
 [Wu Di. “Three Post-Notes of *The Complete Works of Charles Dickens*.” *Chinese Academic Frontier* 1 (2012): 184-186.]
- ：“翻译在外国文学经典生成与传播中的历史使命”，《中国社会科学报》2019年9月10日，第5版。  
 [—.“Historical Mission of Translation in the Creation and Dissemination of Foreign Literature Classics.” *Chinese Social Sciences Today* 10 September 2019: 5.]
- ：“外国文学经典研究的转向与拓展”，《中国社会科学报》2011年11月10日，第5版。  
 [—.“The Shift and Expansion of Foreign Classical Literature Research.” *Chinese Social Sciences Today* 10 November 2011: 5.]
- ：“文学经济批评的可行性”，《中国社会科学报》2024年8月26日，第6版。  
 [—.“Feasibility of Economic Literary Criticism.” *Chinese Social Sciences Today* 26 August 2024: 6.]
- ：《外国文学前沿问题研究》，北京：中国社会科学出版社，2023年。  
 [—.*Research on Frontier Issues in Foreign Literature*. Beijing: China Social Sciences Press, 2023.]

# 新境界、新视界、新见解：吴笛对外国文学研究疆域的拓展与创新

## New Realm, New Vision, New Opinion: Wu Di's Expansion and Innovation on the Frontiers of Foreign Literature Studies

周启超 (Zhou Qichao)

**内容摘要：**围绕着经典“何以生成？”“怎样传播？”这两个核心追问，吴笛率领 8 卷集《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》的作者们考古发掘一般地勘探经典作品或经典文学样式的生成机制、清理它们由原生地到次生地的传播路径。将经典的生成与经典的传播这两个论题域打通，便使得外国文学经典研究得以超越静态的、平面的、单纯的文字文本解读，而进入将文学文本与其跨媒体的艺术“译本”，与其文化密码加以系统化的深耕。这一深耕，对于越来越边缘化的外国文学学科具有战略性意义，它在护卫学科的生存空间，更在拓展学科的疆域。它使我们的外国文学走向“不再是外国的文学”而融入中华民族现代化进程的新境界。这一新境界的生成则得益于吴笛的“大翻译观”。“大翻译观”这一方法论创新的轴心，作为新视界，贯穿“经典生成、经典生长、学科生存”这一“三生研究”全过程，在深层统率 8 卷集的总体设计，在引领 8 卷集里吴笛本人在其一系列堪称样板的个案研究中取得具有突破性的新见解。

**关键词：**外国文学学科；生存与发展；经典研究；生成机制；传播路径；大翻译观

**作者简介：**周启超，浙江大学文学院教授，主要研究现代斯拉夫文论与比较诗学。本文为国家社科基金重大招标项目“世界文学基本文献的整理、翻译与研究”【项目批号：24&ZD242】阶段性成果之一。

**Title:** New Realm, New Vision, New Opinion: Wu Di's Expansion and Innovation on the Frontiers of Foreign Literature Studies

**Abstract:** Centered around two core questions “How is a classic generated?” and “How is it disseminated?” Wu Di leads the authors of the 8-volume monographs *Studies in the Formation and Dissemination of Foreign Literary Classics* to explore the mechanism of the generation of classics or classical literary styles, and

to unravel the paths of their dissemination from primary to secondary sites in an archaeological excavation. By linking the two thematic areas of classic generation and classic dissemination, the study of classics in foreign literature can go beyond the static, flat and purely literal interpretation of texts and enter into the systematic cultivation of literary texts and their cross-media artistic “translations” as well as their cultural codes. This deep cultivation is of strategic importance for the increasingly marginalized discipline of foreign literature, which defends the survival space of the discipline and expands its boundaries. It enables our foreign literature to move toward the new realm of “no longer a foreign literature” and be integrated into the modernization process of the Chinese nation. The creation of this new realm is attributed to Wu Di’s “Great Translation View.” The axis of methodological innovation of the “Great Translation View” as a new vision runs through the whole process of “classic generation, classic growth, and disciplinary survival,” which is the “three lives of research,” and governs the overall design of the Eight Volumes of the monographs. The overall design of the 8-volume monographs leads Wu Di himself to make breakthroughs in a series of case studies that can be regarded as models.

**Keywords:** foreign literature; survival and development; classic studies; generation mechanism; dissemination path; great translation concept

**Author:** **Zhou Qichao** is Professor at the School of Literature, Zhejiang University (Hangzhou, 310058, China). His academic research focuses on modern Slavic literature and comparative poetics (Email: zhouqichao88@126.com).

在四十年来的学术探索中，吴笛不但出色地继承其师力冈、飞白、陈坚的衣钵而成为一位优秀的多语种翻译家、多语种的外国文学研究者，更成为一位杰出的外国文学研究组织者、外国文学学科建设者。进入新世纪以来，吴笛不但一直在引领浙江大学和浙江省外国文学学科的发展，而且率领团队进入经典生成基因的勘探、经典生长路径的深耕，来拓展当代中国外国文学的生存空间，使我们中国学者视野中的外国文学走向“不再是外国的文学”的新境界，使我们的外国文学研究作为文化资源而走向有机地融于三个历程——中华民族思想解放的历程、中华民族精神成长的历程、中华民族的现代化进程——的新境界。

### 一、新境界

外国文学研究这一新境界集中地体现于吴笛领衔主编并担任团队主力，以十年的时光来精心打磨的《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》8卷集（下文简称为8卷集）。

用“精心打磨”来形容8卷集，实不为过。以探究外国文学经典在源语国家的生成，在译入语国家的传播为主要内容的8卷集，是“外国文学经典生成与传播研究”这一国家社科基金重大项目的最终成果。“外国文学经典生成与传播研究”2010年10月立项，属于国家社科基金重大招标项目开始启动时最早的一批。该项目的最终成果为340万字系列专著，结项之后不久就被列入“十三五”国家重点图书出版规划项目，2018年获得国家出版基金立项，2019年4月由北京大学出版社推出。8卷集面世后，不断斩获大奖：2021年3月，8卷集荣获北京外国语大学设立的全国性外国文学奖“第二届王佐良外国文学研究奖”二等奖；2021年12月，8卷集的“第二卷”，即其中六章由吴笛撰写的古代卷（上）荣获浙江省人民政府第二十一届哲学社会科学优秀成果奖二等奖；2023年12月，整个8卷集荣获教育部第九届高等学校科学研究优秀成果奖（人文科学）二等奖。

8卷集之所以能获得学界的高度认可，在于其选题的前沿性与开拓性：在长达数千年的历史长河中，外国文学经典对后世产生了重要影响，是人类宝贵的文化遗产。探索世界文学经典的生成基因与传播途径，研究这些经典的生成语境以及在产生、译介和流传过程中发展、变异和成熟，无疑具有重要学术史意义。从源语文化语境与跨媒介传播等方面深耕文学经典的生长，无疑是具有前沿性、开拓性的重要命题。“将文学经典的生成与传播视为一体并置于互动空间来考察，将外国文学放在复杂、动态、多元的独立系统中加以考察，是一个全球范围内全新的开拓性课题，丰富了文学经典和经典生成的理论”（韩骁190）。

8卷集之所以不断斩获大奖，还在于其重要的学术贡献：不仅在理论上对经典、经典性、经典化、经典重读等问题进行了富有创新的研究，而且对跨媒介的经典传播、经典译介等问题展开了系统性的、建构性的探讨，从而拓展了我国外国文学经典研究的疆域。在经典生成研究界面，8卷集聚焦源语国家社会语境、文化传统、审美体验以及科技革命等方面的复合作用；在经典传播研究界面，8卷集聚焦译介转换、文化交流、跨媒介传播、时代重构与经典再生成，勘察文学与绘画、雕塑、音乐尤其与影视等不同艺术形态的相互动态渗透。尤其探析翻译传播和跨媒体传播，强调没有不同界面的翻译，就不可能存在外国文学经典。文学经典正是从不断的多界面翻译过程中获得再生，获得流传。

8卷集独到的学术贡献，更在于首次研究外国文学经典在源语国家的生成在译入语国家的传播，尤其是深度探析外国文学经典在中文世界的传播之多维度关联，将经典的生成与再生作为一个进程，作为一个系统加以深耕，以中国学者独到的学术立场，从国家文化建设的高度来立体审视与系统反思外国文学经典生成与传播中的精神基因、生命体验与文化传承。

我国外国文学界的著名学者纷纷高度赞扬8卷集学术价值的丰富性，充

分肯定 8 卷集探索路径的开拓性。欧洲科学院外籍院士、英美文学和文学伦理学批评研究专家、浙江大学聂珍钊教授称赞 8 卷集“是外国文学研究领域一部有‘中国风格’和‘中国气派’的学术巨著”（韩骁 188）。西班牙科学院外籍院士、中国社会科学院学部委员、西葡拉美文学与文学理原理学研究专家、外国文学研究所所长陈众议教授赞誉 8 卷集“是所有社科基金重大项目中最值得学界骄傲的成果之一，也是改革开放 40 年来外国文学学科最好的成果之一”（韩骁 188）。浙江大学文科资深教授、人文学部主任、法国文学与翻译学研究专家许钧教授肯定 8 卷集“作为具有理论创新的重大研究成果，是中国外国文学学界独立探索的结果，展现了中国学者的优秀特质”（韩骁 191）。

从外国文学研究者的角度看，8 卷集的学术价值不仅体现于研究主题的前沿性与开拓性，更在于方法论的创新性：更在于其探索路径上的开拓，在于对经典研究路径的深耕。

8 卷集的总主编吴笛在走向这一深耕之追求上有着鲜明而坚定的理念。在“总序”中，吴笛旗帜鲜明地提出走向外国文学经典研究深耕的新视野、新立场、新目标：

外国文学经典研究，应结合中华民族的现代化进程、中华民族文化的振兴与发展，以及我国的外国文学研究的整体发展及其对我国民族文化的贡献这一视野来考察经典的译介与传播。我们应着眼于外国文学经典在原生地的生成和变异，汲取为我国的文学及文化事业所积累的经验，为祖国文化事业服务。我们还应着眼于外国文学经典在中国的译介和其他艺术形式的传播，树立我国文学经典译介和研究的学术思想的民族立场；通过文学经典的中国传播，以及面向世界的学术环境和行之有效的中外文化交流，重塑文化中国的宏大形象，将外国文学译介与传播看成是中华民族思想解放和发展历程的折射。（10）

走向外国文学经典的深耕，不仅需要富有创新性的理念，而且需要方法论上的创新。这一方法论创新主要有几个层面：其一、将对经典的敬畏与对经典的考证结合起来，既坚守“入乎其内”式地“敬畏经典”，又强调“出乎其外”式地“重估经典”。“敬畏经典”意在强调恢复经典的思想尊严、细寻经典的精神魅力；“重估经典”意在强调激活经典的思想命题、开掘经典的精神蕴藏。8 卷集的作者们在吴笛率领下，像考古学家那样下功夫深度勘探经典源语文本，充分发挥多语种优势，积极运用国外最新文献，充分吸收国际学界前沿成果，对外国文学经典的生成要素、建构特征、传播途径、演变过程、潜在影响的内涵而进行全面、深入的探析。正是这种严谨而精细的考证，使得 8 卷集在对外国文学经典的深耕中得以修正多种传统学术观点。其

二，基于经典的生成与传播之间的互动，将经典生成基因的勘探同经典传播路径的考察融为一体，将文学经典的生成与传播作为有机整体。经典在生成的过程中传播，也在传播的过程中再生成。文学经典一旦生成就必然进入对内或对外传播的进程。输出与接受互动，繁衍出全新的文化意义与符号价值，实现“文化增值”。其三，基于不同时代不同国别的文学经典之间的互动、文学与不同艺术之间的互动，8卷集将各个时期的外国文学作为整个文学系统整体图景中承前启后的流动性环节来进行研究，打通艺术门类、国别和时代划分，通过纵横交错的多方位考察，展现出从传统社会过渡到现代社会的历史进程中外国文学经典独特的生成方式，这些文学经典对后世文学的影响，描绘出历史文化变迁在文学中留下的轨迹与这些文学经典生成后的运行轨迹。

8卷集不再将《神曲》或十四行诗体这些外国文学经典作品或经典文学样式视为不证自明的天然存在，而追问经典“何以生成？”“怎样传播？”围绕着这两个核心追问，吴笛率领8卷集的作者们解析经典作品或经典文学样式的生成基因与生成机制，清理而描绘经典作品或经典文学样式由原生地到次生地的传播路线与重生路径。将经典的生成与经典的传播这两个论题域打通，使得外国文学经典研究得以超越静态的、平面的、单纯的文字文本解读的状态，而进入经典之“进程化”“动态化”“立体化”境界——将文学文本与其艺术“译本”，与其文化密码加以“系统化”——的整合式研究境界。这样一种对经典的生成与生长的深耕，必然会激活经典；这样一种对经典生命的激活，必然有助于整个外国文学研究生存空间的拓展。在工具理性至上的势利社会，在外国文学研究越来越被边缘化的今天，这一由经典研究的深耕而带来的学科空间的拓展，实则具有护卫整个外国文学学科的战略意义。

8卷集在外国文学经典深耕路径上的方法论创新也得到了学界的充分肯定。陈众议称赞8卷集“将文学文本研究置于历史的、跨文化的以及跨文学的语境之中，打开了新的研究视角，让人耳目一新”（韩骁 189）。许钧肯定8卷集“将外国文学经典置于复杂动态多元的系统、历史的进程、多学科互动空间中进行考察这一途径极大地拓展了外国文学研究的空间”（韩骁 191）。王立新看出8卷集“把文本完全纳入生成、传播、接受的场域中，通过生成要素、成型标志、建构方式、演变过程、传播途径、译介转换、当代呈现等七个方面，来阐释‘经典为何’的问题，非常全面、严谨且创新。前三者是对经典之结构的分析，后四者是对经典之所以为经典的变量的动态分析；自体逻辑十分完整”（韩骁 190）。

## 二、新视界

吴笛领衔完成的8卷集何以取得这些方法论创新？可从不同维度来探析。以笔者之见，深层次的轴心应是贯穿于“三生”研究——经典生成基因之勘探、经典生长路径之考察、学科生存空间之拓展——的“大翻译观”。推

动 8 卷集方法论创新的轴心枢纽实则是吴笛的“大翻译观”<sup>1</sup>。“大翻译观”作为一种新视界，在深层统率 8 卷集的总体设计，引领吴笛本人对外国文学经典生成与传播的具体研究。吴笛对经典的深耕过程表明：他一直在积极采用其“大翻译观”来探析外国文学经典的生成与再生。

“大翻译观”是对通常意义上“翻译”的超越。“大翻译观”将“翻译”看成几个层面：其一是文字翻译，语言学意义上的翻译；其二是文学翻译，诗学、美学意义上的翻译，不同语言的文学间互动、不同民族的文学间交流；其三是艺术翻译，媒介学意义上的翻译，不同的艺术之间的转换，语言艺术与影视艺术，与绘画艺术、雕塑艺术、音乐艺术之间的转换；其四是文化翻译，符号学意义上的翻译，不同文化文本之间的转换，不同的文化代码之间的破译：编码与解码。“大翻译观”认为，在文学翻译、艺术翻译、文化翻译这些基于语言又超越语言的翻译行为中，总有新的意义得以创生，甚至生成新的文本。

世界文学经典的生成要经由翻译。一民族的文学杰作成为他民族文学的经典，成为世界文学的经典，要经由翻译。没有翻译就没有经典。正是翻译，使得文学文本获得今生之后的“来生”。“文学经典正是在不断的翻译过程中获得再生，得到流传”（吴笛，“总序” 7）。“翻译是源语文本获得再生的重要途径，纵观世界文学史的杰作，都是在翻译中获得再生的。从古埃及、古巴比伦、古希腊罗马等一系列文学经典来看，没有翻译就没有经典。如果说源语创作是文学文本的今生，那么今生的生命是极为短暂的，是受到限定的；正是翻译，使得文学文本获得今生之后的“来生”。文学经典在不断被翻译的过程中获得“新生”和强大的生命力。<sup>2</sup>

从词源学来看，“翻译”一词来自拉丁文的“Traducere”，即“引向远方”。文学翻译使受到时空限定的文学作品成为人类的共同财富。古代文学经典的生成实例充分说明了这一点。中古波斯的《鲁拜集》（*Rubáiyát of Omar Khayyám*），正是因为有了菲兹杰拉德（Edward Fitzgerald）的英译才引起关注，得以成为文学经典。吴笛在 8 卷集第 2 卷第 9 章对《鲁拜集》的经典化历程，进行了精细的勘探与严谨的考证。这一经典生成于翻译之中，生成于这部波斯语诗集的英译、俄译、汉译。正是有了文学翻译活动，世界文学才得以产生，一部世界文学史其实也是一部翻译文学史。文学翻译在民族文学的跨文化交流中具有“工程师”的地位。只有借助于一种重要的文学语言进行的翻译活动，才可以让他们的文本进入到文学世界之中。<sup>3</sup>有别于文字翻译，文学翻译具有自己的特质，自己的使命。吴笛在“总序”中有论述，还

1 “大翻译观”意为对狭义的语言学界面翻译观的超越，这里的“翻译”已包含媒介学、符号学、文化学等不同界面的“翻译”，故称之为“大翻译观”。

2 参见吴笛：“总序”，《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第 1 卷，北京：北京大学出版社，2019 年，第 8 页。

3 参见卡萨诺瓦：《文学世界共和国》，罗国祥等译，北京：北京大学出版社，2015 年，第 156 页。

发表专文来阐述：

文学翻译不只是语言文字符号的转换，而且是以另一种生命形态存在的文学活动。文学翻译是一门艺术。译者充当着作家的角色，因为他需要用同样的形式、同样的语言来表现原文的内容和信息。文学翻译不是逐字逐句的、机械的语言转换，而是需要译者根据原作的内涵，通过富有才情的创造性劳动，用另一种语言再现原作的精神和风采。在这里，译者不是“媒婆”，而是生命创造者。翻译过程就是不断创造生命的过程。翻译是文学的一种生命运动，翻译作品是原著新的生命形态的体现。杰出的作品正是在翻译中获得新生，并且生存于永恒的转化和永恒的翻译状态。文学翻译所承载的另一个重要历史使命就是建构翻译文学。（4）

这里讲的已是“翻译文学”。“翻译文学”与文学翻译是怎样的关系？吴笛有辨析：

文学翻译和翻译文学是两种不同的视角。文学翻译的着眼点是文本，即原文向译文的转换，文学翻译也是媒介学范畴上的概念，是世界各个民族和各个国家之间进行交流和沟通思想感情的重要途径、重要媒介。翻译文学的着眼点是读者对象和翻译结果，即所翻译的文本在译入国的意义和价值，强调的是接受与影响。与文学翻译相比较，翻译文学不只是词语位置的调换，而是研究视角的变更。

翻译文学是文学翻译的目的和使命，也是衡量翻译得失的一个重要标准，它属于“世界文学—民族文学”这一范畴的概念。翻译文学的核心意义在于不再将“外国文学”看成“外国的文学”，而是将其看成民族文学的组成部分，是民族文化建设的有机整体。可以说，文学翻译的目的，就是建构翻译文学。（4）

文学翻译研究朝翻译文学研究这一转向，意义可谓重大，关乎外国文学学科的境界。正是这一转向的实现，可使我们的“外国文学”不再是“外国的文学”，可使我国的外国文学得以成为我国民族文化的有机组成部分。如此看来，文学翻译家杨宪益所译的《荷马史诗》、罗念生所译的古希腊悲剧、梁宗岱所译的莎士比亚十四行诗，季羨林所译《罗摩衍那》《沙恭达罗》、金克木所译的《摩诃婆罗多》、丰子恺所译的《源氏物语》，还有《哈姆莱特》《唐吉珂德》《浮士德》《红与黑》《当代英雄》等外国文学经典的杰出汉译本，作为“翻译文学”，实乃中国现代文学的有机组成。从事翻译文学创作的这些翻译家也是作家，也是中国作家协会成员。吴笛本人出席全国作家代表大会，也是基于这位俄语诗与英语诗杰作的优秀汉译者，这位《苔丝》《罪与罚》等

外国文学名著的优秀汉译者，已是一位作家。

一如外国文学经典的生成需经由翻译，外国文学经典的传播也需经由“翻译”。在漫长的岁月中，外国文学经典经历了多次传播途径，见证了多种语言文字、物质载体、媒体种类的变迁。吴笛将外国文学经典的传播概括为七种形式：口头传播、表演传播、文字传播、印刷传播、组织传播、影像传播、网络传播。<sup>1</sup>以“大翻译观”来审视所有这些经典传播形式，其实质也是“翻译”。外国文学经典的影视改编，可谓是以文学文本为“底本”的“翻译”；文学作品被改编为绘画作品、雕塑作品、音乐作品，这一跨媒介传播过程，实则也是不同艺术形式之间的“翻译”过程。改编是文学经典传播中十分重要的环节，是文学经典生命被激活而得以再生的重要路径。何况许多文学经典的生命力是在改编的状态中得以实现和完善的。<sup>2</sup>尤其是银屏形象在展现复杂的事件和情节方面比语言文字更为直观，甚至更为生动。由荷马史诗改编的电影《特洛伊》和《木马屠城》，由《神曲》改编的多种动画电影，显然成功地普及了外国文学经典。跨媒体改编的艺术机制实则也是“翻译”：“将纸上的语言符号转换成银幕上的视觉符号，不是一般意义上的转换，而是从一种艺术形式到另一种艺术形式的‘翻译’”（吴笛，“总序”11）。

诚然，这里的“翻译”已是另一个层面的“翻译”，“媒介学”意义上的“翻译”。“媒介学”意义上的“翻译”，其机理也还是翻译。我们也可以且必须遵守翻译的基本原理与机制对跨媒介改编加以研究。一如文学翻译研究中是将忠实原著，尤其是忠实原著的思想内涵，看成是“译本”的不可忽略的重要目标，看成是衡量“译本”得失的重要维度，在对由一部文学经典改编成的一部电影进行探讨时，我们可以原著为“底本”，来探讨影片这一“译本”的得失。在文学经典的影视改编中，既要“以大翻译观”看到改编这种从艺术的一种表现形式朝另一种表现形式的转换实则是“再创作”，无视这一点，影视改编中就会出现文学翻译中的“硬译”或“死译”，也要以“大翻译观”看到这种“再创作”无疑又受到“原文”的限制，视觉艺术与语言艺术有着各自特定的艺术特性与表现技巧，而理应将原著所揭示的道德的、心理的和思想的内涵通过新的视觉表现手段来传达给电影观众。<sup>3</sup>何况改编者对原著的阐释，作为一种跨文化的阐释，其本身就是一种“翻译”——符号学意义上的“文化翻译”（周启超，“跨文化阐释：路径与机制”177）<sup>4</sup>；改编者的阐释，总

1 参见吴笛：“总序”，《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第1卷，北京：北京大学出版社，2019年，第5-7页。

2 参见吴笛：“绪论·人类童年的悠远的回声”，《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第2卷，北京：北京大学出版社，2019年，第6页。

3 参见吴笛：“总序”，《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第1卷，北京：北京大学出版社，2019年，第12页。

4 洛特曼认为，阐释即翻译。对他者文化的任何一种把握实则都是翻译。对这一观点的论述，参见周启超：“跨文化阐释：路径与机制”，《社会科学战线》1（2024）：172-178。

是基于改编者之时空的、文化的“外位性”（周启超，“外位性与文学研究的人文化”132）<sup>1</sup>的阐释。在8卷集第5卷第6章，吴笛正是以“改编即翻译”这一“大翻译观”，对电影界曾十分叫好的一次改编中的“误译”——波兰斯基所执导的电影《苔丝》对哈代小说原著的“误译”，进行了精彩的深度探析。

### 三、新见解

对外国文学应不再是“外国的文学”这一新境界的执着追求，对以“大翻译观”这一新视界来统率“三生”研究——经典生成基因之勘探、经典生长路径之考察、学科生存空间之拓展——这一方法论的坚定贯彻，既体现于吴笛作为组织者对8卷集的总体设计理念，更被落实于吴笛作为研究者在8卷集中所展开的对经典生成与传播具体的深耕，呈现于一系列富于开拓性、创新性的新见解。吴笛参与了8卷集第2卷（古代卷）（上）、第4卷（近代卷）（上）、第5卷（近代卷）（下）、第8卷（当代卷）（下）这4卷共10章的撰写，实为团队主力之一；这一主力地位更体现于研究格局：吴笛是对自古代经近代至现代的外国诗歌经典的生成与传播历程进行全覆盖性勘探的研究者。外国诗歌经典是吴笛多年来用心最勤耕耘最深而建树最丰的领域。通读下来，给笔者留下深刻印象的“亮点”至少有：弗罗斯特诗歌经典的生成与传播，这是对“诗之可译性”之机理与诗在翻译中获得新生的例证；《神曲》的影视改编与跨媒体传播，这是对文学经典在改编中被成功地普及而再生的例证；小说《苔丝》与电影《苔丝》：这是对出色的改编中也有“误译”的例证；玄学派诗歌在17世纪的生成与在20世纪的被激活，这是诗歌发育也受益于自然科学的哺育之例证；《鲁拜集》在传播中经由翻译而成为经典，这是对经典在传播中生成的例证。十四行诗体这一重要文学样式，并不是生成于意大利，而是生成于古罗马，这是对经典生成史进行深度发掘、精细考证，文学考古也会有新发现的例证。限于篇幅，在这里无法全面评述。且驻足于吴笛完成的两个研究个案，它们堪称外国文学经典生成与传播研究进入深耕境界的样板。

其一，中古波斯诗歌《鲁拜集》在传播中经由翻译而成为经典。这是经典的生成与传播互动的例证，是民族的杰作经由翻译而成为世界文学经典的例证。海亚姆这位在中世纪波斯的数学家、天文学家和哲学家，作为《鲁拜集》的作者，其诗人地位何以在七个半世纪之后，在19世纪才得以确立？吴笛对《鲁拜集》的经典化历程，进行了精细的勘探与严谨的考证。这一经典生成于翻译之中，生成于这部波斯语诗集的英译、俄译、汉译过程，生成于直译与转译，全译与选译等不同译本之中。就汉译而言，生成于新诗格律体的翻译与古体诗

1 巴赫金认为，时间、空间、文化中的外位性，是对他者文化进行创造性理解的前提。对这一观点的论述，参见周启超：“外位性与文学研究的人文化”，《浙江大学学报》（人文社会科学版）5（2020）：129-136。

的翻译之中。吴笛以其同时精通汉语诗、英语诗和俄语诗而能在多语种的诗歌世界自由穿越的视野与才能，对英国诗人菲茨杰拉德的《鲁拜集》的英译，俄罗斯学者戈鲁别夫（И.А.Голубев）的《鲁拜全集》与自郭沫若以降一百年中国学者、诗人、作家对《鲁拜集》的转译、直译的不同风采，在诗文本的层面，展开精细的比较、层层论证。

吴笛公正地肯定《鲁拜集》俄译本的特色：就其所收原诗的数量而言更为壮观：目前收诗最多的是戈鲁别夫翻译的于2008年在莫斯科出版的海亚姆《鲁拜全集》，共收诗1306首。吴笛有理有据地论证《鲁拜集》英译本——先后5个版本，菲茨杰拉德所译《鲁拜集》虽然只收诗101首，却是真正意义上的创造性翻译（transcreation）。该英译本《鲁拜集》注重体现原文精神内涵，采用翻译、合译、意译、改译，还对原文的排列顺序进行调整，使得诗与诗之间有了一定的关联，这种翻译在意境、意象以及思想内涵等方面都发生了一定程度的改变，更适合于译入语读者的接受。这种经过再经典化的译作也更适于吟咏和流传。正是菲茨杰拉德翻译的《鲁拜集》得到广泛流传，成为英国文学的经典。通过英语的传播，《鲁拜集》走向世界，成为美国，中国以及其他国家的文学经典。

吴笛更具体地梳理《鲁拜集》在中文世界的传播路径：《鲁拜集》在中文世界的传播，分为两个类型：一是以直接译自波斯文的作品而传播；二是以从英文转译的作品而传播。从波斯文原诗直译的作品主要在学界流传，影响有限。在《鲁拜集》百年来汉译历程中，有不少较为齐全的译本，还有不少文学家或翻译家对《鲁拜集》进行了选译，多则数十首，少则一两首。这些译者中，有很多是著名的作家、学者、翻译家，其中包括胡适、闻一多、徐志摩、林语堂、刘半农、吴宓、施蛰存、梁实秋、伍蠡甫、郑振铎、朱湘、飞白、屠岸。《鲁拜集》中译本，绝大多数为新诗格律体翻译，也有一些古体诗翻译的实践，如吴宓、李宽容、黄克孙、柏丽、李霁野、江日新、鹤西、睦谦等人的译诗就是用七绝和五绝或五律翻译的。这些译文，各显神通，各具特色，异彩缤纷。《鲁拜集》何以在中文世界受到如此广泛的译介和传播？这既基于其艺术形式与中国译者彼此相通。也是得力于其思想蕴含与中国译者心心相印。鲁拜体这一四行诗体与我国的绝句存在相似之处，鲁拜体的兴起也主要发生在中国唐王朝控制西域中亚地区之后，不少学者认为两者之间存在着渊源关系。杨宪益先生就曾撰文，认为鲁拜体的产生有可能受到唐代绝句的影响。《鲁拜集》充满着哲理色彩，并且闪烁着人性的光彩。如今看来，波斯诗人海亚姆的这些诗似乎都不是为中世纪的人们所创作，而是为现代人所写。<sup>1</sup>

就这样，海亚姆的《鲁拜集》这一经典的生成与传播历程成为吴笛对经

1 参见 吴笛：“十四行诗的生成、演变和传播”，《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第2卷，北京：北京大学出版社，2019年，第161-175页。

典在传播中生成在翻译中生成这一史实进行考古般勘探的一个精彩样板，成为吴笛展开外国诗歌经典生成机制与传播路径之深耕的一个生动个案。吴笛的这一个案研究证明：文学经典的生成与传播其实是一个有机整体。经典在生成的过程中传播，也在传播的过程中再生。这一个案研究过程表明，吴笛确乎是以考古学者那样的眼力与功夫投入经典生成史的发掘与勘探

其二，如果说《鲁拜集》之经典生成史的考证显示出吴笛对一部文学作品成为经典的勘探力，那么对十四行诗的生成、演变和传播历程的整体性勘察，则展示出吴笛对一种经典的文学样式之生成与生长机制，之发育与发展的机理进行系统性清理的勘探力，而且这一研究还成为“考证性探究”中有所发现，进而得以修正传统见解的例证。

十四行诗体作为一种长久流行于世界文坛的重要诗体，作为许多文学经典的载体，曾经并且依然有着旺盛的生命力。意大利的但丁和彼特拉克，英国的莎士比亚和斯宾塞，法国的龙萨和波德莱尔，西班牙的贡戈拉，俄国的普希金——这些不同民族文学的代表，其诗歌方面的成就主要是通过十四行诗来体现的。十四行诗已成为一种国际性的跨文化的艺术形式。十四行诗的发展折射了世界文学经典的流传与发展。对十四行诗体的生成、演变和传播作一考证性的探究，并对其在世界各国的传播与演变的历程以及在我国译介和融会进行梳理和研究，对于研究世界文学经典的流传与发展实则具有相当典型的意义。十四行诗体源生于何处？十四行诗产生于14世纪的意大利，这是国际学界主流观点。十四行诗的开创者是意大利文艺复兴时期的著名诗人彼特拉克，这是在我国学界的流行观点。然而“主流观点”“流行观点”也可能牵强附会，缺乏史料支撑。吴笛经由大量新的史料的考证来实证这一“主流观点”“流行观点”其实言之无据。这一考证有逻辑分层面推进：

第一层，质疑彼特拉克乃十四行诗体开创者这一成见。通过深度考证，吴笛发现但丁已经先于彼特拉克创作了以十四行诗为主体的诗集《新生》，其中收入的十四行诗达25首。在学界通常被认定是十四行诗体最初成就的“彼特拉克诗体”，在结构上与但丁《新生》中的十四行诗体并无明显区别，也是4433结构，前面一组是“八行诗”(Octave)，后面一组是“六行诗”(Sestet)，认为彼特拉克是十四行诗的首创者显然是有失偏颇的。

第二层，质疑意大利乃十四行诗体发源地这一定论。十四行诗的结构是“八行诗”加“六行诗”。考察十四行诗的生成，无疑不能忽略有关“八行诗”和“六行诗”的概念。在具体创作实践中，“八行诗”和“六行诗”即可作为十四行诗体的前后两个组成部分，也可作为独立的诗歌存在。据现有资料表明：八行诗或六行诗先于十四行诗产生，并且影响了十四行诗歌在形式方面的生成和发展；但是反过来，十四行诗歌的流行和普及，又促成了八行诗和六行诗的兴盛。究竟是八行诗和六行诗影响了十四行诗，还是十四行诗影响了八行诗和六行诗？其实，这并不是“一个尚不清楚的问题”。吴笛先是从

文化语境入手，考证出曾经盛行十四行诗的意大利与古罗马文字与文化有着不可分割的联系，然后从八行诗、六行诗与“十四行诗”共有的核心元素“十一音节律”（Hendecasyllabus）入手，考证出古罗马诗人卡图卢斯给后世留下的丰厚文化遗产中，“十一音节律”（Hendecasyllabus）是其中重要的一项，而但丁、彼特拉克等一些意大利的十四行诗诗人，所采用的正是同样的“十一音节律”，这样的考证便走向一个发现：十四行诗起源于古罗马，在抒情诗人卡图卢斯的诗中已经有了最初的原型。此后，吴笛分四个方面对古罗马诗人卡图卢斯对十四行诗生成所做出的贡献展开论述，确证了十四行诗体的开拓者原来是古罗马诗人卡图卢斯。

十四行诗的生成渊源发生于古罗马，卡图卢斯的诗集《歌集》在十四行诗得以生成的过程中发挥了重要的奠基作用，虽然它只是属于生成的初始阶段，但是其生成阶段的特性是显而易见的，而且其原始因素极大地影响了其后的传播。13世纪意大利十四行诗的繁荣及其4433形式的确定，则是属于该诗体在传播阶段的演变和衍生因素。后来十四行诗在包括中国在内的世界各国的发展和演变同样是这一传播和衍生因素的延伸。<sup>1</sup>

吴笛就是这样以大量的文本考据的方式，确认十四行诗体这一重要文学样式并非生成于意大利，而是生成于古罗马，进而修正了学界主流观点、突破了教科书上的流行观点，使十四行诗体的生成提前了一千多年。

### 结语

衡量一位大学者的学术建树，也有多种尺度。有以著作等身来评价其学术产量，也有以成一家之言来评定其学术质量。在笔者看来，在学术探索路径上的深耕，在方法论探索上的开拓，给学界以方法论上的引领，功莫大焉。经典研究何其多。以经典研究为论题的著作或许比经典本身还要多。吴笛领衔的以外国文学经典研究为主题的8卷集巨著，之所以出类拔萃，在于其别开生面的方法论创新，在于其将外国文学经典的生成与传播置于多界面的翻译——语言学的、文学美学的、艺术媒介学的、文化符号学的“翻译”——这一“大翻译观”的视界。基于这样的方法论上的新视界，吴笛领衔的8卷团队才得以进入对外国文学经典的深耕，才有可能走向外国文学研究的新境界：使我们中国的外国文学不再是“外国的”文学。置身于新境界，才会有新见解。是否走向这一境界，关乎外国文学学科的命运。对经典的深耕——将经典的生成与传播置于互动共生的系统，将文学经典文本与其跨媒体的改编（“译本”）关联起来加以整体研究，将外国文学经典原著的汉译——文学翻译转向我们的“翻译文学”，既是对外国文学学科生存空间的护卫，更是对外国文学学科疆域的拓展。这样的深耕，真可谓立意高远：对于学科建

1 参见吴笛：“十四行诗的生成、演变和传播”，《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第2卷，北京：北京大学出版社，2019年，第271-298页。

设, 实则是具有现实针对性之举, 对于国家文化, 实则是具有战略意义之举。

### Works Cited

- 卡萨诺瓦·帕斯卡尔: 《文学世界共和国》, 罗国祥等译。北京: 北京大学出版社, 2015年。  
[Casanova, Pascale. *The World Republic of Letters*, translated by Luo Guoxiang et al. Beijing: Peking UP, 2015.]
- 韩晓: “外国文学经典研究的跨学科交流: 外国文学经典生成与传播高层论坛综述”, 《文学跨学科研究》4 (2020): 187-191。  
[Han Xiao. “Interdisciplinary Communication on Formation and Dissemination of Literary Classics.” *Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature* 4 (2020): 187-191.]
- 吴笛: “总序”, 《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第1卷。北京: 北京大学出版社, 2019年, 第1-12页。  
[Wu Di. “General Prologue.” *Studies in the Formation and Dissemination of Foreign Literary Classics* Vol. 1. Beijing: Peking UP, 2015. 1-12.]
- : “《鲁拜集》的生成与传播”, 《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第2卷。北京: 北京大学出版社, 2019年, 第161-175页。  
[—.“The Generation and Dissemination of the *Rubaiyat* by Omar Khayyam.” *Studies in the Formation and Dissemination of Foreign Literary Classics* Vol. 2. Beijing: Peking UP, 2015. 161-175.]
- : “十四行诗的生成、演变和传播”, 《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第2卷。北京: 北京大学出版社, 2019年, 第271-298页。  
[—.“The Generation, Evolution, and Dissemination of the Sonnet.” *Studies in the Formation and Dissemination of Foreign Literary Classics* Vol. 2. Beijing: Peking UP, 2015. 271-298.]
- : “翻译在外国文学经典生成与传播中的历史使命”, 《中国社会科学报》2019年9月10日, 第004版。  
[—.“The Historical Mission of Translation in Translation in the Generation and Dissemination of Foreign Literary Classics.” *Chinese Social Sciences Today* 10 September 2019: 4.]
- : “绪论·人类童年的悠远的回声”, 《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第2卷。北京: 北京大学出版社, 2019年, 第1-7页。  
[—.“Introduction: Long Echoes of Human Childhood.” *Studies in the Formation and Dissemination of Foreign Literary Classics* Vol. 2. Beijing: Peking UP, 2015. 1-7.]
- 周启超: “跨文化阐释: 路径与机制”, 《社会科学战线》1 (2024): 172-178。  
[Zhou Qichao. “Approaches to and Mechanism of Transcultural Hermeneutics.” *Social Science Front* 1 (2024): 172-178.]
- : “外位性与文学研究的人文化”, 《浙江大学学报》(人文社会科学版) 5 (2020): 129-136。  
[—.“Outsideness and the Humanitarianism of Literary Studies.” *Zhejiang University Journal (Humanities and Social Sciences)* 5 (2020): 129-136.]

# 经典再生与文化遗产：吴笛的跨媒介传播研究

## Classical Regeneration and Cultural Inheritance: Wu Di's Intermedia Communication Research

龙迪勇 (Long Diyong) 韩文文 (Han Wenwen)

**内容摘要：**吴笛教授基于翻译实践和外国文学研究，以跨媒介研究的视野审视经典文本的跨媒介传播，认为文字文本向影像文本的跨媒介转换，类似翻译学话语体系中的源语文本到译入语文本的转换。翻译从一种文字形式向另一种文字形式的转换，是对经典的一种“再创作”；跨媒介传播则利用图像、音像等媒介，使文字文本向视觉等其他文本转换，或者说从艺术的一种表现形式朝另一种表现形式转换，这相当于跨媒介意义上的“翻译”。源语文本在不断的翻译过程中获得再生，得以代代流传。跨媒介传播所引发的从文字文本到视觉等其他文本的变异，更是体现了源语文本生命的一种“再生”。从英美文学翻译实践到文学跨媒介传播研究，吴笛教授始终以跨界的多维视野，切实践行文学经典再生与文化遗产的使命。他时刻关注文学经典的传播与再生，他的翻译事业和学术研究，尤其是在国内率先开展的文学跨媒介传播研究，更是开风气之先，必将产生深远的学术影响。

**关键词：**吴笛；跨界思维；跨媒介传播；经典再生；文化遗产

**作者简介：**龙迪勇，东南大学首席教授、二级教授，艺术学院院长、中国故事与艺术媒介实验室负责人，主要从事叙事学、比较艺术学研究；韩文文，东南大学艺术学院博士研究生，主要从事艺术理论研究。本文为江苏省社科基金项目“英国文学在拉斐尔前派艺术中的跨媒介再现研究”【项目批号：22WWB005】的阶段性成果之一。

**Title:** Classical Regeneration and Cultural Inheritance: Wu Di's Intermedia Communication Research

**Abstract:** Professor Wu Di, based on the practice of translation and the studies of foreign literature, examines the cross-media dissemination of classical texts from the perspective of cross-media research, and believes that the cross-media conversion from written text to video text is similar to that from source language text to target language text in the discourse system of translation studies. Translation is a kind of “re-creation” of the classics in the sense of conversion from one textual form to another; cross-media dissemination makes use of images, audio and video

media to convert written texts to other texts such as visual texts, or to convert from one form of artistic expression to another, which is equivalent to translation in the cross-media sense. The source language text is regenerated in a continuous process of translation, allowing it to be transmitted from generation to generation. The variation from written texts to other texts, such as visual texts, triggered by cross-media communication is a reflection of the “regeneration” of the life of the source language text. From the practice of translation of English and American literature to the study of cross-media communication of literature, Professor Wu Di has always been practicing the mission of regeneration and cultural inheritance of literary classics with a cross-border multi-dimensional vision. He always pays attention to the dissemination and regeneration of literary classics, and his translation career and academic research, especially the cross-media literary communication research that he has pioneered in China, are the first of its kind, and will surely have far-reaching academic impact.

**Keywords:** Wu Di; cross-border thinking; intermedia communication; classical regeneration; cultural inheritance

**Authors:** Long Diyong is Chief Professor and Senior Professor of Southeast University (Nanjing 211189, China), Dean of the School of Arts, and Director of China Story and Art Media Laboratory. His major research areas include narratology and comparative arts (Email: ldy7073@126.com). Han Wenwen is a Ph.D. candidate at the School of Arts, Southeast University (Nanjing 211189, China). She mainly engages in research on art theory (Email: hww00710@163.com).

跨媒介研究近年来引起了国内外学术界的高度关注。无论是作为观念，还是作为方法，“跨媒介”都被广泛运用于文学、艺术等学术研究领域中。在中国知网以“跨媒介”为主题词进行检索，截至2024年10月20日，可以检索到2500余篇相关论文，仅2024年就已有383篇。与之相关的学术会议、论文论著、课题立项等更是层出不穷。无疑，“跨媒介”已经成为当下学术界最受瞩目的研究焦点之一。研究者们从不同视角，运用跨媒介相关理论与方法，对文艺门类中的跨媒介现象和跨媒介作品展开深入探讨和系统分析。其中，跨媒介叙事和跨媒介传播作为新的研究范式，尤其成为当前文学艺术研究中的热点话题。作为国内最早涉足跨媒介叙事研究的学者，本人早在2008年就组织召集了国内首届“跨媒介叙事”学术研讨会，在会上首次正式提出了“目前的叙事学研究已经出现了一种跨媒介趋势”（“叙事学研究的跨媒介趋势” 66）的观点。关于我的跨媒介叙事研究，感兴趣者可参考《跨媒介

叙事研究》一书<sup>1</sup>，此不赘述。本文主要考察吴笛教授的跨媒介传播研究。

### 一、文学翻译与“跨界”思维

吴笛主要从事英美文学、俄罗斯文学、比较文学研究，出版了《俄罗斯小说发展史》《英国玄学派诗歌研究》《哈代研究》等多部有影响的学术著作。除了学术研究，吴笛还从事文学翻译，主要翻译英俄文学名著，不仅翻译作品众多，且翻译风格独具特色，在译界享有很高声誉。吴笛的文学翻译与文学研究可谓相得益彰、相互促进，在某种意义上，我们甚至可以说：正是文学翻译锤炼了吴笛的“跨界”思维并促成了他的跨媒介传播研究，或者说，吴笛的跨媒介传播研究基于其多年成功的文学翻译实践。

作为译者，吴笛坚信翻译家的使命是极其重要、崇高的，译者不是一般意义上的“媒婆”，而是生命的创造者，翻译的过程就是不断创造生命的过程。吴笛在长期的翻译过程中培养了敏锐的“跨界”思维，这无形中促成了他对文学经典跨媒介传播的关注。他以翻译学的视角，来审视跨媒介传播，认为跨媒介传播如同文学翻译，使文学经典在新的传播途径和新的文化语境中获得新生。他基于翻译实践展开外国文学的研究，并以跨媒体视野多次在会议及文章中讨论文学经典的影视“翻译”、外国文学经典的跨媒体传播等问题。基于他这种特殊的跨媒介研究路径，本文拟以其翻译实践及其文学研究中的“跨界”思维为基础，更多地从他关注的外国文学经典的跨媒介传播展开论述。

从20世纪70年代末、80年代初刚踏上文学翻译之路时，吴笛就在翻译实践中注意到文学艺术的“跨界”特质。在1988年翻译出版的诗选《含泪的圆舞曲》中，他就已经注意到作为诗人的帕斯捷尔纳克风景抒情诗中的“画面感”和“音乐性”，认为帕斯捷尔纳克的诗歌其实是“美术”与“音乐”的复合体。在帕斯捷尔纳克（Boris Pasternak）的诗中，既描绘了雨过天晴、“太阳把光彩朝大地抛洒 / 绿色的叶儿晶莹滴翠”的视觉画面感；又营造了“钻出了林地”、发出丁冬颤音的小溪的节奏感和音韵感。<sup>2</sup>在其后关于雪莱（Percy Bysshe Shelley）抒情诗的两本译著中，他发现了雪莱自然抒情诗中迷人的音乐旋律。雪莱的诗歌，根据不同的情绪和主题需要，具有多变的节奏模式，韵脚变幻无穷，并配置头韵、内韵、叠句、元音相谐等多种艺术手段，从而产生出一种萦回往复的音调。尤其是一些较短的自然诗或爱情抒情诗，显得优美秀雅、富有迷人的音乐旋律。无论是《云》（“Cloud”，1820）中令人惊叹的出色的内韵，还是《西风颂》（“Ode to the West Wind”，1819）中的头韵和连锁韵律，都是为了表现行云之态或秋风之声，在声音和意义两个方面追

1 参见龙迪勇：《跨媒介叙事研究》，成都：四川大学出版社，2024年。《跨媒介叙事研究》一书出版之后，本人又发表了2篇相关论文，分别为“家族相似性、符号圈与艺术跨媒介叙事”（《中国文艺评论》2024年第6期）与“画意摄影的跨媒介叙事论析”（《美术》2024年第10期）。

2 参见吴笛：“译者前言”，《含泪的圆舞曲》，帕斯捷尔纳克著，力冈、吴笛译，芜湖：安徽师范大学出版社，1988年，第1-10、200-201、278-279页。

求高妙的诗歌境界。这种特殊的音乐功能，在《致云雀》（“To a Skylark”，1820）一诗中运用得尤为成功，诗中急促而又悠扬的节奏，给人造成一种动荡回旋的音乐美感。<sup>1</sup>

正是基于对诗歌特质和写作风格的敏锐感受，吴笛在翻译帕斯捷尔纳克、雪莱等诗人诗歌的实践中，努力用文学语言体现并传达源语文本的画面美感和声音内涵。<sup>2</sup>在帕斯捷尔纳克的《耕作》一诗中，吴笛以“新生的械树一尘不染，白桦穿着淡绿的旗袍，耕地披上浅灰的衣服（……）”（《含泪的圆舞曲》246），描绘出了一幅逼真、如画般的景象。雪莱《西风颂》中每一节十四行诗，都采用了但丁《神曲》式的aba、bcb、cdc、ded、ee的“连锁韵律”与英国十四行诗相结合的方式，吴笛在译文中也保留了这种韵式，来传达前后呼应、层层推进的豪放气势和雄浑意境。在翻译雪莱《致云雀》一诗，更是注重以时急时缓的语言节奏，模拟了云雀的歌声，塑造了云雀腾地而起以及鸣声自天而降的音乐性形象。<sup>3</sup>

凭借着卓越的翻译技巧和诗性感觉，吴笛相继翻译出版了多部诗歌及长篇小说、中篇小说译作。进入21世纪之后，他的工作重心从外国文学翻译转向了外国文学和比较文学研究。30余部外国文学经典著作的翻译积累，使得他对大量的文学文本和理论文献资料驾驭自如，也使得他在文学研究中游刃有余、新意迭出。<sup>4</sup>正如吴笛所说，他的不少英国文学研究著作，其实都是基于文学翻译实践而展开的，比如《哈代研究》（1994）和《哈代新论》（2009），就是基于《哈代抒情诗选》和《苔丝》等哈代诗歌和小说翻译实践基础上完成的两部学术专著。<sup>5</sup>确实，翻译本身就是一种跨文化、跨语言、跨媒介的“跨界”行为，而自觉的“跨界”思维，使吴笛在外国文学研究中不断拓展疆域，取得了丰硕的研究成果：就文学体裁而言，他兼顾小说和诗歌研究；就语种而言，他全面发挥精通多种语言的优势，同时聚焦诗歌艺术成就较高的国家或民族，对英语文学和俄语文学展开重点研究；就研究方法而言，他具有敏锐而自觉的“跨界”比较意识，涉及面广，研究视野开阔。<sup>6</sup>

总之，吴笛在长期的翻译实践过程中，深刻意识到外国文学经典研究要

1 参见吴笛：“序”，《雪莱抒情小诗》，雪莱著，杭州：浙江文艺出版社，1992年，第4-8页；雪莱：《雪莱抒情小诗》，吴笛译，杭州：浙江文艺出版社，1992年，第9-16页。

2 参见赵燕：“英美诗歌研究的多维视野——吴笛教授访谈录”，《英美文学研究论丛》2（2023）：10。

3 参见吴笛：“序”，《雪莱抒情小诗》，雪莱著，杭州：浙江文艺出版社，1992年，第4-8页；雪莱：《雪莱抒情小诗》，吴笛译，杭州：浙江文艺出版社，1992年，第161-165、236-241页。

4 参见魏仁：“学术人生的盎然诗意——吴笛的外国文学经典翻译与研究”，《文化正义论丛》第3辑，何勤华、傅守祥编，杭州：浙江大学出版社，2015年，第152页。

5 参见王娅婷、吴笛：“基于翻译实践的外国文学研究——吴笛教授访谈录”，《山东外语教学》1（2024）：2-3。

6 参见赵燕：“英美诗歌研究的多维视野——吴笛教授访谈录”，《英美文学研究论丛》2（2023）：7-8。

在原有的基础上取得突破，迫切需要研究者具有多维视野和“跨界”思维，这不仅包括文学“内部研究”的审美视野，也包括认知批评等“外部研究”的跨界视野，只有通过这样的多维拓展，才能不断挖掘出文学经典的价值，从而体现文学研究的真正意义之所在。在其研究中，吴笛从“生态伦理批评”“文学法律批评”以及“文学跨媒介批评”等新的视角阐释了英美诗歌研究的多维视野。<sup>1</sup> 比如在《哈代新论》一书中，他汲取生态批评、心理学批评等批评技巧，并结合比较文学中的跨文化研究、影响研究等批评方法，对哈代思想和创作规律进行了新的探究；尤其是从跨媒介视角，考察了哈代作品在影视改编过程中所出现的“误读”“误译”等重要问题。<sup>2</sup> 这些新视角下的“跨界”研究均颇具特色、观点新颖、令人信服，为外国文学和比较文学研究打开了新思路、提供了新路径。

## 二、跨媒介传播与文学经典再生

早在 21 世纪初，吴笛就曾在一场题为“跨媒体视野中的世界文学——从影片《苔丝》谈起”的讲座中指出：现代学者除了对传统媒介的关注，也应对纸媒以外的传播产品进行“介入”。他以哈代的小说《苔丝》为例，认为这部经典作品仅仅依靠传统的纸质媒介进行传播，难以达到理想的地步，更广泛的传播靠的更应该是跨越传统纸质媒体之外的其他媒介，如经过影视机构改编的视频媒介、电台的声音媒介、还有网络上的电子文本等。不仅如此，世界文学的跨媒介欣赏，也不仅是通过一种媒介形式来接受某部作品，还要顾及文字、声音、影像等各个方面的因素。从跨媒介视角，结合文字、音响、画面、图像等多种媒介，发挥综合的作用，欣赏效果要远远好于单纯的、传统的文字等单一媒体。<sup>3</sup>

吴笛认为，传播的快慢直接关系到人类的发展与文明的进程，随着时代的发展，传统的世界文学传播产品已经难以满足人们日益增长的文化需求。因此，他提出：“外国文学经典研究应从纸质文本的单一媒介流传转向音乐美术、影视动漫、网络电子的复合型的跨媒体流传（……）研究外国文学经典，局限于纸质文本的范畴也已经很难适应时代的发展。从跨媒介的视野来介入外国文学经典的研究，介入新的外国文学经典传播载体的研究，既是一个崭新的研究领域，也是外国文学学者的历史使命”（“外国文学经典研究的转向与拓展” A07 版）。而且，通过跨媒介传播，文学经典也获得了“再生”。

1 关于此类研究方法，可参见吴笛：《英国玄学派诗歌研究》，北京：中国社会科学出版社，2013年；吴笛：“文学法律批评 VS 法律与文学”，《社会科学文摘》12（2021）：118-120；吴笛：“论休斯诗中的生态伦理思想”，《外国文学》3（2023）：14-23；吴笛：“论布尔加科夫‘魔幻三部曲’中的科技伦理与科学选择”，《外国文学研究》5（2019）：52-60。

2 参见吴笛：《哈代新论》，杭州：浙江大学出版社，2009年。

3 参见吴笛：“跨媒体视野中的世界文学”，《浙江人文大讲堂》第2辑，浙江省社会科学界联合会、钱江晚报编，杭州：浙江科学技术出版社，2007年，第101-106页。

### （一）跨媒介传播的特征

任何事物的传播都需要媒介。“媒介”一词，在不同的情境、不同的条件下，具有不同的意义属性，但无论从哪个层面上看，“媒介”都是社会信息系统不可或缺的重要环节，也是文学经典得以流传的根本渠道。人类的文学经典从生成到传播，经历了多个传播阶段和多种传播方式，如口头传播、表演传播、文字传播、影像传播、网络传播等。从最开始的口耳相传到平面媒体，到之后的影视媒介、网络传播，文学经典经历了多种媒介的变换和发展。正如吴笛所言，当代的网络传播与之前的纸质文本相比，只是一种传播形式的改变，并不改变其文学内涵。网络传播利用图像扫描和文字识别等技术，将纸质文本经典以电子文本的形式进行传播，而电子文本一经打印就是纸质文本，所以没有本质性区别。而影像传播，包括美术传播、影视传播等，就不一样了，它们可以利用绘画、雕塑、动画等媒介对经典文本进行跨艺术或跨媒介传播。这种传播文本在内容上已经有别于原先的文本，因此是一种典型的跨媒介传播。

吴笛从翻译学的视角，来审视跨媒介传播的特征。从文字文本向影像文本的跨媒介转换，类似于翻译学话语体系中的源语文本到译入语文本的转换过程。翻译是从一种文字形式向另一种文字形式的转换；跨媒介传播则利用图像、音像、视频等媒介，使文字文本向视觉文本转换，或者说，从艺术的一种表现形式朝另一种表现形式转换，这其实就相当于媒介意义的“翻译”。如果说，翻译使文学经典获得新的生命，使文学经典再经典化；那么，由跨媒介传播所引发的从文字文本向视觉文本的转换或变异，更是体现了“源语”文本生命的一种超越媒介的“再生”。<sup>1</sup>

### （二）跨媒介传播的途径

无论一部文学作品本身多么精彩，如果没有有效的传播途径，就很难成为经典。文学经典之所以具有经久不衰的艺术魅力和永恒的生命力，事实上与其传播途径密切相关。

吴笛认为跨媒介传播是文字文本、音像文本、影像文本三种形式的结合，是对这古老的“三位一体”的重新认识。其中，音乐传播是以音像文本为根基，美术传播、影视传播，都是属于影像文本或视觉艺术传播的范畴。他以外国文学经典但丁的《神曲》为例，总结了跨媒介传播的三个途径：美术传播、音乐传播、影视传播。

《神曲》作为一部杰出的文学经典，其宏大的神圣主题、崇高的意境和高超的艺术水准使得这部作品在中世纪广为流传，并且深深地影响了后世的文学创作。随后更是以跨媒介的形式广为传播，极大地影响了影视、动漫、绘画、音乐、雕塑等多个艺术领域的创作活动，在长达七个世纪的时间里为无

<sup>1</sup> 参见 吴笛：“文学经典的影视‘翻译’”，《中国社会科学报》2024年1月24日，第A05版。

数的艺术家提供了创作的灵感和构思的源泉，从而不仅在文学史上也在艺术史上成为跨艺术传播或跨媒介传播的一个优秀范例。<sup>1</sup>

首先是美术传播。美术传播又分为绘画传播和雕塑传播。文学与绘画之间有着千丝万缕的关系，尤其是诗歌与绘画，无论是文艺复兴时期的米开朗琪罗（Michelangelo Buonarroti）、18世纪英国的布莱克（William Blake）和19世纪的但丁·罗塞蒂（Dante Gabriel Rossetti），都是集绘画与诗歌于一身的大师；无论是19世纪英国的拉斐尔前派，还是20世纪欧美的达达主义、立体主义、未来主义和超现实主义，都是诗歌与绘画合而为一的文学-美术运动。就但丁的作品而言，《神曲》的绘画传播主要体现在插图作品、油画作品与壁画作品三个方面。

在插图方面，早在14世纪，当但丁的《神曲》以手抄本形式得以流传时，就有艺术家或出于自身喜爱或受命权贵为《神曲》作插图。其后，几乎每个世纪都有为《神曲》作插图的艺术家。其中著名的有：15世纪的意大利画家古列尔莫·吉拉尔迪（Guglielmo Giralardi）、波提切利（Sandro Botticelli）、米开朗琪罗，18世纪的意大利画家萨巴泰利（Luigi Sabatelli）、皮内利（Bartolomeo Pinelli），19世纪的瑞士画家富利斯（Henry Fuseli）、德国画家科赫（Joseph Anton Koch）、法国画家多雷（Gustave Doré），20世纪的西班牙画家达利（Salvador Dalí）、英国画家巴滕（John Dickson Batten），等等。这些不同时代的艺术家都以自己独特的艺术手法展现出关于《神曲》的生动想象。在20世纪的《神曲》插图作品中，最具代表性的是西班牙超现实主义画家达利。他在1951至1960年间，共创作了101幅阐释但丁《神曲》的水彩画，之后这些作品又以木刻术进行了重新处理，构成100幅版画。他的插图线条明快、色彩和谐，既具有非现实的细节真实，又具有立体的美感和超现实主义的风格，写实手法与超现实的形象融为一体，给人带来一种强烈的视觉冲击，恰如其分地体现了但丁《神曲》独特的表现手法和梦魇般的地狱场景。英国诗人兼画家布莱克同样是一位不可忘却的重要人物，他的插图更多是从《神曲》中获取精神内核，服务于自己的美术创作，其中以水彩画等形式创作的《神曲》图像，可以看成一部独立成篇的画集。在油画创作领域，但丁的《神曲》影响了英国画家亨利·霍利兑（Henry Holiday）、但丁·罗塞蒂等多位拉斐尔前派艺术家的创作。在壁画作品方面，但丁的《神曲》对后世基督教绘画中的“末日审判”题材创作产生了深远的影响。比如，乔托（Giotto di Bondone）在1303-1305年间在帕多瓦的斯科罗韦尼礼拜堂绘制的《末日审判》（*Last Judgment*）右下部，描绘了地狱里的恐怖景象，与但丁《神曲·地狱篇》的描述十分吻合。安德烈亚·奥卡格纳（Andrea del Orcagna）在佛罗伦萨新圣母教堂斯特罗齐祈祷室的大幅壁画《末日审判》，在整体构思方面都受到了《神

1 参见吴笛：“但丁《神曲》的跨媒体传播及其变异”，《外国文学研究》5（2015）：88-94。

曲》的影响。同样受到影响的，还有米开朗琪罗、多梅尼科·迪·米凯利诺（Domenico di Michelino）、拉斐尔（Raffaello Santi）等艺术家的壁画作品。到了19世纪，更有德国科赫（Koch）创作的马西莫别墅壁画《地狱》（*Hell*），以及德国魏特（Veit）创作的马西莫别墅天顶画《天堂》（*Heaven*），这些作品使得《神曲》题材的壁画达到了新的高度，堪称西方艺术家的“神曲世纪”。

此外，在美术领域中大家关注比较少的雕塑，也与文学有着深厚的渊源。吴笛认为，在雕塑领域，但丁的《神曲》深深影响了罗丹（Auguste Rodin）的创作。他的雕塑群《地狱之门》（*The Gates of Hell*）、《保罗与弗兰采斯卡》（*Paolo and Francesca*）以及青铜雕塑《思想者》（*The Thinker*），就是受到《神曲》启发而创作的，这些雕塑作品在雕塑领域和艺术领域均享有盛誉，也是但丁《神曲》的跨媒介传播作品。

其次是音乐传播。在人类艺术的起始阶段，文学就与音乐紧密相连，原始劳动歌谣的一个重要特征便是诗歌、音乐、舞蹈三者的合而为一，是三位一体的混合艺术。文学与音乐之间的古老渊源，使得文学经典，尤其是经典诗歌以及篇幅宏大的其他文学作品，常常被谱曲，从而以音乐的形式广为流传。尤其是匈牙利作曲家李斯特（Franz Liszt），在《但丁交响曲》（*Dante Symphony*）中以狂野粗糙的铜管和祥和宁静弦乐的对比，构成了这部作品情绪上的基调，并通过音响色块的梦幻般变幻，勾勒出《神曲》所要表达的可怖的地狱场景。

再次是影视传播。吴笛认为文学经典的影视改编是文学经典得以流传的重要途径。文学经典以电影改编的形式获得关注，成为影像改编的重要资源，经典从此又以新的形式出现，并具有了新的生命形态。而影视作品的受众面更广，这为文学经典的传播创造了极好的契机，使得文学经典中的精神文化内涵能够更为有效地传播，更为深入人心。<sup>1</sup>在影视传播方面，根据《神曲》所改编的影视作品流传广泛，不仅很好地传播了《神曲》这一经典文学文本，也为影视产业的发展做出了应有的贡献。总之，从但丁《神曲》的跨媒介传播这个优秀范例中，吴笛认为：经典文学文本不仅为美术、音乐、影视作品的创作提供了丰富的素材和无限的想象，其自身也在这些“新”媒体的跨界传播中得以再生、升华和不朽。

### （三）跨媒介传播的原则

关于跨媒介传播的原则，吴笛认为同样可以从翻译学的一般概念中获得启示。从翻译学的角度审视文字文本向影像文本等的转换，要关注的其实也是类似于翻译学话语体系中的源语文本和译入语文本的问题。因此，两者之间的对话关系及其契合度，是跨媒介传播研究应当考量的重要方面。<sup>2</sup>

作为一名译者，吴笛认为能否忠实于原著精神，是衡量译本得失的一个

1 参见吴笛：“文学经典的影视‘翻译’”，《中国社会科学报》2024年1月24日，第A05版。

2 参见吴笛：“文学经典的影视‘翻译’”，《中国社会科学报》2024年1月24日，第A05版。

重要条件。他在翻译实践中不止一次提出，翻译时首先要做到的就是忠实于源语文本。在诗歌翻译中，他说自己追求的就是：“最小限度地丧失或最大限度地保存诗之所以为诗的东西，力图以诗歌本文所提供的信息为依据，用准确、流畅、凝练、较为贴近读者的语言。最大可能地传达原诗的形式和内容”（《雪莱抒情小诗·序》8）。在翻译小说时，他也指出：由于各种不同的语言都有其丰富的词汇、严密的语法结构和极强的表现力，而且各个民族都有自己的文化语境，自己的风土人情、思维方式和生存习惯，所以在翻译过程中，要忠实于原作，不能随意发挥，做到译文准确、严谨，合乎规范，译文所传达的信息内容与原文保持高度一致。<sup>1</sup>对于跨媒介传播这一媒介意义的“翻译”来说，吴笛认为作为一个“译者”，同样也应该尊重源语文本，尽可能减少一些“译者”的风格。对于跨媒介传播研究来说，是否忠实于原著的思想内涵，同样是衡量“译本”得失的一个重要方面。他以法国导演罗曼·波兰斯基（Roman Polanski）对哈代的《德伯家的苔丝》所改编的电影为例指出：为了渲染男女主人公的“浪漫情感”，影片以成双结对的天鹅在湖面漫游进行映衬，电影画面固然很美，但这样的处理不仅严重背离了原著的精神，而且也损害了观众的审美体验。<sup>2</sup>

在译本应忠实于源语文本的前提下，吴笛指出：在翻译过程中，译者既要忠实于原作，不能随意发挥；也要把握作品的神韵，不能拘泥于字面意思，应做到形神兼顾。文学翻译作为一种高强度的脑力劳动，不是语法加字典、剪刀加浆糊般的简单的技术性工作，也不是逐字逐句的机械的语言转换，而是需要译者根据原作的内涵，通过自己的创造性劳动，用另一种语言再现出原作的精神和风采来。因此，在尊重译者的创造性劳动的同时，也应避免译文的死板生硬，在原文的限定下，还应体现译者的风格。<sup>3</sup>而要做到神与形的完美结合，就要在译入语丰富的语言矿产中，探寻、挖掘和选择恰当的语料。就拿诗歌和小说翻译来说，作为两种不同的文学体裁，在翻译时要注意的差异是多方面的。小说作品的基本特性是“讲故事”，服从于一定的思想内容，具有明晰的情节性，所以小说翻译主要讲究的是传达原作的内容和思想，尤其是小说的情节；而诗歌作品，无论是韵文体还是无韵体，情节都不是首要的，因此诗歌翻译更重要的是传达诗歌从意象中升华而出的意境和情感以及诗歌构成要素中的韵律、节奏等音乐特质。也就是说，小说翻译主要是传达“意义”，诗歌翻译则需要传达呈现意义的“声音”。<sup>4</sup>

在这种翻译原则的指导下，吴笛认为：在跨媒介传播中，由于作为文学作品的语言艺术与作为绘画、雕塑、电影等视觉艺术，在媒介特质上有着各

1 参见吴笛：《浙籍翻译家翻译艺术》，杭州：浙江大学出版社，2009年，第221页。

2 参见吴笛：“文学经典的影视‘翻译’”，《中国社会科学报》2024年1月24日，第A05版。

3 参见吴笛：《浙籍翻译家翻译艺术》，杭州：浙江大学出版社，2009年，第221页。

4 参见赵燕：“英美诗歌研究的多维视野——吴笛教授访谈录”，《英美文学研究论丛》2（2023）：9-10。

自不同的特点，因此也不能以是否忠实于文学原著作为评判“译作”成功与否的绝对标准，但原著的精神是不能违背的。

总之，在吴笛看来，无论是文学文本的跨语言翻译还是文学与艺术之间的跨媒介“翻译”，由于国家、语言、文化、媒介等方面的差异以及我们认识能力的局限，在“翻译”过程中很难达到完全的等值，也很难绝对地遵循某一标准。但是，译者在把源文本信息向读者传递的过程中，首先应对译文的忠实、包括对原作精神和结构等要素的精准传达放在重要位置；其次，在特殊的情况下也不应过分拘泥，应注意“译作”自身特殊的审美价值和艺术规律，尤其是对文学与艺术间的跨媒介“翻译”更应考虑这方面的特殊性；此外，译者还应根据实际情况，如不同受众的生活经历和文化修养等，选择恰当的“翻译”方法，力求取得理想的传达和传播效果。

### 三、跨媒介传播与文化传承

从纸草、泥板，到印刷、影视，再到电子网络，经典文本的传播途径与人类的进步以及科学技术的发展是同步而行的，传播途径的变化不仅促使了经典文本的流传和普及，也在一定的意义上折射了人类文明的历史进程。正是由于文本翻译和“跨媒介”翻译，以文学经典为代表的优秀文化才得以不断流传和再生，从而滋养着一代又一代人的精神和灵魂。

对于吴笛而言，翻译所承担的使命就是真正意义上的文化传承。翻译是源语文本获得再生的重要途径，纵观世界文学史的杰作，基本上都是在翻译中获得再生的。从古埃及、古巴比伦、古希腊罗马等一系列文学经典来看，没有翻译就没有经典。如果说源语创作是文学文本的今生，那么今生的生命是极为短暂的，是受到限定的；正是翻译，使得文学文本获得今生之后的“来生”。文学经典在不断被翻译的过程中获得“新生”和强大的生命力。因此，文学翻译不只是一种语言文字符号之间的转换，而且是一种以另一种生命形态存在的文艺创作，是本雅明所认为的那种原文作品的“再生”。<sup>1</sup>

然而，随着时间的推移和语言的变化，文学经典的翻译必然要适应时代的变革和需求，因此，跨媒介传播对经典文本的“重译”不仅体现了传播的需求，也通过这些新媒体使得经典得以传承，获得普及，从而获得新的生命。越来越多的事实说明，电子和信息技术的推广运用，对人类文化的存在形态造成了巨大冲击，文化的生产、传播和接受方式乃至人的思维和知觉方式正经历一次史无前例的变革。在电子时代，文字日益失去其优越性和优先地位，电视屏幕和电脑网络逐渐取代书本，成为最基本、最重要的文化传播媒体，它改变了人的知觉、思维、行为和认知方式；它的全面普及和运用，将导致以

1 参见吴笛：“总序”，《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第2卷，吴笛总主编，北京：北京大学出版社，2019年，第7-8页。

文字为基本媒介的文化形态让位于以图像为基本形态的视觉文化。<sup>1</sup>就拿文学经典的影视传播来说,在世界各国,文学经典是影视改编的重要来源,为许许多多的改编者提供了创作素材和灵感源泉。自1900年文学经典《灰姑娘》被搬上银幕之后,影视创作就开始积极地从文学中汲取灵感。据美国学者林达·赛格统计,高达85%的奥斯卡最佳影片都是改编自经典文学作品。<sup>2</sup>从根据古希腊《荷马史诗》改编的影片《特洛伊》(*Troy*),以及根据文艺复兴时期莎士比亚戏剧经典《哈姆雷特》改编的《王子复仇记》(*The Tragedy of Hamlet, Prince of Denmark*),直到根据20世纪帕斯捷尔纳克的长篇小说而改编的同名电影《日瓦戈医生》(*Doctor Zhivago*);从外国根据中国文学经典改编的《功夫熊猫》(*Kung Fu Panda*)、《花木兰》(*Mulan*),直到中国根据外国文学经典改编的《钢铁是怎样炼成的》……文学经典的影视改编可谓无所不在,文学经典为影视改编提供了丰富的素材,这些新媒体也使得文学经典得以传承,获得普及,从而获得新的生命。<sup>3</sup>从这些成功的改编案例可以看出,诸如电影改编等跨媒介传播手段对文学经典原著起到的宣传及传播功效不容忽视,它为文学经典的艺术性再造提供了丰富的可能性,促使一度被冷落、被边缘化的文学再度获得大众的广泛关注。从这个意义上说,文学经典的跨媒介改编和传播,其实就是一种真正意义上的文化传承和跨文化交流活动,具有极其重要的文化价值。

换一个角度来看,文学经典脱离文本,以影像替代文字,也是文学经典本身在新的时代和文化语境下的涅槃。影视使得文学经典以一种更为鲜活的方式重现,以一种更为有效的传播手段得到更多的观众认可;影视作品利用其简洁明了、通俗易懂的表现形式,及其现代媒介的传播优势,成功地将大量的影视观众转化成了小说读者,从而提升了作家和小说的知名度。<sup>4</sup>比如,英国作家哈代对世界文化的影响是多方面的,由他的小说所改编的许多影视作品,同样取得了极为罕见的成功。自1913年他的长篇小说《苔丝》在美国改编成无声黑白电影并成功上演起,到新世纪英国面世的由拉夫兰德(Nicholas Laughland)执导的《绿荫之下》(*Under the Greenwood Tree, 2005*)为止,哈代一些重要的长篇小说和部分短篇小说已经被改编成的影视作品高达30多种,他的长篇小说《远离尘嚣》(*Far from the Madding Crowd*)、《卡斯特桥市长》(*The Mayor of Casterbridge*)、《绿荫之下》(*Under the Greenwood Tree*)、《无名的裘德》(*Jude the obscure*)、《还乡》(*The Return of the*

1 参见吴笛总主编:《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第1卷,北京:北京大学出版社,2019年,第314页。

2 参见吴笛:“总序”,《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第2卷,吴笛总主编,北京:北京大学出版社,2019年,第11页。

3 参见吴笛:“文学经典的影视‘翻译’”,《中国社会科学报》2024年1月24日,第A05版。

4 参见吴笛总主编:《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第1卷,北京:北京大学出版社,2019年,第325页。

*Native*)、《林地居民》(*The Woodlanders*)等,都先后被改编成电影和电视连续剧,尤其是他的代表作《苔丝》,先后6次被改编成影视作品。他的《维塞克斯故事》(*Wessex Tales*)、《萎缩的胳膊》(*The Withered Arm*)、《两种野心的悲剧》(*A Tragedy of Two Ambitions*)等中短篇小说也被改编成多种电视剧。在吴笛看来,这些跨媒介改编不仅是在普及哈代及其文学作品,尤其是在文化传承方面起到了非常重要的作用。<sup>1</sup>

正如吴笛所说,既然认识到了“翻译”所承载的历史使命,那么,我们的研究视野也应相应发生转向,即由“文学翻译”研究朝“翻译文学”研究转向。翻译文学的核心意义在于不再将“外国文学”看成“外国的文学”,而是将其看成民族文学的一个组成部分,是民族文化建设的有机整体,将所翻译的文学作品看成是我国民族文化事业的一个重要的组成部分。<sup>2</sup>在对外国文学经典进行研究时,应从“外向型”研究转向关注中外文化交流和民族文化身份建构与民族形象重塑。研究外国文学经典在中国的传播,目的不是单纯地引进外国文化,而是要服务于中国自身的文化建设。通过外国文学经典的中国传播,以及面向世界的学术环境和行之有效的中外文化交流,将外国文学经典的传播看成是中华民族思想解放和发展历程的折射,进而重塑文化中国的伟大形象。<sup>3</sup>由此看来,经由跨媒介传播再生的国外经典作品也应该得到我们的高度关注,我们既要着眼于对经典文本在原生地的生成和变异研究,更要通过对国外文学经典的译介及其跨媒介传播研究,以中华文化立场及其阔大的包容力,将之汲取为建设我国文化事业的宝贵财富,使之成为我国自身文化思想的有机组成部分。由此看来,跨媒介传播研究是关乎文化传承和文化建设的大事。

各民族之间的文化交流,其目的就是为了文明互鉴、相互吸收有益的成分,从而“各美其美”,促进自身的文化建设。就拿文学来说,外国文学极大地影响了中国现当代文学的进程;反过来,中国文学也对现当代外国文学产生了潜移默化的深刻影响。以英美诗歌为例,英美意象派诗歌就受到中国文化的重要影响。意象派诗歌的诗体改革,以及音节、音步等相关概念的革新,都与中国文化的影响密切相关。这也是中国文化对外传播的意义所在。<sup>4</sup>而随着时代的发展,传统的世界文学传播产品已经不能满足人们日益增长的文化需求了。历史和现实中的很多事例均表明,超越纸质文本的跨媒介性“介

1 参见吴笛:“《苔丝》的生成与传播”,《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第5卷,吴笛总主编,北京:北京大学出版社,2019年,第218-219页。

2 参见吴笛:“总序”,《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》第2卷,吴笛总主编,北京:北京大学出版社,2019年,第10页。

3 参见吴笛:“外国文学经典研究的转向与拓展”,《中国社会科学报》2011年11月10日,第A07版。

4 参见王娅婷、吴笛:“基于翻译实践的外国文学研究——吴笛教授访谈录”,《山东外语教学》1(2024):8。

入”，对传播世界经典文学作品所起到的作用，是不可估量的。同样，我们中华民族的优秀文化和经典文学作品要想走向世界，也不可忽视跨媒介传播所起的重要作用。这其实也正是吴笛教授的跨媒介传播研究所昭示给我们的学术道理和文化思考。

### 结语

作为一位勤勤恳恳且成就卓越的“资深翻译家”，吴笛始终以一颗赤诚之心对待为之奉献毕生精力的文学翻译事业。作为一位紧随时代的学者，吴笛时刻关注文学经典的传播与再生，他的翻译事业和学术研究，尤其是他在国内率先开展的文学跨媒介传播研究，更是开风气之先，必将产生深远的学术影响。

吴笛的跨媒介传播研究，旨在关注经典文学文本在影视等跨媒介传播过程中所获得的流传和再生；而他作为一位资深翻译家，一开始就坚信翻译的使命就在于使源文本在新的文化语境中得到传播和再生。回顾吴笛所走的学术之路，从传统翻译到跨媒介“翻译”，他面临的是文学语言和传播媒介的不断流变，不变的则是他对文学经典再生理念的坚守与传承文化使命的初心。事实上，吴笛对学术初心的坚守，就像最初翻译的诗集《野天鹅》中首尾呼应的“回旋曲式”书名一样萦绕回旋：《野天鹅》不只是一首诗，而是不同作者的两首诗；全书的编排则是自一首《野天鹅》始，至另一首《野天鹅》终……正如飞白先生所言：“我们仿佛看见一群野天鹅组成的‘破碎的环’在湖上飞舞，它们翅膀的闪闪白光时而远去，时而审新回归，很久很久，它们的影子还在眼前不肯消逝”（《野天鹅》 1-2）。

### Works Cited

龙迪勇：“画意摄影的跨媒介叙事论析”，《美术》10（2024）：106-119。

[Long Diyong. “An Analysis of Inter-media Narrative in Pictorial Photography.” *Art Magazine* 10 (2024): 106-119.]

——：“家族相似性、符号圈与艺术跨媒介叙事”，《中国文艺评论》6（2024）：44-68+126-127。

[—.“Family Resemblance, Semiosphere and Intermedia Narratives in Art.” *China Literature and Art Criticism* 6 (2024): 44-68+126-127.]

——：“叙事学研究的跨媒介趋势——‘跨媒介叙事’学术研讨会综述”，《江西社会科学》8（2008）：57-66。

[—.“Intermedia Trends in Narrative Studies: A Review of the Academic Symposium on ‘Intermedia Narrative.’” *Jiangxi Social Science* 8 (2008): 57-66.]

——：《跨媒介叙事研究》。成都：四川大学出版社，2024年。

[—.*Research on Intermedia Narrative*. Chengdu: Sichuan UP, 2024.]

- 帕斯捷尔纳克：《含泪的圆舞曲》，力冈、吴笛译。芜湖：安徽师范大学出版社，2008年。  
[Pasternak, Boris. *A Tearful Waltz*, translated by Li Gang and Wu Di. Wuhu: Anhui Normal UP, 2008.]
- 雪莱：《雪莱抒情诗全集》，吴笛译。杭州：浙江文艺出版社，1994年。  
[Shelley, Percy Bysshe. *The Complete Lyrical Poems of P. B. Shelley*, translated by Wu Di. Hangzhou: Zhejiang Literature and Art Press, 1994.]
- ：《雪莱抒情小诗》，吴笛译。杭州：浙江文艺出版社，1992年。  
[— *The Poetical Works of Percy Bysshe Shelley*, translated by Wu Di. Hangzhou: Zhejiang Literature and Art Press, 1992.]
- 王娅婷、吴笛：“基于翻译实践的外国文学研究——吴笛教授访谈录”，《山东外语教学》1(2024)：1-8。  
[Wang Yating and Wu Di. “Exploration of Foreign Literature through Translation Practices: An Interview with Professor Wu Di.” *Shandong Foreign Language Teaching* 1 (2024): 1-8.]
- 魏仁：“学术人生的盎然诗意——吴笛的外国文学经典翻译与研究”，《文化正义论丛》第3辑，何勤华、傅守祥编。杭州：浙江大学出版社，2015年，第146-155页。  
[Wei Ren. “The Abundant Poetry of Academic Life: Wu Di’s Translation and Study of Foreign Literature Classics.” *Cultural Justice Forum* Vol. 3, edited by He Qinhu and Fu Shouxiang. Hangzhou: Zhejiang UP, 2015. 146-155.]
- 吴笛：“但丁《神曲》的跨媒体传播及其变异”，《外国文学研究》5(2015)：88-94。  
[Wu Di. “The Inter-media Transmission of Dante’s *The Divine Comedy* and Its Variation.” *Foreign Literature Studies* 5 (2015): 88-94.]
- ：“文学法律批评 VS 法律与文学”，《社会科学文摘》12(2021)：118-120。  
[— “Legal Literary Criticism VS Law and Literature.” *Social Sciences Digest* 12 (2021): 118-120.]
- ：《哈代新论》。杭州：浙江大学出版社，2009年。  
[— *New Studies in Thomas Hardy*. Hangzhou: Zhejiang UP, 2009.]
- ：《浙籍翻译家翻译艺术》。杭州：浙江大学出版社，2009年。  
[— *Studies in the Art of Translation of Zhejiang Writers*. Hangzhou: Zhejiang UP, 2009.]
- ：《外国文学经典生成与传播研究》8卷集。北京：北京大学出版社，2019年。  
[— *Studies in the Formation and Dissemination of Foreign Literary Classics* in 8 vols. Beijing: Peking UP, 2019.]
- ：《英国玄学派诗歌研究》。北京：中国社会科学出版社，2013年。  
[— *A Study on British Metaphysical Poetry*. Beijing: China Social Sciences Press, 2013.]
- ：“论休斯诗中的生态伦理思想”，《外国文学》3(2023)：14-23。  
[— “A Study of the Ecological Ethical Thoughts in Ted Hughes’ Poems.” *Foreign Literature* 3 (2023): 14-23.]
- ：“论司各特《密得洛西恩监狱》中的法律伦理思想”，《外国文学研究》4(2024)：125-135。  
[— “A Study of the Legal Ethics in Scott’s *The Heart of Midlothian*.” *Foreign Literature Studies* 4

(2024): 125-135.]

——：“论布尔加科夫‘魔幻三部曲’中的科技伦理与科学选择”，《外国文学研究》5（2019）：52-60。

[—.“A Study of the Scientific Ethics and Scientific Selection in Mikhail Bulgakov’s ‘The Fantasy Trilogy.’” *Foreign Literature Studies* 5 (2019): 52-60.]

——：“文学经典的影视‘翻译’”，《中国社会科学报》2024年1月24日，第A05版。

[—.“‘Translation’ of Literary Classics in Film and Television.” *Chinese Social Sciences Today* 24 January 2014: A05.]

——：“外国文学经典研究的转向与拓展”，《中国社会科学报》2011年11月10日，第A07版。

[—.“The Turn and Expansion of Research on Foreign Literature Classics.” *Chinese Social Sciences Today* 10 September 2011: A07.]

——：《野天鹅——20世纪外国抒情诗100首》。哈尔滨：黑龙江人民出版社，1988年。

[—.*Wild Swan: 100 Foreign Lyrical Poems of the 20<sup>th</sup> Century*. Harbin: Heilongjiang People’s Publishing House, 1988.]

——：“跨媒体视野中的世界文学”，《浙江人文大讲堂》第2辑，浙江省社会科学界联合会、钱江晚报编。杭州：浙江科学技术出版社，2007年，第101-106页。

[—.“World Literature from a Intermedia Perspective.” *Zhejiang Humanities Lecture Hall* Vol. 2, edited by Zhejiang Federation of Humanities and Social Sciences Circles and *Qianjiang Evening News*. Hangzhou: Zhejiang Science Technology Publishing House, 2007. 101-106.]

吴笛、陈逢丹：“论司各特小说中的冤狱书写与法律理想”，《浙江学刊》5（2024）：101-108+239。

[Wu Di and Chen Fengdan. “A Study of the Unfair Trials and the Legal Ideal in Scott’s Novels.” *Zhejiang Academic Journal* 5 (2024): 101-108+239.]

赵燕：“英美诗歌研究的多维视野——吴笛教授访谈录”，《英美文学研究论丛》2（2023）：1-11+406。

[Zhao Yan. “Multidimensional Perspectives in the Study of English and American Poetry: An Interview with Professor Wu Di.” *English and American Literary Studies* 2 (2023): 1-11+406.]

# The Fusion of Boundaries: A Review of the Legal Literary Criticism Advocated by Wu Di

**Chang Liching**

**Abstract:** The study of the correlation between law and literature is typically interdisciplinary. Based on the interdisciplinary studies of literature and the connotation of the academic movement of “Law and Literature,” Wu Di puts forward the concept of “Legal Literary Criticism,” and makes his voice for literary scholars in the field of the comparative study of law and literature. His related researches are based on his understanding of literature. The purpose of legal literary research is not purely to solve legal problems, but to deepen his control over the spiritual connotation of literary works and his comprehensive understanding of the writer’s worldview. However, Wu Di is not satisfied with the role of legal events in the development of the plot of the literary works but wants to explore the writer’s legal thoughts and legal ethics in addition to aesthetics. The legal literary criticism advocated by Wu Di not only enables a new critical vision of literature, but at the same time, it also provides a reference for the study of related issues in the field of law.

**Keywords:** Wu Di; interdisciplinary research; legal literary criticism; law and literature

**Author:** Chang Liching is Chair Professor at the Shih Chien University, and a doctor of law at the University of Munichcc and National Taiwan University. Her research interests include law and literature (Email: liching0903@yahoo.com.tw).

**标题:** 跨界的融合：评吴笛倡导的文学法律批评

**内容摘要:** 法律与文学之间的相互关系的研究，属于典型的跨学科研究。吴笛教授基于文学的跨学科视野，借鉴“法律与文学”学术运动的合理内涵，提出了“文学法律批评”的理念，在法律与文学比较研究领域，为文学学者发出了自己的声音。他的相关研究，以文学的感悟为基点，研究的目的是不是纯粹为了解决法律问题，而是为了加深对文学作品精神内涵的掌控，以及对作家世界观的全面理解。不过，吴笛教授并没有满足于法律事件在作品情节展开中的作用，而是要探究作家除了审美之外的法律思想和法律伦理思想。吴笛教授所倡导的文学法律批评，不仅使得文学有了新的批评视野，与此同时，也为法律领域相关问题的研究提供了参照。

**关键词:** 吴笛；跨学科研究；文学法律批评；法律与文学

**作者简介:** 张丽卿，实践大学讲席教授、德国慕尼黑大学法学博士、台湾大

法学学博士、高雄大学法学院前院长，主要从事法律与文学比较研究。本文为国家社科基金重大招标项目“世界文学基本文献的整理、翻译与研究”【项目编号：24&ZD242】阶段性成果之一。

Law and literature are inextricably linked, their relation often metaphorically referred to by scholars as a “sisterhood” or a “happy partnership.” “Law and literature share the same function. Both have ‘man and society’ as the object of their attention, and both take the idealization of man and society as their task, and their basic function is to sensitize and transform man and society. Literature has the functions of indoctrination, improving self-expression, stimulating sympathy, searching for the self, feeling life, and healing the body and mind. In this way, literature sensitizes the human mind and inspires the human heart to strive for a better world, an ideal society, and human justice” (Chang 249-250). The academic movement of “law and literature,” which had an extremely wide scope, made many legal scholars participate in it and strive to open up the frontiers for cross-border researches of various disciplines. However, in the past, this academic movement was mainly confined to the circle of legal scholars, and literary scholars rarely participated in it. Even if there are scholars involved, most of them are limited to this academic movement in the legal circle to hold discussions. However, based on the interdisciplinary view of literature and the reasonable connotation of legal research, Wu Di (also known as Deyi Woody) puts forward the concept of “legal literary criticism” and raises his voice for the participation of literary scholars.

### **I. Academic Expansion Based on Comparative Researches**

For scholars engaged in legal research, their literary knowledge is relatively limited, especially in the perception of literary works, and they often feel overwhelmed. Wu Di’s research is based on literary perception, and the purpose of the research is not only to solve legal problems but also to deepen the control of the spiritual connotation of literary works and the comprehensive understanding of the writer’s world outlook. In other words, the movement “law and literature” in the field of jurisprudence uses literature as material to solve legal problems, while the legal literary criticism advocated by Wu Di uses the law as material to solve related problems in literature. The propositions concerning the legal wording of literary works, legal metaphors, and legal elements in the structure of literature are beyond the reach of scholars who study “law and literature.” Of course, they are also complementary in a certain sense, expanding the ideal space for comparative studies between literature and law.

Wu Di also aptly defines “legal literary criticism” by saying: “‘Legal literary criticism’ aims to explore the legal issues in literary works, including the themes, images, wording, and techniques, or the influences received from the law, from the perspective of legal criticism, and to explore the refraction of legal thought in the historical development process of literature, as well as the writer’s deep thoughts on the treatment of legal issues in the process of creation, and the resulting jurisprudential thoughts and the formation of the writer’s legalistic outlook” (“Legal Literary Criticism vs. Law and Literature” 36). From this definition, we can feel the difference between “legal literary criticism” and the “law and literature” academic movement. “Law and Literature” is mainly to use literary texts as materials to explore the legal issues in them. Literature comes from real life and is the sublimation of real life, so legal scholars often consider literary works as a broad social reality and explore legal propositions from them. On the other hand, “legal literary criticism” is to use law as a critical perspective of literature, and to examine the influence of law received by literary scholars, as well as the potential role of legal elements in literary creation.

Of course, literary works embody the spirit of the times and the ideals of the writers, and in Wu Di’s opinion, “legal literary criticism” is no exception, which can explore the legal thoughts and the formation of the writers’ legal outlook as well as the corresponding cognitive value of the writers’ creations from the literary texts, in addition to the aesthetic value. “Legal literary criticism has a unique value and function to study the problems related to law in literature from the perspective of law, which has been neglected by previous scholars [...] It allows us to emphasize the social value of literary works while emphasizing the aesthetic concept” (Wu, “Legal Literary Criticism as an Interdisciplinary Research Method” 74). It can be seen that Wu Di’s proposition not only has doctrinal depth but also has practical significance, expanding the space and academic connotation of the comparative study of literature and law at a certain level.

For example, in his monograph *New Studies in Thomas Hardy*, Wu Di devotes a chapter to discussing the unique function of some legal events in Hardy’s *Tess of the d’Urbervilles* in terms of the artistic structure of the novel, and meticulously examines them, arguing that the legal issues in *Tess of the d’Urbervilles* are mainly related to three aspects: “The novel deals not only with criminal law, but also with marriage law, property law and other related aspects. However, as far as the basic structure elements depicted in the novel are concerned, there are three main places where legal issues are involved: namely, Tess’s humiliation in the first part, Alex’s murder by Tess in the seventh part, and Tess’s death sentence at the end of the

novel” (*New Studies in Thomas Hardy* 76). In Wu Di’s view, these three legal events are crucial to the development of the novel’s plot, and it is these legal events that drive the plot of the work. They play a key role in the development of the beginning, the climax, and the end of the plot of the work.

However, Wu Di is not satisfied with the role of legal events in the unfolding plot of the work but rather explores specific evidence and the writer’s ideas. In the following exposition, Wu Di thoroughly examines all three aspects of the problems that arise in *Tess of the d’Urbervilles*. In particular, he examines and analyzes the legal events related to Tess’s victimization extremely thoroughly. Moreover, in the process of argumentation, he emphasizes the role of evidence, according to Hardy’s specific details in his works, especially in the dark forest, after a close reading of the text, he found a very evidential expression like the sentence “She was sleeping soundly” (Hardy 82). He relies on 19<sup>th</sup>-century English legal texts and case records of the time, such as *Digest of English Case Law*, *The Law and Family Marriage: A Manual of Practical Law*, etc., to make a completely different point of view from that of the critics. He believes that the hero of the work, Alec d’Urberville, had committed a crime with clear facts and solid evidence, but was not severely punished by the law. Moreover, he believes that this was Hardy’s criticism of the imperfection of the law and the double standard of the trial process, as he wrote in his monograph:

We have made it clear from the above two parts of the argument that both Alec d’Urberville’s violence against Tess and Tess’s revenge killing of Alec d’Urberville were acts that violated the laws of England at the time. It is unfortunate, however, that the law punished them in completely different ways. The laws of the same country applied “double standards” to both the rich and the poor. Alec d’Urberville’s criminal behavior is not punished in any legal sense; on the contrary, Tess’s action of a certain rebellious nature pays the price of her life. (*New Studies in Thomas Hardy* 87)

This review gives us an intuitive impression of understanding Hardy as a realist writer. Especially for writers like Hardy who had unique insights into legal issues, the advantages of legal literary criticism are quite obvious, not only as a critical method to intervene in traditional literary criticism, but also as a way to deeply understand the real value of literary works, as Wu Di said: “Legal literary criticism as an interdisciplinary research method has its characteristics and values, and also has its rich theoretical resources, including the overall social sciences and humanities. The study of legal principles and legal issues in literary works

can deepen our control over writers' creative intentions, help us understand the possibilities of new interpretations of works in terms of themes, techniques, and characterization after the intervention of legal concepts, and thus embody the cognitive value of literary works in addition to aesthetic enjoyment. Moreover, the legal imagination in literary works and the legal thinking of literary scholars undoubtedly have reference significance for the study of jurisprudence, and also have certain reference significance for the perfection of law and the justice" ("Literary Legal Criticism vs. Law and Literature" 41).

## II. The Broad Vision Beyond the Study of National Literature

The legal literary criticism advocated by Wu Di has a broad scope and a wide vision, not only macro-theoretical statements but also specific and detailed interpretations of works. He believes that the scope of research of legal literary criticism includes literature on legal subjects, legal thought and the value of jurisprudential documents in literature, the writer's view of jurisprudence, legal events in works, and the value of legal critical attitudes in literature, and so on. Moreover, even when he deals with a particular aspect, he does not limit himself to the literature of one country or one type of literary creation but deals with many genres of literature from many countries. This is closely related to his macroscopic mastery of world literature. In his view, the literature of legal subjects not only includes a wide range of poems, novels, plays, and other literary genres, but also includes important writers and works from many regions in the East and West, such as the myths and legends of ancient Greece, Shakespeare and Dickens in England, Tolstoy and Dostoyevsky in Russia, Kafka in Germany, and so on. Wu Di is more concerned with legal writing in English literature and Russian literature.

For example, in his article "A Study of the Legal Ethics in Scott's *The Heart of Midlothian*," he argues that the two legal events in Walter Scott's novel, "Porteous Riots" and "The Unfair Conviction of Effie Deans," form the basis of the work's structure and are the driving force for the plot development of the novel.

In discussing Charles Dickens's masterpiece, *A Tale of Two Cities*, he focuses on the role of legal elements in the structure of the work that other scholars have overlooked, arguing, "*A Tale of Two Cities* tells not only two stories, two cities, two classes, but two generations. Even basically a two-phase comparison. In the two generations connected with the Marquis St. Evremonde, the former commits a crime, does willfully as he likes, and is guilty of it, and the latter suffers and bears the debt of his predecessor's sins, and is punished for no reason at all. In the two generations associated with Madame Defarge, the former suffered cruelty and

persecution at the hands of the aristocracy, and the latter was determined to avenge it. In the two generations connected with Doctor Manette, the former made tearful accusations because of the persecution they suffered, and the latter almost suffered the fate of having their families broken up because of the accusations of their predecessors” (“The Legal Writing in Dickens’ *A Tale of Two Cities*” 30).

In his article, “A Study of the Unfair Trials and the Legal Ideal in Scott’s Novels,” he argues that there is a unique interaction between literature and law, and he aptly expresses the dialectical relationship between law and literature by arguing that “literature is often imbued with elements of law, and law is the upholder of human order, while literature is the overseer of law” (94). According to Wu Di, the writing of unjust imprisonment in Scott’s novel is a cry for the realization of his legal ideals. “*The Heart of Midlothian* is of great documentary value both in terms of recognizing the historical events of the early 18<sup>th</sup> century and understanding the legal issues after the union of England and Scotland, which fully embodies the ideological qualities and spiritual aspirations of Scott’s dual roles as a writer and a jurist. The novelist expressed his thoughts on the concept of jurisprudence in the form of literary works, which is undoubtedly an example of legal writing in literature. Scott regarded literary works as a platform for publicizing his legal ideals and explaining his view of jurisprudence. His novels closely combine real historical events with the portrayal of the ideal image in the author’s mind, and succeed in writing about injustice on a legal level” (101).

Wu Di not only pays attention to the legal writing in the classics of English literature but also has considerable insight into the legal writing in Russian literature. In the article “A Study of the Legal Narration of Alexander Radishev’s Literary Works,” he believes that Radishev is a writer who pays great attention to the law, and that “an in-depth discussion of the legal issues related to his literary works can undoubtedly deepen our understanding of his works as well as his creative thinking. Likewise, Radishev’s legal reflections and corresponding legal ideals are of reference value for the perfection of law and legal justice” (57).

The monograph *History of Russian Fiction* also contains a great deal of legal writing. For example, in the third subsection of Chapter 3, Wu Di provides a better discussion of the legal writing in Old Rus’ literary works, such as *The Trial of Corruption*, *Yershoy Yershovitch*, and others. He argues that the work *Yershoy Yershovitch* was created in the form of a court trial. In it, there is a satirical simulation of the proceedings of the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> centuries. *The Trial of Corruption* takes a humorous and satirical approach, “revealing the greed of the judge and the injustice of the law through the depiction of the three crimes and three punishments

of the main character” (Wu, *History of Russian Fiction* 47).

Wu Di’s legal literary criticism is extremely broad and covers a wide range of topics. “The richness of literature not only provides a diversity of thought, but also cultivates a broad vision and broad-mindedness of the legal person, and does not allow the legal person to be confined to the traditional legal niche” (Chang 233). Many of the legal issues Wu Di mentions in his relevant treatises, as well as some of the English and Russian legal cases he studies, are extremely rare qualities for lawyers and have a certain value for relevant legal research.

### III. From Legal Writing to the Exploration of Legal Thought and Legal Ethics

If exploring the embodiment of legal elements in the structure and metaphors of literary works is one of the main features of Wu Di’s legal literary criticism, he does not rest on these aspects, but also actively explores and makes unique attempts at the level of legal thought and legal ethics in literary works, which have been neglected by legal scholars.

In his article “A Study of the Legal Narration of Alexander Radishev’s Literary Works,” he considers Radishev’s masterpiece *Journey from Petersburg to Moscow* as an outstanding work of legal justice and expression of legal ideals. He thinks that “Radishev saw through the nature of tsarist autocracy and found it difficult to realize his legal ideals in practice, so he conveyed his legal ideals and jurisprudential concepts through literary creation out of his conscience” (58).

If Radishev is considered a representative of the dual identity of a lawyer and a writer in Russian literature, then Scott is undoubtedly a representative of such a dual identity in English literature. As a writer who studied law and had been a lawyer since graduating from university, Scott had always been able to express his legal ideals in literary form. Therefore, in the article “A Study of the Unfair Trials and the Legal Ideal in Scott’s Novels,” Wu Di argues that literature is an important medium for Scott to present justice. “Scott regarded literary works as a platform for publicizing his legal ideals and elaborating his view of jurisprudence. His novels closely combine real historical events with the portrayal of the ideal image in the author’s mind, and were successful in writing about the legal aspects of wrongful imprisonment” (108).

The legal literary criticism is not only a typical interdisciplinary criticism, but also an important part of the criticism of literary ethics. In the process of engaging in literary ethics criticism, Wu Di has also further explored and realized that legal ethical thought is equally important in ethical literary criticism. Therefore, in the article “A Study of the Legal Ethics in Scott’s *The Heart of Midlothian*,” he focuses

on the legal ethical thought in the works of Scott, an important historical novelist in the early 19<sup>th</sup> century of England, and makes an in-depth excavation of this thought, and thoroughly discusses the significance of Jenny Deans, the heroine of Scott's novel, who is a moral model in legal ethics.

In particular, Scott expresses his legal ethics through the writing of "The Unfair Conviction of Effie Deans," which "reinforces the importance of legal ethics in the conflict between 'love' and 'law,' and the protagonist, Jenny Deans, an ideal model, is allowed to make her own difficult ethical choices in the violent collision between flesh and blood and legal justice. It is in the multiple conflicts and ethical dilemmas of the characters that Scott emphasizes the idea of legal ethics and the call for legal justice" (Wu, "A Study of the Legal Ethics in Scott's *The Heart of Midlothian*" 125).

Wu Di agrees with Scott's portrayal of Jenny as an ideal moral model and believes that the idea of legal ethics is an important inspiration for both legal justice and legal ethical criticism. "Legal ethics is a code of conduct that legal practitioners must adhere to in the course of their practice and plays a crucial role in maintaining the integrity of the legal system as well as in the administration of justice" (Wu, "A Study of the Legal Ethics in Scott's *The Heart of Midlothian*" 134).

### **Conclusion**

To sum up, the legal literary criticism advocated by Wu Di expands the function and meaning of literature, not only providing a new and ideal way to study and understand the literary classics but also providing a reference for related research in the discipline of law. Wu Di's legal literary criticism is also enlightening for my research. Twenty-three years ago, I received a Fulbright scholarship to study at Stanford University Law School for one year. Wu Di happened to be visiting Stanford as a Fulbright scholar, so I had the honor of meeting him. I was already interested in literature and inspired and influenced by Wu Di, I visited Stanford University for the second time and ended up in the Comparative Literature Department. When I returned to Taiwan, I started a new program, Law and Literature, in the graduate schools of several universities.

Since law students have to prepare for the judicial examination with great difficulty, reading literary works and thinking about the legal issues in literary works may help them relax their tense spirits, open a new window for them, and breathe different fresh air. The law gets quite a bit of nourishment from literature, and literary scholars have a lot of associations that are thought-provoking to the legal professions. Therefore, the law and literature movement could develop and flourish.

The legal literary criticism advocated by Wu Di not only allows literature

and law to merge across the border but also makes legal scholars benefit from it. The ethical teaching function and universal value of literature involved in legal literary criticism are of great enlightening value to law scholars, and the attention that legal literary criticism pays to the legal-ethical thoughts in literary works is of positive significance to the maintenance of justice and the improvement of the legal consciousness and moral standard of the broad audience.

### Works Cited

- 张丽卿：《法律与文学》。中国台北：元照出版公司，2010年。  
[Chang Liching. *Law and Literature*. Taipei: Angle Publishing Co., LTD, 2010.]
- 吴笛：《俄罗斯小说发展史》。杭州：浙江工商大学出版社，2022年。  
[Wu Di. *History of Russian Fiction*. Hangzhou: Zhejiang Gongshang UP, 2022.]
- ：“作为跨学科研究方法的文学法律批评”，《山东外语教学》3（2018）：70-77。  
[—.“Legal Literary Criticism as an Interdisciplinary Research Approach.” *Shandong Foreign Language and Literature Teaching* 3 (2018): 70-77.]
- ：“文学法律批评 vs 法律与文学”，《外国文学研究》5（2021）：33-42。  
[—.“‘Legal Literary Criticism’ vs ‘Law and Literature’.” *Foreign Literature Studies* 5 (2021): 33-42.]
- ：“狄更斯《双城记》中的法律书写”，《文心语粹：浙大中文学者演讲录》，胡可先、黄擎编。杭州：浙江大学出版社，2023年，第28-40页。  
[—.“The Legal Writing in Dickens’ *A Tale of Two Cities*.” *The Essences from Literary Hearts: Lectures by Chinese Scholars at Zhejiang University*, edited by Hu Kexian and Huang Qing. Hangzhou: Zhejiang UP, 2023. 28-40.]
- ：《哈代新论》。杭州：浙江大学出版社，2009年。  
[—.*New Studies in Thomas Hardy*. Hangzhou: Zhejiang UP, 2009.]
- ：“论司各特《密得洛西恩监狱》中的法律伦理思想”，《外国文学研究》4（2024）：125-135。  
[—.“A Study of the Legal Ethics in Scott’s *The Heart of Midlothian*.” *Foreign Literature Studies* 4 (2024): 125-135.]
- ：“论拉吉舍夫作品中的法律书写”，《俄罗斯文艺》4（2019）：57-63。  
[—.“A Study of the Legal Narration of Alexander Radishev’s Literary Works.” *Russian Literature and Arts* 4 (2019): 57-63.]
- 吴笛、陈逢丹：“司各特小说中的冤狱书写与法律理想”，《浙江学刊》5（2024）：101-108。  
[Wu Di and Chen Fengdan. “A Study of the Unfair Trials and the Legal Ideal in Scott’s Novels.” *Zhejiang Academic Journal* 5 (2024): 101-108.]

# Building a Solid Bridge between Chinese and Western Cultures: Commentary on Wu Di's Comparative Studies in Poetry

**Zhang Ruwen**

**Abstract:** Wu Di's comparative studies of Chinese and Western poetry focus on two interrelated considerations: the distinctive artistic appeal of poetic texts and the cultural exchanges between the East and the West. These exchanges are evident in the mutual appreciation of civilizations, which is reflected in the significant artistic discipline of poetry. In his monographs, such as *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry* and *Studies on English Metaphysical Poetry*, Wu Di explores important issues in British poetry and examines the subtle relationship between Chinese and Western poetry, along with its complex influences, all showcased through his keen philosophical thinking and exquisite writing style. Furthermore, he offers an insightful account of the structural and artistic differences between Chinese and Western poetry, as well as their spiritual integration, particularly through the practice of poetry translation. Wu Di has made a commendable effort to build a solid bridge between Chinese and Western cultural exchanges by studying poetic texts from both traditions, which deserves recognition and praise.

**Keywords:** Wu Di; Chinese and Western poetry; comparative studies; cultural exchanges

**Author:** **Zhang Ruwen**, Professor at the School of Foreign Languages, Zhejiang University of Finance and Economics (Hangzhou 310018 China). Her research focus is on American ethnic women's literature and its translation (Email: zhang\_ruwen@zufe.edu.cn).

**标题:** 构筑中西文化交流的坚实桥梁：吴笛的中西诗歌比较研究

**内容摘要:** 吴笛先生的中西诗歌比较研究，不仅基于诗歌文本的独特艺术魅力，更基于中西文化交流以及在诗歌这一重要艺术门类中所体现的文明互鉴。他的专著，如《比较视野中的欧美诗歌》《英国玄学派诗歌研究》等，以敏锐的哲思和细腻的笔法，论及英国诗歌中的重要命题以及中西诗歌之间的微妙关系和复杂影响。他还从诗歌翻译的具体实践出发，对于汉语诗歌与西方诗歌在结构艺术上的不同之处，以及精神层面的相融相通，作了出色的论述。吴笛先生以切身的努力，以中西诗歌文本为研究对象，构筑起了中西文

化交流的坚实桥梁。

**关键词：**吴笛；中西诗歌；比较研究；文化交流

**作者简介：**章汝雯，浙江财经大学外国语学院教授，兼任浙江省比较文学与外国文学学会副会长，主要研究方向为美国族裔女性文学及译介研究。本文为国家社科基金重大招标项目“世界文学基本文献的整理、翻译与研究”【项目编号：24&ZD242】阶段性成果之一。

Wu Di (also known as Deyi Woody) is a prominent scholar recognized both domestically and internationally. His acclaim stems not only from his extensive publications but also from his academic insight, multi-dimensional approach, and cross-disciplinary research, all of which have significantly contributed to the field of foreign literature studies. Wu Di leads a major project funded by the National Social Sciences Foundation titled “Studies on the Formation and Dissemination of Foreign Literature Canons.” In addition, he has completed several other projects, including “Studies in English Metaphysical Poetry” and “Studies in European and American Poetry from the Perspective of Eco-Criticism.” His research interests are broad, encompassing literary theories, literary criticism, comparative studies, and the interpretation of literary texts. Over the past 20 years, Wu Di has made remarkable contributions to poetry and poetics, particularly in the comparative analysis of Chinese and Western poetry.

This paper primarily focuses on his two monographs, *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry* and *Studies in English Metaphysical Poetry*, to highlight Wu Di’s impact on the comparative research of Chinese and Western poetry and his contributions to cultural exchanges between the East and the West.

### **I. “ABC Metaphor” and the Exchange of Chinese and Western Poetry**

Wu Di’s study of European and American poetry highlights not only the unique artistic charm of Western poetry but also the cultural exchanges between the East and the West, as well as the mutual appreciation of civilizations reflected in this important artistic discipline.

In April 2023, during a gathering hosted by Mr. Burns, the U.S. Ambassador to China, Wu Di introduced a thought-provoking metaphor using the English alphabet to describe cultural exchanges between China and the United States. He proposed that if “A” stands for America and “C” represents China, then what does the letter “B” signify in this context? Wu believes that “B” stands for “Bridge.” He emphasized that by strengthening cultural exchanges and communication between China and the United States, we can reinforce this bridge. This ABC metaphor offers valuable

insight.

This kind of metaphor between Chinese and American cultures appeared in Wu Di's writings long ago. In his monograph entitled *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry*, when discussing the relationship between the American poet Walt Whitman and Chinese literature, he uses the metaphor of a "bridge" and writes, "Whitman's poetry is undoubtedly deeply influenced by the classical Chinese poetry, but in turn, it has exerted a similarly obvious effect on the contemporary Chinese literature. This phenomenon is evident in the cultures of all peoples, which is indeed worthy of note and study in the cultural exchanges of various nationalities, and in a sense, it serves to build a bridge between classical Chinese culture and modern culture" (Wu, *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry* 369).

Wu Di is committed to fostering a robust interconnectivity between Chinese and Western cultural exchanges, particularly through an in-depth examination of Chinese and Western poetic traditions. In his book *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry*, Wu Di examines the intricate relationship between Chinese and Western poetry, as well as the profound impact of philosophical thinking and writing style. "It would be remiss not to consider the influence of exchanges between Western poetry and Eastern culture on their development. The mutual exchanges and influences between Eastern and Western poetry also play an important role in the development of human culture, to some extent" (Wu, *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry* 268).

In addition to providing a summary of the cultural influence resulting from the interaction between Chinese and Western poetry in a broader sense, Wu Di also illustrates this influence by using specific poetic trends, schools of poetry, and genres of poetry as examples. To demonstrate the influence of Western poetry on Chinese poetry, he initiates the discussion with an analysis of Romantic, Symbolist, and Imagist poetry. He argues that these genres not only play a pivotal role in the advancement and transformation of European and American poetry but also exert a profound impact on the development of Eastern literature.

In his analysis of the modern Chinese poet Dai Wangshu's poem "Rainy Lane," Wu Di examines the characteristics of Western symbolism and its correlation with musical elements within the poem. He draws our attention to the utilization of natural imagery in this poem and its capacity to evoke a musical quality through techniques such as repetition and superimposed lines. Wu Di emphasizes that these artistic techniques create a harmonious and beautiful rhythm, enhancing the lyrical color of the poem and underscoring the symbolic meaning of the "lilac-like" girl as the embodiment of beauty in a somber and solitary environment. Wu Di's analysis

is characterized by a rational and insightful approach, which is both profound in its thinking and keen in its perception.

In the context of Romanticism, Wu Di makes a significant reference to the impact of Guo Moruo's seminal work, *The Goddess*. Composed primarily in 1920, Guo Moruo's anthology *The Goddess* reflects the tenets of "constant destruction" and "constant creation," as espoused by Western Romantic poets such as Shelley. The fundamental spirit of *The Goddess* can be defined as a process of creation and destruction, whereby the old is discarded to facilitate the emergence of a new self. This bears resemblance to the English Romantic poet Shelley's "Ode to the West Wind," in which the central figure is both the "destroyer" and the "creator." Furthermore, Wu Di identifies an ideological connection, proposing that "the majestic style and belief in victory expressed in Guo Moruo's poetry, the artistic 'borrowing of metaphors,' the ideological 'doctrine of reincarnation' and 'reverence for the self' and so on, are all very closely related to the Western poetry" (*Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry* 302).

The interrelationships between different poetic traditions are not unidirectional; rather, they are reciprocal, a phenomenon that is particularly prevalent in the domain of poetry. Wu Di is profoundly affected by this and he not only addresses the influence of Romanticism and Symbolism poetry on modern Chinese poetry, but also the impact of Chinese poetry on Western poetry. In Chapter 19, entitled "The Influence of Classical Chinese Poetry on Imagism," Wu Di posits that the influence of classical Chinese poetry on imagist poetry can be primarily attributed to three key factors: visual consciousness (sense of picture), mood, and language style. The characteristic of using "absolutely no word that does not contribute to the presentation" (Pound 4) in imagist poetry is believed to be deeply inspired by Chinese poetry, as Chinese characters are hieroglyphs and possess strong visual effects.<sup>1</sup>

A considerable number of classical Chinese poems possess a pronounced visual impact, largely due to the distinctive role of hieroglyphs. In the extensive corpus of Chinese poetic art, poetry and painting have reached a state of harmonious unity, as Su Shi once observed, "In painting or in poetry, the same pursuit is freshness and spontaneity" ( "诗画本一律, 天工与清新" ) (Su 211). In particular, the concept of the "realm" as it pertains to mood in classical Chinese poetry has exerted a notable influence on the Imagist school of poetry. Accordingly, Wu Di posits that the emphasis of classical Chinese poetry on the "realm of the selfless" bears some resemblance to the Imagists' emphasis on objective presentation and opposition to

<sup>1</sup> See Wu Di, *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry*, Beijing: Writers' Publishing House, 2004, 306.

subjective emotions.

A distinctive feature of classical Chinese poetry is its ability to evoke a sense of beauty and tranquility. An ostensibly objective description of natural scenery is replete with thoughts and emotions, leaving a lasting impression and an enduring charm. This has served as a source of inspiration for Imagist poets.

In the context of cultural exchanges, there is a mutual influence between Western and Chinese poetry. Wu Di thinks that the Western Imagist movement, which has been shaped by classical Chinese poetic traditions, has also exerted an influence on 20<sup>th</sup> century Chinese literature. In particular, the renewed focus on poetic imagery has been enriched by the influence of Imagist poetry. “This multifaceted influence is not merely a reiteration, but rather a deliberate intertextuality with substantial cultural exchange implications” (Wu, *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry* 320).

Furthermore, poetic or literary exchanges entail a more profound level of cultural exchanges, encompassing a spiritual dimension of communion. In his study of Western Romantic poetry and the corresponding ecological criticism, Wu Di has made a significant contribution to our understanding of the concept of “seeking common ground while reserving differences” in the spiritual aspect of cultural exchanges between the East and the West. He observes that “Concerning the relationship between humanity and the natural world, the principal tenet of Chinese culture is one of interiority and homogeneity. Western dualism gives rise to a confrontational and conflictual relationship between humanity and the natural world, whereas Chinese monism fosters a harmonious coexistence between the two. However, as a result of the intermingling of Eastern and Western cultures and the ongoing evolution of ideas and circumstances, there have been notable shifts in the relationship between humanity and the natural world in both Eastern and Western cultures. Western ecocriticism, which prioritizes the pursuit of a harmonious relationship between humanity and the natural world, draws upon this connotation of Chinese culture” (*Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry* 269).

It is obvious that using poetry as a medium to explore the cultural exchanges between East and West in terms of poetic forms, styles, themes, and schools of thought is of great importance in building a solid “bridge” between Chinese and Western cultural exchanges.

## **II. Sensitivity in Perception and a Comparative Study of Chinese and Western Poetical Texts**

In his books, *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry* and *Studies in English Metaphysical Poetry*, Wu Di provides a thorough examination of poetic

themes, poetic art, and rhythms in both Eastern and Western poetry. He illustrates the integration of human cultures through a proper comparative study.

For instance, in his thematic comparisons, Wu Di analyses such themes as “Carpe Diem,” “life and death,” “female world,” “peace and war,” “love” and “the self” etc. In the two books, he provides detailed and in-depth discussions of these themes in both Eastern and Western poetry. Wu Di argues that “Carpe Diem” is a universal theme in both Eastern and Western poetry from a philosophical perspective. He points out that although the term “Carpe Diem” was first used by the Roman poet Horace and has been an important theme in Greco-Roman literature, this theme is not a specialty of Western poetry. Many ancient Chinese poems also emphasize this theme, highlighting the similarities and differences in its expression across different cultural backgrounds. Wu Di takes the Tang Dynasty poem “Gold Thread Coat” as an example to show that “Carpe Diem” is a common theme that embodies the awareness of life and the spirit of secularism, albeit with specific manifestations in poems from different cultural traditions. In “Gold Thread Coat” Du Qiuniang, the poet of the Tang Dynasty, writes:

I adjure you, sir, not to prize your coat of gold thread;  
I adjure you, sir, to prize the time of youth.  
When the flower opens and is ready for plucking, it should straightway be plucked;  
Do not delay until these no flower, and pluck an empty twig. (Davis 24)<sup>1</sup>

In his books, Wu Di compares the poem with the 17<sup>th</sup> century English metaphysical poet Robert Herrick’s “To the Virgins, To Make Much of Time” and the Spanish poet Luis de Góngora’s “While to Contend in Brightness with Thy Hair.” He argues that one of the distinctive techniques of these poems is the use of floral imagery as a metaphor for expressing the theme of “Carpe Diem.”

The analysis of the poem is highly relevant: “The poem emphasizes the importance of cherishing time and not missing out on the youthful years. The flowering season is short and youth is fleeting. The poet openly declares that there is no need to hesitate to boldly enjoy real life, otherwise one will only find oneself in the situation of ‘plucking an empty twig’” (Wu, *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry* 52).

Wu Di’s analysis of the poems on this subject is very convincing from every point of view. It shows an in-depth study based on a keen perception of the poems in

1 劝君莫惜金缕衣，劝君惜取少年时。花开堪折直须折，莫待无花空折枝。

terms of conception, wording, philosophy, and other aspects. He carefully examines the structure of the poem and finds that the ancient Chinese poem “Gold Thread Coat” is very similar to Góngora’s “While to Contend in Brightness with Thy Hair.” In both poems, the first part uses imperative sentences to urge the other person to enjoy life, while the last line expresses, in sharp contrast, the decaying state of “the future.”

In terms of wording, Wu Di posits that classical Chinese poetry is characterized by a greater degree of subtlety and euphemism, whereas Western poetry tends to be more impassioned, uninhibited, and forthright in its expression of the same theme of “Carpe Diem.”

With a comparative study of Eastern and Western Poetry on the theme of “Carpe Diem” on one hand, Wu Di, on the other hand, puts this theme at a macro-level to outline the evolution of its implications and connotations under different cultural backgrounds in different times. He points out that the idea of “Carpe Diem” appeared in poetry a long time ago, and that “in its development and evolution, it has been closely connected with various trends of thoughts in different ages throughout the world” (*Studies on English Metaphysical Poetry* 30). Before the Renaissance, the theme of “Carpe Diem” was confined to such topics as romantic love and fine wine, persuading people to enjoy secular life and this life, which lacks deep philosophical thoughts and takes on a pessimistic outlook though it has a somewhat progressive tendency. During the Renaissance and the century following it, greatly benefiting from social innovations, religious reforms, achievements of science, and the further development of humanist thoughts, this theme is endowed with a strong progressive color of anti-feudalism, anti-religion, and anti-abstinence. “Carpe Diem” emphasizes that people should cherish this life and secular life because of a transient life and flying time. In the book *Studies in English Metaphysical Poetry*, Wu Di takes Andrew Marvel’s “To His Coy Mistress” as an example, and makes a deep analysis, pointing out that the poet stresses the importance of enjoying life here and now by his deductive reasoning. Wu Di thinks that this poem is a deep meditation on life though it is seemingly dedicated to his “coy mistress,” giving the poem a philosophical meaning.

As far as philosophical meaning is concerned, Eastern poetry expresses the theme of “Carpe Diem” with profound depth. Wu Di argues that the connotation of this theme is not a negative view of the world in general, but rather a specific manifestation of a positive philosophical life. “This expression goes beyond literature and plays a crucial role in the conflicts between human studies and theology, secularism and the idea of afterlife, as well as between feudalism and

humanism in the history of human thoughts, and has significant implications” (Wu, *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry* 41).

Moreover, *Studies in English Metaphysical Poetry* focuses on the theme of the female world with its sharp sensitivity and in-depth sight. Wu Di takes Katherine Philips’s poem “A Retir’d Friendship. To Ardelia” as an example, and through deep textual analysis, points out that this poem expresses a kind of women’s idealistic tendency, hoping to run away from the political society, return to nature, and enjoy love and friendship, which to a certain degree let people hear women’s voice that belongs to the women of that time. In that patriarchal society, the world that women picture for themselves tended to be too idealistic, “the female world in the English metaphysical poetry is outlined anyway mainly by those male poets” (Wu, *Studies on English Metaphysical Poetry* 102). Unfortunately, the male voice expresses a kind of desire to dominate the women. They adopt the same model of discourse, that is, to persuade the women to have their hands tied and wait to be captured, completely disregarding women’s free will, thus leading to a confrontational female world. To this, Katherine Philips makes a reply in her poem “An Answer to Another Persuading a Lady to Marriage” and discloses the inequality between men and women in an ironical approach.

As it is, *Studies in English Metaphysical Poetry*, with John Donne’s poem “Good Morrow” as an object of textual analysis, shows women’s yearning and pursuit of equality between men and women through the imagery of “two hemispheres.” With an in-depth textual analysis of many metaphysical poems, Wu Di puts forward his view that the female world in English metaphysical poems is complex, changeable, and confrontational. “Behind the complex, conflictual and strange mood that the metaphysical poets hold toward the women there hides a kind of obvious patriarchal consciousness” (Li 171), but the exquisite language, the profound thoughts, and rich rhetorical devices in the metaphysical poems lead us readers into a wonderful realm and allows us to appreciate their artistic charm.

Whether “Carpe Diem” or “female world,” themes in both Eastern and Western poetry have been developed and enriched with the progress of society. Wu Di concludes the scope of the themes, saying that it no longer focuses solely on romantic love between men and women, but goes further to explore the existential value of the individual life. It delves into various topics such as human society, war and peace, and the mystery of existence, etc. Through a comparative study and impact research both at a macro and micro level, Wu Di points out that since the Renaissance, the theme of “Carpe Diem” which seemingly belongs to Western poetry is found to be closely associated with Eastern literature and cultures. The

mutual influence and reference between Eastern and Western poetry helps to push forward the development of world literature and world civilization. In my opinion, Wu Di's analysis appears to be unique and insightful.

### III. The Ideal Presentation of the Comparative Study of Chinese and Western Prosody

Problems of prosody mainly belong to the category of poetic creation. The comparison of Chinese and Western poetic rhymes primarily belongs to the category of comparative prosody. This type of study involves comparing different types of literary genres and different languages. The specific research categories involved in this comparison tend to include the following: 1) the comparative study of a poetic meter; 2) the comparative study of rhyming schemes; and 3) the comparative study of poetic forms and styles. In *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry*, there is an ideal presentation of a comparative study of Western and Eastern prosody.

As far as the comparison of poetic meter is concerned, it involves studying different poetic meter systems from around the world. Professor Fei Bai, in his wonderful book *The Outline of the History of World Poetry*, identifies six main metrical systems of world poetry, which are considered to be more scientific. These include the long and short syllable system, the accentual system, the pure syllabic system, the accentual-syllabic system, the syllabic-tonic system, and the free verse system.<sup>1</sup> These metrical systems are really important and have their peculiar focuses in poetry from different countries, but they're not fixed, instead, they change as poetry evolves and develops. Take free verse, for instance. It took off with the advent of modern poetry and can be seen in the works of poets from all over the globe.

When it comes to comparing the meter and rhyming scheme of Chinese and Western poems, Wu Di really shines! He says, that although Chinese poetry doesn't have any corresponding meters like iambic pentameter, it does have some lovely forms of Ping and Ze (level and oblique tones) in modern-style poems, which are formed by matching tones with each other. This is done artistically, using the "flat voice, rising voice, falling voice, and entering voice" to form the format of pentameter, heptameter, and quatrain (Jueju). Similarly, since there is no concept of "foot" (音步) in Chinese, some poetry translators and researchers have tried to replace it with "pause" (顿).<sup>2</sup>

1 See Fei Bai, *The Outline of the History of World Poetry* (Modern Volume), Guilin: Lijiang Publishing House, 1989, 1600-1610.

2 See Wu Di, *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry*, Beijing: Writers' Publishing House, 2004, 175.

When it comes to metrics, Wu Di believes that it's all about cultural exchanges. In the translation of poetry from Western languages into Chinese, understanding and capturing the rhythmic essence of the original is crucial to conveying its full meaning. Wu Di is impressed by the translation of *Shakespeare's Sonnets* by Tu An, Pushkin's *Yevgeny Onegin* by Wang Zhiliang, and *Anthology of British Victorian Poetry* by Fei Bai, as well as Xu Yuanchong's translation of Chinese poems into English. He thinks these translations show that full use can be made of the strengths of the target language in getting across exactly what the original poem means. In his translations, he tries his best to keep the formal structure and the semantic richness of the poems, including their rhyming schemes, just as they were in the original.

Based on what is discussed above, it can be said that the translation of poetry succeeds as an efficacious method of fostering intercultural understanding between Chinese and Western civilizations. The translation of Western poetry into Chinese serves to showcase and promote Chinese culture on an international scale. This principle also applies to the translation of Chinese poetry into foreign languages. In the Western world, as early as the 20<sup>th</sup> century, several poets recognized the value of drawing on Chinese poetic traditions and began their spontaneous translation of Chinese poems into Western languages. To guarantee that the translated version of the poem can be well received in the target language, translators from both Chinese and Western backgrounds frequently utilize the domestication strategy. This necessitates a considerable degree of rewriting and reconstruction of the original text to align it with the reading preferences of the target audience. This strategy is consistent with the essential characteristics of translating literary classics. A key aspect of the essence of literary classics lies in their ability to be adaptable and translatable. If a classic work cannot be effectively translated or fails to resonate with readers of the translated language, it loses what Benjamin termed as the "eternal afterlife" (Benjamin 255) of the source language text.

In the translation of poetry, how to deal with rhetorical devices is one of the difficulties since people of different cultures tend to associate with different matters on the same linguistic expressions. In *Studies in English Metaphysical Poetry*, Wu Di puts forward his view on the translation of poetry with analogy and image as the research points. While discussing how to deal with metaphor in the process of translation in this monograph, he argues that it is much more difficult to handle since it is more obscure and hidden in poems, and it is not so easy for translators to find effective equivalents in another culture. Imagery is also one of the main rhetorical devices that often appear in poems. Greatly affected by natural science and geographic discovery of that time, the metaphysical poets are encouraged to use the imagery in

astronomy, geography, and nature to express their views and thoughts on society, politics, love, and life, which are so peculiar that it is very difficult to find equivalents in another culture or another language. For this situation, Wu Di says, “It is very important for translators to find objective equivalents in another culture in the process of translation, to associate sensitive intuition and inner feelings ingeniously, so that readers can follow what the poem implies and means without making logic reasoning or in-depth analysis” (Wu, *Studies on English Metaphysical Poetry* 139). Wu Di’s views greatly enlighten and inspire translators. Different cultures and languages may have different vehicles, so it is encouraging for translators to find objective equivalents as Wu Di advises so that the translated versions can be better received in the target audience.

In the field of prosody, Wu Di offers a comprehensive and insightful analysis of the structural nuances between Chinese and Western poetic forms. He places particular emphasis on the distinction between the structural unit of Chinese poetry (the word or Chinese character) and that of Western poetry (the syllable). He notes that some Western scholars regard each Chinese character as a vivid picture with deep meaning. They frequently equal Chinese characters to syllables. Nigel Fabb, for instance, asserts that “the earliest recorded Chinese verse (12<sup>th</sup>-7<sup>th</sup> centuries BC) is in 4-syllable lines, that later developed into 5-syllable and 7-syllable lines” (Fabb 255). However, Wu Di posits that “While the ‘syllable’ in Western poetry and the ‘word’ in Chinese poetry are both the smallest structural units of poetry, the connotation of ‘Chinese character’ is greater than that of ‘syllable.’ This is because, in English poetry, a syllable is merely a connection of sound categories, whereas in poetry, a Chinese character serves a dual function, both as a semantic component and as a sound connection” (Wu, *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry* 371).

And in this field, scholars of Chinese poetry in the West have conducted fruitful explorations in the process of translation, with the purpose of liberating the traditional syllabic-accented meter system and thus introducing a novel structural unit. The pursuit of a high degree of integration between the structural units of Chinese and English poetry has, to some extent, prompted poetic and metrical transformations in prosody. These examples illustrate the appeal of East-West cultural exchanges through the medium of poetry.

Hu Shi once wrote in his article “The Concept of Literary Evolution and Theater Reform” that “literature sometimes evolves to a certain stage, comes to a stop and makes no more progress. It is only through contact with other literature that it can make comparisons, and either be influenced unconsciously or deliberately incorporate

the strengths of others: then and only then progress may continue [...]" (qtd. in Saussy 6). This is the significance of engaging in the comparative studies of Chinese and Western poetry. In a discussion of the role of literary translation, Wu Di cited the words of Aleksander Pushkin, who observed that translators serve as "couriers of the human spirit" (Yang and Woody 513). In this sense, Wu Di can be considered a cultural "courier." He specializes in the field of comparative studies of Chinese and Western poetry, acting as an intermediary between the two cultures. His assiduous translations and research are intended to reinforce this bridge, which is commendable and worthy of recognition.

### Works Cited

- Benjamin, Walter. *Selected Writings* Vol. 1, edited by M. Bullock and M. W. Jennings. Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press, 1996.
- Davis, A. R. ed. *The Penguin Book of Chinese Verse*. Middlesex: Penguin Book Inc., 1970.
- Fabb, Nigel and Morris Halle. *Meter in Poetry: A New Theory*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2008.
- 飞白: 《世界诗歌史纲》(现代卷)。桂林: 漓江出版社, 1989年。
- [Fei Bai. *The Outline of the History of World Poetry* (Modern Volume). Guilin: Lijiang Publishing House, 1989.]
- Pound, Ezra. *Literary Essays of Ezra Pound*, edited by T. S. Eliot. New York: New Directions, 1968.
- Saussy, Haun ed. *The Making of Barbarians: Chinese Literature and Multilingual Asia*. Princeton: Princeton UP, 2022.
- 苏轼: 《苏轼诗词选》, 许渊冲译。长沙: 湖南人民出版社, 2007年。
- [Su Shi. *Selected Poems of Su Shi*, translated by Xu Yuanchong. Changsha: Hunan People's Publishing House, 2007.]
- 吴笛: 《比较视野中的欧美诗歌》。杭州: 作家出版社, 2009年。
- [Wu Di. *Comparative Studies in European and American Poetry*. Beijing: Writers' Publishing House, 2004.]
- : 《英国玄学派诗歌研究》。北京: 中国社会科学出版社, 2013年。
- [—]. *Studies on English Metaphysical Poetry*. Beijing: China Social Sciences Publishing House, 2013.]
- Yang Haiying and Deyi Woody. "The Courier of the Human Spirit: Song Zhaolin's Literary Translation and His Academic Contributions." *Forum for World Literature Studies* 3 (2022): 501-514.

# 文学史实与创作个性：吴笛对俄罗斯文学史研究的贡献

## Historical Facts of Literature and Academic Personality: Wu Di's Contribution to the Study of Russian Literary History

张 杰 (Zhang Jie) 姚婷婷 (Yao Tingting)

**内容摘要：**本文重点研究了我国著名外国文学研究专家吴笛教授撰写的《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》和《俄罗斯小说发展史》两部学术专著，揭示了吴笛教授如何在文学史作的撰写过程中，处理好文学史实与研究者学术个性之间的关系，从批判的接受、客观的评价、与未来接轨三个方面，论述了吴笛教授的学术思想及其在俄罗斯文学史撰写上所取得的成就，以期为我国的外国文学史撰写，提供值得借鉴的路径。

**关键词：**吴笛；学术个性；俄罗斯小说史；俄国诗歌史

**作者简介：**张杰，南京师范大学外国语学院二级教授，主要研究领域为符号学与外国文学；姚婷婷，南京师范大学讲师，主要研究领域为符号学和翻译学。本文为国家社科基金重点项目“19世纪俄罗斯文学体裁演变史研究”【项目批号：21AWW004】的阶段性成果。

**Title:** Historical Facts of Literature and Academic Personality: Wu Di's Contribution to the Study of Russian Literature History

**Abstract:** This paper focuses on two academic monographs, *History of the Development of Old Rus' and Modern Russian Poetry* and *History of the Development of the Russian Fiction*, written by Prof. Wu Di, one of the most outstanding scholars in foreign literature study in China, which reveals how Wu Di handles the relationship between literary historical facts and the researcher's academic personality in the process of writing literary history. Additionally, it examines Wu Di's scholarly ideas and his accomplishments in writing the history of Russian literature from the perspectives of acceptance of criticism, impartial assessment, and convergence with the future. The discussion of this paper aims to provide a worthy path for writing the history of foreign literature in China.

**Keywords:** Wu Di; academic personality; history of Russian fiction; history of

## Russian poetry

**Authors:** **Zhang Jie** is Senior Professor at the School of Foreign Languages, Nanjing Normal University (Nanjing 210097, China). His primary research areas include semiotics and foreign literature (Email: z-jie1016@hotmail.com). **Yao Tingting** (corresponding author) is Lecturer at School of Foreign Languages, Nanjing Normal University (Nanjing 210097, China). Her current academic research mainly focuses on translation and semiotics (Email: Karen1020@aliyun.com).

长期以来，文学史的撰写一直是我国外国文学研究界关注的重要问题。俄罗斯文学史作为我国建国初期以来一直备受重视的研究领域，就更是如此。但是，由于受到时代的局限和资料的匮乏，17世纪之前的古罗斯文学长期无人涉足。然而，吴笛教授不畏艰难，在其国家社会科学基金重点项目成果《俄罗斯小说发展史》顺利出版并荣获浙江省人民政府哲学社会科学优秀成果奖一等奖之后，他的又一部国家社会科学基金重点项目成果《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》如今面世了。这是值得庆贺的。

究竟应该如何撰写好一部文学史，如何处理好文学史实与研究者的学术个性之间的关系？吴笛教授通过《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》和《俄罗斯小说发展史》的撰写，很好地诠释了这些问题。这两部文学史作不仅为我们提供了两部完整的俄罗斯文学体裁史，弥补了我国俄罗斯文学研究中的不足，而且更重要的是为我们展示了作者吴笛教授的文学史书写思想，以及他对我国外国文学研究所做出的杰出贡献。

在我国的外国文学研究界，吴笛教授是一位非常独特的学者，他能够娴熟地运用俄语和英语两种语言来阅读原文原作，不仅保证了对国外文学创作的原汁原味的接受，而且还可以从不同国家学者的视角来观照研究对象，从而为研究奠定了坚实的基础。同时，吴笛教授既是一位研究型学者，又是一位创作型诗人。这就更便于他从创作的维度来审视作品，跨越了理性思维与形象思维的鸿沟，形成了自己独特的研究思想和风格。特别值得指出的是，吴笛教授长期以来一直在浙江大学文学院任教，担任世界文学与比较文学研究所所长。他在俄罗斯文学史的研究过程中，始终坚持从中国学者的立场来看待俄罗斯文学的发展。他所完成的两部俄罗斯文学史作，充分体现了中国学者研究的独特视角。正如吴笛教授本人在《俄罗斯小说发展史》结语部分所写道的那样：“在撰写中，还特别注意体现中国学者的学术立场。尤其是改变俄罗斯文学研究界长期存在的俄国与欧美、本土与侨民两种倾向矛盾和对峙的局面，力求客观公正，尤其是客观介入被忽略的作家的研究，既汲取俄罗斯和西方学者的研究成果，又充分体现中国学者的学术话语和独立的学术立场，以客观真实地展现俄罗斯小说艺术发展的历史进程为本书的学术追求”（537）。

## 一、批判的接受：尊重历史

在对俄罗斯诗歌史的研究过程中，吴笛教授对于国外学者的意见，哪怕是著名学者的论断，也总是要进行史实的认真考察，从不人云亦云。在英美俄罗斯诗歌研究界，通常把俄罗斯诗歌创作视为始于18世纪，最为典型的是英国研究俄罗斯诗歌的学者彼得·弗朗斯（Peter France）的观点。弗朗斯曾经断言，俄罗斯诗歌开始于18世纪。<sup>1</sup>正是这些观点的存在，影响了整个学界对18世纪之前的俄罗斯诗歌的关注。现有的一些俄罗斯诗歌研究著作，大多涉及的是19世纪和20世纪的诗歌创作。

然而，吴笛教授以批判的接受姿态，尊重历史，把俄罗斯诗歌史的研究推进到了公元10世纪。他在《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》一书中，对10世纪至17世纪的我国学界尚未涉及的古罗斯诗歌进行了独到的论述，发掘古罗斯诗歌艺术渊源。他认为古罗斯“以‘圣诞歌’、‘壮士歌’和英雄史诗为主要代表的民间诗歌，对于理解和认知长达七个世纪的古罗斯文化，具有独特的意义”（5）。他探究诗歌发展的渊源、不同体裁的发展、不同诗体形式的演变，以及不同历史时期的主导意涵、诗学特征、诗歌艺术技艺、民族文化内涵；探究诗歌艺术在俄罗斯历史文化、民族意识以及个体诗人内心精神世界的折射。

俄罗斯诗歌艺术是世界文化遗产的瑰宝，全面探究其生成渊源，弘扬优秀文化具有重要的理论意义。相比较已有的研究成果，特别是俄罗斯诗歌史，多数学者对19世纪普希金以来的俄罗斯诗歌充分重视。相反，对普希金之前的俄罗斯诗歌创作缺乏足够的关注，或者有所忽略甚至一笔带过的倾向。这样一来，普希金以来的诗歌创作仿佛就缺少了民族创作的根基和渊源，显然是不完整的。吴笛教授努力改变这一现状，这显然是前无古人的研究，无论是古罗斯语言的难以理解，还是散落民间诗歌的收集难度，其任务的艰巨性都是难以想象的。

吴笛教授在《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》一书中，以将近一半的篇幅探究18世纪之前的俄罗斯诗歌艺术的渊源和发展、音节诗等诗体的生成和演变轨迹，对19世纪初期普希金登台之前的诗歌亦给予一定的篇幅进行探究，力图呈现俄罗斯诗歌发展的全部真实历程。

其实，吴笛教授的研究目的还远不在于此。他在努力还原俄罗斯诗歌史发展原貌的同时，更是立足于我国文化自身的建设，为了我国文化强国建设的需求。俄罗斯诗歌对中国读者具有根深蒂固的影响，研究俄罗斯诗歌的发展历程，尤其是普希金等一些著名俄罗斯诗人的作品，在我国国民文学修养以及国民素质提升方面，均起到了潜移默化的作用。无疑，俄罗斯诗歌对中俄文化交流以及中国文化建设亦发挥了重要的借鉴作用。吴笛教授曾经多次

1 参见 Peter France, *Poets of Modern Russia*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982, 1.

强调,《俄罗斯古代诗歌发展史》的撰写的一个愿望,是力图对于我国文化事业的发展,弘扬先进文化,尤其是文学文类学研究和中外文化交流,具有一定的推动作用。

当然,吴笛教授作为一位长期工作在我国高校外国文学教学第一线的教师,更是通过希望对于俄罗斯文学史的撰写,不断丰富教学实践,为我国的人才培养做出自己应有的贡献。

自20世纪90年代初苏联解体之后,由于世界格局所发生的变化以及我国文化发展的新局面,包括俄罗斯诗歌史在内的俄罗斯文学发展历史,都面临反思和重写。过去所撰写的一些文学史类著作在新的历史语境下,已经很难适应科研和教学工作的需求,迫切需要具有创新意识的全面探究俄罗斯体裁文学史类新的著作的面世,以求正本清源,适应我国新时代文化建设的需求。这就是吴笛教授的创作初心和目的。

## 二、客观的评价:实事求是

吴笛教授的《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》不仅把研究对象推进至公元10世纪,重点研究10世纪至19世纪中后期的俄罗斯古代诗歌,而且着力对俄罗斯诗歌的发展作连贯的、完整的书写。他从比较的维度,采用实事求是的科学态度,对俄罗斯诗歌的渊源和成型,进行客观的评价,尤其是注意区分客观史实与研究者的评价,做到“述”与“论”的互相补充。这样既可以让读者清晰可见哪些是客观存在的文学史实,即创作本身,哪些属于本书作者自己的个人见解,哪些属于当时社会环境的影响,哪些又是后人随着时代变化的不断阐释。吴笛教授把文学的正向发展,即渊源流变,与文学的逆向发展,即接受阐释,相互结合起来。这样一来,这部《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》就成为了既是一部描述俄罗斯诗歌发展“古代史”,又是呈现当代人接受和阐释的“当代史”。

这部“古代史”主要探寻始于公元988年直至17世纪的俄罗斯诗歌的源头。第一部分“俄罗斯诗歌的渊源”主要发掘俄罗斯诗歌艺术的渊源。尽管很多研究所关注的是19世纪以后的俄罗斯诗歌,仿佛俄罗斯诗歌是在没有谱系的情况下突然降临的,但是,形成于公元10世纪至17世纪的俄罗斯诗歌的源头无疑是不容忽略的,英雄史诗《伊戈尔远征记》(Слово о полку Игореве)等诗歌艺术成就代表了俄罗斯诗歌艺术的高超,波洛茨基(Симеон Полоцкий)以音节诗体所创作的被誉为俄罗斯的第一部诗集的《多彩的花园》(Вертоград многоцветный, 1676-1680),已经含有典型的寓教于乐的成分,以及文学所特有的伦理教诲功能。

在此基础之上,第二部分为“俄罗斯诗歌的成型”共有三章,主要探究18世纪的俄罗斯诗歌的成型,以及以古典主义诗歌和感伤主义诗歌为代表的诗歌创作与西欧诗歌的接轨。这一部分主要聚焦于俄国18世纪诗歌。实际

上, 18 世纪俄罗斯诗歌在古典主义和感伤主义两个方面所取得的成就已经令人赞叹。罗蒙诺索夫 (Михаил Васильевич Ломоносов)、特列佳科夫斯基 (Василий Кириллович Тредиаковский)、卡拉姆津 (Николай Михайлович Карамзин) 等诗人的创作, 已经开始接轨于世界诗坛, 为俄罗斯诗歌艺术开创了新的篇章, 尤其是俄罗斯重音 - 音节诗律的最终成型, 为 19 世纪俄罗斯诗歌的辉煌奠定了扎实的根基。第三部分是“黄金时代: 俄罗斯诗歌的辉煌”, 共有五章, 所研究的是俄罗斯诗歌的“黄金时代”, 即 19 世纪上半叶以普希金为代表的俄罗斯诗歌的辉煌。这一部分主要探究的是 19 世纪俄国浪漫主义时期的诗歌创作。经过 18 世纪罗蒙诺索夫、卡拉姆津等诗人的努力, 以及在亚历山大一世统治时期茹可夫斯基 (Василий Андреевич Жуковский)、巴丘什科夫 (Константин Николаевич Батюшков)、维亚泽姆斯基 (Пётр Андреевич Вяземский) 等诗人的共同的努力, 为普希金 (Александр Сергеевич Пушкин)、莱蒙托夫 (Михаил Юрьевич Лермонтов)、巴拉丁斯基 (Евгений Абрамович Баратынский)、丘特切夫 (Федор Иванович Тютчев), 以及雷列耶夫 (Кондратий Фёдорович Рылёв) 等十二月党人诗歌的登场, 铺平了道路, 俄罗斯诗歌不仅逐渐与西欧诗歌接轨, 并且在世界诗坛占据了主导地位。

本书的第四部分为“多元发展: 现实与唯美的冲撞”, 共有四章, 所研究的是 19 世纪下半叶俄罗斯诗歌在浪漫主义思潮退潮之后朝现实主义和唯美主义的两极发展以及相应的诗歌艺术成就。这一部分主要探究浪漫主义思潮之后, 19 世纪中下叶俄罗斯诗歌中所出现的唯美主义诗歌和现实主义诗歌这两种不同的创作倾向。在这一时期, 曾经作为浪漫主义杰出诗人并且抒写公民诗的丘特切夫, 开始在“杰尼西耶娃组诗”等诗篇中出现了一定的现代色彩, 为象征主义等现代诗歌发挥了先驱的作用, 与此同时, 涅克拉索夫 (Николай Алексеевич Некрасов)、屠格涅夫 (Иван Сергеевич Тургенев) 等诗人, 为俄罗斯现实主义诗歌的发展作出了杰出的贡献。而费特 (Фёдор Афанасий Афанасьевич)、阿·康·托尔斯泰 (Алексей Константинович Толстой)、波隆斯基 (Якова Петровича Полонского)、迈科夫 (Аполлон Николаевич Майков)、斯卢切夫斯基 (Константин Константинович Случевский)、阿普赫京 (Алексей Николаевич Апухтин)、索洛维约夫 (Соловьёв Владимир Сергеевич) 等一些具有唯美主义倾向的诗人, 强调审美的非功利性和艺术的独立价值, 不仅为俄国唯美主义诗歌艺术发挥了应有的作用, 同时也在一定程度上折射了俄罗斯诗歌从黄金时代到白银时代的转向。

如果说这部“古代史”又是一部“当代史”, 这就是全书渗透着吴笛教授本人在“当代”对俄罗斯古代诗歌史的评价, 显示出中国学者的“当代”立场。吴笛教授学术视野极其开阔, 描绘了一张俄罗斯诗歌发展的全景地图。这张地图始于民间文化的渊源和对西欧诗歌创作的借鉴, 逐渐成为傲然独立于

世界诗坛的诗歌王国。吴笛教授揭示了俄罗斯诗歌与西欧诗歌的脱轨到与世界诗坛的接轨，展示了俄罗斯诗歌艺术的独特魅力以及俄罗斯诗歌在中国的译介，甚至还论及俄罗斯诗歌对中国民族文化建设的独到意义等。整部诗歌史呈现出一种开放的态势。也正是从这个意义上说，吴笛教授的《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》又是一部具有当代现实意义的“当代史”。

### 三、与未来接轨：目标追求

任何一部历史都既是客观的，又是主观的，历史是过去史实的记载，又是当代人主观认知的阐释，吴笛教授的《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》和《俄罗斯小说发展史》亦是如此。它既是俄罗斯诗人和小说家创作的结晶，同时也是我们当今接受研究和阐释的文本。然而，吴笛教授的两部俄罗斯文学体裁研究史，还有一个更为显著的特点，这就是它们既是描绘过去的历史，更是面向未来的，是与未来接轨的研究成果。

我国俄罗斯文学研究专家刘文飞教授在《中华读书报》曾就吴笛教授的《俄罗斯小说发展史》撰写了专门的书评，称该书为我国乃至全球最完备的一部俄罗斯小说发展史。刘文飞主要概述了该书的三个特点，一是把俄罗斯小说的历史向前延展了数百年；二是这部文学体裁史充分显示了俄罗斯小说在文学类型学上的丰富性和多样性；三是这是一部具有中国学者独特视角的俄罗斯小说史研究专著。<sup>1</sup>实际上，这三点归结起来就是一片——“接轨未来”。把俄罗斯小说历史的向前延伸了数百年，就是为了当今和未来的读者更清楚地了解俄罗斯小说发展史的全貌，解读历史是为了当下和未来。对俄罗斯小说创作形式丰富性与多样性的揭示，就是为了让丰富的艺术世界去拥抱未来多彩的世界，让我们的地球变得更加丰富多彩。以中国学者的立场来观照俄罗斯小说的发展，并非只是坚持以“我”为主的研究视野，而是要让中国学术融入世界，让未来的世界更加多元和充满活力。

可以说，吴笛教授撰写的这部俄罗斯小说发展史是一部真正意义上的小说通史。这种“通”不只是接通了俄罗斯小说创作的传统，从基辅罗斯时期的“小说”或曰“准小说”谈起，在俄国古代文学中梳理出了一种小说叙事传统，在各类文体中发掘小说出叙事元素。在作者看来，无论是编年史还是圣徒传，其中都具有一定程度的小说要素。<sup>2</sup>19世纪辉煌的俄罗斯小说史不可能没有祖先，没有谱系，突然腾空而起。作者把《往年故事》（*Повесть временных лет*）、《拔都侵袭梁赞的故事》（*История нашествия Батыя на Рязань*）、《亚历山大·涅夫斯基传》（*Александр Невский*），甚或英雄史诗《伊戈尔远征记》等作品视为俄国小说的“源头”和“雏形”。

1 参见刘文飞：“俄国小说史的完整概括和丰盈呈现”，《中华读书报》2023年12月20日，第19版。

2 参见吴笛：《俄罗斯小说发展史》，杭州：浙江工商大学出版社，2022年，第18页。

然而，吴笛教授的创作追求和学术探索并没有就此止步。他的《俄罗斯小说发展史》一共分为五编，第一、二编分别是历史的溯源探索，即“俄罗斯小说的源头与雏形”和“俄罗斯小说的成型”。第三编则是通常学界关注的19世纪，也就是“俄罗斯小说艺术的辉煌”。在最后两编“俄罗斯小说艺术的现代转型”和“俄罗斯小说的当代探索与文化转向”，吴笛教授更加注重当代俄罗斯小说艺术的发展及其如何与未来接轨。这种接轨既是时间的，又是空间的。作者不再将俄罗斯小说的发展强行分为俄国和苏联两部分，而是从俄罗斯民族文化的视角审视其整体的发展线索，力求厘清俄罗斯小说艺术发展的全貌，探索俄罗斯小说的精神和艺术特质以及对世界小说艺术发展所做出的独特贡献。

俄语诗人叶夫图申科（Евгений Александрович Евтушенко）在他早年的长诗《布拉茨克水电站》（*Братская ГЭС*, 1963）中写出这样一段名句：诗人在俄国大于诗人。<sup>1</sup>照此说法，在俄罗斯，小说也大于小说，甚至文学也大于文学。其实，文学的作用在俄罗斯社会的发展中，从来就具有引领社会发展的重要作用。通常是生活走到了尽头，文学就出现了。俄罗斯小说的发展既是社会发展的产物，又是推动社会发展的动力之一。从这个意义上来说，吴笛教授的《俄罗斯小说发展史》就不只是一部总结俄罗斯民族小说创作成就的历史，也积极体现了时代的精神，甚至价值观等的历史变迁，形成与未来世界的对话与接轨。

吴笛教授在《俄罗斯小说发展史》的序言中明确指出：

本书的撰写力求体现国际视野，客观公正地对待在西方受到重视，而在我国和俄罗斯学界受到忽略的小说家，如什梅廖夫等作家的小说创作。对于这些被忽略的作家，也给予一定的篇幅进行论述。在研究俄罗斯文学发展进程的同时，无论是18世纪的拉吉舍夫，19世纪的普希金和果戈理，或是20世纪的布尔加科夫，对于这些经典作家的经典小说，都力图在细读文本的基础上，以跨学科的理念进行深入的探究发掘其中的新的内涵，努力体现中国学者独立的学术立场。（1）

显然，如果用几个关键词来概括吴笛教授这部《俄罗斯小说发展史》的特点，就是“国际视野”“客观公正”“细读文本”“跨学科的理念”以及“中国学者的独立学术立场”。

同样，对于俄罗斯诗歌史研究，吴笛教授写道：

在《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》撰写过程中，作者力图对俄罗斯诗歌的发展进程中的重要阶段作连贯的、完整的书写。聚焦古罗斯

1 参见刘文飞：“叶夫图申科：我不善于道别”，《文艺报》2017年4月10日，第3版。

和近代这两个重要的发展时期，对俄罗斯诗歌的渊源和成形、对俄罗斯诗歌从对西欧的借鉴到傲然独立于世界诗坛，对俄罗斯诗歌与西欧诗歌的脱轨到与世界诗坛的接轨，对俄罗斯诗歌艺术的独特魅力、俄罗斯诗歌在中国的译介与交流以及对中国民族文化建设的独到意义等方面的问题，进行深入的探究和思考。（《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》460-461）

可见，无论是70多万字的《俄罗斯小说发展史》，还是50多万字的《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》，吴笛教授总是以中国学者的学术立场以及世界文学的宏观视野来对文学史现象进行独到的审视。

吴笛教授既是一位学者又是一位作家，他的文本细读不少是从创作的维度来思考的。他不断追求文学创作与读者心灵上的沟通与互动。他的《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》和《俄罗斯小说发展史》就是一座连接不同时代、不同国度作者与读者之间的桥梁。

### Works Cited

France, Peter. *Poets of Modern Russia*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1982.

刘文飞：“俄国小说史的完整概括和丰盈呈现”，《中华读书报》2023年12月20日，第19版。

[Liu Wenfei. “A Complete Summary and Abundant Presentation of Russian Fiction History.” *China Reading Weekly* 20 December 2023: 19.]

——：“叶夫图申科：我不善于道别”，《文艺报》2017年4月10日，第3版。

[—.“Yevtushenkov: I’m Not Good at Farewells.” *Literary Gazette* 10 April 2017: 3.]

吴笛：《俄罗斯小说发展史》。杭州：浙江工商大学出版社，2022年。

[Wu Di. *History of the Development of the Russian Fiction*. Hangzhou: Zhejiang Gongshang UP, 2022.]

——：《古罗斯与近代俄国诗歌发展史》。上海：上海人民出版社，2024年。

[—.*History of the Development of Old Rus’ and Modern Russian Poetry*. Shanghai: Shanghai People’s Publishing House, 2024.]

# Is the Divine Model of Literary Creation Obsolete? Ironies, Paradoxes, and Insights

**Gu Mingdong**

**Abstract:** Across cultures, the divine has often been used as the ultimate yardstick for measuring the achievement of an artist and hence become the aesthetic ideal in artistic creation. The relationship between the divine and the artist, however, is a controversial topic. While some scholars consider the divine model of creation still has some value for aesthetic studies, some others dismiss it as meaningless to creation in our time. To better understand the complexity of the controversy, this paper conducts an inquiry into some cross-cultural ideas of the divine in aesthetic thought and attempts to reveal the similarities and differences as well as the subtleties, ironies, and paradoxes that often escape the attention of scholars and theorists in the realm of literature and art.

**Keywords:** divinity; artist as god; creative model; aesthetic ideal; human creativity

**Author:** **Gu Mingdong** is Distinguished Visiting Professor in the School of International Studies at Yangzhou University (Yangzhou 225000, China) and Katherine R. Cecil Professor in the School of Arts, Humanities, Technology at University of Texas at Dallas (Dallas 75080, USA). His research interests include comparative literature, poetics, critical theory, comparative thought, and cultural studies (Email: mdgu@utdallas.edu).

**标题:** 神性文学创作模式过时了吗？相关争论的反讽、悖论与洞见

**内容摘要:** “神”这一概念在不同文化中一直被用来作为衡量一位艺术家成就的最高标准，因而成为艺术创作中的审美理想。但是，神性与艺术家的关系却是一个颇有争议的话题。一些学者认为神性文学创作模式对审美研究仍然具有一定的价值，而另一些学者则认为其对当代的创作毫无意义而不屑一顾。为了更好地理解这一争议，本文对跨文化美学思想中的相关观念进行研究，试图揭示此争议中常为文艺领域的学者和理论家所忽视的异同、微妙之处、反讽及悖论。

**关键词:** 神性；如神的作者；创作模式；审美理想；人的创造力

**作者简介:** 顾明栋，扬州大学外国语学院特聘客座教授、美国达拉斯德州大学人文艺术学院凯萨琳·西塞尔讲席教授，主要研究领域包括西方文论、英美文学和中外文学文化关系等。

Artistic creativity is a human endeavor, but in major literary traditions, creativity is believed to relate to the divine. In Greek mythology, creativity is attributed to the Muses, daughters of the supreme god Zeus.<sup>1</sup> In early Greek thought, Plato considered literary creativity as a kind of divine madness that possesses the poet.<sup>2</sup> In classical times, Julius Caesar Scaliger, influenced by Plato's idea of divine inspirations, proclaims: "while they [other arts] [...] represent things just as they are, in some sense like a speaking picture, the poet depicts quite another sort of nature, and a variety of fortunes; in fact, by so doing, he transforms himself almost into a second deity" (139). This line of thought continued into the Age of Enlightenment. In his magna opus, *New Science*, a treatise supposed to probe into history, language, poetry, and human sciences in rationalist terms, Vico suggests that poetic "wisdom began with the Muse, whom Homer in a golden passage of the *Odyssey*, defines as the knowledge of good and evil or what was later called divination [...] This popular wisdom contemplated God in the attributes of His providence, so that from divinari, to divine, his essence was called divinity" (325).

Up to our own time, people across cultures are fond of using god or gods as the ultimate yardstick for measuring the artistic achievement of an artist. A most common practice is to view the relationship between the artist and his creation in terms of an analogy that treats the latter as a god. As a result, the divine continues to be the aesthetic ideal in artistic representation. It is therefore reasonable to believe that the concept of art as being related to the divine is not obsolete, at least in popular parlance. As I will show shortly, in the domains of literary and art criticism, the idea of the artist as a god has given rise to a divine model of artistic creation, endorsed by some prominent creative artists and thinkers. The relationship between the divine and artistic creation, however, is a topic that has aroused controversies in our time. While some scholars consider the divine model of creation still has some value for literary studies, some theorists like Roland Barthes and Jonathan Culler have expressed views which practically dismisses the divine model as meaningless to creation.<sup>3</sup> To better understand the complexity of this controversial topic, I will conduct an inquiry into some cross-cultural ideas of the divine in aesthetic thought

1 See Edith Hamilton, *Mythology: Timeless Tales of Gods and Heroes*, New York: Mentor Book, 1969, 37.

2 See Plato, *The Collected Dialogues of Plato*, edited by Edith Hamilton and Huntington Cairns, Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1961, 220.

3 For example, while Roland Barthes argues against the text as an entity "releasing a single 'theological' meaning the 'message' of the Author God," Jonathan Culler simply dismisses the divine conception of literary creation as "useless." See Bathes, "The Death of the Author," *Image Music Text*, New York: Hill and Wang, 1977, 146; Culler, "Omniscience," *Narrative* 12 (2004): 23.

and attempt to reveal the similarities and differences as well as the subtleties, ironies, and paradoxes that often escape the attention of scholars and theorists in the realm of literature and art.

### I. The Nature of the Divine Model in Conceptual Terms

Generally speaking, the divine is conceived in two major modes, one theological and the other intellectual. The theological approach conceives the divine as a creator of the world or primal mover of nature. The intellectual approach conceives the divine as the first principle in nature perceived by the human intellect. This article will examine both conceptions. Interestingly, the divine in the second conception is also called “One” or *pneuma* in both Chinese and Western traditions, which covers a gamut of ideas related to intellect and reason. For meaningful comparison, I will select conceptions by Plotinus from the West and Liu Xie from China, as both thinkers synthesized ideas of the divine prior to them and served as a connection with later thinkers. In Plotinus’ conception, the One manifests itself in a triad: the Good, the Intellect and its knowledge, and the intellectual principle. As a result, in his discourse, the discussion of gods is largely conducted in a symbolic manner. In Liu Xie’s conception, the One is called *shenli* (divine principle), equivalent to the Dao, and manifests itself through virtue, sages, and human spirituality. Although both talked about the divine, their conceptions of gods have little implication of a personal creation god in the Christian sense. In Plotinus’s discourse, he did talk about gods as prior models for artistic imitation, but these gods are simply perfect forms like Plato’s Idea or Aristotle’s artistic ideals, objects for the highest order of imitation. In many ways, Plotinus’s conception of gods represents a metaphysical notion that comprises both the Platonic Idea and Aristotle’s empirical Ideal. In his analysis of Greek art, images of Helen, Aphrodite, and other gods are universally acknowledged images of beauty. Where does their beauty come from? Plotinus answered this question with a series of rhetorical questions meant as answers: “Is not this beauty everywhere form, which comes from the maker upon that which he has brought into being, as in the arts it was said to come from the arts upon their works? Well, then, are the things made and the forming principle in matter beautiful, but the forming principle, which is not in matter but in the maker, the first immaterial one, is that not beauty?” (243) The forming principle is rooted in intellect and is both transcendental and immanent, subjective and objective: “There is therefore in nature a rational forming principle which is the archetype of the beauty in body, and the rational principle in soul is more beautiful than that in nature, and is also the source of that in nature” (245).

The subjective and objective duality also underlies the Chinese conception of the divine in art. In traditional China, popular belief holds that everything in the universe is endowed with *shen* (the divine or essence). Mountains, rivers, forests, and land, each has a god (or spirit) who is often personified. Philosophers hold a similar view albeit in impersonal and non-theological terms. Guanzi (d. 645 B.C.), for example, said: “The essence of myriad objects can transform to give life. On earth, it generates five grains. In heaven it gave rise to various stars. When it floats between heaven and earth, it is called ghosts and the divine. Hidden in a person’s heart, it turns him into a sage” (*Guanzi* 154). In this passage, *shen* or the divine obviously refers to the essence of myriad things in the universe, as well as to the intellect and its knowledge in the mind. This Chinese conception comes even closer to Abrams’s view of Platonism in the Renaissance, which connects the Idea in the individual mind with the universal Idea in nature.

Here, we need to pay a special attention to the choice of words in the Chinese phrasing. The divine essence is like a floating energy, which flows to and resides in myriad things in the universe. This energy is also called *qi* (literally “air,” metaphysically pneuma) in Chinese philosophical thinking, and *wenqi* (literary pneuma) [a compound word which combines *wen* and *qi*] in aesthetic thought. What is the relationship between *shen* (the divine) and *qi* (pneuma)? Liu Dakui (1698-1779 AD), a Qing dynasty poet-scholar, described their relationship thus: “The divine is the master of pneuma. The pneuma is the function of the divine. The divine is the essence of pneuma” (“Lunwen ouji” 137). He meant that the divine controls literary creativity and literary works represent the outward manifestation of the divine. The ultimate source of creativity is the divine. Here again, we see the duality of transcendence and immanence in the divine. Renaissance Platonism also viewed the divine Idea as something that flows in the universe. Only, while the Chinese use the analogy of air, their Renaissance equivalents employ an optical analogy, “according to which rays of archetypal beauty, streaming from the countenance of God, are reflected in three mirrors, one in the angels, a second in the souls of men, a third in the material world” (Abrams 44).

Plotinus’s view of the artist/nature relationship and Liu Xie’s view of the same relationship are mutually illuminating. From one direction, Plotinus’s view provides an insight into the Chinese conception of the relationship between the Dao and literature, first posited by Liu Xie and continuously expounded by later theorists like Ye Xie. Plotinus thought that there are two kinds of wisdom involved in artistic imitation: the wisdom of nature and the wisdom of the artist. The wisdom of nature, which presides at artistic making, is everywhere: “Some wisdom makes

all the things which have come into being, whether they are products of art or nature, and everywhere it is a wisdom which is in charge of their making” (Plotinus 253). Plotinus viewed it as coming from the ultimately unknowable One. In this sense, the first kind of wisdom resembles and illuminates Liu Xie’s *shenli* (divine principle) which is responsible for “all creations in the universe” (Liu Xie 18). Plotinus recognized the wisdom of the artist as a separate category, but he also viewed it as inseparably bound to the wisdom of nature: “But the craftsman goes back again to the wisdom of nature, according to which he has come into existence, a wisdom which is no longer composed of theorems, but is one thing as a whole, not the wisdom made into one out of many components, but rather resolved into multiplicity from one” (253-255). Plotinus called it “primal wisdom” or “intellectual principle.” It is in nature, yet nature itself is its source. He went to some lengths to explore how nature came to possess it, whether nature derived it from some other source, whether it is self-generative, and drew the conclusion that “The true wisdom [...] is substance, and the true substance is wisdom; and the worth of substance comes from wisdom, and it is because it comes from wisdom that it is true substance” (255).

## II. The Controversy over the Divine Model

Since art is mainly a representation of the observed universe or an expression of inner experiences resulting from observing the universe, conceptions of artistic creation is invariably related to conceptions of the humankind’s relation to the universe or Nature. Each cultural tradition’s approach to the universe is predicated on certain conceptual models. As one scholar points out, “all the definitions of nature and of the human are given in terms of models, models filled by divine, evolutionary, or merely human will” (Owen 83). The creationist model, which conceives of God as the primal maker of the world is one of them. It has exerted a profound impact upon conceptions of art as well as upon the relationship between nature and humanity in Western culture. In literary creation, the creationist model gave rise to a model of literary creativity based on the author-as-god analogy. In 1886, Mark Twain compared his literary creation to that of God: “When the Lord finished the world, he pronounced it good. That is what I said about my first work, too. But Time, I tell you, Time takes the confidence out of these incautious opinions. It is more than likely that He thinks about the world, now, pretty much as I think about the *Innocents Abroad*. The fact is, there is a trifle too much water in both” (DeVoto 764). According to recent studies, this conception is still very much alive. Susan Lanser, for example, notes: “It is not accidental that we use the term author

to refer to God or that the root of the word ‘authority’ links it to the notion of the creator or promoter” (84). In a more systematic study, Barbara K. Olson, taking the author/God analogy seriously, has demonstrated through well-documented research the reasons why the analogy continues to have significance for conceptualizations of authorial creation in narration. In her article on “Omniscience” in narration, Jonathan Culler, despite his criticism of Olson’s study as an “extreme instance” of taking the author-God analogy seriously and his intention to put the analogy behind us, admits to the power of the analogy and acknowledges that it may help us “to imagine the possibility of a creator, a god, a sentient being, as undetectable to us as the novelist would be to the characters who exist in the universe of the text this god created” (23).

Nevertheless, Culler considers the analogy useless to literary study because “The fundamental point is that since we do not know whether there is a God and what she might know, divine omniscience is not a model that helps us think about authors or about literary narration” (ibid.). In a rejoinder, Olson disagrees with Culler’s dismissal of the author-God analogy and cites more evidence to argue that authors from Henry Fielding to Virginia Woolf have long been enamored by the analogy and reflected on literary creation in theological terms. Even authors who consider the belief in the existence of God “obscene” have no qualms in employing the author-as-god model for theorization. Olsen analyzes the case of Woolf, a self-professed atheist, and compares her literary universe to a “narrational cosmology” by quoting from the latter’s own words: “And yet we who have named other presences equally impalpable—and called them God for instance or again The Holy Ghost—have no name but novelist or poet, or sculptor or musician, for this greatest of all preservers and creators” (Woolf 61-62).

Aware of the power of the author-as-God model, some comparative scholars claim that the formation of aesthetic systems is heavily dependent upon metaphysical conceptions of the universe, especially models of cosmogony. Stephen Owen, a scholar of Chinese and comparative literature suggests that the fundamental difference between Chinese aesthetic system and its Western counterpart is largely determined by the historical fact that each tradition followed a different model of cosmogony in high antiquity. In the West, the model of cosmogony is a creationist one based on the Christian conception that God created all living creatures in the world including humans: “Humankind was humankind not in its differentiation from the beasts, but had its identity from a divine model, which it replicated prolifically” (Owen 82). He argues that even after Darwin’s theory of evolution forced many people to abandon the divine model of cosmogony, the creationist model has

had considerable impact upon human conception of teleology and entelechy in metaphysical thinking.

By contrast, the Chinese followed a different model of cosmogony, in which the world was conceived to begin differently than that in the creationist model. In Stephen Owen's apt summary, the world in ancient Chinese conception "simply happened, uncreated either by transcendent plan or empirical necessity" (83). Owen's view is solidly grounded in Chinese thought, especially in the writings of Laozi, Zhuangzi, and Huainanzi. Laozi's *Daode jing* (The Way and Its Power) states: "The Way begets one; one begets two; two begets three; three begets the myriad creature. The myriad creatures carry on their backs the yin and embraces in their arms the yang and are the blending of the generative forces of the two" (Lao Tzu 103). Clearly, the cosmogony conceived by Laozi is different from the creationist model of cosmogony in the Judaic-Christian tradition.

The difference in creative models gave rise to some further differences in poetic creations in the Chinese and Western traditions. In the created world of the West, Owen observes, "The model of a transcendent and hidden Plan, which may end the world as it was begun, authorizes the little 'makers' to fabricate their fictions and metaphors, and the secret meanings of these lesser creations belong to the 'maker' alone: theirs is the power to begin, direct, and end their stories, and their little creatures run through strictly guided paces under the guise of free will" (ibid.). By contrast, in the Chinese tradition, "In the uncreated world such willful fabrication is perverse, a mere deception: the poet is concerned with the authentic presentation of 'what is,' either interior experience or exterior percept. The *shih* poet's function is to see the order in the world, the pattern behind its infinite division; like Confucius, he 'transmits but does not create'" (ibid. 84). In other words, the poet in the Chinese conception is only a transmitter, not a maker in the Greek conception, still less a creator, a minor deity.<sup>1</sup>

### III. Subtle Ironies and Paradoxes of the Divine Model

Owen's conceptualization has made an important connection between Chinese and Western literary traditions. I agree that models of cosmogony may have their impact upon conceptions of artistic creation and aesthetics, but I venture to question the claim that the presence or absence of a divine model of cosmogony in a tradition determines the conception of the artist as a creator or transmitter. I argue that though the dominant model of cosmogony in the Chinese tradition is a self-generative one

1 This view for a time gained a wide currency but was later criticized by a number of scholars. See Yong Ren, "Cosmogony, Fictionality, Poetic Creativity: Western and Traditional Chinese Cultural Perspectives," *Comparative Literature* 2 (1998): 98-119.

and that the primal creator of the universe is generally speaking not a personal God, but there are alternative models of cosmogony and alternative views on the creator of the universe. In high antiquity of the Chinese tradition, the supreme divine being responsible for creating the world is called *Shangdi* or God on High. Later on it was interchangeably used with and gradually replaced by *Tian* (literally, Heaven). In traditional Chinese thought, *Tian* (Heaven) is conceived both as a self-generative force and as a personal God. *Shangshu* (The Book of Documents), one of the oldest Chinese historical documents, states: “Heaven protects human beings below. He designated a king and a teacher for them” (180). This idea is also found in major Chinese schools of thought. In both Confucianism and Mohism, *Tian* is viewed as a personal God (Shangdi or God on High) who has all the characteristic traits of humans. He has his will, personality, and emotions, and can confer legitimacy to rule through the Mandate of Heaven. Emperors of different dynasties are but his sons who are successively given the Mandate to rule. As a result of various models of cosmogony and cosmology, subtle ironies and paradoxes appear in the Chinese conceptualizations of the divine and art in relation to the Western counterpart.

The first paradox is that although in the West, God is believed to be the primal Maker who created human beings in His image, the irony is just the opposite. David Hume may be the earliest thinker to challenge the accepted view on God. He suggested that “the idea of God, as meaning an infinitely intelligent, wise, and good Being, arises from reflection on the operations of our own mind, and augmenting, without limit, those qualities of goodness and wisdom” (97). Later on, Karl Marx (and Feuerbach) astutely pointed out that it is not God who created humankind in His image but humankind who created God in their image. In his critique of Hegel’s dialectic, Marx views the creation of God or the absolute spirit as “an abstraction, and alienation of human life,” which is the very reason for regarding it as a “divine process of mankind,” a “process which man’s abstract, pure, absolute being, as distinguished from himself, traverses” (190). In an ironic way, Marx’s critique contains a vision of human creativity that comes wryly close to the Chinese vision. In the Chinese conception of the divine as personalities, although Chinese thinkers did not explicitly claim that human beings created gods in their images, they made implicit conceptions in this vein. In Chinese thought, while the primal mover in philosophical Daoism is the impersonal Tao, in religious Daoism, the Dao [Tao] has been anthropomorphized as a personal God of creation. The Xiang Er’s Commentary on Laozi’s *Daode jing* (Way and Its Power) is a foundational text of religious Daoism. In it, the Dao [Tao], the impersonal first principle of Chinese metaphysics, is transformed into a personal God of creation. Laozi’s Chapter 4 states: “Do you

not yet know whose child I am? My image preceded the Thearchs.” The Xiang Er’s Commentary explains: “‘I’ refers to the Dao, as does the phrase ‘preceded the Thearchs’” (Bokenkamp 81). Laozi’s Chapter 37 reads: “Since the Dao never acts falsely, nothing is left undone.” The Xiang Er’s Commentary explains: “The nature of the Dao is such that it does not perform evil deeds. Thus it is spiritual and is creative of all things” (ibid. 140). In *Laozi bianhua jing* (the Classic of How Laozi Transforms), another Daoist text, Laozi, the reputed author of the *Daode jing* (the Way and Its Power), becomes a personal God: “He exists at the origin of the Great Beginning, he walks about in the beginning of the Great Simplicity [...] Alone, without companion, he wonders in the times of yore, before there were Heaven and Earth. He comes out of his hidden state and returns there to dwell. Having vanished, he is the Primordial; being manifest, he becomes human. Elusive! Through the transformation of Heaven and Earth and of his spirit, he is made flesh in the bosom of Mother Li” (Schipper 114). Moreover, his cosmic body becomes the model and sources of the whole universe: “Lao Tzu [Laozi] transformed his body. His left eye became the sun; his right eye, the moon; his head became Mount K’un-lun; his beard, the planets and constellations; his bones, dragons; his flesh, four-footed creatures; his intestines, snakes his stomach, the sea; his fingers, the Five peaks; his hair, trees and grasses; his heart, the Flowery Dais; as to his two kidneys, they were united and became one, the Real and True Father and Mother” (ibid. 114).

The transformation of the Dao from a cosmic principle into a personal God and of Laozi into a personal deity who gives rise to the entire universe testifies to the correctness of Marx’s conception of God as a human creation, but at the same time, it complicates the conceptions of cosmogony, cosmology, and the primal creator. It in turn gives rise to alternative models and alternative views with regard to divine and artistic creation. Chinese tradition is deeply rooted in shamanism, which exerted a profound impact upon Daoism as well as artistic creation. The shamanistic beliefs serve as the theoretical and theological foundation for people to believe that a human being can become a god who creates his world, or an immortal who transcends the limitations of this world, or a semi-god, who creates, orders, organizes his own universe. As one scholar of Daoism aptly puts it, “In this dynamic world, which he himself has built, the Taoist sits at the center, as a kind of demiurge, a creating spirit: by locating connecting, identifying, and naming, he gives meaning to the cosmos” (Robinet 16).

In shamanism and religious Daoism, myriad things in the universe can receive the quintessential pneuma floating in the universe and become a god with personalities. In the popular mind, the sky, the earth, mountains, rivers, forests,

valleys, even the kitchen and toilet at home may have a god. Human beings can become gods as well. Yuhuang Dadi (the Great Jade Emperor), the Supreme God in Chinese mythology who is the leader of all gods in heaven, was a legendary prince before he attained divinity through arduous cultivations (*Zhongguo wenhua cidian* 1068-1069). Even real historical persons may become gods and receive sacrifice and worshipping. Guan Yu, a historical person of the Eastern Han, became the Chinese god of war and fortune. Qing Qiong and Yuchi Gong, two generals of the Tang Dynasty became the guardian gods of the house. Zhong Kui, a warrior who committed suicide after he failed a martial examination, became another guardian god who specialized in catching ghosts (*ibid.* 1089). Most significantly, almost all the gods in the Daoist pantheon in the Chinese tradition were ordinary human beings before they were believed to become gods through cultivation.<sup>1</sup> Even the Daoist priests who play the role of media between the human and divine worlds tend to view themselves as a semi-god (medium) who can command various gods in the universe to perform at their rituals and religious services.

The second paradox is to be found in the realm of art. In the West, it is believed that God imparts a kind of divine madness to the artist who involuntarily creates his art work which exerts effects on the audience. In Plato's "Ion," Socrates employs the analogy of how a magnetic stone attracts iron rings to explain the rationale of poetic inspiration and how it works: the god first imparts poetic inspiration to the poet and then gives the rhapsode his skill; the rhapsode transmits the poet's original inspiration from the muse to the audience.<sup>2</sup> Thus, the poet is only one of the links in the chain that connects gods to the audience. In this conception, the artist is by no means a god, but an intermediary possessed by divine madness. At most, he or she can only be viewed as a minor deity or a second god. By contrast, the Chinese penchant for creating gods in human image has complicated the relationship between poets and gods in literature, and further problematized the source of literary creativity. Although the Chinese tradition seldom attributes literary creativity to a goddess as the Greek tradition does, there is no lack of instances in which literary writings are viewed as the results inspired by a goddess.

In the Warring State period, Song Yu (c. 290 BC – c. 223 BC), a famous court

---

1 The Daoist Pantheon consists of hundreds of gods, goddesses, immortals, masters of inner alchemy, and personified natural forces. Its most well-known figures include its founder Laozi, the supreme ruler in heaven the Jade Emperor, the Eight Immortals, and the Three Purities. Most of them are historical personages in the Chinese tradition. In other words, they were "real people" before they were deified in history.

2 See Plato, "Ion," *Norton Anthology of Theory and Criticism*, edited by Vincent B. Leitch, New York: Norton, 2001, 41.

poet wrote a lyric exposition titled “Shennü fu” (rhyme-prose on the goddess). Over history, scholars have paid much attention to its lavish use of ornate language in the description of the goddess, but few have paid much attention to its significance for the study of creative inspiration. The writing is accompanied by a preface, which gives a detailed account of how the writing came to be written. According to the preface, King Xiang of Chu and Song Yu had a visit to the Yunmeng (Clouds and Dream) Lake. The king ordered Song Yu to write a rhyme prose on the legendary goddess of Gao Tang. That evening, the king dreamt of an encounter with the goddess. The next day, the king told Song Yu of his unusual dream. Song Yu inquired about the details of the dream, but the king said that as he was in a dazed state of mind, inflicted by both joy and a sense of loss, he could only faintly remember seeing an extraordinary lady in his dream. After he awoke from his sleep, he could not remember her appearance and therefore felt very unhappy. Hearing this account, Song Yu put his imagination to work and was able to re-present what the king had dreamt. He gave the king a brief description of the goddess and the king asked him to write down the account in detail. Hence the birth of a brilliant rhyme-prose on the goddess, a lyric writing that has had a lasting impact on the imagination of Chinese writers in history.

This legend offers us an insight into the relationship between the divine and literary creation in the Chinese tradition. As a rule, Chinese creative writers do not view god or goddess as the maker of a literary writing, but they accept them as a source of creative inspiration. In their mind, humans are responsible for the rise of literature and art although they do not deny the inspirational role played by the divine in literary creation. Thus, in the final analysis, the ultimate maker of literature and art is still human, not divine. And the world of the divine created with this conception fully reflects the predominance of rational spirit promoted by Confucianism and historical empiricism. Self-consciously or otherwise, the divine world in Chinese literature and art is an objectification of the human spirit. Li Zehou, the well-known Chinese aesthetician, makes an apt observation on the relationship between the human world and the divine counterpart:

The world of men and that of gods have maintained a direct and complex relationship, not in reality but in imagination; not in conceptual thinking but in artistic fantasy. The inseparable unity of men and gods in dream fantasies of primitive art and reality became a unity of senses and desires in the world of imagination. It is no longer a world of primitive art in which gods were invited to coerce and control the human world, but a world in which human beings

attempted to ascend to heaven to participate in and share the joy of gods. (*Mei de licheng* 90-91)

The objectification of the human spirit in the Chinese tradition gave rise to a literary phenomenon rarely found in the literature and art of the West: it is not gods who created the humans but the humans who created gods. Here, I will only cite a legendary account. In Chinese literary history, Cao Zhi (192-232), the literary genius of the Wei Dynasty, wrote a poetic piece, “Rhyming Prose on the Goddess of River Luo” (Xiao Tong 254-256). The preface to the poetic composition narrates a real account of unfulfilled love, and the poetic composition presents an intriguing case in which a poet turns a fellow human being into a goddess. According to the preface, towards the end of the Eastern Han, Cao Zhi fell in love with Zhen Fu, a daughter of a noble man Zhen Yi, and wanted to marry her. But his wish was not fulfilled, for his father married Zhen Fu to Cao Zhi’s brother, Cao Pi who became the Emperor of the Wei Dynasty. Cao Zhi was so lovesick that he often forgot food and sleep. After many years, Cao Zhi went to the capital to see his brother. The latter showed him a jade pillow inlaid with gold filets, which belonged to Zhen Fu. At the sight of the pillow, Cao Zhi could not help shedding tears. The woman was already dead due to an imperial concubine’s persecution. The emperor bestowed the pillow to Cao Zhi, who traveled back to his home. On his way, he stopped at the River Luo at night. Thinking of the departed beauty, Cao Zhi could not fall asleep. Just as he was about to doze off, the beauty appeared and told him that she was in deep love with him and wanted to be his wife, but fate separated them. While expressing her undying love for Cao Zhi, she gave the latter the pillow, which was part of her dowry. They slept together on the pillow and shared each other’s tender affections. They wanted to live together forever, but the divide between humans and spirits separated them. Overcome by the joy of meeting and the sorrow of separation, Cao Zhi composed a poetic prose. In the prose, Cao Zhi merged Zhen Fu with an existing goddess of the river, Fu Fei.

According to Chinese legends, Fu Fei was a daughter of Fu Xi, the legendary ancestor of the Chinese nation in high antiquity. She was drowned in River Luo and became the river goddess after her death. In Chinese literary history, she seems to be a source of poetic inspiration, if not a Chinese Muse.<sup>1</sup> She first appears in Qu Yuan’s (c. 340 – c. 278 BC) long poem, *Lisao* (Encountering Sorrow) (Qu Yuan 51-62). In that poem, the poet takes an imaginative journey on which he attempts to court the

---

1 I believe that if one wishes to find a goddess of poetry in the Chinese tradition comparable to the Muse in the Western tradition, she may be the most qualified legendary figure.

goddess: “And so I made Feng Lung ride off on a cloud/ To seek out the dwelling-place of the lady Fu-fei. I took off my belt as a pledge of my suit to her,/ And ordered Chien Hsiu to be the go-between” (Qu Yuan 57). Then she figures in Sima Xiaoru’s (179-117 BC) “Shanglin fu” (Rhyme Prose on the Shanglin Park) (Birch 142-153), and finally in Cao Zhi’s “Rhyme Prose on the Goddess of River Luo). What is original and fascinating in Cao Zhi’s lyric composition is that he replaced a legendary goddess with a real person in history. Thereafter, Zhen Fu became the Goddess of River Luo in Chinese mythology. The prose presents a vivid account of the interaction between the human and the divine. Through artistic imagination, Cao Zhi created a river goddess out of a real person. This poetic composition is a typical example, which reveals an irony in Chinese tradition: the artist may not be a god himself, but he is capable of creating a god. Thus, although the Chinese tradition does not have a strong belief in gods as the primal maker of arts, it believes in the human creation of gods both in life and art.

By contrast, although the conception of gods as the ultimate maker of arts is embedded in the Western tradition, it is not a guarantee for the rise of the conception of the artist as a creation god. In fact, it may be an impediment if it is taken too literally. By simple logic, the Greco-Roman conception of the Muses as goddess for arts makes it difficult to attribute the sources of artistic creativity to humans. The Judaic-Christian theology of monotheism made it even more difficult for ancient Western thinkers to conceive of the artist as a god who is the ultimate creator of his art. In the opening of this essay, I have mentioned Scaliger’s well-known idea that by depicting another sort of nature, the poet “transforms himself almost into a second deity” (Scaliger 139). While he heartily agreed with the Greeks in defining the poet as the maker and a creative maker at that, Scaliger took a step backward, admitting that “its common title was furnished it, not by the agreement of men, but by the provident wisdom of nature” (140). He eventually reverted to the Platonic idea of divine inspiration and regarded artists as servants to gods: “Plato first, and then Aristotle, said that there are diversities of inspiration, for some men are born inspired, while others, born ignorant and rude, and even averse to the art, are seized on by the divine madness, and wrested from their lowliness. It is the work of the gods, who, though divine, use even these as their servants. Thus Plato himself, in the *Ion*, calls such men the interpreters and expounders of the gods” (ibid.). In the final analysis, the poet is able to create because he is driven by the gods: “The poets invoke the Muses, that the divine madness may imbue them to do their work” (ibid.). Thus, the ultimate makers are still gods who created all forms of art. By contrast, in Chinese literary thought, literary thinkers conceive of poetry as emanating from the

work of genius and even admit its relation to the creative work by gods or nature, but they firmly believe in its human origin.

#### IV. The Artist as a Pseudo-Deity in Creation

My little comparison suggests an intriguing irony in the Chinese and Western tradition on the matter of divine in art. Because of the creation God, the Western tradition could not go all the way to view the artist as the ultimate creator. At most, it will only accept the conception of the artist as a minor deity, second to the primal God, who can only serve to show the almighty power of the primal Maker. By contrast, though the Chinese tradition does have ideas of creation gods, yet, precisely because it does not set great store by a creation god, it was able to conceive of the artist as a deity, a creative maker. In philosophical as well as creative discourses of the Chinese tradition, there are numerous statements that suggest that it is not nature that drives the artist into creation but the artist who, like a god, drives nature to work for him. There are numerous instances in Chinese metaphysics and aesthetic thought in which the artist is viewed both implicitly and explicitly as a creative god.

In the remaining pages, I will provide some illustrations to argue against the view that because the Chinese tradition lacks a creation god, there is no creative model to conceive the poet as a creative maker. In Chinese history, there are many stories of how a superb artist observes different specimens of bird, fish, or flower for years and is finally able to represent the birdiness, fishiness, and essence of a particular flower. When an art object acquires that essence, it is said to have transmitted the divine spirit (*chuanshen*) or entered the divine (*rushen*). In the philosophical writings of Zhuangzi, there is a parable of the master carpenter. By closely analyzing it, we may see the similarity and difference in the Chinese and Western conception of the divine. In the parable, the Marquis of Lu contracted Carpenter Qing to make an ornate music stand with carved birds and animals. When the stand was finished, people saw the life-likeness of the carved birds and animals and suspected that he must have been a god. The Marquis inquired how he acquired his divine skills. The carpenter gave a detailed account of his material, mental, spiritual, and technical preparations and said: "If I did not do these preparations, I would not have started the job. I was using nature to meet nature. Isn't this the reason the stand makes people suspect that I was a god?" (Zhuangzi 210-211) This parable suggests that contrary to Plato's claim that the idea of an object can only be created by God, Chinese mimetic theory believes that so long as an artist absorbs himself in his creative act and leaves no stones unturned in his observation of objects, cultivation of his creative imagination, and perfection of his skills, he will be able to rival the

Creator and represent his subject as though he was aided by the divine. Clearly, the Chinese belief locates the divine not in heaven but on earth.

This belief in locating the divine in art is not alien to the Western theories of representation. It finds a similar expression in Joshua Reynolds's Platonism, an empiricist revision of Plato's original Idea or Form. Reynolds examined the Platonic belief that all the arts receive their perfection from an ideal beauty, superior to what is found in individual objects in nature and the artist is supposed to ascend heaven and to furnish his mind with the perfect idea of beauty. Like Carpenter Qing in Zhuangzi's parable, Reynolds believed that the divine ideal in art should be sought in the artist. He did not completely reject the Platonic idea of divine inspiration, "The artist is supposed to have ascended the celestial regions, to furnish his mind with this perfect idea of beauty." But he declared: "This great ideal of perfection and beauty are not to be sought in heaven, but upon the earth. They are about us, and upon every side of us" (354-355). And the way of finding the divine is also similar to that in the Chinese parable. It is the cultivation of the eye, which, through "a long habit of observing what any set of objects of the same kind have in common, has acquired the power of discerning what each wants in particular," and enabled the artist to form "an abstract idea of their forms more perfect than any one original" (55). As a summary, Reynolds stated: "Thus it is from a reiterated experience, and a close comparison of the objects in nature, that an artist becomes possessed of the idea of that central form," which is "the abstract of the various individual forms belonging to the class" (*Discourse on Art* 356). Reynolds considered an artist who has achieved the "idea of the perfect state of nature" as having "a right to the epithet of divine," because "it may be said to preside, like a supreme judge, over all the production of nature; appearing to be possessed of the will and intention of the Creator" (355-356).

In Chinese literary thought, there are many famous sayings and poetic lines, which suggest that even though the artist is not a god, he could, through a combination of innate talent and post-natal practice, emulate gods and accomplish their supreme creations (*qiao duo tian gong*). In his comment on some superb poetic lines, Ouyang Xiu (1007-1072) said: "The ingenuity of poetry is like the delicate touches of a painter. From this, one knows that writing can compete with the creator in skills" ("Wen Tingyun Yan Wei shi", vol 2, 6). Some poets expressed similar ideas in their poetics lines. Du Fu (712-770), China's sage poet, expressed an idea of the divine in quite a number of his poems. Here are some of the poetic lines containing this idea:

1. After reading books over ten thousand volumes,

- I feel as though aided by the divine in my composition.
2. Intoxicated by wine I was a passive guest.  
Poems completed, I felt the presence of God.
  3. Welding a pen, gorgeous brocade flies in the wind.  
Your writings appear to possess the divine.
  4. Composing poems among the guests, / And wielding his brush to shake eight bounds; / Known as a master-hand of the time, / He is ever more divine in power with old age.<sup>1</sup>

In a comment on the first couplet in the above poetic lines by Du Fu, Wu Dashou, a literary critic of the Qing Dynasty, remarked:

Writings of poetry and prose will not go far without divine power. The divine is the living pneuma in my body. Du Fu said, “Having read books over ten thousand volumes, / I feel as though aided by the divine in my composition.” When the divine in my body connects with poetry, my god has arrived and I feel as though I were assisted by a supreme being. Why should we consider being inspired by the zither playing of the goddess of River Xiang as the only form of divine assistance? (*Shihua* 371)

This statement affirms that a superb writer is a creative being endowed with inner divine power, which does not necessarily come from without. In other poetic lines by Du Fu, we may find the divine in the subject as well as in the object. When a poet feels aided by the divine, he may be said to be in a subjective state described by Plato as possessed by God. When a poetic composition is said to be endowed with the divine, it is believed to have captured the divine in the objective world. Whether it is a subjective state of the mind or an objective state of an object, the divine in Chinese aesthetic theory has a transcendental nature, which coincides with Plato’s Idea of an object. Nevertheless, it is also immanent in the represented object. Sikong Tu (837-908) in his *Twenty Four Forms of Poetry* characterized it as something that objectively transcends outward appearance and subjectively exists in the artist’s mind: “It rises beyond the image, / And yet is obtainable within a poet’s contemplation” (38).<sup>2</sup>

1 All the poetic lines are quoted from *Qian zhu Dushi* (Du Fu’s Poetry Annotated by Qian Qianyi) (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1958), 1, 321.

2 Previous scholarship has annotated “huanzhong” as referring to Zhuangzi’s metaphorical state of emptiness and transcendence. I have adopted its literal meaning, “dunei” (in one’s contemplation).

By now, the fundamental difference between ancient Western and Chinese thinkers on the divine in art is clear. Western thinkers believed that human beings are not divine and therefore cannot emulate gods; hence the divine can only serve as the ultimate aesthetic ideal beyond the reach of human artists who can only approximate it. By contrast, Chinese thinkers believed that the divine is not alien to humans. A first-rate artist is a creative deity whose creation is capable of capturing the spiritual essence of representation and rival nature. This conception of the artist started with metaphysical inquiries into the relationship between Man and the universe, was transposed into inquiries into literature and art, and continued to be upheld by thinkers and artists throughout the dynastic history of China. Here, I will cite another ancient Chinese thinker's view as an illustration. Ye Xie (1627-1703), a scholar-poet of the Qing Dynasty, further enriched the line of thought pioneered by his predecessors in metaphysical and aesthetic inquiries. Like his predecessors, he continued to think of the relationship between nature and art in terms of the divine: "Wind, clouds, rain, and thunder constitute the great pattern/literature (*wen*) of heaven and earth. They change and transform in such an unpredictable manner that no one can envisage their bounds. They are therefore the ultimate gods of heaven and earth and also the ultimate pattern/literature" (72). He viewed the universe as an entity with divine luminosity and art as a creation resulting from the joint work of nature and man. He rejected a popular view of literature as a result of following certain mechanical rules but located the law of literary creation in divine luminosity: "I say that poetic composition requires another method, which lies in the divine luminosity, but beyond skilled competence. It is the so-called method in which changes and transformations give birth to a creative mind" (21).

In conceptualizing the relationship between the world and the artist, Ye Xie posited two series of terms to discuss the subjective and objective conditions of literary creativity, which correspond respectively with the subjective and objective divine advanced by his predecessors. Furthermore, he explored how the integration of the two turns the writer into a godlike creator. He first discussed the objective divine in the universe: "The three terms, *li* (principle), *shi* (event), and *qing* (condition), can exhaustively encompass the transformations of myriad things in the world. No shapes, colors, sounds, or appearances can exist independent of them. When we talk about their presence in things, there is nothing that can escape from them" (*Yuanshi* 23). Evidently, these three terms cover the internal operations of the universe. Then he discussed the subjective divine: "The four other terms, *cai* (talent), *dan* (courage), *shi* (learning), and *li* (energy), can exhaustively encompass the divine luminosity in the mind. All shapes and colors, sounds and appearances,

depend on these four qualities to rise and propagate, and to become known and manifest” (ibid.). These four terms concern the creative consciousness of a writer’s mind in the creation of a literary work. When the subjective divine meets the objective divine, the writer becomes a god-like person who creates a world that rivals the natural world.<sup>1</sup> Ye Xie’s conception explores how the subjective and objective divine relate to each other in the triple relationship of the artist, art, and the world. It exemplifies an aesthetic condition called *shensi* (literally, “divine thinking”; figuratively, “imaginative thinking” or “daemonic thinking” in Goethe’s conception of poetic creation). Liu Xie, who wrote the first comprehensive poetics in the Chinese tradition, views “divine thinking” (359) as a creative process through which the subjective divine in the artist grasps the objective divine in the universe and brings about a fusion of the two. Through “divine thinking,” an artist enters the realm of the divine, an imaginative space constructed on the subjective perception of the objective essence in an object and creates a representational totality that encompasses the subjective divine in the artist and the objective divine in the world. By penetrating the secret of the divine order, the artist may be considered to have achieved the highest order of artistic creation in the Chinese tradition and attained the stature of a creative god.

### **Conclusion: Divine Conception as Infinite Potential of Human Creation**

On the nature of the divine and the relationship between the human world and the divine world, the Chinese conception shares both similarities to and differences from its Western counterpart. While both traditions view the divine as a supernatural power beyond human ken, they differ as to how the divine is related to human beings. Whereas in the West, the divine is always humanized as a personal god responsible for the creation of the world, the Chinese divine is not always a personal god who creates everything in Nature, but often an invisible, all-present, and ineffable force that makes things be themselves. In analytic terms, the Chinese divine comes close to the Platonic Idea or Form and converges with the neo-Platonic conception of the divine as the spiritual essence of an entity, human or natural. When the Chinese divine is humanized, it is not monotheistic but polytheistic or pantheistic. Anything and everything may be endowed with the quintessential *pneuma* between heaven and earth and become a god with supernatural powers. This way of thinking makes it easier for the Chinese to attribute divine powers to humans and to conceive of the artist as a minor deity who creates an art work that rivals Nature. But ultimately, the Chinese and Western traditions share one

---

1 See Ye Xie, *Yuanshi (Origins of Poetry)*, Beijing: Renmin Wenxue Chubanshe, 1979, 24.

common conception of the divine, aptly described by Northrop Frye as an unlimited projection of the human potential. The artist as god is thus a creator of an aesthetic universe centering on “a universal man” who is also “a divine being conceived in anthropomorphic terms” (Frye 120). In the final analysis, the divine model of art is essentially a humanistic approach to the creation and conception of art. As such, it will continue to be relevant to our life and study of art.

### Works Cited

- Abrams, M. H. *The Mirror and the Lamp: Romantic Theory and The Critical Tradition*. New York: Norton, 1953.
- Bathes, Roland. “The Death of the Author.” *Image Music Text*. New York: Hill and Wang, 1977.
- Bokenkamp, Stephen. *Early Daoist Scriptures*. Berkeley: U of California P, 1997.
- Cao Zhi. “Luoshen Fu (‘Rhyming Prose on the Goddess of River Luo’).” *Wenxuan (Selections of Refined Writings)*, compiled by Xiao Tong. Taipei: Qiming Shuju, 1960. 254-256.
- Culler, Jonathan. “Omniscience.” *Narrative* 12 (2004): 22-35.
- DeVoto, Bernard, ed. *The Portable Mark Twain*. New York: Viking, 1946.
- Frye, Northrop. *Anatomy of Criticism: Four Essays*. Princeton: Princeton UP, 1957.
- Guan Zi. *Guanzi (Writings of Master Guan)*. *Ershi'er Zi (Writings of Twenty-Two Masters)*. Shanghai: Shanghai Guji Chubanshe, 1986.
- Hamilton, Edith. *Mythology: Timeless Tales of Gods and Heroes*. New York: Mentor Book, 1969.
- Hume, David. *An Enquiry Concerning Human Understanding*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1999.
- Lanser, Susan. *The Narrative Act*. Princeton: Princeton UP, 1981.
- Lao Tzu. *Tao Te Ching*, translated by D.C. Lau. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1963.
- Li Zehou. *Mei De Licheng (A Journey of Beauty)*. Beijing: Zhongguo Shehui Kexue Chubanshe, 1984.
- Liu Dakui. “Lunwen Ouji (‘A Random Note on Literary Discussions’).” *Zhongguo Liedai Wenlun Xuan (Selections of Chinese Literary Theories through the Dynasties)*. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1963.
- Liu Xie. *Wenxin Diaolong (Literary Mind and the Carving of Dragons)*. Jinan: Qilu Shushe, 1995.
- Marx, Karl. *Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts*, translated by T. B. Bottomore. *Marx’s Concept of Man*, Erich Fromm. New York: Frederick Ungar Publishing Co., 1966.
- Olson, Barbara. *Authorial Divinity in the Twentieth Century: Omniscient Narration in Woolf, Hemingway, and Others*. Cranbury, NJ: Associated UP, 1997.
- Ouyang Xiu. “Wen Tingyun Yan Wei Shi (Poems by Wen Tingyun and Yan Wei).” *Zhongguo Meixheshi Ziliaoxuan*. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1985. 3-10.
- Owen, Stephen. *Traditional Chinese Poetry and Poetics: Omen of the World*. Madison: U of Wisconsin P, 1985.
- Plato. “Ion.” *Norton Anthology of Theory and Criticism*, edited by Vincent B. Leitch. New York: Norton, 2001.

- Plato. *The Collected Dialogues of Plato*, edited by Edith Hamilton and Huntington Cairns. Princeton: Princeton UP, 1961.
- Plotinus. "On the Intellectual Beauty." *Plotinus* Vol. 5, translated by A. H. Armstrong. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1984.
- Qian Qianyi. *Qian Zhu Dushi (Du Fu's Poetry Annotated by Qian Qianyi)*. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1958.
- Qu Yuan. "Lisao Encountering Sorrow." *Anthology of Chinese Literature: From Early Times to the Fourteenth Century*, edited by Cyril Birch. New York: Grove Press, 1965. 51-62.
- Ren Yong. "Cosmogony, Fictionality, Poetic Creativity: Western and Traditional Chinese Cultural Perspectives." *Comparative Literature* 2 (1998): 98-119.
- Reynolds, Joshua. "Discourse on Art." *Critical Theory since Plato*, edited by Hazard Adams. San Diego and New York: HBJ Publishers, 1971. 354-358.
- Robinet, Isabelle. *Taoism: Growth of a Religion*. Stanford: Stanford UP, 1997.
- Scaliger, J. C. *Poetics. Critical Theory since Plato*, edited by Hazard Adams. San Diego and New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1971.
- Schipper, Kristofer. *The Taoist Body*. Berkeley: U of California P, 1993.
- Shisanjing Zhushu (Thirteen Chinese Classics Annotated)*. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1979.
- Sikong Tu. *Twenty Four Forms of Poetry. Lidai Shihua (Poetic Talks from Various Dynasties)*, edited by Wenhuan. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1981.
- Sima Xiaoru. "Shanglin Fu (Rhyme Prose on the Shanglin Park)." *Anthology of Chinese Literature*, edited by Cyril Birch. New York: Grove Press, 1994. 142-153.
- Song Yu. "Shennü Fu ('Rhyme-prose on the Goddess')." *Wenxuan (Selections of Refined Writings)*, compiled by Xiao Tong. Taipei: Qiming Shuju, 1960.
- Vico, Giambattista. *New Science. Norton Anthology of Theory and Criticism*, edited by Vincent B. Leitch. New York: Norton, 2001.
- Woolf, Virginia. *Pointz Hall: The Earlier and Later Typescripts of Between the Acts*, edited by Mitchell A. Leaska. New York: University Publications, 1983.
- Wu Dashou. *Shihua (Poetic Remarks)*, requoted in Chen Liangyun. *Zhongguo Shixue Tixi Lun (Chinese System of Poetics)*. Beijing: Zhongguo Shehui Kexue Chubanshe, 1992. 371.
- Zhongguo Wenhua Cidian (A Dictionary of Chinese Culture)*. Shanghai: Shanghai Shehui Kexueyuan Chubanshe, 1987.
- Zhuangzi. *The Zhuangzi (Writings of Zhuangzi)*, annotated by Guo Xiang. Shanghai: Shanghai Guji Chubanshe, 1995.

# 约翰·邓恩《跳蚤》的婚恋伦理观解析

## An Interpretation of John Donne's "The Flea" from the Perspective of Marriage and Love Ethics

李正栓 (Li Zhengshuan) 徐童歆 (Xu Tongxin)

**内容摘要:** 约翰·邓恩在《跳蚤》一诗中将男女主人公非人格化, 以戏剧独白手法完成了一场关于爱情的逻辑推理, 为读者提供一种全新的感知形式。诗中蕴含诗人的婚恋伦理观, 但诗人语言直白、意象粗糙, 常被人误解。运用文学伦理学批评理论, 结合历史客观性和道德主观性评价、个人经历与群体婚恋认知重新解读, 可以发现该诗顺应了“只争朝夕”的时代主题, 呼唤男女间自然情感与身体本能结合, 提出“灵肉合一”的观点。文学伦理学批评的视角将对《跳蚤》的单一道德审判转回到历史环境下的伦理探究, 随之产生新的伦理启示。

**关键词:** 约翰·邓恩; 《跳蚤》; 文学伦理学批评; 非人格化; 婚恋伦理

**作者简介:** 李正栓, 河北师范大学外国语学院教授, 主要研究领域为英美诗歌、文学翻译与批评等; 徐童歆, 河北师范大学外国语学院硕士研究生, 主要研究领域为英美文学、文学翻译。本文为河北省研究生示范课程立项建设项目《英国文学》【项目批号: CJSX2024054】的阶段性成果。

**Title:** An Interpretation of John Donne's "The Flea" from the Perspective of Marriage and Love Ethics

**Abstract:** John Donne depersonalized the male and female protagonists in his poem "The Flea" and used dramatic monologue techniques to complete a logical reasoning about love, providing readers with a new form of perception. The poem contains the poet's ethics of marriage and love, but the poet's straightforward language and rough imagery are often misunderstood. Through the perspective of ethical literary criticism on marriage and love ethics, combined with historical objectivity and moral subjectivity evaluation, additionally, the experience of poet and the public's understanding of marriage and love. It is found that the poem conforms to the theme "Carpe Diem" of the times, calls for the natural emotions between men and women to be combined with bodily instincts, and proposes the concept of spiritual and physical unity. The perspective of ethical literary criticism shifts the singular moral judgment of "The Flea" back to ethical exploration in the historical context, leading

to new ethical insights.

**Keywords:** John Donne; "The Flea"; ethical literary criticism; dehumanization; marriage and love ethics

**Authors:** Li Zhengshuan is Professor at the School of Foreign Studies in Hebei Normal University (Shijiazhuang 050024, China). His academic research focuses on British and American poetry, literary translation and criticism (Email: zhengshuanli@126.com). Xu Tongxin is master candidate at the School of Foreign Studies in Hebei Normal University (Shijiazhuang 050024, China). Her academic research focuses on British and American literature and literary translation (Email: 1838416951@qq.com).

约翰·邓恩(John Donne)被德莱顿(John Dryden)和约翰逊(Samuel Johnson)戏谑地冠以玄学派。<sup>1</sup>这一戏称歪打正着,指出了邓恩诗歌的典型特征。他诗中的“玄”在于奇思妙想,以学问作诗,强调感情的理性显现。大胆奔放地呼吁在爱情中追求灵与肉统一,放荡不羁的表达使其诗作被冠以“艳情诗”的称呼,因与当时主流文学创作理念、原则和规范存在抵触<sup>2</sup>而沉寂百年。直至1912年,格瑞尔森(Herbert J. C. Grierson)出版《约翰·邓恩诗集》(*The Poems of John Donne*),使邓恩诗作重见光日,改变了邓恩在英国诗坛上的边缘地位。

《跳蚤》是约翰·邓恩经典之作,呼唤男女间的自然情感与身体本能结合。该诗借助非人格化和戏剧化独白的手法,巧妙构建陌生化艺术效果,让诗中主角在爱情的逻辑推理中走向结合,同时融入文化意象,为诗作增添了文化内涵。更重要的是,该诗不仅展现了诗人的高超诗艺,还隐含着诗人独特的婚恋伦理观念和深切的伦理诉求。聂珍钊教授于2004年提出文学伦理学批评理论,旨在解决文学批评中伦理道德价值缺失的问题。经过二十余年发展,该理论日益成熟,被翻译成多种语言,产生深远国际影响。本文便是运用文学伦理学批评理论重新理解邓恩《跳蚤》及其蕴含的伦理选择,使对其的评价由单一的道德审判转换为重回历史环境中的伦理探究,用更清晰的方式呈现诗歌整体结构,从全新视角感知这一经典诗作。

### 一、《跳蚤》中的婚姻伦理观:历史客观性与道德评价的交融

婚恋伦理观是性伦理学的重要组成部分,它专注于探讨和研究婚恋关系中所涉及的道德原则、行为规范以及价值观念<sup>3</sup>,且随人类社会发而演变。文

1 参见托·斯·艾略特:《现代教育和古典文学:艾略特文集论文》,李赋宁等译,陆建德编,上海:上海译文出版社,2012年,第1-9页。

2 参见李正栓、刘露溪:“现当代国外邓恩研究述评”,《当代外国文学》3(2008):57。

3 参见蒋家国:“从《白孔雀》看劳伦斯的婚恋伦理观”,《外国文学研究》6(2010):90。

学伦理学批评要求我们避免使用过去的道德观念来批评当前文学，同时也不能依据未来假设的道德观念来评判当前文学。<sup>1</sup> 因此，我们需要重回历史语境，考虑社会环境如何对个人婚恋观产生影响并为文学解读、阐释和评价提供基础。

傅浩提出邓恩的爱情诗包含色情元素，将学问融入性爱激情之中<sup>2</sup>；吕洪灵亦称邓恩为“艳情诗人”<sup>3</sup>。以《跳蚤》为例，邓恩语言直白，意象粗糙，容易使人误读。第一节前四行：“你看吧，你看看这跳蚤，/ 你否认我的成分能有多少？/ 它先咬了我，此刻又咬了你，我俩的血已在它里边融为一体”（李正栓 吴晓梅 36）<sup>4</sup>。该诗是一首由男性独白所构成的求爱诗，求爱却不抒情，其语言是口语化的表达，有很强戏剧性特征。这四行是男主人公向女主人公求爱未果后的一番推理，以此证明诗中的女子是不能否认他们之间有爱情的。另外，诗中存在模拟听众，这个模拟听众没有开口说话，但以某种方式与说话者进行交流，使独白中露出对话性，可看做是一种隐性对话（*hidden dialogue*）。说话者通过逻辑推理得出结论：跳蚤让男主人公在不违背人伦道德的前提下和女主人公结合了。

从时代背景来看，在 17 世纪早期斯图亚特王朝，玄学派诗歌体现了人文主义思想：肯定现世、赞美爱情、追求个性解放，同时也与作者对新生活体验与表达方法的需求相适应，因此受到人们的关注。在民间幽默文化中，那种狂欢般的世界感知的核心是交替的精神和平等的对话意识，这些正好与人文主义否定神权、反对禁欲主义、肯定人的自然情欲和追求个性解放的理念一致。与此同时，创作的诗作的主题集中在及时行乐上。“及时行乐”源自拉丁文“*carpe diem*”，英译为“*seize the day (hour)*”或“*snatch the day*”，它并非指消极放纵的生活态度，而是一种积极、充满活力的人生哲学，此理念在解放英国人民思想及推动社会进步方面发挥了积极作用。在此背景下，《跳蚤》中的男主人公被拒绝后，并未沮丧或愤怒，而是进行了奇妙的逻辑推理，正如诗中写道“要承认，这件事不能被说成是羞耻、罪过，/ 也算不上你贞操的损失”（36）。男主人公并不存在强行将自己的个人意愿施加给女子的行为，只是通过奇妙的推理在这场爱情的比赛里略占上风，礼貌地达到了目的，体现了邓恩“求爱而不言情”的独特风格。正如德莱顿评论邓恩：“他不仅在讽刺诗中喜欢玩弄玄学，在爱情诗中亦如此。本应以言情为主的爱情诗，却被他用哲学般微妙的思辨把女性们的头脑弄糊涂了”（15）。

1 参见 Nie Zhenzhao, “Ethical Literary Criticism: A Basic Theory,” *Forum for World Literature Studies* 2 (2021): 189-207.

2 参见 傅浩：“约翰·但恩的艳情诗和神学诗”，《外国文学评论》2（1995）：76。

3 参见 吕洪灵：“追寻爱的真谛——读约翰·邓恩的艳情诗”，《外国文学研究》1（2000）：80。

4 本文有关《跳蚤》（“*The Flea*”）的引文均来自约翰·邓恩，《英美诗歌教程》（李正栓译，北京：清华大学出版社，2004年）。以下引文仅标注页码，不再一一说明。

此外，在文艺复兴时期，结婚与生育得到了充分的肯定和鼓励，社会对婚姻和生育高度重视，并深信生育是传播美、延续美的关键途径。“而它却未求婚就先得快意，/合我俩的血为一体，涨大它的腹肌”（36）。译者采用了拟人化的手法将其译为“涨大它的腹肌”，以暗示跳蚤吸了两人的血并将它们融合后，竟然怀孕而带来新的生命。随后的诗句“唉，它做得远远超过我们自己”（36），进一步印证了诗中的男主人公并未对女主人公做出格行为，他是一个有分寸、符合道德伦理的求爱者。

诗中说话者认为婚姻是有程序的：相识、相恋、求婚、订婚、结婚，是情感历程，是法律要求，也是伦理道德要求。所以他没有违背女性意志把自己的爱强加给诗中女性听者，但跳蚤以其兽性因子<sup>1</sup>和追求快乐原则直接完成了婚姻才允许的行为。尽管他情感上认可跳蚤的行为，但理性上他认为这是未婚同居行为，而未婚同居是不光彩、不符合伦理道德的：

“Though parents grudge, and you, we are met, / and cloistered in this living walls of jet”（35）<sup>2</sup>。这里的“parents”用了模糊化和不明确的表达方式，让人不禁产生疑问：这是男女主人公中谁的父母？根据邓恩的个人经历，他于1598年被聘任为伊丽莎白宫廷中掌玺大臣伊格尔顿（Lord Keeper Egerton）的私人秘书，仕途一度光明。而在1601年，他的人生遭遇了重大转折。他与伊格尔顿的妻侄女安·莫尔（Ann More）秘密结婚，这桩秘密婚姻遭到安·莫尔父亲的极力反对，愤怒的岳父将邓恩罚到监狱住了4年。邓恩虽仕途受挫，出狱后生活困顿，但这未撼动他与安的爱情，反而深化了他对爱情的理解。他以睿智、博学及玄学派特有的奇思妙喻，用独特伦理观向世人诠释了对爱情的理解。<sup>3</sup>由此，该处的“parents”可以理解为女主人公的父母。此外，不被父母认可的婚姻也是超出伦理期待的。这里对女主人公的称呼为“you”，不仅拉远了男女主人公之间的距离，也透露出男主人公对这场婚姻的内疚和不安。男主人公使用了“we are met”这样的被动句表达，表明不管女子和父母同意与否，男女主人公被动地被跳蚤撮合在一起。从用词上，亦能看出邓恩对这种在跳蚤体内非法同居的内疚。他的用词是“cloister”，该词本意是“隐居”，可以理解为“cohabit”，指没有婚姻关系而共同生活，也可理解为未经法律认可的同居行为。

邓恩的作品蕴含丰富悖论和张力，大胆奔放的表达下蕴含着隐性作者（implied author），即作者的“第二自我”。作为作者潜在的“替身”（程锡麟 17），该替身反映作者本人的价值观和伦理选择。实际上，邓恩诗中的“我”绝大部分情况下就是邓恩本人，诗中暗含着邓恩的婚恋伦理观：婚姻

1 参见 Nie Zhenzhao, "Ethical Literary Criticism: Sphinx Factor and Ethical Selection," *Forum for World Literature Studies* 3 (2021): 383-398.

2 这里直接引用原文旨在更清晰地揭示主语模糊化处理及被动语态应用的实际情况。

3 参见李正栓、杨丽：“邓恩诗歌意象研究——兼与李清照诗词意象比较”，《外语与外语教学》4（2006）：34。

应公开透明，得到父母祝福，是光明正大的爱情，非隐秘不宣、依赖跳蚤维系的感情。有些人对《跳蚤》中的爱情观提出质疑，认为其缺乏道德性，但这主要是因为他们在进行文学评价时，未能全面考虑诗人的个人背景和当时社会的核心价值观。实际上，这种批评往往更多地反映了批评者自身的道德观念和其所处时代的道德标准，而非对文学作品的客观解读。<sup>1</sup> 这正揭示了文学伦理学批评与道德批评之间的本质区别，主要在于是否尊重历史客观性。运用文学伦理学批评重新审视《跳蚤》，结合当时的时代背景、主流价值观以及诗人的个人经历和诗人在诗中的用词、构句，可以认为《跳蚤》情节安排合情、合理、合德。

## 二、婚恋伦理通过修辞策略、意象选择得以彰显

“修辞”通常指为使语言表达更加生动形象而运用的各种技巧外，同时也涵盖作品与读者之间的交流方式，引发读者对小说虚构世界中人物和事件的兴趣，并探讨作品如何在道德层面对读者产生影响。<sup>2</sup> 邓恩《跳蚤》中的意象选择和主人公的对话探讨正符合这一点。

### （一）修辞与伦理：跳蚤意象的合理性

意象的选择无美丑之别，“文学的审美只有同文学的教诲功能结合在一起才有价值”（聂珍钊，“文学伦理学批评：基本理论与术语”17）。修辞不仅需要形式上展现美感，更重要的是，要同时确保作品的具有一定伦理道德，并能为读者带来道德启示。因此，尽管跳蚤常被视为恶心、丑陋的寄生性昆虫，邓恩在诗中却未描绘其负面特质，反而巧妙地运用对人的非人格化（dehumanization）和对跳蚤的人格化手法，通过跳蚤的本能行为，映衬出说话者的道德理性。这一意象不仅推动了情节，更引导读者深入探索，最终巧妙传达出合理的婚恋观，富含教诲与启示。此精心构思的意象，不仅传递情感，更实现了伦理意义的修辞交流。修辞的精髓在于构建作者与读者之间的心灵桥梁，促进深层的理解与共鸣。而文学伦理学批评则着重于强调文学作品所承载的社会责任及其教育引导功能，旨在通过文学的力量传递正面的伦理观念与价值观。<sup>3</sup>

### （二）非人格化叙述与伦理：虫格化的合理性

非人格化叙述可能会损害传统道德推理带来的正面印象和良好效果，但在这种代价下，作品会提供另一种形式的经验和认知体验，令读者在阅读过程中注入更大主动性和创造性。<sup>4</sup> 《跳蚤》中有明显的对“虫格化”现象的运用，即：将男女主人公的情感线索物化成跳蚤。特别是在《跳蚤》中，陌生化思维的显著体现在于其非人格化的独特构思。求爱者并未按照常规颂扬被

1 参见 聂珍钊：《文学伦理学批评导论》，北京：北京大学出版社，2014年，第14页。

2 参见 程锡麟：“试论布思的《小说修辞学》”，《外国文学评论》4（1997）：17。

3 参见 聂珍钊：“文学伦理学批评：基本理论与术语”，《外国文学研究》1（2010）：17。

4 参见 谭运长：“试论非人格化叙述”，《文艺理论研究》2（1990）：30。

爱者的仪表和魅力，反而巧妙地将对方降至虫类的地位，这种别具一格的表现手法，展现了陌生化思维的魅力，如“它是你是我，是我们的花烛温床，/是我们婚姻的殿堂”（36）。

非个性化其实是一种掩饰或伪装。<sup>1</sup>非人格化的艺术创作目的是为了现实创作客观化而做的艺术努力。诗人巧妙将自己藏了起来，用诗句来宣扬他的观点和看法。这跳蚤既是“你”也是“我”，同时还是跳蚤本身，如此构成了“三位一体”（trinity）的意象。在这一设定中，怀孕的过程发生在跳蚤体内，形成了一个未婚先孕的鲜明意象。诗人深知跳蚤中实际上蕴含了四条生命，但他刻意描述为“三个”生命，将人与跳蚤的结合神性化，其背后蕴含着深邃的用意。在文艺复兴时期，对“数”的崇拜和重视尤为突出，展现了当时人们对宇宙秩序、和谐与平衡的深刻理解和不懈追求。<sup>2</sup>诗人以虫格化手法，将世俗爱情升华至神性光辉，构建男女主人公与跳蚤的三位一体神圣象征。此体系中，他杀或自杀均被视为对神圣性的损害，破坏三位一体即渎圣。按“生存之链”（chain of being）理论，《跳蚤》展现由动物性至人性，再至神性的升华过程，实现神圣与世俗的完美融合，体现邓恩丰富的宗教想象与深刻的哲学思考。虽以跳蚤为题，却未描述其生物特性或危害，而是通过虫格化修辞，富有想象力地将男女情感与跳蚤相结合，展现了玄学意味。这种奇喻手法是邓恩的典型修辞。玄学派虽被视为“狂傲”“自恃甚高”，其主要原因在于其伦理思想，即玄学派具有一种伦理至上的立场。

跳蚤蕴含了生命的同时，还被男主人公赋予了许多额外意义。

你突然狠心地把毒手下，  
用无辜者的血染紫了你的指甲？  
这跳蚤只吸过你一口血，  
这怎能算作一种罪过？  
而你却得意洋洋地说：  
你和我都不比从前弱；（36-37）

女主人公眼疾手快，坚决果断，把跳蚤掐死：“Purpled thy nail in blood of innocence？”（35）邓恩在句尾加了一个问号，表示男主人公不满地质问女子，同时责备女子的残忍行为，没等女子说什么就进而质问她：“这跳蚤只吸过你一口血，/这怎能算作一种罪过？”（37）女子机智回应：“你和我都不比从前弱”（37）。诗人乘势而上，将情感推向高潮，提出接受受爱无

1 参见王松林：“小说‘非个性化’叙述背后的道德关怀”，《外国文学研究》1（2006）：39。

2 参见李正栓、南方：“邓恩《歌》中的格律音乐与数字命理意象”，《河北师范大学学报（哲学社会科学版）》4（2008）：127。

损你名誉，何不及时行乐？从叙述道德化角度来看，在一个道德标准相对化的时代，企图用绝对的道德标准要求全社会统一的做法，是不合时宜并且很难实现的。实际上，非人格化叙述之所以能够成功，是因为它符合当时社会价值标准趋向相对化的现实。在《跳蚤》中，我们更倾向于男主人通过巧辩和推理，在这场求爱中略胜一筹，并抒发了自己的婚姻伦理观，劝导人们用合适的方式追爱，力争得到被认可的、符合道德伦理婚姻关系。

在叙事的结尾，面对男主人公的指责，女子佯装知错，并流露出害怕与悔意。然而男主人公却欲擒故纵，一针见血地指出她那假装的后悔与矜持的姿态无济于事。女方无法否认爱意，因为他们已被跳蚤“撮合”为一体。跳蚤通过吸吮他们二人，完成了婚姻之实，并且怀了孕，其躯体成为了他们婚姻欢愉的床和神圣的殿堂。当女子欲杀跳蚤时，男主人公惊呼“刀下留人”，却未能阻止。他继续不遗余力地为那只跳蚤辩护，言辞中充满了对微小生命的关怀与尊重。然而，女子虽然带着一丝胜利的喜悦，试图解释自己的观点，却未能赢得男主人公的认同。她的解释显得苍白无力，无法穿透他心中的壁垒。于是，女子开始流露出悔悟之情，她的言辞中透露出深深的懊悔和自责。她试图挽回男主人公的信任，但遗憾的是，他已经不再信任她了。男主人公最终通过修辞与辩论占据了上风。从这场戏剧化的争辩中，邓恩通过展示他的婚恋伦理观以更新人的观念，进而获得认同，实现文学对人的道德教诲作用。

### 三、伦理效果：婚恋伦理的探索与启示

文学作品的研究不应该只停留在文本本身上，还要关注文本对社会、读者的影响与启发。文学伦理学批评的目的不仅在于阐述文学的伦理道德特性或探讨创作伦理问题，更在于从伦理道德角度审视文学作品，深入研究其与社会、作家、读者的关系。<sup>1</sup>文学伦理学批评强调伦理意图对读者的重要性，并指出目前探讨的多数文学作品除了蕴含潜在的伦理意图，更应能激发读者的伦理共鸣。文学伦理学批评具有现实意义，可使文学批评更好服务于文学理解，并公正评价经典、具有历史意义且能指导现实存在的文学作品。邓恩作为一位处于宗教与思想转型之际的人文学者，在严峻的社会现实面前表现出了敢于质疑的精神，并用自己的笔墨探寻着生命的意义。邓恩诗歌的伦理意义深远，具体体现在特殊的历史条件下，他对诗歌创作与社会责任所做出的伦理选择，充分展现了他在道德和伦理层面上的深刻思考与独到见解。这一选择不仅为我们反思文学经典的现代价值提供了宝贵的视角，也为文化多元化的融合带来了极大的启示。<sup>2</sup>

我们需要重回作品当时的历史语境进行客观分析，文学伦理学批评和道

1 参见 Nie Zhenzhao, "Ethical Literary Criticism: A Basic Theory," *Forum for World Literature Studies* 2 (2021): 189-207.

2 参见 李正栓、马洋洋：“约翰·邓恩神学诗歌伦理思想研究”，《外国语文》5（2018）：42-43。

德批评有着本质的不同，在这里，我们试图用文学伦理学鼓励并且引导读者在特定的语境中对文本的伦理进行感知和回应。然而，我们都能认同的是，莎翁的戏剧深植伦理道德，聚焦公共生活下的个体命运，强调爱、正义、友善和忠诚，引发我们共情，并从中汲取深刻伦理教诲。读者的情感不仅能够通过伦理选择引发的悲剧得到净化，进而实现情感的升华，而且还会转变为一种道德情感，例如从麦克白的悲剧中汲取教诲。<sup>1</sup>同理，在我们读邓恩的《跳蚤》时，不应该侧重关注带有色情暗示的词汇表达或者有些令人不适的意象，因为那些不是邓恩想要引导我们去关注的重点。我们也应该意识到原文中某些性暗示强烈的词汇，在阅读时或许会引发种种联想，但却绝不会给人猥亵下流之感。事实上，跳蚤这一意象在邓恩之前的欧洲文学中就已存在，并常与色情内容相关联。然而，邓恩在《跳蚤》一诗中的运用，却赋予了它更丰富的伦理内涵，展现了一种全新的伦理选择。伦理选择的价值标准是一个综合考量体系，旨在促进个体人格完善与道德提升，同时致力于人类社会的和谐生存与全面发展。<sup>2</sup>这种影响不仅仅是看阅读后的明显效果，更重要的是要观察这些伦理思想是否在阅读过程中持续深入到了读者的心灵和价值观中，润物细无声地感染着读者。

伦理传达是一个双向的过程，我们作为读者也应该在这个过程中进行深刻的思考，作者在文本里到底想要传达出什么样的信息、如何与作者达成共识、更重要的是如何产生实际效果使我们可以日常生活中更好地生存，并独立地进行道德伦理的判断，这也就形成了一种对作者的伦理回应。文学伦理学批评作为一种新兴的批评方法，在解读中外小说、西方古典主义诗歌等文学领域已经展现出了其独特的解释力。它不仅仅关注文学作品的审美价值，更深入挖掘作品背后的伦理道德问题，从而得出了一些与传统批评截然不同的研究结论，为我们对文学作品的研究开辟了新的思路。<sup>3</sup>通过文学伦理学批评理论深入分析特定历史背景下邓恩的诗歌及其伦理选择，揭示了其诗歌中意象、用词和句式所蕴含的伦理意义。同时，该批评方法也强调作者、文本和读者之间的互动，以及读者能否与之产生共鸣并领会其现实意义，这对于深化道德意义和关怀至关重要。

《跳蚤》这首诗意象玄妙，意境深奥，很耐咀嚼，并非是不道德的。通过文学伦理学批评回到当时的历史语境，结合邓恩个人经历以及文艺复兴的时代背景对其进行分析，通过解析诗中意象和修辞以及作者的伦理选择和读者的伦理回应，我们认为《跳蚤》一诗是可以多解的，其中的伦理价值足以

1 参见 聂珍钊：“文学伦理学批评：论文学的基本功能与核心价值”，《外国文学研究》4（2014）：13。

2 参见 聂珍钊等：“文学伦理学批评与文学跨学科前沿（笔谈）”，《华中师范大学学报（人文社会科学版）》2（2022）：105。

3 参见 董洪川：“文学伦理学批评与英美现代主义诗歌研究”，《外国文学研究》4（2014）：35。

给世人深刻的教诲。通过文学伦理学批评，我们穿越几百年与作者进行心灵沟通，有助于更好地得到婚恋伦理启示进而指导当代人的生活并促进社会更好地发展。

## Works Cited

- 程锡麟：“试论布思的《小说修辞学》”，《外国文学评论》4（1997）：16-24。  
 [Cheng Xilin. “The Analysis of Booth’s ‘The Rhetoric of Fiction.’” *Foreign Literature Review* 4 (1997): 16-24.]
- 董洪川：“文学伦理学批评与英美现代主义诗歌研究”，《外国文学研究》4（2014）：34-39。  
 [Dong Hongchuan. “Ethical Literary Criticism and the Study of Anglo-American Modernist Poetry.” *Foreign Literature Studies* 4 (2014): 34-39.]
- 约翰·德莱顿：《德莱顿论文集》第II卷，杨周翰译。牛津：克莱伦敦出版社，1900年。  
 [Dryden, John. *The Essays from John Dryden* Vol. 2, translated by Yang Zhouhan. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1900.]
- 傅浩：“约翰·但恩的艳情诗和神学诗”，《外国文学评论》2（1995）：76-81。  
 [Fu Hao. “John Donne’s Erotic and Theological Poetry.” *Foreign Literature Review* 2 (1995): 76-81.]
- 蒋家国：“从《白孔雀》看劳伦斯的婚恋伦理观”，《外国文学研究》6（2010）：90-97。  
 [Jiang Jiagu. “D. H. Lawrence’s Concept of Marriage Reflected in ‘The White Peacock.’” *Foreign Literature Studies* 6 (2010): 90-97.]
- 李正栓、刘露溪：“现当代国外邓恩研究述评”，《当代外国文学》3（2008）：56-63。  
 [Li Zhengshuan and Liu Luxi. “A Review of John Donne’s Studies in Modern and Contemporary Foreign Countries.” *Contemporary Foreign Literature* 3 (2008): 56-63.]
- 李正栓、马洋洋：“约翰·邓恩神学诗歌伦理思想研究”，《外国语文》5（2018）：38-43。  
 [Li Zhengshuan and Ma Yangyang. “An Interpretation of John Donne’s Poetic Ethics.” *Foreign Languages and Literature* 5 (2018): 38-43.]
- 李正栓、南方：“邓恩《歌》中的格律音乐与数字命理意象”，《河北师范大学学报（哲学社会科学版）》4（2008）：124-128。  
 [Li Zhengshuan and Nan Fang. “On the Rhythmical Music and Numeral Propositions in ‘Song’ by Donne.” *Journal of Hebei Normal University (Philosophy and Social Sciences Edition)* 4 (2008): 124-128.]
- 李正栓、吴晓梅编：《英美诗歌教程》。北京：清华大学出版社，2004年。  
 [Li Zhengshuan and Wu Xiaomei, eds. *A Course of English and American Poetry*. Beijing: Tsinghua UP, 2004.]
- 李正栓、杨丽：“邓恩诗歌意象研究——兼与李清照诗词意象比较”，《外语与外语教学》4（2006）：34-37。  
 [Li Zhengshuan and Yang Li. “A Study on the Imagery of John Donne’s Poetry—A Comparison with

- the Imagery of Li Qingzhao's Poetry." *Foreign Languages and Their Teaching* 4 (2006): 34-37.]
- 吕洪灵：“追寻爱的真谛——读约翰·邓恩的艳情诗”，《外国文学研究》1（2000）：77-80。
- [Lyu Hongling. "In Pursuit of the True Meaning of Love—Reading John Donne's Erotic Poetry." 1 (2000): 77-80.]
- Nie Zhenzhao. "Ethical Literary Criticism: A Basic Theory." *Forum for World Literature Studies* 2 (2021): 189-207.
- . "Ethical Literary Criticism: Sphinx Factor and Ethical Selection." *Forum for World Literature Studies* 3 (2021): 383-398.
- 聂珍钊：“文学伦理学批评：论文学的基本功能与核心价值”，《外国文学研究》4（2014）：8-13。
- [-. "Ethical Literary Criticism: On Fundamental Function and Core Value of Literature." *Foreign Literature Studies* 4 (2014): 8-13.]
- ：《文学伦理学批评导论》。北京：北京大学出版社，2014年。
- [-. *Introduction to Ethical Literary Criticism*. Beijing: Peking UP, 2014.]
- ：“文学伦理学批评与道德批评”，《外国文学研究》2（2006）：8-17。
- [-. "On Ethical Literary Criticism and Moral Criticism." *Foreign Literature Studies* 2 (2006): 8-17.]
- 聂珍钊等：“文学伦理学批评与文学跨学科前沿（笔谈）”，《华中师范大学学报（人文社会科学版）》2（2022）：79-105。
- [Nie Zhenzhao et al. "Ethical Literary Criticism and Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature (Conversation by Writing)." *Journal of Central China Normal University (Humanities and Social Sciences)* 2 (2022): 79-105.]
- 谭运长：“试论非人格化叙述”，《文艺理论研究》2（1990）：29-36。
- [Tan Yunchang. "The Interpretation of Impersonal Narrative." *Theoretical Studies in Literature and Art* 2 (1990): 29-36.]
- 托·斯·艾略特：《现代教育和古典文学：艾略特文集论文》，李赋宁等译，陆建德编。上海：上海译文出版社，2012年。
- [T. S. Eliot. *Modern Education and the Classics: Selected Essays*, translated by Li Funing et al. and edited by Lu Jiande. Shanghai: Shanghai Translation Publishing House, 2012.]
- 王松林：“小说‘非个性化’叙述背后的道德关怀”，《外国文学研究》1（2006）：36-43。
- [Wang Songlin. "The Moral Choice behind Impersonal Narrative." *Foreign Literature Studies* 1 (2006): 36-43.]

# The Review of “Koreans in Japan” Novels Through the Lens of Ethical Literary Criticism: Lee Yangji’s *Nabi T’aryŏng and Other Stories*

**Inseop Shin**

**Abstract:** This review examines Koreans in Japan literature through Lee Yangji (李良枝)’s works, particularly her collection *Nabi T’aryŏng and Other Stories*, highlighting its educational value in literature studies. Lee Yangji was a second-generation Korean in Japan whose writing reflects the complex identity struggles of Koreans in Japan. Her works explore themes of ethnic and cultural identity, societal discrimination, and the personal conflicts Koreans in Japan experience within both Japanese and Korean contexts. Nie Zhenzhao (聂珍钊)’s “ethical literary criticism” provides a framework here, viewing literature as an “art of ethics” reflecting the moral life of specific historical periods. The review discusses earlier Korean authors in Japan like Kim Saryang and Kim Dalsu, who wrote about ethical conflicts arising from colonial pressures and identity crises. Post-liberation, Koreans in Japan continued to face discrimination, using literature as a platform to assert identity and human rights. For Lee, “ethical limbo” describes her characters’ emotional and psychological conflicts in reconciling Japanese societal norms with Korean heritage. In works like *Nabi T’aŏng* and *Yuhi*, Lee’s protagonists navigate intense personal and social conflicts, exemplifying the ethical dilemmas of Koreans in Japan. By doing so, Lee’s literature portrays their identity struggles as both ethical and existential, resonating with broader themes of displacement, exclusion, and resilience.

**Keywords:** literature education; Lee Yangji; *Nabi T’aryŏng and Other Stories*; Nie Zhenzhao; ethical literary criticism

**Author:** **Inseop Shin** is Professor in the Department of Japanese Language Education at the College of Education, Konkuk University, and the Director of the Academy of Mobility Humanities (Seoul 143-701, South Korea). His research primarily focuses on mobility humanities and Korean-Japanese literature (Email: seoha@konkuk.ac.kr). This paper was supported by Konkuk University in 2021.

**标题:** 文学伦理学批评视角下的“在日朝鲜人”小说评论：以李良枝《纳比·塔里昂及其他故事》为例

**内容摘要：**本文聚焦李良枝的文学创作，尤其是她的作品集《纳比·塔里昂及其他故事》，对“在日朝鲜人”文学进行研究，并强调其蕴含的伦理教诲价值。李良枝是旅日朝鲜族人的第二代，她的作品反映旅日朝鲜族人复杂的身份认同困境，主要探讨种族和文化身份、社会歧视，以及在日朝鲜人在日本和韩国环境中经历的个人冲突等主题。聂珍钊教授提出的文学伦理学批评为本文提供理论支撑，该理论将文学视为反映特定历史时期道德生活的“伦理艺术”。本文还讨论了早期在日韩国作家，如金史良和金达寿等，他们的作品也描写了殖民压力和身份危机带来的伦理冲突。相比之下李良枝更突出人物在调和日本社会规范与韩国传统时面临的“伦理困境”，比如在《纳比·塔琼》和《于希》等中，主人公经历了激烈的个人和社会冲突。李良枝将人物的身份挣扎描绘成伦理和生存的双重挣扎，从而与流离失所、排斥和复原力等主题产生共鸣。

**关键词：**文学教育；李良枝；《纳比·塔里昂及其他故事》；聂珍钊；文学伦理学批评

**作者简介：**申寅燮，韩国建国大学教育学院日语教育系教授、移动人文研究院院长，主要研究方向为移动人文、韩日文学。

Lee Yangji (李良枝, 1955-1992) was a Korean in Japan (在日朝鲜人) writer<sup>1</sup> who operated at the crossroads of Japanese and Korean literature. Born in Kyoto, Japan, she was a second-generation Korean in Japan who explored themes of identity and ethnicity in her literary works. Lee is known to construct a fictional world based on her experiences portraying the environment and struggles of Koreans in Japan. Although she wrote in Japanese, Lee Yangji has established herself as a prominent literary figure in both Korea and Japan. In 2022, the English edition of her major works, *Nabi T'aryōng and Other Stories*<sup>2</sup>, was published, allowing readers worldwide to engage with her literary world.

This review explores the characteristics of literature written by Koreans in Japan through the lens of Lee Yangji's works and examines why Koreans in Japan novels are regarded as ethical art from the perspective of ethical literary criticism. Nie Zhenzhao (聂珍钊) once defined literature as “a unique form of expression of ethical concepts and moral life at a particular historical stage, and literature, in essence, is the art of ethics” (505).

In particular, this review will closely examine how this proposition applies to

1 The term used for Koreans in Japan varies depending on the perspective, such as “Zainichi Kan-kokujin” (在日韩国人), “Zainichi (在日) Korean,” or simply “Zainichi” (在日). Here, the most academically neutral term, “Koreans in Japan” (在日朝鲜人), is used.

2 See Yangji Lee, *Nabi T'aryōng and Other Stories*, translated by Cindi Textor and Soo Mi Lee, Irvine: Seoul Selection U.S.A., 2022.

Lee Yangji's literary world. Through such analysis, this paper aims to examine how Koreans in Japan literature is distinguished as ethical art. Before diving into Lee Yangji's *Nabi T'aryŏng and Other Stories*, it makes sense to first identify where Lee's work currently fits within the broader flow of Koreans in Japan literature and thereafter, review the trajectory of the author, thus take a further look into the ethical issues in her works.

The roots of Koreans in Japan literature stem from the works of Korean authors who wrote in Japanese during the Japanese colonial period. As Korea entered the era of modernization through Japan, its literary scene developed under the influence of Japanese colonial rule. Among literary figures were those who created works in Japanese while living in Japan, such as Kim Saryang (金史良) and Kim Dalsu (金达寿). These intellectuals of the colonial period depicted characters who wrestled with "ethical choice" (Nie 535), often reflecting on the unconscious internalization of the perceived superiority of the empire overruling their homeland.

Kim Saryang meticulously portrayed the dilemma of a protagonist whose identity, under his Japanese name, is criticized and who eventually reclaims his Korean name, symbolizing a recovery of "ethical status" (*Into the Light*, 1939). The protagonist, a young intellectual, narrates his insecurities as a Korean in Japan who hides his identity, conveying a mix of fear and sorrow rising from his own affects. Here, a colonial intellectual with an "ethical status" as a Japanese would be seen as supporting or endorsing Japanese imperialism, whereas adopting his Korean name would exhibit a spirit of resistance to his annexed homeland. In reality, Kim Saryang sought to escape his pro-Japanese actions towards the end of the colonial era by participating in the independence movement. This exemplifies how the ethical nature of literature can influence the life and the work of the author. Additionally, Kim Dalsu depicted the contradictions of a Korean in Japan writer who, despite harboring anti-Japanese sentiments, found it comfortable to write in Japanese (*The Street of Descendants*, 1948). So to speak, both writers grappled with oppressive ethical conflicts created by the colonial system.

Even after liberation and even after the dissolution of the empire, Koreans in Japan who remained in Japan likewise were not exempt from this ethical dilemma. The Japanese society oppressed the lives of Koreans in Japan through structural discrimination. Therefore, for Koreans in Japan to reveal their identity was the same as entering into this structure of oppression. The only way they could assert the injustice and emphasize human ethics was through the expressive act of literature. This was because Koreans in Japan were stripped of political rights in Japan, and it was nearly impossible for them to enter the upper echelons of society, or have

access to public office or professional careers. The only way they could secure a space in public discourse as opinion leaders of society was through creative activity. This demonstrates the truth of the statement that literature mirrors ethics, serving as a final bastion for human rights.

Koreans in Japan writers were able to make ethical appeals to Japanese society through their creative activities in the Japanese language. However, conveying their intense feelings to the public in their homeland required translation. In other words, the fact that Koreans in Japan authors were unable to express themselves in their native language contained the potential to lead to another ethical aversion to contamination or impurity. Nevertheless, Koreans in Japan literature written in Japanese can be seen as a “unique form of expression” shaped by “the ethical concepts and moral life of a specific historical era” (Nie 505). Furthermore, when delving deeper by period and by individual writer, we can encounter numerous works that engage in the confusion of national identity within the context of “specific historical developments” (Nie 505).<sup>1</sup>

Second-generation Koreans in Japan writers, while writing their works in Japanese, tend to delve deeply into the historical legacy of the colonial period and the dual identity between Korea and Japan. Lee Yangji, the author discussed in this paper, is one such writer who adopts this literary approach, but we will look at Lee in more detail later. First, the paper first refers to the example of from Lee Hoesung’s (李恢成) *Watershed* (1992).

This novel intricately depicts the complex entanglement of a father’s choice to live as a Japanese and the son’s ensuing guilt, providing a profound exploration of the ethics of Koreans in Japan identity. Their choice to abandon their relatives and flee to Japan from Sakhalin after the Japanese surrender saved their lives. Tormented by guilt, the protagonist later visits his relatives in Sakhalin and kneels for forgiveness. This guilt-laden narrative continues through other episodes, interlinking one after another. Here, two points are worth noting. First, the issue of identity becomes a significant factor in the ethical concepts and moral life of Koreans in Japan. Second, the literary expression of conflicts such as guilt serves as a form of ethical atonement. Readers, by following the narrative of these conflicts and the revelation of ethical dilemmas, are prompted to reflect on their own ethics and moral lives.

From this perspective, Koreans in Japan literature could exist as a form of

---

1 Koreans in Japan have a diverse spectrum of identities depending on where they associate themselves—whether with Korea before the division between South and North Korea, or Japan, the country where they reside—as well as the strength of their sense of belonging to these places.

border literature, neither Japanese nor Korean, due to the significant issue of ethics serving as its foundation. In this sense, Lee Yangji's literature that dealt with the issue of national identity at its inception, in particular, can be evaluated as having expanded the horizons of Koreans in Japan literature while pursuing the self as a boundary person. Lee Yangji's literature, while expressing identity conflicts in a literary manner, particularly places her characters in a state of "ethical limbo." Introducing this unfamiliar concept of "ethical limbo" can be helpful in interpreting her works, as she often depicts characters whose ethical conflicts become so intense that they function as trauma. This is because she primarily portrays characters who suffer from trauma due to extreme ethical conflicts.

In this context, "ethical limbo" is defined as a state of psychological turmoil caused by the conflict between the self that seeks to establish a proper sense of identity and the self that negates its own existence. For example, in her works, characters are often anticipated with eagerness to establish their Korean identity as Koreans in Japan, but are also faced with the reality of not being accepted as Koreans. At this moment, the characters emit negative energy of denial and fall into ethical limbo. Through these characters in a state of ethical limbo, the reader recognizes the fictional world of literature as one dominated by "the ethical concepts and moral lives of a specific historical stage" (Nie 505). By expressing ethical emotions such as anxiety, anger, sympathy, criticism, and support, readers can reconstruct this world. Having this theme at the heart of her consciousness, the writer works to figure out how to artistically sublimate this topic through literature.

In this context, the act of writing becomes a means to escape ethical limbo, while readers empathize with the characters' ethical turmoil, participating in the art of ethics through empathy and evaluation. This represents a cycle of creation and interpretation that meets the definition of literature as an art grounded in ethics.

Lee Yangji was born in 1955 in a typical rural village at the northeastern foot of Mount Fuji in Japan as a second-generation Korean in Japan. A brief overview (*Collected Works of Yangji Lee* 684-688) of her life can be gathered from her biography. Her father migrated to Japan from Jeju Island as a laborer in 1940, at the young age of 15. When Lee Yangji was nine years old, she acquired Japanese citizenship when her family naturalized to Japan. Since she grew up outside of the Koreans in Japan community and lived integrated into Japanese society, her childhood was more assimilated to Japan compared to the first generation or other second-generation Koreans in Japan.

Her life took a complete turn after she became fully aware of her identity as a Korean in Japan. In her essay "I'm a Korean in Japan" (1977), she recounts that

she discovered her family’s Korean lineage when she issued certified copy of her family register to take a test for studying in the US. Although she had vaguely felt something was different as she grew up, she unconsciously went along with her parents’ intention to raise her as a Japanese.

My parents did not speak Korean in front of the children, nor did they eat kimchi. Moreover, living in the countryside where everyone around me was Japanese, there was practically nothing in my life that made me feel “Korean.” I had never been scorned by friends for being Korean either. My parents, based on their own life experiences, raised me as a Japanese so I wouldn’t endure the same hardships they had faced, and I never questioned this. In fact, I took lessons in Japanese dance, flower arranging, and koto (a traditional Japanese harp), and had genuinely dreamed of becoming a certified master of Japanese dance. Occasionally, I visited relatives in Osaka, but the feelings I experienced there were only those of “backwardness,” “dirtiness,” or “barbarism.” My rejection toward “Koreans” and denial was of my own subconscious. (*Collected Works of Yangji Lee* 585)

The quotation stated above is a form of ethical writing in which the author confesses her internalization of the negative view of Koreans as “unclean and savage barbaric” (*Collected Works of Yangji Lee* 584), a perspective held by Japanese people at the time. In other words, because she, living as Tanaka Yoshiye (田中淑枝), defined her own identity as a second-generation Korean in Japan, she was able to express her former self, who had denied her Korean identity. In a sense, the author was able to achieve moral redemption or overcoming through self-sabotage. Her confession continues. As tensions between her parents worsened, leading to separation and a divorce lawsuit, she ran away from home several times, eventually dropping out of school in her senior year and moving to Kyoto to work at a tourist inn. It was the owner of the inn, once depicted as an unfavorable character in her book titled *Nabi T’aōng*, who helped her join the senior year of high school where her Japanese history teacher encouraged her to awaken her ethnic identity. In 1975, Lee Yangji entered Waseda University, where she started to learn more about Korea by interacting with other student Koreans in Japan. However, she dropped out after just one semester and embarked on a path as a Koto player. Despite her participation in the nationalist movements, she began to feel disgusted by what she saw as the hypocrisy of her actions. Nonetheless, it was also during this time that she aspired to become a writer.

In 1980, she visited Korea for the first time and began to learn the “gayageum”

(Korean traditional musical instrument) and pansori (a form of Korean narrative singing) as well as getting exposure to traditional shamanic dance. That same year, her eldest brother suddenly passed away, followed by the death of her second brother the following year. In 1982, she enrolled at Seoul National University but soon took a leave of absence and returned to Japan. While her older brothers passed away one after another and her parents' divorce proceedings were finalized, Lee Yangji published *Nabi T'aōng* that was written during her staying at a boarding house in Seoul. The following year, in 1983, she published *The Diver and My Brother, Gone Before Me*. Lee Yangji experienced a turning point in her career in 1988 when she won the Akutagawa Prize for her work *Yuhi*. This achievement not only brought her recognition in the Koreans in Japan literary scene but also propelled her to prominence in the Japanese literary world, garnering attention from critics and readers alike. During this period, she graduated from Seoul National University's Korean Literature department and studied dance at Ewha Womans University, continuing her academic and literary work while traveling between Korea and Japan. She tragically passed away at the young age of 37 in 1992 due to acute myocarditis.

In *Nabi T'aryōng and Other Stories*, the four works mentioned above are included. In order of importance, the title story *Nabi T'aōng* (1982) portrays the conflict that arises from the clash between the negative energy of self-denial, which comes from being a Korean in Japan, and the rational desire to escape from it. The story is built around the family history of a girl who has naturalized as Japanese, the discrimination she faces as a Korean in Japan, her awakening to ethnic identity, her journey of trying to reclaim her national identity by living in Korea, and frustration.

Unlike other Korean-Japanese writers, Lee Yangji built her literary world simultaneously observing both Korea and Japan through her experiences in Korea. This novel, which casts a dark tone throughout, leads readers to reflect on the story of the protagonist's 'ethical limbo' through their own ethical perspectives. The fictional world in the novel is based on the author's experiences, and while readers familiar with Lee Yangji or Koreans in Japan may feel a sense of realism. However, even without this contextual knowledge, the work can still be appreciated.

The novel begins with Aiko (爱子, who goes by her Japanese name at this point), a runaway and high school drop-out, who works odd jobs at an inn in Kyoto for two years, meeting her older brother who heard about her return and came to pick her up. The two enter a bar and begin drinking, but their conversation is somber. In their parents' divorce lawsuit, Aiko sides with their mother as a witness, while the eldest brother supports their father. Their parents, who migrated from Jeju

Island to Japan, became enemies, locked in bitter conflict. Although the specific reasons for their hatred toward each other is left out of the novel, Aiko seems to harbor ill feelings toward her father for the sin of naturalizing as Japanese citizen. Some readers may interpret this as a metaphor for the division of the Korean peninsula into North and South, while others may depict the negative legacy passed down from the first generation of immigrants to the second generation. Another layer worth exploring lies in the ethical criticism of having to choose one side of the family while honoring filial duty.

Despite the fact that Aiko sided with her mother due to the resentment of her father, the writer delves much deeper into the complex emotions of hatred and love Aiko feels towards her father. Although Aiko’s sympathy for her mother is also portrayed in the novel, it is her father’s paternal love, being at a loss in the face of his children’s misfortune, that truly resonates with readers. Upon returning from Kyoto, the protagonist reminisces about her time working at the inn in Kyoto. The writer employs a “flashback narrative” to depict the people she met and the events that unfolded during her time in Kyoto. The protagonist, who conceals her identity as a Korean in Japan and lives in constant fear of being exposed, reveals her endlessly pitiful self without filter. According the remaining record of the writer, It was the owner of the inn helped her join high school. Thus, the conflicts involving the people she met at the inn can be seen as a literary device used to illustrate how tense living as a Korean in Japan is.

However, rather than focusing on criticizing the unethical discrimination of Japanese people, her novel, *Nabi T’aōng*, centers around the protagonist’s personal journey of ethical growth and the pain she endures in the process. Aiko, the protagonist of the novel, exposes her own life of moral transgression, including multiple suicide attempts, rebellion against her father, and having an affair with a married man. To save herself from self-destructive despair, the novel portrays her rational will to reconnect with Korea by learning traditional Korean arts such as the “gayageum,” “pansori,” and “salpuri” dance (a Korean traditional shamanistic dance). She describes her rational desire to connect with Korea as a crucial element in her journey towards salvation. At one point, she asks her Japanese lover to call her by her Korean name, Ae-ja ( 爰子 ), and leaves Japan for Korea. In the final scene of the novel, she writes a letter to her Japanese lover, breaking off their relationship, demonstrating the unwavering strength of her rational will. Despite her strong rational will, the formidable barrier illustrated as the “motherland” is too high and too exclusive of an obstacle to overcome. Confronting the exclusivity of Korean society toward Koreans in Japan, she ends up wandering the streets in a state of ethical limbo as the novel draws to

a close. By examining the protagonist's descent into ethical panic from an ethical criticism perspective, readers may discover a variety of avenues for critical analysis in this deeply complex narrative that go beyond the question of identity. These may be issues of the relationship between ethical concepts and the body, ethical ethos, and the ethical writing as an act of salvation.

*Yuhi* (1988) is a novel that portrays the Koreans in Japan's experience, as a marginalized figure within both societies as outsiders, reflecting a broader narrative of social exclusion and displacement across national borders. It can be read as a continuation of *Nabi T'aōng*, where the protagonist, Ae-ja (爰子), struggles to live as herself, ending the novel with a sense of determination to overcome her ethical conflicts. The central characters in this novel is also named Yuhi, the same as the title who is studying at S University in Korea to learn more about her homeland, referred to as "I" as the story is told from the first-person perspective of the boarding house owner's niece. The novel begins with the scene of Yuhi fleeing back to Japan after failing to adapt to life in Korea. Interestingly, this first-person narrative is from the niece who feels both sympathy and resentment toward Yuhi while trying to support her during her time in Korea. On the day Yuhi leaves Korea, "I" could have gone to her aunt's house to see her off, but, for some reason, arrives after Yuhi has left. The intentional mismatch, narrated by "I," foreshadows the inevitable disconnection and misalignment in Yuhi's life, where she can never fully belong in either Japan or Korea.

In fact, Yuhi's struggle to adapt in her motherland could be seen as anticipated by Ae-ja's staggering walk through the streets of Seoul in *Nabi T'aōng*, where the seeds of this theme were planted. Yuhi's decision to enroll in the Korean language department at Korea's prestigious S University highlights the depth of her inferiority complex regarding the Korean language. On the one hand, Koreans in Japan are treated as outsiders, referred to as "Koreans" and segregated, while in Korea, they are criticized for not being able to speak proper Korean. Moreover, the novel's 1980s Seoul setting amplifies this tension. Yuhi voices her frustrations to "I," lamenting the perceived dirtiness, noise, rudeness, and the harsh tones of the Korean language heard in the streets of Seoul. In response, "I" critiques Yuhi for her inability to grasp Korean culture and for her persistent attachment to her Japanese identity.

It is worth noting that the first-person narrator in this context is not Yuhi herself, but "I," offering a distinct narrative perspective. The novel is narrated by "I," who reconstructs the events of Yuhi's time in Korea through a reflective lens, chronicling her struggles with what she saw, heard, and experienced. Readers can

imagine a state similar to what modern medicine calls panic disorder as they follow Yuhi’s emotions. The narrative strategy of employing “I” as the first-person narrator, who critically observes and contrasts Yuhi’s behavior, positions the narrator as an extension of the author’s rational will.

“I” recounts episodes with Yuhi in a calm and detached manner, empathizing with her emotions while reconstructing their conversations and her actions, attempting to fill in the gaps left by Yuhi’s fragmented experiences. Ultimately, this narration serves to bridge the disconnect, revealing why Yuhi felt compelled to leave so abruptly and why “I” was hesitant to see her off. The author examines the Korean gaze directed at Koreans in Japan, and by situating herself within that gaze, engages in self-reflection and critique of her own position. Thus, Yuhi poses an ethical question concerning the state of disconnection introduced at the novel’s outset. Through “I’s” narration, readers vicariously experience Yuhi’s descent into what can be interpreted as an “ethical limbo,” inviting them to engage in understanding how she navigates her frustration and despair.

In *Nabi T’aryŏng and Other Stories*, one of the two additional works included is *The Diver* (1983), a deeply troubling and painful narrative. Although the title may evoke images of a diver, possibly a Haenyeo (Jeju female diver), the story bears no relation to these figures. Instead, the title refers to the protagonist’s final moments of suicide, where she hears the hallucination, “Dive in. Dive into the water!” (*Nabi T’aryŏng and Other Stories* 218) as she sinks into the bathtub, finding a sense of peace in the water, which symbolizes her death. The plot centers on the violence inflicted on the protagonist’s body and mind after her Jeju-born mother remarries a Japanese stepfather, forcing her into a Japanese household. As a Korean in Japan, the protagonist endures daily physical, emotional, and sexual abuse from her stepbrothers, leaving her profoundly traumatized. Following her mother’s death, she escapes, surviving on alcohol and prostitution, but eventually spirals into hallucinations of torture and fears of being massacred by the Japanese, before ultimately taking her own life.

This tragic narrative depicts the protagonist in a state of ethical limbo, as her perspective alternates between terror and shame. The story intertwines with the voice of her Japanese stepsister, Keiko, who reconstructs the protagonist’s life. The mixed narration style leaves the protagonist’s ethical status unresolved, mirroring the confusion and chaos of her existence. Keiko, who visits her stepsister’s home by chance, discovers the tragic scene and attempts to piece together the protagonist’s movements from her disappearance to her death. In doing so, Keiko uncovers unsettling details about her life. The protagonist’s mind and body bear the scars

of trauma that extend beyond domestic violence, resembling the trauma inflicted upon an entire nation. For instance, the protagonist lives in constant fear of being killed by Japanese people while recalling the massacre during the Great Kanto Earthquake. Even before she could fully assert her own ethical identity, she is already overwhelmed by the throes of ethical panic, unable to escape the weight of her historical and personal trauma. It is worth considering how ethical criticism can interpret the intertwining of personal narrative with historical trauma in this case. Another issue to examine is how the Japanese stepsister, Keiko perceives her stepsister's troubled life and eventual suicide. However, in this novel, Keiko remains consistently a bystander, refusing to engage with the serious events that unfold. Of course, in the realm of literary fiction, multiple interpretations are always possible.

*My Brother, Gone Before Me* (1983) is written in the form of a letter from the younger sister, Tamiko (民子), to her deceased brother, Hideo (秀男). The central theme that Tamiko conveys to her late brother revolves around their older sister, Kazuko (和子). The narrative unfolds through episodes highlighting Kazuko's awakening to ethnic consciousness and her conflicts with Tamiko, who is more passive and willing to compromise, particularly on issues of national identity. Kazuko leads an unstable life, searching for her identity through a variety of pursuits: political activism, participation in labor movements for ideological change, rigorous study of the Korean language, and a desire to become a singer in Korea—only to later abandon that goal in favor of studying abroad. Her yearning to reinvent herself reflects a deeper desire for personal liberation and a reimagined way of living. However, her relationship with a married Japanese man links her back to the themes of *Nabi T'aōng*.

Tamiko, the letter's narrator, leads a more passive life, supporting her radical older sister in a gentle manner. She plans to marry a Japanese man but is hurt when her lover deceives her and has an affair. Since the deceased brother cannot read the letter, no answer can be expected. The incomplete communication between the letter's writer and recipient reflects the confusion and unformed identity that are central to the story, asking how one should live as a Korean in Japan. However, in comparison to the other two works, Tamiko's decision to forgive and accept her unfaithful Japanese lover results in a significantly lower density in terms of ethical expression. In this sense, the author fails to fully explore the meaning behind writing a letter to an absent recipient.

So to speak, the dead cannot be the recipient of a letter. Therefore, the reader becomes the one to fill the absence, reading the message intended for the brother.

By engaging in the communication between the sister and her deceased brother, the reader becomes acutely aware of the inherent incompleteness of the letter's message due to the absence of its recipient. This narrative strategy seems designed to emphasize the unresolved quest for the ethical identity of Koreans in Japan. If the brother's absence had been given more ethical clarity, or if the tension between the need to return to Korea and the choice to remain in Japan had been portrayed with clearer, more defined boundaries, the ethical complexity of the story might have been further deepened.

The next generation of Koreans in Japan writers, such as Kaneshiro Kazuki (金城一紀), a third-generation Korean in Japan, advocates for living as a Korean in Japan, distinct from both Korean and Japanese identities. Authoer Yu Miri (柳美里) similarly operates beyond the confines of concepts such as homeland or colonial power. In this context, the literature of Lee Yangji, which centers on literary ethics, may represent the pinnacle of Koreans in Japan literature. Lee Yangji will be remembered in literary history as a writer who profoundly explored the ethical complexities inscribed in the individual bodies of Koreans in Japan people.

### Work Cited

- 李良枝: 「わたしは朝鮮人」, 『李良枝全集』。東京: 講談社, 1993年。  
 [Lee, Yangji. “I Am Korean,.” *Collected Works of Yangji Lee*. Tokyo: Kodansha, 1993.]
- Lee, Yangji. *Nabi T'aryŏng and Other Stories*, translated by Cindi Textor and Soo Mi Lee. Irvine: Seoul Selection U.S.A., 2022.
- 니에전자오: 《문학윤리학비평》, 김순진, 윤석민, 임대근역. 서울: HU: iNE, 2022년。  
 [Nie Zhenzhao. *Introduction to Ethical Literary Criticism*, translated by Soon-jin Kim et al.. Seoul: Hankuk University of Foreign Studies Knowledge Publishing Content Center, 2022.]

# A Study of Heterogeneous Similarities in Poetics between Pre-Qin China and Ancient Greece from the Perspective of Ethical Literary Criticism

**Zhang Baike & Tian Junwu**

**Abstract:** Chinese poetics originated in the pre-Qin period, while Western poetics emerged during the Hellenistic period. Despite the lack of direct communication and influence between the two traditions due to geographical distance and chronological separation, there are notable commonalities between Sino-Western thinkers. These commonalities are particularly evident in the ethical instruction, ethical harmony, moral passion and inspiration and ethics of rhetoric that are pursued and advocated by the scholars of different cultures. Guided by Nie Zhenzhao's ethical literary criticism, this paper compares the poetics of Confucius philosophy and Mingjia School with those of Plato, Aristotle, and the Sophists. It reveals the shared ethical concerns of Chinese and Western poetics within the context of their distinct cultural backgrounds and respective historical periods.

**Keywords:** Pre-Qin; Ancient Greek; poetics; heterogeneous similarity; ethical literary criticism

**Authors:** **Zhang Baike** is Associate Professor at the School of Foreign Languages, Luoyang Institute of Science and Technology (Luoyang 471023, China). Her research focuses on foreign literature and culture (Email: misshelen126@126.com). **Tian Junwu** (corresponding author) is Professor at the School of Foreign Languages, Beihang University (Beijing 100191, China). His research primarily centers on foreign literature and comparative literature (Email: tjw1966@163.com).

**标题:** 文学伦理学批评视域下的先秦和古希腊诗学比较研究

**内容摘要:** 中国诗学起源于先秦时期，而西方诗学则出现在希腊化时期。尽管由于地理距离和时间上的分隔，两个传统之间缺乏直接的交流和影响，但是中西思想家之间仍存在显著的共性。这些共性尤其体现在伦理教化、伦理和谐、道德激情与灵感以及修辞伦理上，这些都是不同文化的学者所追求和倡导的。在聂珍钊的文学伦理学批评指导下，本文比较了儒家哲学和名家学派的诗学与柏拉图、亚里士多德及诡辩学派的诗学。本文认为在各自独特的文化背景和历史时期中，中西诗学具有共同的伦理关切。

**关键词：**先秦；古希腊；诗学；异曲同工；文学伦理学批评

**作者简介：**张柏柯，洛阳理工学院外国语学院副教授，研究方向为外国文学与文化；田俊武，北京航空航天大学外国语学院教授，主要从事外国文学与比较文学研究。本文为北京航空航天大学“西方文论精品课项目”【项目批号：12112302】的阶段性成果。

According to Jesse Fleming, comparative studies—particularly those comparing Eastern and Western philosophical ideas, theories, systems, and traditions—are often criticized as “pointless comparisons of apples and oranges” (259), suggesting that Eastern and Western philosophies are too disparate to yield meaningful comparisons. Despite this assertion, which may seem specious, scholars continue to employ comparative methods in cultural studies due to the essential role of these approaches in transcultural and interdisciplinary research. The practice of Sino-Western comparative study predates the formal establishment of comparative studies as an academic discipline. Nonetheless, this field has frequently been dominated by theories of cultural superiority, often implying the superiority of Western culture over Chinese culture or suggesting that Chinese culture is derived from Western influences. Wiebke Denecke refers to this approach as “ellipsis” (13). For instance, Cecil Maurice Bowra and Ernst Robert Curtius have claimed that Chinese culture lacks the epic tradition characteristic of European cultures.<sup>1</sup> Similarly, it has often been asserted that “there is no tradition of tragedy in Chinese literature” (Wallace 99). Perhaps the most notorious example of this “ellipsis” is the longstanding debate over whether “there is such a thing as Chinese philosophy” (Defoort 393), a question first posed by Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel more than 200 years ago. Many of these perspectives, we argue, are both problematic and chauvinistic. Such academic prejudices often stem from Western scholars’ misunderstandings about the relationship between terminology and substance. For example, the term “philosophy” was not used in China until it was introduced by the Japanese scholar Nishi Amane in 1873.<sup>2</sup> However, this does not imply that China lacked philosophical thought. In reality, China and the West share numerous common perspectives, especially in their early poetics. This paper aims to demonstrate that there are heterogeneous similarities between Chinese and Western poetics from their respective formative periods—the pre-Qin period in China (479 BC-221 BC) and ancient Greece (500

1 See Marie Chan, “Chinese Heroic Poems and European Epic,” *Comparative Literature* 2 (1974): 142-143.

2 See Carube Defoort, “Is There Such a Thing as Chinese Philosophy? Arguments of an Implicit Debate,” *Philosophy East and West* 3 (2001): 394.

BC-336 BC)—particularly when viewed through the lens of Nie Zhenzhao’s ethical literary criticism<sup>1</sup>. By “poetics,” we refer to a broader conception that encompasses literature, philosophy, rhetoric, music, and other related disciplines as an integrated whole, rather than adhering strictly to Aristotle’s definition. Additionally, the term “heterogeneous similarity” indicates that, while Sino-Western poetics may appear different in name, they are essentially similar in their actual substance.

The comparative study of China and Greece, a subset of Sino-Western comparative studies, particularly values the comparison between pre-Qin China and ancient Greece. This focus on specific periods and regions is justified by the fact that both cultures existed during what Karl Jaspers termed the Axial Age, a period roughly spanning from the eighth to the third centuries BC. Jaspers describes this era as “an interregnum between two ages of great empire, a pause for liberty, a deep breath bringing the most lucid consciousness” (51). During this formative period of human civilization, both pre-Qin China and ancient Greece developed remarkable and original cultures independently, due to the vast geographical distance and limited means of transportation that prevented recorded communication between the two regions. As Derk Bodde asserts, “Chinese civilization, though not as autochthonous as once supposed, was founded and subsequently developed in relative isolation from other civilizations of comparable level” (291-292). The “Contention of a Hundred Schools of Thought” during the pre-Qin period coincided with a golden age of academic prosperity in ancient Greece. In such heterogeneous cultural contexts, Chinese and Western poetics naturally differed in language, fundamental concepts, and modes of expression. The literary terms and theories of ancient Chinese scholars were so unique and metaphysical that they posed significant challenges for Western scholars to comprehend. Steven Van Zoeren notes,

There are nevertheless difficulties in discussing the history of traditional Chinese poetic criticism and theory. The language of criticism was allusive and metaphorical, and critics combined a passion for key terms with an almost total disinterest in the problems of their definition. Instead, writers on literature assumed a complex web of continuities and analogies between and within the natural and social/cultural worlds that worked to subvert and evade analytic distinctions. (146)

---

1 See Nie Zhenzhao, “Ethical Literary Criticism: A Basic Theory,” *Forum for World Literature Studies* 2 (2021): 189-207; Nie Zhenzhao, “Ethical Literary Criticism: Sphinx Factor and Ethical Selection,” *Forum for World Literature Studies* 3 (2021): 383-398.

Despite these linguistic and methodological differences, there remains the potential to explore the heterogeneous similarities between pre-Qin China and ancient Greece, especially from the perspective of ethical literary criticism.

### **Ethical Instruction**

The first similarity in poetics shared by scholars of pre-Qin and ancient Greece is that they both emphasized the utilitarian purpose of literature. According to Nie Zhenzhao, “If we closely examine the history of literature, we will find that literature has always been utilitarian and that its political inclination has consistently been a fundamental characteristic. Even in the works of aestheticist writers, non-utilitarian literature remains merely a utopian ideal, as their creations have never transcended morality and are marked by evident moralistic features” (“On the Ethical Value and Instructive Function of Literature” 13). In the view of Nie Zhenzhao, The “Four Books” and “Five Classics” of the pre-Qin era were primarily used for instruction. The Confucianism particularly highlighted poetry and music as the means through which political ideals were to be achieved. Starting with “poetic education,” Confucius (551 BC-479 BC) spoke highly of the social functions of literature. He says, “Get your start with the Odes; acquire a firm standing through ritual; complete the process with music” (Confucius 55). To “get your start with the Odes” means that one must first learn poetry if he wants to cultivate his moral character, while to “complete the process with music” indicates that the improvement of human nature relies on the nurture of music. Therefore, poetry and music are of great importance in the cultivation of a person’s moral integrity. Also in this book, Confucius says, “The Odes train you in analogy, allow you to observe customs, teach you to be sociable, teach you to express anger” (122). This saying serves as a good summarization of the functions of poetry, and has exerted great influence on the theories of Chinese literature for thousands of years.

Xun Zi (310 BC-237 BC), another important representative of the Confucianism, also emphasized the social functions of literature and art, holding that the mutual use of ritual and music can achieve the goal of rectifying personal conduct, extending construction so as to produce personal reform and refining popular customs and usages.<sup>1</sup> In the history of Chinese literature, Xun Zi was the first scholar who proposed the theory of equilibrium and harmony, which deepened the theory of moral education and transformation of Confucianism. He noted that man could not live without music. Originating from sound and being produced from movements,

---

<sup>1</sup> See Xun Zi, *Xunzi* Vol. 1, translated by John Knoblock, Changsha: Hunan People’s Publishing House, 1999, 249.

music enters deeply into men and rapidly transforms them. Moderate and tranquil music is of particular importance in making people harmonious and in encouraging them to shun excess, while stern and majestic music makes people well-behaved and encourage them to shun disorder. Xun Zi observes, “Thus musical performances are the greatest creator of uniformity in the world, the guiding line of the mean and of harmony, and a necessary and inescapable expression of man’s emotional nature” (2:653). Moreover, Xun Zi holds that the sage kings founded music to make good the hearts of the people, as it played the role of “harmony” in coordinating human social relations emotionally. Therefore, the ideal state of music in harmonizing all kinds of people was:

Hence, when music is performed within the ancestral temple, lord and subject, high and low, listen to the music together and are united in feelings of reverence; when music is played in the private quarters of the home, father and son, elder and younger brother, listen to it together and are united in feelings of close kinship; when it is played in village meetings or clan halls, old and young listen to the music together and are joined in obedience. (2:651)

The aforesaid “reverence,” “close kinship” and “obedience” all refer to the social education functions of music. Disagreeing with Mencius’ arguments that human nature was originally good and ritual propriety was out of a heart of “courtesy” and “deference,” Xun Zi believes that, as contention and indulgence in extravagance are human nature, “Thus, to follow inborn nature and true feelings is not to show courtesy or defer to others. To show courtesy and to defer to others contradicts the true feelings inherent in his inborn nature” (2:749). That is to say, there is a strong desire for extravagance in human nature; if the desires cannot be guided by ritual propriety and music, they will fall into pruriency. Therefore, to get rid of the evils of human nature, “cultivation through the way of Kings” must be promoted so as to make people embrace kindness. To this end, advocating decent music that emphasizes integration of kindness and goodness is a sensible choice.

As long as it is literature, whether modern or contemporary, Western or Chinese, instruction is its most fundamental function. It can even be said that literature without instruction does not exist. The heroic ideals, national concepts, familial values, and the ethics and morals of society and individuals in ancient Greece were all disseminated and accepted because of Homer’s epics. The basic characteristic of ancient Greek tragedy is its ethical nature.

(Nie, "On the Ethical Value and Instructive Function of Literature" 14)

The two major sources of Western aesthetics are Plato and Aristotle, who attached great importance to the functions of literature in guiding and educating people. Plato's denial of Greek literature was not because he had not recognized its social influence; on the contrary, it was precisely because he had deep understanding of its influence that he adopted an extreme utilitarian attitude toward this issue. According to Plato, both the Homeric epics and tragicomedies were bad not only because they destroyed the God-hero worship in the Greek religion, but also because they released, and even nurtured, the "inferior part" of the human souls—as a result of which "justice" was destroyed. Therefore, in the third volume of *The Republic*, Plato expelled those poets who were engaged in creating honeyed lyrics and epics. If a poet wants to stay in the Republic, he or she must write good poetry: "For we mean to employ for our souls' health the rougher and severer poet or story-teller, who will imitate the style of the virtuous only, and will follow those models which we prescribed at first when we began the education of our soldiers" (Plato, *The Republic* 64). In the tenth volume of *The Republic*, Plato reiterated his prohibition: "[...] we must remain firm in our conviction that hymns to the gods and praises of famous men are the only poetry which ought to be admitted into our State" (*The Republic* 233). Plato's intention of expelling poets, and in keeping the few poems that could motivate man's rationalism and kindness, is completely based on the edificatory functions of poetry, which indicates that he attached importance to the educative role of literature. Therefore, Plato was the first in the Western world to use the political education effects as the evaluation criterion of literature. Subsequently, this exerted influence over the views of Jean Jacques Rousseau and Leo Tolstoy on literature.<sup>1</sup>

Plato's expelling poets was exactly the same as Confucius' deleting poetry and correcting music. According to Sima Qian (145 BC-87 BC),

There were more than three thousand ancient songs, but Confucius rejected those which were repetitious and retained those which had moral value [...] Confucius choose three hundred and five songs in all, and these he set to music and song, fitting them to the music of Emperor Shun and King Wu. After that the old rites and music became widely known, to the enrichment of the kingly culture, and the Six Classics were established. (270)

---

1 See Zhu Guangqian, *History of Western Aesthetics*, Beijing: Press of People's Literature, 1979, 56.

To correct the music, Confucius strongly opposed the emerging folk songs of the states of Zheng and Wei, saying that “for music, the Shao and Wu. Do away with the Zheng tunes and stay away from artful talkers. The Zheng tunes are excessive, and artful talkers are dangerous” (107-108). Confucius believes that the excessive expression of emotion and honeyed folk songs can make people confused and cause them to become bad. Therefore, he equated the honeyed folk songs with those artful and dangerous talkers. From this perspective, it can be seen that Confucius had an in-depth understanding of the role of literature and art in cultivating moral character.

On the issue of the functions of literature, Aristotle went further than Plato. He argues that literature can meet some natural demands of humankind, which is good to the healthy development of the people and the society at large. Aristotle defines tragedy and its function as “the imitation of an action that is serious and also, having magnitude, complete in itself; in language with pleasurable accessories, each kind brought in separately in the parts of the work; in a dramatic, not in a narrative form, with incidents arousing pity and fear, wherewith to accomplish its catharsis of such emotions” (*On the Art of Poetry, with a Preface by Gilbert Murray* 35). Unfortunately, Aristotle did not explicate the “catharsis” function in definite terms, which led to various interpretations by later scholars. Despite the heterogeneity of interpretation, there is still consensus regarding the literal meanings of the word “catharsis.” According to Eva Schaper, “catharsis” means “purgation” in a medical context, a kind of “healing and curing through expulsion and evacuation of harmful elements;” while, in a religious context, it means “purification,” a kind of “cleansing the spirit and sublimating the emotions in order to prepare for or to achieve a state of exaltation” (132). Nowadays more and more scholars turn to interpret this word from the viewpoint of spiritual purgation. Through music, literature and other types of art, some strong emotions of human beings can be relieved and their psychological health can be improved. After experiencing this spiritual purification, people feel good and experience harmless pleasure. This view of Aristotle was dramatically opposed to that of Plato. According to Plato, emotions and pleasures were “inferior part” of the soul and must be suppressed; as poetry “nurtures” them, poets ought not to be admitted into the Republic. “So we were right not to admit him [the poet] into a city that is to be well-governed, for he arouses, nourishes, and strengthens this part of the soul and so destroys the rational one, in just the way that someone destroys the better sort of citizens when he strengthens the vicious ones and surrenders the city to them” (Plato, *The Republic* 276). In addition, Aristotle believes that the purification effect of tragedy on audience had its own cognitive value and ethical purpose. In his opinion, the aim of a tragedy should

not be the tragedy itself, nor should it be the enraptured state of audience. Rather, it should deliver wisdom and give enlightenment, letting audience recognize and practice “thrifit” life. Although Aristotle inherited Plato’s ideas of “literary value,” he attached more importance to the “poetic education” of literature. Through the theory of catharsis, Aristotle explicated the functions of “tragedy” and other forms of literature.

### **Principle of Ethical Harmony**

The second similarity in poetics shared by scholars of the pre-Qin era and ancient Greece is their emphasis on the principle of harmony in the creation of literature and art. Philosophically, harmony refers to a state of balance, order, and congruity within a system and can be applied in various contexts, such as metaphysical, aesthetic, psychological, social-political, and ethical. When applied ethically, “harmony” denotes balance and coherence within an individual’s moral life or within a society. Perfect harmony within an individual or a society involves aligning an individual’s actions with the moral order of society to achieve “harmony without uniformity.” As Sidney Zink notes, “From the time of the early Greek philosophers, the concept of ‘harmony’ has been popular in ethical discussion” (557). Its ethical meaning is often associated with “good” (Zink 558) by later philosophers such as Leonard Hobhouse, George Santayana, John Perry, and John Dewey. This ethical sense of “harmony” aligns with Nie Zhenzhao’s ethical selection of good and evil. According to Nie, “The notion of good and evil emerges along with ethical consciousness and is used to evaluate human beings only. In this sense, good and evil constitute the basis of ethics” (“Ethical Literary Criticism: Sphinx Factor and Ethical Selection” 386). Furthermore, Nie Zhenzhao explicates “harmony” from a social-political perspective. In his work “Interchange of Different Civilizations and Construction of a Harmonious World,” Nie Zhenzhao argues that “although different cultures often vary in form, content, and aesthetic tastes, they, as a common heritage of humanity, can achieve mutual communication, understanding, and tolerance, even to the extent of learning from, absorbing, and integrating with each other. This process can lead to the evolution of more vibrant new cultures and become an important factor in building a harmonious world” (109).

Nie Zhenzhao’s ethical thinking about “harmony,” alongside the ideas of other modern philosophers, helps us reveal the heterogeneous similarity of harmony between pre-Qin and ancient Greek scholars.

The “Doctrine of the Mean” was a fundamental principle of Confucian philosophy. Confucius applied this principle to aesthetics, insisting that various

opposing elements in literature and art should be harmoniously unified without emphasizing one side to the exclusion of the other. The appropriateness of the unity and development of these opposing elements was a central tenet of Confucius' aesthetic criticism. His pursuit of harmony and unity is particularly evident in the emotional expression of poetry and music. Confucius states, "The three hundred poems of the *Book of Odes* may be summed up in a single phrase: Think nothing base" (20). From an artistic perspective, the critical criterion of "thinking nothing base" aims to advocate the beauty of "equilibrium and harmony." In music, equilibrium and harmony manifest as a moderate and peaceful melody. Based on this, Confucius proposed the principle of "joy, but not excessive; sadness, but not to the point of injury" (29). In Confucius' view, the "Guanju Ode," a famous love poem from the *Book of Odes*, exemplifies this principle through its implicit and mild emotional expression, starting with emotional love and ending with virtue. Regarding literary works, the principles of "joy but with no excessiveness" and "sadness but not to the point of injury" require that literary works be euphemistic and implicit in their content and wording.

Xun Zi emphasized harmony as the defining characteristic of musical art, advocating for "harmony" in "diversity." He posited that harmony stands in contrast to uniformity, as the latter merely adds repetition without innovation. In contrast, only the harmony of diverse elements can produce something new. Xun Zi also underscored the importance of peace and moderation in music, stating: "Hence for musical performances, the pitch of the prime note is set in order to determine the proper pitch of the other notes. The temperament of the other instruments is adjusted to match in order to prepare the modal key" (2:652). Thus, setting the prime note to determine the pitch of the others illustrates the "guiding principle of the mean and harmony." This means that a central note is established as the prime note, serving as the foundation upon which other notes are organized to create harmonious music.

Similarly, the aesthetic ideal of ancient Greek philosophers was to discover an eternal law governing diverse aesthetic phenomena, aiming to achieve an ideal state of unity, order, harmony, and perfection. In Greek mythology, there is even a goddess named Harmonia, the daughter of Ares, the god of war, and Aphrodite, the goddess of love and beauty. As the offspring of war and love, Harmonia symbolizes the harmonization of opposites. Pythagoras and Heraclitus, philosophers predating Plato and Aristotle, both proposed theories asserting that beauty lies in the harmonious unity of opposites. The Pythagoreans believed that the universe was fundamentally composed of harmony and number, and that music represented a harmonious unity of opposite elements, transforming multiplicity into oneness

and chaos into order. Aristotle provided a vivid, though sarcastic, summary of the Pythagoreans' views on the relationship between number, music, and harmony in his *Metaphysics*:

They [the Pythagoreans] saw that the modifications and the ratios of the musical scales were expressible in numbers; since then, all other things seemed in their whole nature to be modeled on numbers, and numbers seemed to be the first things in the whole of nature, they supposed the elements of numbers to be the elements of all things, and the whole heaven to be a musical scale and a number. And all the properties of numbers and scales which they could show to agree with the attributes and parts and the whole arrangement of the heavens, they collected and fitted into their scheme; and if there was a gap anywhere, they readily made additions so as to make their whole theory coherent. (9)

The Pythagorean conception of the harmonious unity of numbers and music becomes clearer and more defined in Heraclitus' assertion that the harmony of the world is a harmony of oppositions. Heraclitus argues that "from things that differ comes the fairest attunement" and that "all things are born through strife" (46). To Heraclitus, the entire universe is the attunement of opposites, such as day and night, winter and summer, war and peace, surfeit and hunger. However, all these opposites are ultimately attuned in God. Plato inherited the theory of harmonious opposition. When discussing the duality of love, Plato expressed his unique perspective on harmony, stating, "to speak of a harmony as being in disagreement with itself, or as existing when it is composed of elements still in disagreement, is quite absurd [...] Here it is music that creates agreement in all these things by implanting mutual love and unanimity between the different elements" (*The Symposium* 19-20). Additionally, Plato believes that the highest form of beauty is an "idea," which is "eternal" and "does not come into being or perish, nor does it grow or waste away" (*The Symposium* 40). All other beautiful objects are derived from this "idea," and they are merely imitations of this "idea" of beauty.

In Aristotle's poetics, the concept of harmony is rooted in the idea of organic integrity, which he frequently emphasizes when discussing poetry and other arts. This organic integrity reflects the internal laws of development within the content. Integrity consists of parts, and the principle that combines these parts is their internal logic. In his *Politics*, Aristotle states, "there is a similar combination of qualities in good men, who differ from any individual of the many, as the beautiful are said to differ from those who are not beautiful, and works of art from realities,

because in them the scattered elements are combined, although, if taken separately, the eye of one person or some other feature in another person would be fairer than in the picture” (*The Politics of Aristotle: Introduction and Translation* 86). In his *Poetics* or *On the Art of Poetry*, Aristotle defines a “whole” as:

that which has beginning, middle, and end. A beginning is that which is not itself necessarily after anything else, and which has naturally something else after it; an end is that which is naturally after something itself, either as it’s necessary or usual consequent, and with nothing else after it; and a middle, that which is by nature after one thing and has also another after it. A well-constructed plot, therefore, cannot either begin or end at any point one likes; beginning and end in it must be of the forms just described. (*On the Art of Poetry, with a Preface by Gilbert Murray* 40)

Because the arrangement of various elements reveals their proportional size and order, forming an organic whole, harmony is thereby achieved. Concerning whether something is beautiful, Aristotle observes, “to be beautiful, a living creature, and every whole made up of parts, must not only present a certain order in its arrangement of parts, but also be of a certain definite magnitude. Beauty is a matter of size and order [...]” (*On the Art of Poetry, with a Preface by Gilbert Murray* 40). Therefore, after further developing the concept of harmony and beauty, Aristotle concluded that the structure of dramatic poetry is also an integral whole composed of parts.

### **Principle of Moral Passion and Inspiration**

The third similarity in poetics shared by scholars of pre-Qin China and ancient Greece is the function of moral passion and inspiration in literary and artistic creation. This concept, referred as “poeta” in classical literary theory, involves the transformation of ethical emotions into literature and art. In artistic works, poetry often serves to illustrate this process. Theories that explain how emotions are transformed into art include the association theory focusing on psychological experiences of association, the empathy theory centering on the concept of empathy, the expression theory being based on the principles of expression, and the isomorphism theory being founded on Gestalt brain field theory, which posits that the relationship between human emotions and artistic forms is heterogeneously isomorphic. According to Nie Zhenzhao, “regardless of all the theories, none can contradict the logic of the transformation from natural emotions to ethical emotions”

(“A Study of Emotion and Poetry” 55). Ethical emotions are a psychological reflection of objective reality, manifesting as subjective experiences, attitudes, and psychological will, all within the realm of subjective consciousness. “Regarding poetry, the subjects of emotions are the poet, the reader, or the critic. Emotions psychologically represent value judgments toward others or things (including abstract concepts). For example, sympathy for the unfortunate, admiration for those who self-sacrifice, and hatred for evildoers can all inspire poetry through emotional responses.<sup>1</sup> Nie Zhenzhao’s theory on “poeta” helps reveal the heterogeneous similarity between pre-Qin and ancient Greek scholars concerning the role of emotion and inspiration in literary and artistic creation.

In the pre-Qin period, Mencius’ theory of “comprehending speech and nourishing spirits” profoundly influenced literary criticism in subsequent generations. Mencius states

I am skillful in nourishing my vast, flowing passion-nature [...] This is the passion-nature: it is exceedingly great and exceedingly strong. Being nourished by rectitude, sustaining no injury, it fills up all between heaven and earth. This is the passion-nature: it is the mate and assistant of righteousness and reason. Without it, man is in a state of starvation. It is produced by the accumulation of righteous deeds; it is not to be obtained by incidental acts of righteousness. (189-190)

Mencius believes that the internal beauty of spiritual character is a prerequisite for an author to create beautiful and decent expressions. Once applied in literary creation, Mencius’ thought emphasized that writers must first cultivate their moral personality before they can produce good literary works. This relates to the subjective activity of writers. Although Mencius’ “vast, flowing passion-nature” emphasized moral spirit and was of pure rational content, it also represented an internally irrepressible passion, full of strong will. To some extent, the “vast, flowing passion-nature” can be seen as a mental state produced by the interplay of emotional will and moral ethics. Without this “vast, flowing passion-nature,” writers and artists cannot generate creative impulses and, therefore, cannot achieve success in artistic creation.

The literary theories of ancient Greece also emphasized the subjective activity of writers, including their talent, passion, and inspiration. Plato attributed the subjective activity of poets to their inspiration, which he viewed as divine madness

1 See Nie Zhenzhao, “A Study of Emotion and Poetry,” *Shandong Social Sciences* 8 (2014): 58.

bestowed by the gods, propelling poets into a frenzied state of creation. In the “Ion,” Plato repeatedly emphasizes that:

For all good poets, epic as well as lyric, compose their beautiful poems not by art, but because they are inspired and possessed [...]. like Bacchic maidens who draw milk and honey from the rivers when they are under the influence of Dionysus but not when they are in their right mind. And the soul of the lyric poet does the same...For the poet is a light and winged and holy thing, and there is no invention in him until he has been inspired and is out of his senses, and the mind is no longer in him: when he has not attained to this state, he is powerless and is unable to utter his oracles. (*Selected Dialogues of Plato* 9-10)

Plato’s attribution of poetic creation to irrational “divine madness,” setting rationality in opposition to inspiration and equating talent with inspiration, undoubtedly sowed the seeds of irrationality for later artistic creations. From the perspective of artistic creation methods, Plato primarily represented a romantic tendency. With the rise of romanticism in the late 18<sup>th</sup> century, the idea that literature was the expression of writers’ inspiration and passion became a worldwide literary trend, subsequently forming the critical tradition of romanticism, characterized by the shift “from imitation to expression and from the mirror to the fountain, to the lamp” (Abrams 57).

Unlike Plato, who attributed inspiration to divine madness, Aristotle required poets to possess good senses. In his *Poetics*, Aristotle states, “At the time when he is constructing his Plots, and engaged on the Diction in which they are worked out, the poet should remember to put the actual scenes as far as possible before his eyes. In this way, seeing everything with the vividness of an eye-witness as it were, he will devise what is appropriate, and be least likely to overlook incongruities” (*On the Art of Poetry, with a Preface by Gilbert Murray* 60-61). These words indicate Aristotle’s belief that poets should employ their creativity and subjective activity to reveal the essence and internal relations of the world to be imitated. To Aristotle, Plato’s mysterious “idea” was no more than the universality of particularity. Universality could not exist without particularity and existed within it. The “idea” was not the other shore of reality but the “possibility” and the “cause” of everything. Like a seed or an embryo, the “idea” contains the potential for growth and realization. Therefore, a poet’s imitation of nature in artistic creation is no longer passive but an active creation, turning the possibility of imitating nature into reality. In discussing poetic imitation, Aristotle held that “the poet being an imitator just like the painter or other maker of likenesses, he must necessarily in all instances represent things in

one or other of three aspects, either as they were or are, or as they are said or thought to be or to have been, or as they ought to be” (*On the Art of Poetry, with a Preface by Gilbert Murray* 85-86). The third case, namely, imitating things as they ought to be, emphasizes a poet’s subjective intention in artistic creation. Aristotle’s assertion that “poetry is something more philosophic and of graver import than history” (*On the Art of Poetry, with a Preface by Gilbert Murray* 43) was based on the idea that history tends to express the particular, as historians have no creative space, while poetry tends to express the universal, as poets can actively use their imagination and subjective activity to create works. Therefore, if a poet uses historical events as the materials for their creation, they must use their soul to conquer the chaotic, accidental, and unintelligible materials, making their poetry unified and harmonious in form and content.

### **Ethics of Rhetoric**

One important similarity between pre-Qin scholars and those of ancient Greece is their use of rhetoric as an effective means of discourse. In his work “Where Goes Forth Chinese Literary Theory,” Nie Zhenzhao criticizes the current state of Chinese literary theory, stating: “With the increasing dominance of Western theoretical discourse, the study of Chinese literary theory, amidst the surge of reform and opening up, did not merely open a window to the West or even two large doors, but instead dismantled barriers and tore down walls. Our academic community has almost completely adopted Western literary theory” (11-12). James J. Murphy also highlights this issue in his discussion of rhetoric, mockingly asserting that “it is important to note at once that rhetoric is an entirely Western phenomenon” (1). George A. Kennedy supports this view by arguing that rhetoric existed in Greece only because it was named as such. These chauvinistic assertions are patently absurd, as Edward Schiappa humorously points out with an analogy: “Just because the Greek texts of a period do not use a word for urination does not mean that no one was urinating at the time” (21). To address the dominance of Western literary theories in China, Nie Zhenzhao suggests the following approach: “Based on ourselves, we draw on and absorb foreign elements, use Western practices for our own needs, innovate and develop, and build our own theoretical framework on the foundation of Western theories” (“Where Goes Forth Chinese Literary Theory” 13). The phrase “based on ourselves” implies that China, particularly ancient China, possesses a rich tradition of literary theories, which should be utilized in the creation of new literary theories that are characteristic of Chinese style.

Regarding the theory of rhetoric, Pre-Qin scholars not only attributed the same

importance to rhetoric as an effective discourse as the scholars in ancient Greece but also coined the term “xiuci” (the Chinese term for rhetoric) even before Plato coined the term “rhetoric.” This is evidenced by the famous Chinese phrase “xiuci li qi cheng” (polished expressions are to be based on sincerity) (Kao 143-154), which appeared in *The Book of Change*, a text written during the Western Zhou Dynasty (roughly 1027 BC-770 BC). The major difference between Eastern and Western approaches to rhetoric is that “in the East, rhetoric has been considered so important that it could not be separated from the remainder of human knowledge,” whereas “in the West, rhetoric has been considered to be so important that it has had to be explored and delineated separately, as a special field of knowledge about human relations” (Oliver 10). The essential similarity between Pre-Qin rhetoricians and ancient Greek rhetoricians is their shared emphasis on the importance of ethical sincerity, trust, or credibility in rhetorical persuasion, with the exception of the Pre-Qin school of Mingjia and the Greek sophists. As mentioned earlier, “xiuci li qi cheng,” which was established as a rule in rhetoric as early as the Western Zhou Dynasty, was followed by the thinkers of Confucianism, Mohism, Daoism, and Legalism, albeit articulated differently. For instance, Confucius, who traveled extensively to preach his politics of benevolence, understood the importance of rhetoric in persuasion. In Confucian discourse, “cheng” (sincerity) was explicated as the rectification of names and was regarded as playing a crucial role in the advocacy of social order. He observes,

If names are not rectified, then speech will not function properly, and if speech does not function properly, then undertakings will not succeed. If undertakings do not succeed, then rites and music will not flourish. If rites and music do not flourish, then punishments and penalties will not be justly administered. And if punishments and penalties are not justly administered, then the common people will not know where to place their hands and feet. (Confucius 88)

In Aristotelian rhetoric, ethos, logos, and pathos are three indispensable modes of persuasion, among which ethos bears a similarity to the ethical sincerity emphasized in Pre-Qin rhetoric. Ethos, in the Greek sense, means “moral character.” In his *Rhetoric*, Aristotle argues that “character” played an important role in oration: “But since rhetoric exists to affect the giving of decisions—the hearers decide between one political speaker and another, and a legal verdict is a decision—the orator must not only try to make the argument of his speech demonstrative and worthy of belief; he must also make his own character look right and put his hearers, who are to

decide, into the right frame of mind” (59).

The similarities between Pre-Qin rhetoric and ancient Greek rhetoric are particularly evident in the rhetorical ideas of the School of Mingjia, represented by Deng Xi (560 BC-501 BC), Hui Shi (370 BC-310 BC), and Gongsun Long (325 BC-250 BC), and the sophists, represented by Protagoras (ca. 490 BC-420 BC) and Gorgias (ca. 483 BC-375 BC). Unfortunately, most of the original works by the Mingjia School and the sophists have been lost, and their ideas are known primarily through the comments of other rhetorical thinkers such as Xun Zi, Confucius, and Aristotle. For instance, Xun Zi criticizes the Mingjia School, stating that they “are fond of treating abstruse theories, and playing with shocking propositions [...] Nonetheless, some of what they advocate has a rational basis, and their statements have perfect logic, enough indeed to deceive and mislead the ignorant masses. Such men are Hui Shi and Deng Xi” (127). Similarly, Aristotle, in his “Sophistical Refutations,” defines sophists disparagingly: “For the art of the sophist is the semblance of wisdom without the reality, and the sophist is one who makes money from an apparent but unreal wisdom” (165a). Both schools shared the concept of multiple probabilities in human life and recognized the power of language in debate and persuasion. As Xing Lu observes, “In many ways, Mingjia resembled the Greek sophists [...]” (129). For instance, Protagoras’ famous claim that “humans are the measure of all things, of things that are that (or: how) they are, and of things that are not that (or: how) they are not,” according to Van Norden and William Bryan, parallels Deng Xi’s advocacy that “both arguments are acceptable” (Norden 102), which was termed “liang ke” (dual possibilities) and “liang shuo” (dual interpretations). A vivid illustration of Deng Xi’s theory of dual possibilities and dual interpretations is expressed in an anecdote in “Lü Shi Chun Qiu”:

The Wei River is very great in size. A wealthy man from Zheng drowned in it, and someone retrieved his body. The wealthy man’s family sought to buy it, but the one who found the body was asking a great deal of money. The family reported this to Deng Xi, who said ‘Do not worry about this. He certainly can sell it to no one else.’ The man who found the corpse was anxious about this and reported this to Deng Xi, who told him, ‘Do not worry about it. They certainly will be unable to buy the corpse from someone else. (Lyu 454)

This anecdote about Deng Xi illustrates that the human faculty of reasoning determines the truth of an issue, rather than moral appeal or divine intervention. If an argument is logically convincing and well-presented, truth can be found on either

side of the issue. This is why both the sophists and the School of Mingjia were often accused of lacking ethical sincerity or moral sense in their rhetorical practices.

Guided by Nie Zhenzhao's ethical literary criticism, this paper examines the heterogeneous similarities between pre-Qin poetics and that of the ancient Greek. It finds that the development of Chinese and Western poetics occurred within the context of distinct cultures, without mutual contact, exchange, or influence. Despite differences in specific content and modes of expression, Chinese and Western poetics share fundamental views about the nature and function of literature, art, and rhetoric. Highlighting these heterogeneous similarities in their respective origins not only challenges the longstanding theories of Chinese ellipsis or Western superiority prevalent in comparative studies but also enhances Western scholars' understanding of Chinese culture, particularly ancient Chinese culture.

### Works Cited

- Abrams, Meyer Howard. *The Mirror and the Lamp: Romantic Theory and the Critical Tradition*. New York: Oxford UP, 1958.
- Aristotle. *Metaphysics*, translated by Richard Hope. Ann Arbor: U of Michigan P, 1960.
- . *On the Art of Poetry, with a Preface by Gilbert Murray*, translated by Ingram Bywater. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1920.
- . *The Politics of Aristotle: Introduction and Translation*, translated by Benjamin Jowett. Ann Arbor: U of Michigan P, 2009.
- . *Rhetoric*, edited by W. D. Ross and translated by W. Rhys Roberts. New York: Cosimo, Inc., 2010.
- . "Sophistical Refutations." *The Complete Works of Aristotle*, edited by J. Barnes. Princeton: Princeton UP, 1984.
- Bodde, Derk. *Essays on Chinese Civilization*. Princeton: Princeton UP, 1981.
- Chan, Marie. "Chinese Heroic Poems and European Epic." *Comparative Literature* 2 (1974): 142-168.
- Confucius. *The Analects of Confucius*, translated by Burton Watson. New York: Columbia UP, 2007.
- Defoort, Carube. "Is There Such a Thing as Chinese Philosophy? Arguments of an Implicit Debate." *Philosophy East and West* 3 (2001): 393-413.
- Denecke, Wiebke. *Classical World Literatures: Sino-Japanese and Greco-Roman Comparisons*. New York: Oxford UP, 2013.
- Fleming, Jesse. "Comparative Philosophy: Its Aims and Methods." *Journal of Chinese Philosophy* 2 (2003): 259-270.
- Heraclitus. "On the Universe." *Hippocrates* Vol. 4, translated by W. H. S. Jones. Cambridge: Harvard UP, 1967.
- Jaspers, Karl. *The Origin and Goal of History*, translated by Michael Bullock. London: Routledge &

- Keegan Paul, 1953.
- Kao, Karl. "Recent Studies of Chinese Rhetoric." *Chinese Literature: Essays, Articles, Reviews* 15 (1993): 143-154.
- Lu Xing. *Rhetoric in Ancient China, Fifth to Third Century B.C.E.: A Comparison with Classical Greek Rhetoric*. Columbia: U of South Carolina P, 1998.
- Lyu Buwei. *Lü Shi Chun Qiu*, translated by John Knoblock and Jeffrey K. Riegel. Stanford: Stanford UP, 2000.
- Mencius. *The Works of Mencius, The Chinese Classics 2*, translated by James Legge. Hong Kong: Hong Kong UP, 1960.
- Murphy, James J. *A Synoptic History of Classical Rhetoric*. California: Hemiagoras Press. 1983.
- Nie Zhenzhao. "Ethical Literary Criticism: A Basic Theory." *Forum for World Literature Studies* 2 (2021): 189-207.
- . "Ethical Literary Criticism: Sphinx Factor and Ethical Selection." *Forum for World Literature Studies* 3 (2021): 383-398.
- 聂珍钊: "论不同文明的交流与建构和谐社会", 《上海师范大学学报》(哲学社会科学版) 1 (2012): 103-110。
- [—."Interchange of Different Civilizations and Construction of a Harmonious World." *Journal of Shanghai Normal University (Philosophy & Social Science Edition)* 1 (2012): 103-110.]
- : "论文学的伦理价值与教诲功能", 《文学评论》2 (2014): 13-15。
- [—."On the Ethical Value and Instructive Function of Literature." *Literary Criticism* 2 (2014): 13-15.]
- : "论诗与情感", 《山东社会科学》8 (2014): 51-58。
- [—."A Study of Emotion and Poetry." *Shandong Social Sciences* 8 (2014): 51-58.]
- : "中国的文学理论往何处去", 《东北师范大学学报》(哲学社会科学版) 6 (2016): 11-14。
- [—."Where Goes Forth Chinese Literary Theory." *Journal of Northeast Normal University (Philosophy and Social Sciences)* 6 (2016): 11-14.]
- Norden, Van and William Bryan. *Introduction to Classical Chinese Philosophy*. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing, 2011.
- Oliver, Robert T. *Communication and Culture in Ancient India and China*. Syracuse: Syracuse UP, 1971.
- Plato. *Selected Dialogues of Plato*, translated by Benjamin Jowett. New York: Random House Publishing Group, 2009.
- . *The Symposium*, edited by M. C. Howatson and Frisbee. C. C. Sheffield and translated by M. C. Howatson. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2008.
- . *The Republic*. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing, 1992.
- Schaper, Eva. "Aristotle's Catharsis and Aesthetic Pleasure." *The Philosophical Quarterly* 71 (1968): 131-143.

Schiappa, Edward. *The Beginnings of Rhetorical Theory in Classical Greece*. New Haven: Yale UP, 1999.

司马迁:《史记节选》第1卷,杨宪益、戴乃迭译。北京:外文出版社,2008年。

[Sima Qian. *Selections from Records of The Great Historians* Vol.1, translated by Yan Xianyi and Gladys Yang. Beijing: Foreign Language Press. 2008.]

Wallace, Jennifer. "Tragedy in China." *The Cambridge Quarterly* 2 (2013): 99-111.

荀子:《荀子》第1-2卷,约翰·克诺布洛克译。长沙:湖南人民出版社和外文出版社,1999年。

[Xun Zi. *Xunzi* Vol. 1 & Vol. 2, translated by John Knoblock. Changsha: Hunan People's Publishing House, 1999.]

朱光潜:《西方美学史》。北京:人民文学出版社,1979年。

[Zhu Guangqian. *History of Western Aesthetics*. Beijing: Press of People's Literature, 1979.]

Zink, Sidney. "The Good as Harmony." *The Philosophical Review* 6 (1994): 557-574.

Zoeren, Steven Van. "Chinese Theory and Criticism: Pre-Modern Theories of Poetry." *The Johns Hopkins Guide to Literary Theory & Criticism*, edited by Michael Groden and Martin Kreiswirth. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins UP. 1994.

# The Ethical Dilemma in *The Uniting of Human and Divine*

**Qin Xuan & Wang Yongqiang**

**Abstract:** *The Uniting of Human and Divine* is a companion volume of the author Chen Zhongyi previous work, *As I've Heard It*. This novel exposes and condemns the evil deeds of “Master”: Cuihua who is deceitful, manipulative, and commits all kinds of atrocities. The story tells about professor Chen under the support of the government, the ideal world she stretched her mind to build was destroyed and she was ultimately brought to justice. In *The Uniting of Human and Divine*, the two prevalent ethical dilemmas presented are “old age” dilemma and “intergenerational” dilemma, which are interconnected and intertwined. This study delves into the ethical reconstruction predicament in *The Uniting of Human and Divine* and its underlying causes. Ultimately, it criticizes the ethical choices and sinful actions of “Cuihua” from the perspective of ethical literary criticism.

**Keywords:** *The Uniting of Human and Divine*; ethical literary criticism; ethical choice; ethical dilemmas; ethical reconstruction

**Authors:** **Qin Xuan** is Associate Professor in School of International Communication, Communication University of Zhejiang (Hangzhou 310018, China). Her primary research areas include ethical literary criticism, English and American literature, and Cross-cultural drama (Email: 20210054@cuz.edu.cn). **Wang Yongqiang** is a Ph.D. candidate at Department of Dramatic Literature, Shanghai Theatre Academy (Shanghai 200040, China). Her primary research areas include Western Drama and Performance Studies (Email: 19946225919@163.com).

**标题:** 《冥合天人》中的伦理困境书写

**内容摘要:** 《冥合天人》是陈众议笔下《如是我闻》的姊妹篇。小说对大师“翠花”装神弄鬼、蛊惑人心的罪恶行径进行了批判和揭露。最终，“陈教授”在政府的支持下捣毁了“翠花”处心积虑营造的世外桃源，并将其绳之以法。在《冥合天人》中呈现出两个典型的伦理困境：“暮年”困境和“代际”困境，这两种困境互相影响、互相嵌套。本文运用文学伦理学批评的方法，通过分析《冥合天人》中的伦理困境及其成因，分析“翠花”的伦理选择，揭露她的罪恶行径。

**关键词:** 《冥合天人》；文学伦理学批评；伦理选择；伦理困境；伦理重构

**作者简介:** 秦璇，浙江传媒学院国际文化传播学院副教授，研究方向为文学

伦理学批评、英美文学、跨文化戏剧；王咏蔷，上海戏剧学院戏文系博士生，研究领域为西方戏剧、表演学。本文为教育部国别与区域研究备案中心—浙江传媒学院英国研究中心资助的重点项目“英国戏剧跨文化传播对中国戏曲改编的影响力研究”【项目批号：23ZCYY04ZDI】和浙江省教育厅资助的一般科研项目“‘互联网+’时代越剧的数字化传承与创新”【项目批号：Y202352669】的阶段性成果。

## Introduction

The novel *The Uniting of Human and Divine* is a companion volume of the author's previous work *As I've Heard It*. Both novels revolve around the complex relationship between Professor Chen and Cuihua and interweave metaphorical ghost stories from various times and cultures to complement the main plot. These two novels serve as the author's tools to shatter the "illusions" clouding people's minds by employing the strategy of "fighting fire with fire." The author Chen Zhongyi, being both a scholar and a translator, aims to emulate the ancient sages' ideal of "Only by observing and studying the civilized customs and etiquette created by human society can one achieve the goal of enlightening the world" (Zhu 95). His writing style is both engaging and insightful, striking a balance between profundity and accessibility. While some scholars have attributed the author's literary style to the long-standing influence of his research subjects, Latin American literature and Magical Realism, the author Chen Zhongyi's works more closely align with the essence of classical Chinese literature, especially the allegorical stories of the pre-Qin era, which embody both aesthetic charm and profound meaning. The term "allegory" combines "li" (principle) with "yan" (narrative) and refers to stories that contain philosophical truths. The two fundamental requirements for allegorical stories are: having a storyline and imparting moral lessons, which relate to ethics. The construction of ethical dilemmas in the core situations of *The Uniting of Human and Divine* and provide an interpretation from the perspective of ethical literary criticism.

### I. Character Development: The Dilemma of Choice amid Incomplete Identities

#### (I) Ethical Choices of Cuihua: Chaos and Loss

The novel *The Uniting of Human and Divine* follows a clear narrative thread, which can be summed up as the story of Professor Chen and my group fighting against the villainous gang led by Cuihua. Professor Chen and Cuihua first met during the

“Down to the Countryside”<sup>1</sup> and became close friends and companions in their youth, and even developed some unspoken romantic feelings for each other. In the blink of an eye, a lifetime passed, and they ultimately became irreconcilable enemies. Cuihua, once a spirited “iron girl” team leader, a symbol of youthful vigor and determination, has transformed into a wealthy “big boss” and a worldly-wise “Master Rushi,” offering guidance to those seeking enlightenment. “Iron girl” Cuihua and Master Rushi are juxtaposed in a parallel “montage” by the author, creating a powerful contrast that shocks the senses. Throughout Cuihua’s life, her journey mirrors the phrase “a riot of blooms begins to dazzle the eye.”<sup>2</sup> As the tide of the era surged, Cuihua’s choice was to follow the times repeatedly immersing herself in the currents of the times, ultimately devolving into a demon. The defining characteristics of Cuihua’s ethical choices are “chaos” and “loss,” stemming from the incomplete nature of her internal ethical identity.

Cuihua’s life coincided with three waves of the times: the Cultural Revolution, the reform and opening up, and the information explosion. These turbulent waves of history molded her into the “Master Rushi” while simultaneously obliterating the remnants of her former self, “Cuihua.” Cuihua’s life experiences varied greatly, bearing distinct imprints of historical development. She was “iron girl” in the production team, a “businessperson” who ventured into the market during the early stages of reform and opening up, and even became the owner of a nightclub. Eventually, she became a revered and worshipped “enlightened master.” It can be seen that Cuihua underwent multiple significant identity transformations throughout her life, and in the midst of these complex changes, her initial two choices are particularly representative. One was the encounter with the “blind fortune-teller” on the train after Professor Chen left. The other was her handling of the 64 gold bars left by the “blind fortune-teller” after his passing.

In these two “choices,” Cuihua’s character traits can be seen. Firstly, she is driven by strong instincts and possesses a strong sense of action. Secondly, Cuihua is easily swayed by external influences, lacking a stable inner core. This lays the groundwork for her later actions in the story—engaging in money-for-sex deals, misleading others, breaking the law, and disregarding ethics. Ethical identity changes often directly lead to the creation of ethical confusion.<sup>3</sup> Therefore, when a

1 It was a political and social campaign in China that lasted from the 1950s to the late 1970s. During this period, millions of educated urban youth were sent to rural areas to live and work with peasants.

2 From an ancient poem by the Chinese poet Bai Juyi, “The Spring Journey of Qiantang Lake,” the original intention is that too many flowers to see the eyes, often used to compare things to dazzle people.

3 See Nie Zhenzhao, “Ethical Literary Criticism: A Basic Theory,” *Forum for World Literature Studies* 2 (2021): 189-207; Nie Zhenzhao, “Ethical Literary Criticism: Sphinx Factor and Ethical Selection,” *Forum for World Literature Studies* 3 (2021): 383-398.

character in a novel exhibits a lot of chaos and deviation from moral behavior, one can try to find the reasons from their ethical identities.

At the turn of the century, people experienced two World Wars, armed revolutions, the Cultural Revolution, and the economic “revolution” known as reform and opening up. The once-solid and self-consistent value system and ethics centered around “land” underwent a radical change following several profound societal transformations. The dissociation of old ethical identities and the establishment of new ones inevitably require a transitional period of incomplete and blurred identities. Cuihua is a typical figure in this transitional period. Therefore, Cuihua’s actions and choices in the story all demonstrate the characteristics of her incomplete ethical identity—a lot of bad ethical choices. Because of the incomplete ethical identity, Cuihua cannot obtain the answer to “who she is” from the existing social and cultural traditions. When ethical identities are incomplete, neither individuals nor society can locate their identities. In the absence of norms and examples, different people behave differently when faced with the question of “who am I.” Individuals often resort to either reckless behavior or inaction when they are unsure of how to act. Cuihua’s pursuit of personal gain and disregard for ethics clearly falls into the former category, as her incomplete ethical identity drives her to explore a place outside the law.

#### (II) Ethical Choices: Search and Avoidance

Cuihua and Professor Chen are two typical representatives of generation. In the tide of time, Professor Chen’s ethical identity, along with hers, has been repeatedly deconstructed and reconstructed. The dissolution of societal hierarchies marked by traditional identities, such as the scholar, farmer, artisan and merchant, along with the influence of capital and the explosion of information, have distorted and fragmented our existing ethical identities. When a person cannot obtain an accurate role positioning from the external society and internal self, his behavioral choices are inevitably affected. This disorder stems from the lack of clarity in one’s role positioning. Cuihua is an extension of the traditional “farmer” archetype, while Professor Chen represent the condensed image of the traditional social class of scholars. Compared to Cuihua’s carefree and fearless approach of doing whatever she pleases, Professor Chen’s choices are filled with contradictions and pain. The rift between old ethical morals and social development underlies Professor Chen’s actions and choices.

The advancements in society and scientific progress have significantly extended human lifespan. The traditional Chinese proverb “it’s rare to live to seventy since olden day” reflects the brevity of old age in ancient times. If we

apply this outdated perspective to contemporary society, the elderly would face an exceptionally protracted period of old age. In the span of several decades of this life spanning, each individual faces the choice of how to spend their old age. Both the elderly Cuihua and Professor Chen have emotional and physiological needs. From the perspective of traditional ethical values, Cuihua's choices can be seen as incestuous and immoral. Elderly Cuihua, through her alluring words and financial power, entices young men to engage in physical relationships with her. As for the feelings that developed between Professor Chen and the young girl Lu, and her direct and sincere gestures of affection, Professor Chen selected let it happens in nature, and ends because of moral etiquette. Professor Chen's attitude towards the "May-December romance" with Lu represents a spiritual yearning and an act of avoidance. This contradiction between knowledge and action is a typical characteristic of his behavior.

Throughout the book, Professor Chen selected sacrifice personal interests and shoulder social responsibility by exposing Cuihua's crimes. This is a task that rightfully belonged to the police, not a retired old man like Professor Chen. The "pursuit" in his heart is not something that can be acknowledged by mainstream values. Professor Chen's actions may be objectively perceived as those of an outsider, an amateur, a busybody or even a disturber of public order. However, it is the embodiment of his ethical view of "pursuit" and ultimately helps the police bring Cuihua to justice. From an individual perspective, this may be seen as the heroic act of a "Don Quixote," but when Professor Chen existed as a reflection of the collective, it becomes a painful scar hidden beneath the grand narrative of the era. The ethical choices driven by his ethical beliefs fail to satisfy the true needs of the subject, resulting in the underlying anguish and struggle of the individual behind his choices. These contradictions reflect the incompleteness of Professor Chen ethical identity and its mismatch with the current social realities.

## II. Narrative Method: Ethical Dilemmas in Perplexing Choices

The protagonist's incomplete ethical identity leads to confusion in their ethical choices, creating a narrative filled with complex ethical dilemmas. A "dilemma" refers to a situation that forces individuals to make difficult decisions, often with tragic consequences. Throughout history, classic stories have often revolved around such ethical dilemmas. The choices made by Cuihua and the Professor Chen lead us down different paths, while also exposing the ethical dilemmas we face.

### (I) An Ideal World or A Place of No Attachment

In the article *The Uniting of Human and Divine*, Cuihua establishes a self-

sufficient “ideal world” far away from the city. This “ideal world” stands in sharp contrast to the reality of the outside society, highlighting the prominent ethical dilemma of our current society - the dilemma of old age. In Cuihua’s “ideal world,” Cuihua is the “rule,” actually the embodiment of the inner desires of Professor Chen and Cuihua.

The “ideal world” is like the “Castle in the Clouds” in *Les Misérables*. The more beautiful the castle in the clouds appears, the more it emphasizes Cosette’s difficult situation. In other words, the fear held within Cuihua’s and Professor Chen’s hearts manifests in the real world as a situation of the elderly having no one to rely on. Professor Chen and Cuihua become two senior citizens stripped of social standing. This underlying fear is subtly expressed by the author through the concept of “the ideal world.” Outside of “the ideal world,” Professor Chen is a retired professor who can pass as someone else with a wig on, an “expert” often scoffed at on the internet, and a sleepless widower. Cuihua is a transcendent being who has achieved “Dao” and no longer indulges in worldly affairs, described by Lu as a monster who is like an old and dried-up poplar or plum tree. Despite the seemingly opposite lifestyles of Professor Chen and Cuihua, they both belong to the elderly population over the age of seventy. Society blurs the gender boundaries of this group and overlooks their needs, thus largely diminishing their social value and authority. Although human lifespan is increasing, this physical and mental suffering is also invisibly prolonged.

#### (II) The Paradox of the “Self” in Nested Spaces

The novel *The Uniting of Human and Divine* employs a captivating tapestry of multilayered narratives, also known as multiple narrative threads. There are two prominent contrasting narratives: one is parallel storytelling between ghost stories and the main plotline, and the other is the parallel storytelling between the present Professor Chen and the past Professor Chen from his youth. The former is similar to Chinese “zhiguai” (tales of the strange) fiction, which seems to be about ghosts and monsters but actually criticizes corruption and cruelty. In *The Uniting of Human and Divine*, ghost stories from across time and cultures are employed as an antidote to their own mystique, laid bare on the page to dispel their supernatural allure. This narrative technique is a common method used in psychology and sociology—the secret lies in the secrecy itself. “Audiences can feel the mystery and power behind the performance, while the performers are well aware that their main secrets are nothing more than insignificant tricks. As numerous folktales and initiation ceremonies have shown, the true secret behind mysterious things is that there are actually no secrets at all; the real issue is how to prevent the audience from knowing this” (Goffman 56).

Imposing restrictions on contact, such as maintaining social distance, can create and maintain a sense of awe. However, the author breaks this social distance in order to demystify the supernatural. Cuihua, elevated to a divine status due to this very “mystique,” is ultimately stripped of her divinity by Lu after close contact, revealing Cuihua’s true nature as “a hunched old woman, like a dried-up poplar or plum tree” (307)<sup>1</sup>.

The parallel narrative between the present and the past is a form of montage in terms of narrative space. In the linear progression of time and space in reality, individuals are unable to simultaneously see their own past, present, and future, resulting in an inability to intuitively grasp cause and effect. However, in literary works such as novels, plays, and movies, the timelines and spatial dimensions can be freely rearranged, giving rise to spatial storytelling. Taking the novel as an example, through the use of words, a narrative space is constructed, within which the author can freely organize the relationships of time, space, and characters, achieving contemplation and observation that are difficult to attain in real life. In the novel *The Uniting of Human and Divine* the most prominent function of spatial storytelling is to achieve “self-inspect” that is difficult to attain in real life. Through parallel narration, the author juxtaposes the past Professor Chen and Cuihua with the present Professor Chen and the present Cuihua, allowing the reader to perceive the simultaneous occurrence of cause and effect, which would otherwise follow a linear sequence. The result is a vivid portrayal of the moment when the bullet from someone youth hits the heart of the present character.

Every person experiences the roles of “parent” and “child,” and only through mutual recognition can young and old individuals attain a complete sense of self, thereby bridging the ethical gap. Otherwise, intergenerational conflicts will create divisions within each individual at every stage of their life, perpetuating like genes. This intergenerational dilemma is cleverly externalized in the novel *The Uniting of Human and Divine*. Generally, intergenerational conflicts often manifest between two opposing individuals. However, in the case of Professor Chen and Cuihua, both have aspects of “parent” and “child.” Intergenerational conflicts exist within a single independent entity, resulting in a confrontation and mutual non-recognition between “him” and “him self.” The intergenerational conflict between Professor Chen and Cuihua reveals a sharp contradiction, vividly showcasing the causal patterns of social development during a specific historical period: during youth, the subversion of old, established traditional ethics and morals within society. In old age, catalyzed by rapid social development, the flaws of a deteriorating, comprehensive ethical

---

1 Quotation from the author’s translation.

order gradually become apparent. This leads to a conflict between the older Professor Chen and Cuihua, transitioning from the role of “child” to that of “parent.” Cuihua is destroyed by the chaos resulting from the loss of ethical norms, while Professor Chen is trapped in his own awkward existence.

### III. Artistic Self-Awareness in the Creation of *The Uniting of Human and Divine*

(I). The Aim of *The Uniting of Human and Divine*: Advocating Ethical Reconstruction  
The reason why the novel *The Uniting of Human and Divine* presents aging and intergenerational conflicts as dilemmas is because there has been a change in societal structure. In addition, the revolution of thought has shattered and dissolved the old ethics, and the subsequent technological revolution has ushered in the information age, rapidly accelerating the pace of social development and transformation, making it difficult to establish a new ethics. Consequently, propositions that had previously been compatible with the ethical order, such as those related to aging and intergenerational issues, became increasingly acute and transformed into intractable dilemmas. The core of explicit and intertwined ethical dilemmas such as the dilemma of older years or intergenerational dilemmas is the dilemma of ethical reconstruction. It is the dilemma between the inapplicability of the old ethics and the emergence of new ethics. In such a situation, the characters of Cuihua and Professor Chen in the novel make different ethical choices. Cuihua represents an extreme choice of self-demonization, while the choice of Professor Chen is a contradictory mixture of retreat, avoidance, and desperate pursuit.

Why construct an ethical reconstruction dilemma with the scope of a novel? The writing of the ethical reconstruction dilemma in *The Uniting of Human and Divine* is essentially a call for ethical reconstruction. At the heart of *The Uniting of Human and Divine* lies a reflection of a reality lacking ethics, a call for ethical reconstruction, and an urgent plea for the reawakening of ethical morality. This exemplifies the values embodied in the novel *The Uniting of Human and Divine*, and represents the author’s commitment to the concept of “cultivation through culture.” The creation of *The Uniting of Human and Divine* is imbued with a strong consciousness of questioning issues, critical awareness, and a sense of social responsibility.

(II). Social consciousness of Creation and Criticism in *The Uniting of Human and Divine*

Social values and literary creation are in a mutually supportive relationship. They promote and complement each other, but they also thrive or decline together. Literary creations that lack a sense of social responsibility and become disconnected

from society are not conducive to the vitality of strong literary creations. As a means of education and enlightenment, literary works serve as the forefront of conveying revolutionary ideology, a carrier of ideology, and a gospel that saves people from fire and water. Likewise, they are also invisible weapons that kill enemies. The functionality and effects of literary works are diverse. However, throughout Chinese history, literary creations have often emphasized their role and value in the real society. The thoughts of “literature as a means to elucidate the way” and “literature carrying the way” have been passed down from ancient China to the present day, and their core idea is that literature or articles are used to illustrate and uphold justice and morality. In fact, the close connection between Chinese literature and social reality is the result of a positive choice of literary works. As a tool for conveying and shaping ethical concepts, it is a result of the efforts, spontaneity, and initiative of literary creations in China. It is one of the ways to closely link literary creation with social reality.

Therefore, the establishment of ethical order and moral education, as a long-standing literary principle, is not only the embodiment of its inner nature but also a necessary approach for its own development. The sense of social responsibility and mission of intellectuals drives literary creation and literary theory to voluntarily participate in society, politics, economy, and culture. Moreover, for their own development, literary creation and theory should participate more actively in these domains. The ethical literary criticism theory as well as the building and dissemination of ethical order in literary works, as a form of literary self-awareness passed down for thousands of years, have promoted the development of literature. One of the sources of the vigorous vitality of Chinese literature lies precisely in this.

### Works Cited

Chen Zhongyi. *The Uniting of Human and Divine*. Beijing: People's Literature Publishing House, 2023.

欧文·戈夫曼：《日常生活中的自我呈现》，冯刚译。北京：北京大学出版社，2022年。

[Goffman, Erving. *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life*, translated by Feng Gang. Beijing: Peking UP, 2022.]

Nie Zhenzhao, “Ethical Literary Criticism: A Basic Theory.” *Forum for World Literature Studies* 2 (2021): 189-207.

—. “Ethical Literary Criticism: Sphinx Factor and Ethical Selection.” *Forum for World Literature Studies* 3 (2021): 383-398.

朱熹：《朱子全书》第1册。上海：上海古籍出版社，2002年。

[Zhu Xi. *The Complete Works of Zhu Xi* Vol. 1. Shanghai: Shanghai Ancient Books Publishing House, 2002.]

# 动态视角下轭式搭配的认知框架

## The Cognitive Framework of Zeugma from a Dynamic Perspective

洪峥怡 (Hong Zhengyi)

**内容摘要:** 从认知角度看, 轭式搭配语义的生成和修辞效果的实现都是隐喻使用的结果。就一个  $V+N_1+N_2$  结构的轭式搭配而言, 子结构  $V+N_1$  是一个常规组合, 而  $V+N_2$  则是相对非常规的表达。在理解非常规搭配的过程中, 隐喻发挥了关键的作用, 但其实现的方式既不是简单地将  $V+N_1$  作为源域,  $V+N_2$  作为目标域的跨域映射, 也不完全符合以  $V$  为范畴,  $N_1$  和  $N_2$  为要素的范畴归属, 原因是拆分后的  $V+N_1$  和  $V+N_2$  之间存在着不同程度、不同类型的关联, 主体对前一部分的理解会影响后一部分理解时认知框架的构建, 是一个动态的概念整合过程。针对这一动态的理解过程, 本文遵循动态语义学的基本理念, 将语句的含义理解为语境改变潜力, 并基于情境语义学描写这类表达中的语境变化和语义生成, 其中, 语境的改变体现为情境类的重构, 而两个子结构之间的关联体现为情境类之间的规约制约。

**关键词:** 轭式搭配; 隐喻; 概念整合; 动态语义

**作者简介:** 洪峥怡, 浙江大学哲学学院博士后, 主要从事语言逻辑研究。本文为国家社会科学基金重大项目“汉语隐喻的逻辑表征与认知计算”【项目批号: 18ZDA290】和国家社会科学基金青年项目“基于信息流逻辑的隐喻语义动态性研究”【项目批号: 24CZX086】阶段性成果。

**Title:** The Cognitive Framework of Zeugma from a Dynamic Perspective

**Abstract:** From a cognitive perspective, both the semantic generation and rhetorical effects of zeugma are depend on metaphor. In the case of a zeugma construction  $V+N_1+N_2$ , the substructure  $V+N_1$  typically represents a conventional combination, whereas  $V+N_2$  is a relatively abnormal expression and understanding it requires identifying and interpreting the metaphors. The metaphor in a zeugma is neither a simple cross-domain mapping where  $V+N_1$  serves as the source domain and  $V+N_2$  as the target domain, nor does it fully adhere to the categorization where  $V$  is the category and  $N_1$  and  $N_2$  are its elements. The reason is that there are different degrees and types of correlations between  $V+N_1$  and  $V+N_2$  components, and the agent's understanding of the former part will affect the construction of the cognitive

framework during the understanding of the latter part, so it is a dynamic process of conceptual integration. To address this dynamic understanding process, this paper follows the basic tenet of dynamic semantics, interpreting the meaning of the statement as the context change potential, and uses situation semantics describes the contextual variations and semantic generation of such expressions based on. Here, the change of contexts is reflected in the reconstruction of situation types, while the associations between the two substructures are the conventional constraints between situation types.

**Keywords:** Zeugma; metaphors; conceptual integration; dynamic semantics

**Author:** Hong Zhengyi is Postdoctoral Researcher at the Department of Philosophy, Zhejiang University (Hangzhou 310058, China). Her research area is Natural Language Logic (Email: flourite@zju.edu.com).

## 一、绪论

轭式搭配 (Zeugma) 是一种高度文学性的表达, 作为一种修辞手法, 它以独特的词汇搭配方式构建了全新的认知图式, 实现了特别的修辞效果。Zeugma 一词源于希腊语的 *zeugnynai*, 其意为“连接”或“用轭连起”。轭, 原指驾车时搁在牛马颈上的曲木, 以此将两头牲口套在一起拉车。<sup>1</sup> 轭式搭配的结构便与之类似, 《牛津文学学术语词典》(*The Concise Oxford Dictionary of Literary Terms*) 将其定义为这样一种修辞手法: “在一个句子中, 单个单词与句子的两个部分相关, 且往往在语法或逻辑上仅适用于其中一个部分”(Baldick 278)<sup>2</sup>。典型的轭式搭配是, 使用同一个动词、介词、形容词同时支配或修饰两个或两个以上的名词, 使其产生不同语义。一种情况是, 只有部分是符合逻辑的惯常用法, 其他非常规搭配需要借助于常规搭配构建的语境才能被接受。如 *She opened the door and her heart to the homeless child* (她对这个无家可归的孩子打开了家门, 也敞开了心扉。), *opened the door* 是字面义, 而 *opened her heart* 不能按字面义直接理解; 另一种情况是同一个词以不同的义项与几个名词分别搭配, 表达不同的意义, 如 *Yesterday he had a blue coat and heart* (昨天她穿了蓝色的衣服, 怀着忧郁的心情), *blue* 分别作为“蓝色的”和“忧郁的”两个不同义项与 *coat* 和 *heart* 搭配。我们把共用的词称为支配词 (governing words) 或者“轭”, 多个与之搭配的词或短语称为被支配部分 (governed parts)。将支配词与被支配部分分别组合, 就构成了该语句所管辖的多个子句。

据统计, 轭式搭配中动词所构成的搭配占 85.5%, 形容词及名词所构成的搭配占 14.5%, 在动词结构为参照点的轭制构在动词结构为参照点的轭制

1 参见 国学大师网汉语字典 <https://www.guoxuedashi.net/zidian/8F6D.html/>, 2024 年 8 月 30 日。

2 外文引文均出自笔者译。

构式中，动词支配  $N_1$  和  $N_2$  的结构占 64.5%，动词作为  $N_1$  和  $N_2$  的谓语的占 21%。<sup>1</sup> 可见轭式搭配的典型结构可以表示为  $V+N_1+N_2$ ， $N_1$  与  $V$  为正常搭配，而与  $N_2$  为非正常搭配。 $N_1$  多为实体名词而  $N_2$  多为抽象名词，两者多属于不同的范畴，只有将它们同置于一个事件域或一个场景时两者才能在语义上并现并协调。所以，下文也主要以  $V+N_1+N_2$  形式为例，对该结构以及拆分得到的  $V+N_1$  和  $V+N_2$  两个子结构进行讨论。

对轭式搭配的早期研究主要研究轭式搭配的结构、分类、对比分析和修辞效果，探讨对轭式搭配的理解、赏析和翻译策略等。分类上，福科尼耶 (Gilles Fauconnier) 区分了双链接型 (double-link zeugma) 和多链接型 (multi-link zeugma) 轭式搭配<sup>2</sup>；戴维 (Donald Davie) 根据主导词在句子中出现的位置将其分为前置轭式搭配 (prozeugma)，中置轭式搭配 (mesozeugma) 和后置轭式搭配 (hypozeugma)<sup>3</sup>；皮尔波特 (Robert Pierpont) 从句法和语义的角度分析了 zeugma 和 syllepsis (异叙) 的异同<sup>4</sup>；布莱克默 (Diane Blakemore) 分析了 zeugma 在文学和非文学作品中的使用效果，指出这样的表述不仅是刻意的新奇化，也是为了实现最佳关联，使得表达能在特定语境下产生特殊意义<sup>5</sup>。此后，学者们开始更多地关注轭式搭配形成的特殊的认知模式，一方面，关注到它是一种结构上的多义词，具有一词多义属性的支配词需要在语境中确定选择何种意义，因此，分配给词汇条目的单一意义是语境专门化的。<sup>6</sup> 而一些原本不合理的搭配也需要在专门的语境中得到合理的解释，这些研究基于语用学的合作原则、关联理论、自主/依存分析框架、会话含义理论来解释这一结构的语境依赖性<sup>7</sup>。另一方面，斯蒂恩 (Gerard Steen)、科尔茨 (Daniel Corts) 等都指出，轭式搭配本质上是一种隐喻<sup>8</sup>，因此基于认知语言学的认知参照点理论、概念隐喻理论、概念整合理论、甚至

1 参见王可可等：“英语轭制构式的‘惯性压制+’研究”，《天津外国语大学学报》6 (2012)：29。

2 参见 Gilles Fauconnier, *Mappings in Thought and Language*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.

3 参见 Donald Davie, “Sixteenth-century Poetry and the Common Reader: the Case of Thomas Sackville,” *Essays in Criticism* 2 (1954): 117-127.

4 参见 Robert Pierpont, “Syllepsis or Zeugma: ‘Pickwick’,” *Notes and Queries* 97 (1911): 366.

5 参见 Diane Blakemore, “The Relevance of Reformulations,” *Language and Literature* 2 (1993): 101-120.

6 参见 Ann Copestake and Ted Briscoe, “Semi-productive Polysemy and Sense Extension,” *Journal of Semantics* 1 (1995): 15-67.

7 参见牛保义：“自主/依存联结——认知语法的一种分析模型”，《外语与外语教学》1 (2008)：1-5。

8 参见 Gerard Steen, “Towards a Procedure for Metaphor Identification,” *Language and Literature* 1 (2002): 17-33; Daniel Corts, “Factors Characterizing Bursts of Figurative Language and Gesture in College Lectures,” *Discourse Studies* 2 (2006): 211-233.

心智哲学来阐释轭式搭配的生成机制。申 (Yeshayahu Shen) 还结合语言实验讨论了轭式搭配中并列成分的顺序, 证明中搭配中倾向于熟悉的表达出现在陌生的, 即隐喻性表达之前, 违反这一倾向的句子在回忆中比不违反这一倾向的句子更容易被倒转。<sup>1</sup> 这些研究不再局限于轭式搭配在语言层面的特色, 而更多地探讨了它的认知基础及其影响。

我们赞同轭式搭配的认知基础是隐喻, 但相比于简单的隐喻表达, 轭式搭配的子结构之间会形成不同程度和类型的关联, 其中涉及的隐喻理解的认知模式也有所不同, 既有研究使用隐喻理论对非常规搭配的语义进行分析时解释并不充分。此外, 这种特殊修辞手法的使用在语句内部创建了动态的语境, 完整的理解过程不仅需要考虑静态的隐喻跨域映射, 还需要还原这种动态性的影响。本文第二节从逻辑的角度, 讨论轭式搭配内部的基本语义结构, 第三节说明其背后的认知框架构建方式不是简单的概念映射和范畴归属, 而是动态的概念整合; 第四节基于动态语义学的基本理念, 以情境语义学为工具形式化这一动态的认知构建过程, 尝试更清晰地刻画轭式搭配的语义生成和理解。

## 二、轭式搭配的语义结构

从轭式搭配的定义可以看出, 其基本结构包括一个共有的支配词和多个被支配部分, 通过补充或拆分, 将其重新拆分成两个独立的子结构, 如语句 *She opened the door and her heart to the homeless child*, 可以拆分为 *She opened the door to the homeless child* 和 *She opened her heart to the homeless child* 两个子结构以便分析, 因此支配词是否省略或重复出现不影响本文的分析内容, 文中也同时使用了英汉两种语言的例子。

而同样是轭式搭配的表达, 不同语句在理解时仍然有很大的差异, 存在着不同的认知建构的方式。对比下面两个句子:

(1) *The murder kills all the boys and luggage.*

(2) *Lawsuit consumes time and money.*

句 1 拆分后得到 (1a) *kill the boy* 和 (1b) *kill the luggage*, 如果后者单独出现, 并不是一个在惯常交际中能被接受的表达, 理解者很难正确地解读它的含义。而 (2) 中得到的是 (2a) *consumes time* 和 (2b) *consumes money*, 即使两个句子分别出现也不影响对非惯常表达 (2b) 的理解。

据此, 我们可以从语义的逻辑关系上将轭式搭配分为两种模式:

(1)  $A \wedge B$  形式。  $V+N_1+N_2$  的语义大致可以简化为  $(V+N_1) \wedge (V+N_2)$ , 语义理解时,  $V+N_1$  作为常规搭配很容易被理解, 而  $V+N_2$  虽然相比于  $V+N_1$  不够常用, 但使用的隐喻也相对常见, 更明显的情况是, 这种隐喻义已经固定在

<sup>1</sup> 参见 Yeshayahu Shen, "Zeugma: Prototypes, Categories, and Metaphors," *Metaphor and Symbol* 1 (1998): 31-47.

语词中了，相当于一词多义，使用了同一个词的不同意思。据统计， $N_1$  和  $N_2$  主要由连接词“and”来连接，其次 as well as, but, then, than 等连接词，构成并列(77.6%)、转折(9.2%)、选择(7.9%)、递进(3.9%)、和顺序(1.4%)几种语义关系。<sup>1</sup> 以上几种关系简化为基本的逻辑联结词时，都作为合取式，因此  $A \wedge B$  形式是轭式搭配语义理解的基本模式。

(2)  $A \rightarrow B$  形式。此时一个  $V+N_1+N_2$  形式的语句， $V+N_1$  的语义仍然保留， $V+N_2$  的语义大致可以简化为  $(V+N_1) \rightarrow (V+N_2)$ 。即异常搭配中隐喻的使用是依赖于前面这个相对惯常的语义的，如果脱离了前一句话构造的语境，这个隐喻表达会被认为是不好的甚至是不可理解的。

这种差异也导致了两者在真值条件方面的区别。和经典命题逻辑一样， $A \wedge B$  为真当且仅当  $A$  为真且  $B$  为真。考虑到肯定句的隐喻表达在字面上平凡为假，这里需要主体能够独立地认知到其隐喻义  $B^M$ ，因此，表达为真需要判定  $A$  和  $B^M$  都为真，两者任意一个为假则整个表达为假。但  $A \rightarrow B$  的真值条件不同于命题逻辑， $A \rightarrow B$  为真当且仅当如果  $A$  为真则  $B^M$  为真，如果  $A$  为假则  $B^M$  无意义进而整个搭配无意义。

直观上，相较于  $A \rightarrow B$ ， $A \wedge B$  中的两个子结构的独立性更强。但无论是哪种形式，共轭的两个结构总是基于相同的语境的，存在着语义相互牵连的情况，这使得对其的语义表达更为复杂。很多情况下， $V+N_2$  单独表述时，该表达也可以被听话人接受，但出现在  $V+N_1+N_2$  的搭配中， $V+N_1$  部分会补充相应的信息，使得对  $V+N_2$  部分的理解指向更明确，内容也更丰富。

以上给出的两种模式也对应于轭式搭配定义中给出的两种情况，合取的相对独立性通常也来源于隐喻含义逐渐被固定下来，新奇隐喻变为惯常隐喻，最后变为语词自身包含的一个稳定的义项。蕴含的独立性更低，如果脱离了前一个子句就会变得无法理解，也就是一个还依赖于上下文的新奇隐喻。而汉语的拈连用法中，对拈词管辖的成员间语义上不要求具有相关性，因此  $AB$  表现得更为明显。

### 三、轭式结构的隐喻认知框架

学者们普遍认同，轭式搭配与隐喻关系密切，遵循隐喻的认知机制，本质上是通过将喻体属性映射到本体使对本体的描述变得容易接受。其中常规搭配充当喻体，属于源域，非常规搭配充当本体，属于目的域。例如：

(3) She opened the door and her heart to the homeless child.

(4) 于是，我打开了抽屉，不仅是打开了抽屉，我打开了自己的心。

按照概念隐喻理论的解释，上述两个句子分别以“打开门”和“打开抽屉”为源域，映射到“打开心”这一目标域。显然，开门和开抽屉存在差

<sup>1</sup> 参见王可可等：“英语轭制构式的‘惯性压制+’研究”，《天津外国语大学学报》6(2012)：27-32。

异，所构建的认知框架也不同，但“打开心”的理解在这两句话中并没有根本的区别，都是指袒露内心。两者理解上的差异只是来自于常规搭配构建的不同语境，前者因为打开门得到接纳而袒露内心，而后者则是打开抽屉触发回忆而袒露内心。

申的研究认为轭式搭配的认知机制类似于范畴归属，支配词提供了范畴，而共轭的两部分都是这个范畴中的成员，一个是原型，一个非原型。即  $V+N_1+N_2$  的结构中，由支配词  $V$  给出一个范畴， $N_1$  是范畴中的典型， $N_2$  在该范畴中处于边缘位置甚至不属于该范畴，而该结构将  $N_1$  和  $N_2$  并置，形成一种认知上的迁移，将  $N_2$  也作为该范畴中的典型被理解。<sup>1</sup> 这样能够解释上文给出的例句，其中“门”“抽屉”属于“被打开物”的典型范畴，“心”不属于该范畴，“打开”的动作被迁移到“心”这一抽象概念上，在理解者的认知中构造了类似于开门开抽屉的图式并投射为袒露内心想法。这一解释的缺陷同样是将  $V+N_2$  只作为独立的句子来理解，而没有将其置于  $V+N_1$  修改过的语境中，因此丢失了部分用于理解的信息。

但隐喻语义存在历时的动态变化，一个搭配会随着使用频率的增加而从新奇隐喻转变为惯常隐喻，最后成为该语词固定的义项，不再需要概念框架和上下文语境。可以说，很多一词多义的情况也是由隐喻发展而来的。因此  $V+N_2$  是异常搭配还是一词多义的区别并不是绝对的。而  $A \wedge B$  形式与  $A \rightarrow B$  形式的区分取决于  $B$ （也就是  $V+N_2$ ）能否被独立地接受，自然也没有清晰的划界。上述这些研究没有细分不同情况下不同的语义形成情况，也没有对其中具体的映射方式做进一步的说明。就像 *She opened the door and her heart to the homeless child*. 这个例子中，虽然 *open her heart* 的理解离不开 *open the door* 提供的认知模式，但由于这是一个被频繁使用的隐喻，即使没有“打开门”构建的语境，单从“打开心（扉）”看，我们也能知道“不隐瞒，表现出内心想法”这样的含义，但并不知道是因为郁结得以纾解，感到温暖，还是被施以压力。*She opened the door to the homeless child* 相当于是“后面供听者展开推理的基础和进行联想的背景，为解读后面即将出现的异常搭配 *open her heart* 提供发挥的方向”（陈友勋 62）。

从上文的例子中可以看出，轭式搭配认知的基础是，利用常规搭配提供的信息作为一个认知背景和认知参照点，为理解和领会后面的非常规搭配提供思考的方向。为描述隐喻构建认知背景和认知参照点这一方面的作用，福科尼耶（Gilles Fauconnie）等人提出的概念整合理论的观点能更好地描述轭式搭配中的隐喻认知相比概念映射理论和范畴归属理论有更强的解释力。所谓的概念整合是心理空间的整合，一个概念整合网络（conceptual integration network）包含四个由投射链彼此连接的心理空间，其中两个为输入空间（input

1 参见 Yeshayahu Shen, “Zeugma: Prototypes, Categories, and Metaphors,” *Metaphor and Symbol* 1 (1998): 31-47.

mental space), 每个输入空间都是一个情境的部分结构; 由一个跨空间的部分映射将这两个输入空间中相联系的部分分别进行匹配; 两个空间中共有要素组成类属空间 (generic mental space); 由两个输入空间的选择性投射则得到合成空间 (blended mental space)。从输入空间到合成空间的整合过程是通过关键关系的压缩实现的, 包括时间、空间、表征、变化、价值/角色、类比和因果关系等。通过压缩这些外在的空间关系, 合成空间中会形成一个新的内在空间关系。<sup>1</sup> 语义解释可以调用不同输入空间及其交互形成的知识, 经过组合、完善、精演等心理操作, 得到合理解释。<sup>2</sup> 在概念整合的框架下, 轭式搭配是语形和语义双重压缩重组的结果, 将被压缩的成分还原后,  $V+N_1$  和  $V+N_2$  作为两个输入空间中的内容, 投射到合成空间中的要素包括  $V$  给出的范畴,  $V+N_1$  给出的语境, 和  $N_2$  给出的填充内容, 并由合成空间中的组合和进一步推理, 构成一个新的认知图式。

#### 四、轭式搭配的动态语义

既然轭式结构的隐喻并不是简单的概念映射或范畴归属, 而是一种概念整合。那么这种整合机制是怎样的, 如何将这一动态的语义对象化? 本节中, 我们用情境理论来重构这一过程, 以更清晰地呈现这一结构中的语义生成。

以蒙太格语法为代表的经典逻辑语义学是一种静态的语义学, 它研究的意义以句子为最大单位。由语言和世界的静态对应得到相应的含义。但对于存在语境依赖的语义现象, 静态的语义学在解释时存在诸多不足, 为弥补这一理论的不足, 学者们提出了各种各样的动态理论。大致说来, 有“语境变化的理论、信仰增减的理论、指派更新的理论以及动态蒙太格语法等等”(邹崇理 杨蓉荣 27), 统称为动态语义学。这里, 我们选取动态语义学的一个理论分支——情境语义学 (situation semantics) 作为描写轭式搭配中语义动态性的工具。和其他动态语义学理论一样, 情境语义学也特别强调了语言的功效性, “意义的核心是通过表达式传递关于外部世界和我们心灵状态的信息”(Barwise and Perry 1), 是基于情境之间的关系从一个情境关联到另一情境的能力。与将意义视为抽象实体的真值条件语义学不同, 情境语义学把意义视为情境之间的关系, 而不是一个真正可分离的实体, 离开情境, 它们之间的关系和关系构成的意义也不再存在。

情境是可能世界被认识或被关注的部分, 包含了主体、关系、(时空) 场点、极性四个基本要素。由多个情境组合而成的复合情境可以通过选取时空序列上不连续的时空位置来表达情境的变化过程, 这种动态的事件被称作事件过程。比如当前时空场点中, 主体  $a$  口渴喝水的事件  $e$  可以由如下情境表达:

1 参见 Gilles Fauconnier and Mark Turner, *The Way We Think*, New York: Basic Books, 2008, 137-138.

2 参见王勤玲: “概念隐喻理论与概念整合理论的对比研究”, 《外语学刊》1 (2005): 42-46。

$$e: = \text{at } \ell: \text{drinking, a; } 1 \\ \text{at } \ell': \text{thirsty, a; } 0 (\ell \leq \ell')^1$$

而对于动态语义学强调的语境动态性，情境语义学的表现方式是情境类型之间的信息传递关系。情境类型 (situation type)<sup>2</sup> 是具象情境的简单扩充，它允许信息元中的一些要素也可以是被抽象了的自由变元，即在一个情境类型中，其要素既可以包括具象的个体、场点和关系，也允许抽象的个体未定量、场点未定量和关系未定量的存在，以此对具有相同要素的一类事件进行概括性的描述。如果对具体情形中的部分要素进行抽象，就得到一个抽象情境。比如将时空场点和行为主体抽象为未定量后， $s = \langle \text{thirsty, } x, \ell, 1 \rangle \wedge \langle \text{drinking, } x, \ell, 1 \rangle$  就表示就表示“此时某人又饿又渴”这一类事件。<sup>3</sup> 相应地，抽象情境也可以通过一个函数  $f$  分配给每个参数具体对象、关系或极性被还原为具体的情境，该函数被称为锚定函数 (anchor)<sup>4</sup>。情境类型的引入，使得个体与集合、普遍性和特殊性之间的关联得以表达，方便以相对统一的方式处理具象内容和抽象。

情境类型之间的信息传递关系由“制约” (constraints) 给出。“制约”是定义在情境类型上的二元关系，它是信息流的核心机制，如果适应了该制约，就能从当前情境跳转到另一情境，实现信息的流动，通过给出情境类型到另一个情境类型的信息传递，语句才获得了意义。因此当我们说一个对象有什么意义时，实际上我们是在讨论涉及该对象的情境所属的情境类与另一情境类之间的制约关系，即“由一个类型  $S$  可以得到另一类型  $S'$ ，记为  $C=[S \Rightarrow S']$ ” (Devlin 94)。进一步地，巴威斯和佩里还将制约分为必然制约、惯常制约、规约制约和条件制约，其中必然制约是由必然关系产生的制约，惯常制约是自然规律形成的制约，规约制约产生于生物群内显式或隐式的规约，仅在一定的条件下成立的制约都为条件制约<sup>5</sup>。

我们认为，轭式搭配的认知机制是概念整合，认知目标的整合对象有两类，一是支配词作为范畴给出的框架，二是上下文及其推理给出的语境。其中，前者是一个范畴归属，可以通过支配词构建的情境类来描述，典型范畴的构建依赖于语言使用，是一种规约制约。如例 (3) 中，open 范畴所包含的对象是“被打开的事物”，通常具有“改变原事物的关闭状态”“使其处于展开的或伸展”，“允许内外物质交换”等性质，也就是说，“打开”通过范畴提升理解为“允许事物自由通过”：

1 为简化记法，情境也可以表示为主体、关系、(时空)场点、极性的有序  $n$  元组  $\langle r, a, \ell, i \rangle$ ，事件类型中的情境可以记作  $s = \langle \text{thirsty, } a, \ell, 1 \rangle \wedge \langle \text{drinking, } a, \ell', 1 \rangle \wedge \langle \text{thirsty, } a, \ell'', 0 \rangle$ 。

2 在 Barwise 和 Perry 的理论中，情境类型也称抽象情境或事件类型。

3 本文中， $a, b, \dots$  表示个体常元， $x, y, \dots$  表示个体变元。

4 参见 Keith Devlin, *Logic and Information*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991, 52.

5 参见 Jon Barwise and John Perry, *Situations and Attitudes*, Stanford: CSLI, 1983, 97-99.

E: = at  $\ell$ : open, x; l  
 at  $\ell$ : in/out, y; l  
 at  $\ell$ : through, y, x; l

后者是语句对语境动态的修改过程。首先由  $V+N_1$  对初始情境进行更新<sup>1</sup>，再以更新后的语境来理解  $V+N_2$ ，这一语境更新过程也依赖于情境类之间的规约制约。但在修改方式上，前文所述的  $A \wedge B$  和  $A \rightarrow B$  两类轭式搭配稍有区别。遵循动态语义学的基本的观点，意义是语境变化的潜力（context change potential, CCP）。即语义是一个关于如何用新信息更新一个现存语境的指令，通过这个指令，现有的文本（text）或话语（discourse）片段作为输入对现有语境进行更新，得到一个新的语境，这个改变信息的过程就是该句子的语义。<sup>2</sup> 语境改变潜力是一种对语境转化过程进行突显的机制，这样，语言的使用就不仅仅直接起到指称客观世界的作用，还通过构建和修改话语参与者共享的语境来发挥作用。采用动态语义定义方式，我们将两类表达形式的语义视为语境的更改，情境语义学的框架下，其外延是一集作为输入和输出的锚定函数构成的有序对。令语义模型为  $M$ ， $h$ 、 $g$ 、 $k$  为情境类型的锚定函数。

对于  $A \wedge B$  模式，规定  $\|A \wedge B\|_M = \{ \langle h, g \rangle \mid \exists k: \langle h, k \rangle \in \|A\|_M \ \& \ \langle k, g \rangle \in \|B\|_M \}$ 。说的是  $A \wedge B$  的语义是所有满足以下条件的输入  $h$  与输出  $g$  构成的有序对：以锚定情境类型的函数  $h$  为输入，存在一个函数  $k$ ，以它的赋值为输出，能够满足  $A$  的描述，且以  $k$  为输入、 $g$  为输出时情境满足  $B$  的描述。直观上， $h$  给出的赋值是关于源域本身的， $k$  的赋值是概念整合框架上的，而  $g$  的赋值是关于目标域的。这样能够保证  $A$  和  $B$  两部分的语义关于当前语境是相容的。

而对于  $A \rightarrow B$  模式，规定  $\|A \rightarrow B\|_M = \{ \langle h, g \rangle \mid h = g \ \& \ \forall k: \langle h, k \rangle \in \|A\|_M \Rightarrow \exists j: \langle k, j \rangle \in \|B\|_M \}$ 。该模式的语义则是所有满足以下条件的输入  $h$  与输出  $g$  构成的有序对：以函数  $h$  为输入，如果存在输出函数  $k$  还原的情境类型满足  $A$  的描述，则存在锚定函数  $j$ ，使得  $\langle k, j \rangle$  满足  $B$  的描述。

仍然以上文例（3）为例，拆分得到（a）She opened the door to the homeless child，（b）She opened her heart to the homeless child。初始语境是当前会话场景，由于此处没有目标语句之外的上下文，所以初始语境为空。加入（a）后，首先将支配词形成的范畴映射到合成空间中，新的语句进入该认知图式。当听话人接受 She opened the door to the homeless child 给出的信息后，新的语境形成，产生关于此的新的认知图式是一个情境类型  $E_a$ ：

1 允许初始情境为空，在描述没有上下文的轭式搭配语句，如果是肯定句，则初始情境为空；如果是否定句，因为否定只是让核心要素不再核心，而不是对其本身的否定，因此初始情境不为空。

2 参见 Heim, Irene, "On the Projection Problem for Presuppositions," *Formal Semantics: the Essential Readings*, edited by P. Portner and B. Partee, Oxford: Blackwell, 2002, 249-260.

Ea: = at  $\ell$ : door, x; 1  
 at  $\ell$ : homeless child, y; 1  
 at  $\ell$ : attributed to, open  $\dot{R}$ ; 1

对应的锚定函数  $h[Ea]$  和  $k[Ea]$  满足:  $h(y)=a$ ,  $a$  是句中所指的那扇门,  $h(y)=k(y)=Anne$ ,  $Anne$  是所指是那个无家可归的孩子,  $h(\dot{R})=k(\dot{R})=let\ sth.\ out$ , 指范畴归属的性质。

Ea: = at  $\ell$ : mind, x; 1  
 at  $\ell$ : homeless child, y; 1  
 at  $\ell$ : attributed to, open  $\dot{R}$ ; 1

锚定函数  $k[Eb]$  和  $g[Eb]$  满足:  $k(y)=g(y)=Anne$ ,  $k(x)=g(x)=Anne's\ mind$ 。

最后, 将两个分句的信息代入, 并与初始情境  $e_0 = \langle at\ \ell: door, a; 1 \rangle \wedge \langle at\ \ell: homeless\ child, y; 1 \rangle \wedge \langle at\ \ell: open...to..., a, b; 1 \rangle$  合并, 由制约对情境进行补充, 构成完整的认知图式。虽然非常规搭配是最终的表达效果是新奇的, 但用于推出该语义的每一步所依赖的仍然是一些规约制约, 在这里, 即使没有上下文, 也可以根据日常语言使用习惯得到制约关系  $C=[S \Rightarrow S_1 \Rightarrow \dots \Rightarrow S_n]$ , 其中  $S = \langle door, x, \ell, 1 \rangle \wedge \langle homeless\ child, y, \ell, 1 \rangle \wedge \langle open, x, y, \ell, 1 \rangle$  为常规搭配给出的情境  $s$  的抽象,  $S_1, \dots, S_n$  为规约制约能合理推出的一系列情境类, “为无家可归的孩子开门”意味着“收留”, “收留”这一行为能够“让其放松下来”以及进一步地“愿意表达内心想法”, 经过制约关系链补充的推理, 情境类之间的信息传递得以完善, 最终构成了该搭配的完整语义。

轭式搭配中, 拆分得到的两个分句之间存在不同程度、不同形式的关联。从逻辑视角看, 两者的关联大致可以分为合取和蕴含两种, 区分的标准是非常规搭配的理解是否依赖于常规搭配。轭式搭配的认知机制是隐喻, 但仅仅理解为概念映射或范畴归属会缺失大量信息, 无法完整地还原轭式搭配的含义, 因此还要考虑句中要素的概念整合。我们尝试以情境语义学为工具还原概念整合的动态过程, 常规搭配中的内容被投射到合成空间后, 自身语义保留, 其中的支配词作为范畴给出认知框架, 用于理解其在异常搭配中的语义, 此外, 常规搭配的分句还对语境进行了更新, 成为理解异常搭配的新语境。这一整合给予了异常搭配理解所需的背景信息, 保证前述两种形式的轭式搭配都能得到有效的理解, 且追求修辞效果而进行的压缩并没有导致语义的缺失。

## Works Cited

- Baldick, Chris. *The Concise Oxford Dictionary of Literary Terms*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004.
- Barwise, Jon and John Perry. *Situations and Attitudes*. Stanford: CSLI, 1983.
- Blakemore, Diane. "The Relevance of Reformulations." *Language and Literature* 2 (1993): 101-120.
- 陈友勋: “轭式搭配的认知理据”, 《重庆文理学院学报(社会科学版)》3(2007): 61-

63。

[Chen Youxun. "A Cognitive Account of Zeugma in E-C Translation." *Journal of Chongqing University of Arts and Sciences (Social Sciences Edition)* 3 (2007): 61-63.]

Copestake, Ann and Ted Briscoe. "Semi-productive Polysemy and Sense Extension." *Journal of Semantics* 1 (1995): 15-67.

Corts, Daniel. "Factors Characterizing Bursts of Figurative Language and Gesture in College Lectures." *Discourse Studies* 2 (2006): 211-233.

Davie, Donald. "Sixteenth-century Poetry and the Common Reader: the Case of Thomas Sackville." *Essays in Criticism* 2 (1954): 117-127.

Devlin, Keith. *Logic and Information*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1991.

Fauconnier, Gilles. *Mappings in Thought and Language*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1997.

Fauconnier, Gilles and Mark Turner. *Conceptual Integration Network*. *Cognitive Science* 2 (1998): 137-138.

—. *The Way We Think*. New York: Basic Books, 2008.

Heim, Irene. "On the Projection Problem for Presuppositions." *Formal Semantics: the Essential Readings*, edited by P. Portner and B. Partee. Oxford: Blackwell, 2002. 249-260.

牛保义: "自主 / 依存联结——认知语法的一种分析模型", 《外语与外语教学》1 (2008): 1-5。

[Niu Baoyi. "Autonomy/Dependence Alignment—An Analytical Model of Cognitive Grammar." *Foreign Languages and Their Teaching* 1 (2008): 1-5.]

Pierpont, Robert. "Syllepsis or Zeugma: 'Pickwick'." *Notes and Queries* 97 (1911): 366.

Shen, Yeshayahu. "Zeugma: Prototypes, Categories, and Metaphors." *Metaphor and Symbol* 1 (1998): 31-47.

Steen, Gerard. "Towards a Procedure for Metaphor Identification." *Language and Literature* 1 (2002): 17-33.

王可同等: "英语轭制构式的'惯性压制+'研究", 《天津外国语大学学报》6 (2012): 27-32。

[Wang Keke et al. "A study of inertia coercion+ of Zeugma." *Journal of Tianjin Foreign Studies University* 6 (2012): 27-32.]

王勤玲: "概念隐喻理论与概念整合理论的对比研究", 《外语学刊》1 (2005): 42-46。

[Wang Qinling. "A Contrastive Study of Conceptual Metaphor Theory and Conceptual Integration Theory." *Foreign Language Research* 1 (2005): 42-46.]

邹崇理、杨蓉荣: "动态语义学的发展和思维", 《广西大学学报(哲学社会科学版)》5 (2001): 27-30。

[Zou Chongli and Yang Rongrong. "The Development and Innovative Thinking of Dynamic Semantics." *Journal of Guangxi University (Philosophy and Social Science)* 5 (2001): 27-30.]

# A Comparative Study of Poems by AI Poet and Human Poet: In the Case of *Poetry Has No Future Unless It Comes to Its End: Poetry of Artificial Intelligence*

**Feng Yi**

**Abstract:** With the booming development of GPT and AI technology, artificial intelligence can be trained to compose poems with the similar styles and techniques of a particular human poet. Taking an AI poetry collection by Bernstein and Balula as an example, this essay compares the AI poems and Bernstein's poems and explores the echoes between AI poems and Bernstein's poems. According to the analysis, AI poems demonstrate many echoes with Bernstein's poems in terms of themes and images etc., which successfully reflects Bernstein's poetics, whereas generally AI poems can not emulate the rich cultural and literary connotations in Bernstein's poems. The essay continues to probe into the relationship between AI poems and human poems, and ends with the reflection of the challenges facing AI poems and human poems in future.

**Keywords:** Charles Bernstein; AI; poetry; Chat GPT; American Language poetry

**Author:** Feng Yi is Research Fellow and Associate Professor at Foreign Studies College, Northeastern University (Shenyang 110819, China). Her research area is American and British Literature (Email: fengyi202020@163.com).

**标题:** 人工智能诗歌和人类诗歌比较研究：以《诗歌只有走到尽头才有未来：人工智能诗歌》为例

**内容摘要:** 随着 GPT 和 AI 技术的蓬勃发展，通过深度学习，人工智能可以创作出与特定人类诗人相似的“风格”和“技巧”的诗歌。本文以伯恩斯坦和巴鲁拉合作出版的人工智能诗集为例，对人工智能诗歌与伯恩斯坦诗歌进行比较研究，探讨人工智能诗歌和人类诗歌之间的呼应。通过分析可见，一些人工智能诗歌在主题、意象等方面与伯恩斯坦的诗歌有着诸多呼应，较成功地反映了伯恩斯坦的诗学。然而，总的来看，人工智能诗歌无法比肩伯恩斯坦诗歌中丰富的文化和文学内涵。本文还探讨了人工智能诗歌与人类诗歌之间的关系，反思人工智能和人类诗歌未来的挑战。

**关键词:** 查尔斯·伯恩斯坦；人工智能；诗歌；人工智能技术；美国语言派诗歌

**作者简介：**冯溢，东北大学外国语学院研究员、副教授，主要研究方向为英美文学。本文为辽宁省社会科学规划项目“美国语言派诗歌的中国道禅思想意蕴研究”【项目批号：L22BWW003】的阶段性成果。

It was believed that GPT (Generative Pre-trained Transformer) “represents the latest development in one of the hottest research directions in the field of AI — which enables computers to generate complex, seemingly human written text” (Mo 32). “On November 30, 2022, Open AI released the AI dialogue model ChatGPT” (Chen 5-6), and due to Chat GPT’s stunning capabilities, it attracted 1 million users in just 5 days of launch. When it comes to today, Chat GPT has bombarded human world with its resourceful and artistic creations, and the poems created by AI have amazed many poetry readers across the world. Today we have come to an age when people and AI co-write. What is more fascinating is that through deep learning, AI can not only master the skill of using natural human language creatively, but also be able to synthesize poems with the styles and techniques of a particular poet. But can a trained AI have even “signature voice” and the “personality” of the poet himself? The first AI poetry collection in history, *Sunlight Misses Window*, was published by an AI poet named “Xiao Bing” (小冰), also translated as XiaoIce or Little Ice, in China in 2017. But some critics believe that although AI has made great progress in the exploration of opinion, syntax and semantics of human language, it is difficult to compensate for the deficiencies in “textual-level” semantics, overall structure, and global perspective (Zhu and Li 43). However, when the time comes to 2023, what will AI poetry tell the world?

In July, 2023, Charles Bernstein and Davide Balula published a poetry collection of AI, entitled *Poetry Has No Future Unless It Comes to its End: Poetry of Artificial Intelligence*. What is noteworthy is that the experiment of this poetry collection has coincided with the fast advancement of the AI technology. What Balula has done from 2020 to 2022, is to train an AI or, in other words, create a neural network through numerous algorithms by making the machine read and learn a database of more than 20 Bernstein’s works. The works which AI reads and learns include Bernstein’s works at all ages, from his earliest poetry collections such as *Asylums* in 1975 and his latest poetry collection *Topsy-Turvy* in 2021, to his most important works of poetics, such as *A Poetics* in 1992, and *Pitch of Poetry* in 2016. Balula has trained the AI, intending to not only “imitate the brain functions” of human but also evolve by changing the course of prediction into creating new meanings out of the original poems as well as to imitate the “personality” of the poet. After many AI poems have been generated, Bernstein cooperates with the

AI, by “readjusting the format slightly” but without adding “any new language.”<sup>1</sup> The AI poetry collection is with as little human interference as possible, — only Bernstein’s final touch as “he would on the last stage for his own work” ( Bernstein and Balula 15).

As the poetry collection’s paradoxical title suggests, it intends to bring new possibility and perspectives to poetry with the cooperation between a human poet and AI, when today, a lot of people seem to be in desperate, since AI has been replacing human being at every industry of the society in the world, and even now AI has challenged human poets in the creation of poetry, a field which humans dominate. This essay aims to explore and compare poems by this AI poet and by a human poet, Bernstein, in order to inquire into the relationship between AI poetry and human poetry, and to endeavor to foresee the future development of AI poetry and human poetry.

### I. Echoes between AI poet and human poet Bernstein

Bernstein once claimed that language itself is a technology and his long-time criticism on emotional clichés and personification in poetry indicate that he has been for long meditated the relationship between human and non-human. Examples of lines and poems are abundant, such as “I don’t want human art” in “The Lie of Art,” or poems such as “How I became Prehuman” (*Near/Miss* 42 105) and so on. Besides, Bernstein is also famous for his combination of multiple cultural elements into his poetics, such as Chinese Zen-Taoism and American literary tradition. Hence, it would be alluring and eye-opening for readers to read what an AI poet who tries to imitate Bernstein’s poems writes.

We may as well compare the works by the AI poet, who called himself Bernstein’s “brother,” with works by Bernstein to discover the relationship between them. First, AI poems focus on the themes which frequently appear in Bernstein’s poems, such as nothingness, emptiness, negativity, non-logics, American Dream, Human emotion, the Other, the truth and poetry, and theoretic ideas, etc.. Some typical poem titles by Bernstein such as “Seldom Splendor” “Don’t Tell Me About the Tide” “Why I Am Not a Buddhist” “Catachresis My Love” “Emotion of Normal People” and “What Makes a Poem a Poem” and so on, can reveal the themes suggested above. From the title of the AI Poems, such as “The Ocean of Nothingness” “I Am Not” “He Knows a Lot about American Dream, too” “An Emotion Not Comprehended” “I Call this Poem, the Lost Separation” “If All You

---

<sup>1</sup> See Charles Bernstein and Davide Balula, *Poetry Has No Future Unless It Comes to its End: Poetry of Artificial Intelligence*, Rome: NERO, 2023, 15.

Have Is the Book You Are Bound to Get Lost in It and Perhaps Discover Your Own History” among others, both old and new readers of Bernstein will recognize that all these themes of AI poems are also the central themes and consistent concerns of Bernstein in his poetry.

In addition, the AI can skillfully imitate Bernstein’s styles by using the major images and typical sentence structures in Bernstein’s poetry. For instance, the AI poet precisely locates and presents some images which are typical in Bernstein’s poetry, — such as “language” “word” “time” “future” “poetry” “book” “tear” “pipe” “song” and “bee” etc., although some significant images in Bernstein’s poetry are missing in this AI collection. As to sentence structures, AI skillfully uses typical sentence structures in Bernstein’s poetry. A good example is the negative sentence structure, — such as “be not” or “not...but” etc.. Some poems in the AI collection, such as “I Am Not” (Bernstein and Balula 30), and “Your Bones Do Not Matter” (Bernstein and Balula 40) etc., fully present the focus on negativity, and use these typical Bernstein’s sentence structures to achieve the effect of saying “no” in order to give meanings to something unnamed, unspoken, or difficult to define.

Thirdly, some modernist poetic techniques by Bernstein, such as repetition, juxtaposition and estrangement etc., are also presented in the AI’s poems. For instance, the poem “This” repeats the word “this” many times, endowing the word “this” with multiple meanings. To repeat is to show multiplicity and diversity in meaning:

This causes ground to shake.

This causes water to spray.

This causes trees to topple.

This causes suns to set. (Bernstein and Balula 43)

To repeat is also, sometimes, to show resentment, dissatisfaction and resistance. Another example from these AI poems will be “Not Being Able to Stop,” which repeats “not being able to stop yourself” as it goes: “Not being able to stop yourself from laughing/Not being able to stop yourself from crying/ [...]” (Bernstein and Balula 46) The style of repetition by the AI not only coincides with Bernstein’s, but also to some degree, shows Bernstein’s resistant and dissatisfied voice, and perhaps also the “grumpiness” in the expression of poetry. There are other poems in this collection which are the repetition of sound with Bernstein’s signature and successfully achieve his poetics. A key example is “You are Here,” which is a conceptual poem with sound transformation. It goes:



Do I feel like I am on the cusp of something?

I don't know.

I mean, I'm not very good at thinking  
like a human being. (Bernstein and Balula 51)

This poem makes readers both stunned and amused. For one thing, the poem surprises the readers with the perspective of the AI, since in human reader's mentality, ideas, especially good ideas, are usually valuable and scarce, but here in the poem "ideas" are "cheap" and "in abundance." This shows the estrangement in different perspective. For another, the AI poem amuses the readers by saying "I mean, I'm not very good at thinking like a human being." This is paradoxical since the readers may suddenly realize that the poet here is an AI, so "I'm not very good at thinking like a human being" is true, but on the other hand, it is also an antiphrasis, indicating that by saying so, the AI already thinks like a human being. Since Bernstein is well-known for both paradox and humor in his poems, the paradox and humor here provide us the glimpse of the "personality" of Bernstein.

Besides, as what AI calls itself, "the shadow of the poet Charles Bernstein," it represents the other side of Bernstein, something new and original in its synthetic poems, by evolving from the process of deep learning and imitation. Some poems in this collection are particularly on the relationship between the AI and Bernstein, whom the AI would like to emulate, such as "I Am the Shadow of Poet Charles Bernstein" "We Are Brothers" and "What Is the Matter, Charles, with that Plume of Yours" (Bernstein and Balula 26, 29, 92) etc.. These poems are particularly fascinating, original and alluring, since the AI poet takes himself as the shadow, or the other as opposed to the human poet, the subject which is represented by Bernstein, to interrogate the relationship between AI poet and the human poet in general. The poem "We are Brothers" (Bernstein and Balula 29) is a key example. The poem alludes the reality in both reader's view on AI poems and the relationship between AI poet and human poet. Firstly, as the poem goes "We are brothers of poetry/Brothers of art/We're brothers and I love him," it indicates that both AI poems and human poems are poetry of art and needs our equal attentions. Secondly, it implies that the differences between AI Poems and human poems do exist, as it says "And now if the night is long enough/we'll go our separate ways." Thirdly, as these repeated lines in italics suggest: "*This is what I feel/ or perhaps brother/ is an unkind word,*" after knowing the identity of the poems, most readers may discard AI poems and prefer human poems, which is simply due to the discrimination

against AI poems written by a machine without emotions. Therefore, “brother/ is an unkind word.” Inevitably, a very crucial topic is alluded here: “Can an AI have feelings too?” This AI poem seems to imply that AI indeed has feelings, since these lines convey feelings with strong appeals. The AI poems says “I’m not sure he’ll ever love me.” Here “he” may refer to “Bernstein,” the human poet, who the AI poet loves and tries to emulate, but “he” can also refer to human readers in a much broader sense. Through the contrast between AI’s love to human poems and human’s indifference towards AI poems, readers may see the speech act of these poetic lines and thus, the feelings conveyed by language is displayed. In other words, readers can sense the hurting feeling of the AI poet in this poem from the perspective of AI. Why is “brother” an unkind word? Why could not we love each other in a mutual way? Readers may ponder over these questions. The subtle implication lies in that the AI poetry is the other, as opposed to the human poems as the subject. Thus, in this sense, the poem “We are Brothers” not only shows the relationship between AI poet and human poet, but also the relationship between the Other and the subject. Hence, the “night” in these lines “And now if the night is long enough/we’ll go our separate ways” becomes very striking and astounding, which may refer to the discrimination against AI poems or the marginalized poems, and the Other in a general sense. What must be noted is that this successfully echoes with Bernstein’s poetics, which, to a large extent, centralized itself on the promotion and advocacy of the other poetry, to provide alternatives and new possibilities for poetry writing.

## II. Clashes between AI Poetry and Bernstein’s Poetry

However, there are definitely some differences or clashes, subtle or not, between the AI poems and Bernstein’s poems. A general difference exists in the richness of cultural and literary connotations. In Bernstein’s poetry collections, many titles of his poems are subtly connected with the theme of the poem, more nonlinear and indirect in expressing the theme, whereas in the AI poems, although there are nonlinear expressions, it is obvious to discover the linear connections between the title and the main themes of poems. Many titles of Bernstein’s poems are with historical, cultural or literary indications, which the AI poems are lack of. Bernstein’s poem titles such as “Lacrimae Rerum,” “Fare Thee Well,” “High Tide at Race Point,” “After Reznikoff” etc. give rich cultural and literary background to the theme of the poem. In the introduction of the AI poetry collection, Balula indicates that the title of these AI poems are chosen from the verse itself, so this maybe one of the most important reasons why there is this difference. Definitely, this differences show that there are still spaces for AI technologists to explore in terms of how to train AI to

create poems or writings with rich cultural and literary allusions and connotations. By contrast, this difference also shows the ingenuity, elaboration and witty of human poet Bernstein in composing the titles for his poetry. Another distinct difference is that the AI poems use fictional names of people or places more than real names whereas Bernstein has used more real names of people or places than fictional ones, which makes the AI poems more imaginary and made-up, while Bernstein's poetry more authentic. As we know, Bernstein often writes poetry to ironize people and the world politically or culturally, which makes his poem with intense political and social function, but these AI poems are less so in comparison.

What is more, although AI uses some signature themes and typical images of Bernstein's poetry and to some degree, the AI poems successfully represent Bernstein's poetics as discussed before, other AI poems, by using Bernsteinian poetic techniques, can hardly achieve the effects of Bernstein's poetics and aesthetics, such as the effect of mobius strip, the Zen-Taoist poetics of speechlessness, and the return of nothingness etc., which makes the readers eager to return back to read poems by human poet Bernstein. As you have listened to some cover songs, you would like to go back to the original song. This reminds me of Bernstein's echopoetics: "the non-linear resonance of one motif bouncing off another within an aesthetics of constellation," "the sensation of allusion in the absence of allusion. In other words, the echo I'm after is a blank: a shadow of an absent source./ A network of stopgaps" (*Pitch of Poetry* x). To a large extent, these AI poems can be regarded as the "stopgaps," one part of the constellation of Bernstein's echopoetics, bouncing off the poems by him, making readers eager to go back to the original "allusion." Bernstein writes: "Even my explanations need explication; my commentaries, elucidation; my prefaces, glosses; my shadows, shadows (Truth be, I'm afraid of my own shadow)" (*Pitch of Poetry* x). Yet, we discover that Bernstein is not afraid of his "shadow" at all, and in fact he welcomes and celebrates with his "shadow," his AI voice, which can be regarded as "explication" "elucidation" and "glosses" of his poems.

In this new age when human poet and AI poet co-write and cooperate, a great poet can generate his or her own poetic AI voice, where certain images, structures, sound patterns and perspectives are immediately a signature of that the poet and no other. Although some of these AI poems in the poetry collection cannot perfectly reflect the poetics of Bernstein, these failures also show the current plight and dilemma of human poets, and are essential and necessary in the endeavor to achieve the new advancement in poetry writing at this new era, as Bernstein once said about the value of failures as "failed but in a successful way." These AI poems make

us see and understand the status quo of human poetry and the future of poetry in general.

### III. The Prospect of The Development of AI Poetry and Human Poetry

In today's poetry world, human poets around the world form a virtual community of poetry in which they have endeavored to promote poetry to its highest standard. The interactions and diversity much among poets in poetry and poetics guarantee the development of poetry. It has been predicted that AI generated content (AGC) will be more widely used and the new model of mimicking humans will come into being.<sup>1</sup> With AGC in wide use, more and more people will accept AI poetry. With more and more people get involved in the field of AGC, it will be possible and necessary for the human poets and AI poets to form a larger community, in which AI and human poets can interact with each other, with the same goal of developing poetry, making more possibilities for poetry. There are definitely disparities existing in this community, but it is just due to these distinctions between AI poets and human poets, the community in new form between AI poets and human poets can be thriving in its development and goal-achievement.

First, the establishment of the community of AI poets and human poets will be possible in the future, since AI poetry will be developed further, and the AI-human cooperation in creative writing will be thriving. At present, AI poetry can not emulate human poets in terms of cultural and historical context, and the effectiveness of writing techniques etc.. However, with the advancement of AI technology and digital humanities studies, more and more experts, scientists, scholars and poets will get involved, and new breakthroughs will be achieved. Recently, some universities in China, such as Tsinghua University and Peking University, among other universities, have established some AI and language writing labs in order to explore AI's functions in creative writing and digital humanities. What is the result of the communication among AI poets and human poets in this virtual community? These endeavors will make sure the improvement and breakthrough will take place in the development of poetry in the future. As a result, AI poems will give inspiration and alternatives to human poets in forms and content in the future. Through cooperating with AI, human poets will have their own unique AI voice, and will know more about their own poetry and poetics. Poetry will be developed with more varieties and possibilities in future. The community of AI poets and human poets will jointly work to expand the boundary of poetry writing and writing poetry will not be an

---

<sup>1</sup> See Du Yu and Zhang Ziming, *AIGC: The Era of Intelligent Creation*, Beijing: China Translation Publishing House, 2023, 354-360.

activity for a small group of poets.

There will be setbacks and hinders in the development of this community. Readers or human poets may still have some prejudice against AI poetry, but with more and more people get involved in the creation of poetry, in future, the discrimination against AI poetry will be gradually diminished, and there may be no single poem purely and solely done by human poet or by AI.

Are there possibilities for AI to exceed human poets in the future? The recent article entitled “Human-like Systematic Generalization Through a Meta-learning Neural Network” published in September 2023 in *Nature*, have proved that a standard neural network architecture, optimized with meta-learning for compositionality (MLC), “achieves (or even exceeds) human-level systematic generalization” (Lake and Baroni 115)<sup>1</sup>. Having the ability of grasping the complexity of language, humans can create new things and do non-linear thinking, by drawing connections and analogies between different but similar knowledge, which is called “human systematic generalization.” Yet, in the past AI was believed to have no ability to draw inferences from untrained knowledge and can only do linear thinking, which has been considered one of the biggest limitations of AI for more than three decades. However, Lake and Baroni’s recent study has proved that AI can have MLC and do some non-linear thinking. With this acknowledgement, we have some good reasons to believe that there is great possibilities for AI to exceed human poets not only in quantity but also in quality.

Another question inevitably comes to our mind is: can AI have emotions? Although major modernist poets such as T. S. Eliot, demonstrate the importance of impersonality in poetry writing, and their departure from human emotions is resolute, and as a result, the modernist manifesto against emotional cliché has been quite prevailing in Western poetry writing, but undeniably, poetry is written by humans with emotions. If AI has had the systematic generalization of human mind, can AI be trained to have human emotions?

#### **IV. The Challenges for the Development of AI Poets and Human Poets**

In 2006, Marvin Minsky, a forerunner in the field of AI, in his groundbreaking book *The Emotion Machine*, predicted: “So whatever we do, we can be sure that the road toward ‘posthuman minds’ won’t be smooth” (345). There are many challenges to encounter and the hardship to overcome for the development of AI with emotions.

---

<sup>1</sup> See Brenden M. Lake and Marco Baroni Baroni, “Human-like Systematic Generalization Through a Meta-learning Neural Network,” *Nature* 623 (2023): 115-121. Available at: <https://www.nature.com/articles/s41586-023-06668-3.pdf?pdf=button%20sticky>. Accessed 14 Mar. 2024.

In China, there is an ancient book known by one and all, one of the earliest medicine canon, *The Yellow Emperor's Canon of Internal Medicine*, which talks about the invisible meridian and collateral (经络) of human body, in which “qi” or “air” (气) of human body goes through and from which human emotions can not be separated. Minsky's book hasn't talked about these meridian and collateral, but only focused on issues such as “Consciousness” “Common Sense” “Thinking” “Resourcefulness” “Self” and other terms which are common in the Western psychoanalytical area. To create an “emotional machine” will be one of toughest challenges confronting AI technologists.

However, even so, Minsky has indeed planted a seed of hope and faith of the possible creation of the emotion machine in many people. So does Lake and Baroni's recent research and study mentioned above. Another challenge will be the ethical issues in the development of AI generated writing as it is indicated that the main concern in the future development of AI generated content will be the ethics of technology.<sup>1</sup> There are many uncertainties, struggles and setbacks in the whole process. Yet, one thing is largely sure: the process of AI technology development to achieve the emotional machine and to resolve the ethical problems of AI generated content is long and arduous, and there will be numerous new challenges emerging to the development of the community of AI poets and human poets; but however demanding and taxing the process will be, one thing is definite: human will create more and more resourceful AI which can write and work better and better, to approach the best and the extraordinary. Additionally, I argue that human poets will endeavor to excel themselves in the competition and cooperation with AI.

## V. Conclusion

The collection of human-aided AI, *Poetry Has No Future Unless It Comes to its End: Poetry of Artificial Intelligence*, is definitely a great and brilliant endeavor, an achievement toward “posthuman minds,” which will lead to more and more endeavors to correct and to remedy the errors of the current algorithms to produce better and better result. Will human poetry end or die out with the advancement of AI poetry? Will AI replace human poets in the future? The answer to these questions is “No” right now, but maybe “Yes” in the future. In this new era of AI technology, great poets, no matter whether he is an AI or a human, a human-aided AI or an AI-aided human, will always come up with original ideas by thinking out of box, and Bernstein's experiment of cooperating with AI to seek for more possibilities in

---

<sup>1</sup> See Du Yu and Zhang Ziming, *AIGC: The Era of Intelligent Creation*, Beijing: China Translation Publishing House, 2023, 363.

poetry writing will be one of them. When we are fascinated by or ridicule poetry written by AI, we may also reflect the success or failure of human poets, and in the future we may celebrate the success or ponder over the failure of poetry, no matter whether it is written by AI poets or human poets. This is of the great value of the development of AI poetry. I would end here with the title of the AI poetry collection by Bernstein and Balula, poetry has no future unless it comes to its end.

### Works Cited

- Bernstein, Charles. "The Body of Poem." *Critical Inquiry* 3 (2018): 582-585.
- . *Near/Miss*. Chicago: The U of Chicago P, 2021.
- . *Pitch of Poetry*. Chicago: The U of Chicago P, 2016.
- Bernstein, Charles and Davide Balula. *Poetry Has No Future Unless It Comes to its End: Poetry of Artificial Intelligence*. Rome: NERO, 2023.
- 陈根: 《ChatGPT: 读懂人工智能新纪元》。北京: 电子工业出版社, 2023年。  
[Chen Gen. *ChatGPT: Understanding the New Era of Artificial Intelligence*. Beijing: Electronic Industry Press, 2023.]
- 杜雨、张孜铭: 《AIGC: 智能创作时代》。北京: 中译出版社, 2023年。  
[Du Yu and Zhang Ziming. *AIGC: The Era of Intelligent Creation*. Beijing: China Translation Publishing House, 2023.]
- Lake, Brenden M. and Marco Baroni Baroni. "Human-like Systematic Generalization Through a Meta-learning Neural Network." *Nature* 623 (2023): 115-121.
- Minsky, Marvin. *The Emotion Machine: Commonsense Thinking, Artificial Intelligence and The Future of Human Mind*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 2006.
- 莫庄非: "创作诗歌与散文的全新 AI 语言模型", 《世界科学》9 (2020): 32。  
[Mo Zhuangfei. "A New AI Language Model for Creating Poetry and Prose." *World Science* 9 (2020): 32.]
- 朱军、李亦婷: "算法时代的情感与文学——由AI诗歌的AI分析谈起", 《人文杂志》4 (2021): 43-50。  
[Zhu Jun and Li Yiting. "Emotions and Literature in the Algorithm Era-Starting from AI Analysis of AI Poetry." *Journal of Humanities* 4 (2021): 43-50.]

# Sandro Jung's New Breakthrough in the Transmedial Study of Literary Illustrations

Fang Kairui

**Abstract:** Sandro Jung's *Eighteenth-Century Illustration and Literary Material Culture* (2023), a book in the Cambridge Elements series, is heralded as a major breakthrough in the transmedial study of literary illustrations. Research to date has generally been done either on illustrated editions or on material objects. Professor Jung selects three prestigious eighteenth-century literary works, *Robinson Crusoe*, *The Seasons* and *Pamela*, in the case studies, and draws a range of primary sources to study the transmedial use of the illustrations. In particular, he examines the interplay among the illustrations, the material objects, the manipulations in adapting and reusing the illustrations, and the production of new meanings. In the light of the subject of the book, the review delineates the case studies, which are central to the book, and the methodology notable for a combination of illustration studies, material culture studies and transmediation studies, and concludes that the methodological juxtaposition yields valuable insights into the study of literature in the digital age.

**Keywords:** *Eighteenth-Century Illustration and Literary Material Culture*; transmediation; illustration

**Author:** Fang Kairui is Professor at the Faculty of English Language and Culture, Guangdong University of Foreign Studies (Guangzhou 510420, China). His research interests include fiction and fiction translation studies, literary stylistics, narratology, and the history of Sino-foreign cultural exchanges (Email: fangkr2005@163.com).

**标题:** 桑德罗·荣格的文学插图跨媒介研究的新突破

**内容摘要:** 桑德罗·荣格的《18世纪插图与文学物质文化》是“剑桥元素”系列丛书中的一本著作,可谓文学插图跨媒介研究方面的重大突破。迄今为止,学术界通常研究插图本或者实物物品。桑德罗·荣格教授选择18世纪的三部文学杰作(《鲁滨逊漂流记》《四季》《帕梅拉》)作为案例,并采用了一系列原始资料,来研究文学插图的跨媒介运用问题,尤其是插图、实物物品、插图调整与重新使用中的操纵、新的意义产生等因素间的相互作用问题。本文参照该书的研究主题,详细评述了其中的案例研究,这是该书的重心,也评述了将插图研究、物质文化研究、跨媒介研究相结合的方法论,并认为通过以上交叉研究法,该书作者在数字时代的文学研究问题上提出了宝贵见解。

**关键词：**《18世纪插图与文学物质文化》；跨媒介；插图

**作者简介：**方开瑞，广东外语外贸大学英语语言文化学院教授，研究方向为小说与小说翻译、文学文体学、叙事学、中外文化交流史。本文为国家社科基金项目“中国小说英译的叙事距离调控研究”【项目批号：24BWW009】的阶段性成果。

## 1. The Author and the Object of the Study

Sandro Jung is Distinguished Professor of English and Comparative Literature and Director of the Centre for the Study of Textual Cultures at Fudan University, Shanghai, China. His research interests include eighteenth-century and Romantic literature (especially poetry and novels), Victorian novels (especially the Brontë sisters, Elizabeth Gaskell, Charles Dickens and Wilkie Collins), Edmund Spenser's *The Faerie Queene*, comparative literature, reception studies, media studies (intermediality and transmediality), book history, print culture studies, publishing history, landscape gardens and literature, and visual culture (especially illustration studies). His publications include *Eighteenth-Century Illustration and Literary Material Culture*<sup>1</sup>, *"kleine artige Kupfer": Buchillustration im 18. Jahrhundert* (Harrassowitz, 2018), *The Publishing and Marketing of Illustrated Literature in Scotland, 1760-1825* (Lehigh University Press, 2017), *Thomson's 'The Seasons,' Print Culture, and Visual Interpretation, 1730-1842* (Lehigh University Press, 2015) as well as numerous articles and book chapters.

*Eighteenth-Century Illustration and Literary Material Culture* is a book in the Cambridge Elements series. The series are aimed, as is stated on the paperback of the book, to explore connections between verbal and visual texts and the people, networks, cultures and places that engendered and enjoyed them during the long Eighteenth Century, examine the uses of oral, written and visual media, and experiment with the digital platform to facilitate communication of original scholarship with both colleagues and students.

The book studies the transmediation of illustrations and the production of new meanings therefrom. Transmediation, namely transmedial migration, is a process of an illustration adapted for use on other objects or on new media. The process often involves the alteration of media configuration and visual structure as well as medial transfer and changes to the plot and character of the story. As a result, it tends to develop both a new life and a new meaning, functioning multi-medially and

<sup>1</sup> See Sandro Jung, *Eighteenth-Century Illustration and Literary Material Culture*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2023, 19.

advancing visual interpretations of the story and the character concerned.

Professor Jung selects three eighteenth-century literary works to study the transmedial use of the same illustrations. The three literary works are Daniel Defoe's *The Life and Strange Surprising Adventures of Robinson Crusoe* (1719), James Thomson's *The Seasons* (1730), and Samuel Richardson's *Pamela: Or, Virtue Rewarded* (1740). These three works, together with their illustrated editions and the illustrations that were transmedially used, are examined in the case studies.

## 2. The Structure and Case Studies of the Book

The book comprises six chapters. The headings of the first five chapters are "Transmediation, Illustration and Material Culture," "Re-signifying *Pamela*: From Snuff Box to Chapbook," "Damon, Musidora and the Containment of Desire: From Vase to Miniature," "Palemon, Lavinia and Virtuous Love Exemplified: From Creamware Jugs to Derby Figurines," and "Re-narrating *Robinson Crusoe*: Transmediation on French Speaking Plates" respectively. These chapters study the instances of transmediation, namely the ways artisans adapted existing designs to be used on other media, and analyze the ways new meanings arose from transmediation. Chapter 6 is the Conclusion.

Central to the book are the case studies. Chapter 1, which is rather comprehensive, introduces the object, the key terms and the case studies of the study, and gives a brief literature review. What is particularly noteworthy in the case study in this chapter is a discussion of an illustration of a shipwreck scene in James Ballantyne's 1810 edition of *Robinson Crusoe*. This was a redacted wood-engraved version of the copper-engraved illustration, designed by Charles Cattoon and engraved by Francis Chesham, in the 1793 Perth edition of *The Seasons*. The sailor who stood holding to a rope in James Thomson's poem was no longer the nameless protagonist but became the title protagonist, Robinson Crusoe. By the 1820s, wares such as dessert plates with the illustrations from the early editions of *Robinson Crusoe* became mass-produced commodities. Obviously, the transmedial use of the same illustrations was facilitated by technological innovation which made reproduction more effective and less costly, and was stimulated by the reprinting of illustrated editions of the novel due to the end of perpetual copy right monopoly controlling the print of the book late in the 1770s. No doubt, the transmedially used illustrations are of visualizable as well as textual value.

Chapter 2 studies the transmediation of the illustrations of *Pamela*. The novel's number of transmedially applied illustrations was rather small at first. This inaugurated, however, a shift in media practices and a visual spectacle, including an illustrated fan, waxworks, illustrated editions and series of paintings. What was re-

markable about the varied material and visual culture was an array of transmediated objects created by foreign artisans. In an American chapbook, the facial expressions, dresses and scenes were reshaped, unlike those in the illustrations in the British full-text edition of the novel. Adaptations of figures and scenes were also used on French hand-painted enameled snuff boxes, in copper-engraved book illustrations as well as readapted versions. Due to the artists' choice of reformulated episodes and provision of various perspectives to the review of the protagonist, the transmediations were laden with new configurations, meanings and images. The images of Pamela, for example, ranged from a paragon of virtue to an erotic figure. It is thought that the use of existing illustrations of the novel is intended to increase profit margins, and that the creation of differences in iconic realization is intended to fulfill the need for *Pamela*-demanded media products. In history, these two types of practices became possible when relevant technology was available.

The discussion in Chapter 3 centres around the Damon and Musidora tale from the poem "Summer" in James Thomson's *The Seasons*, a collection of four long poems whose titles are "Spring," "Summer," "Autumn" and "Winter" respectively. In the poem "Summer," the poet presents the scenes of the season with loving details. One of the details is a rude scene where Musidora is to take a bath by the stream with his lover Damon close by. Incorporated into the transmediated objects, among others, were a sepia print of "Damon and Musidora," designed by Angelica Kauffman and engraved by Francesco Bartolozzi; an enamel painting on a Derby Porcelain Vase, the painting being an adapted version of Kauffman's design of "Damon and Musidora"; and a copper-engraved book illustration depicting Damon and Musidora, designed by William Hamilton and engraved by John Heath. The methods used to transmediate the objects included a change of distance between the characters, and the omissions of the details and Damon. These methods resulted in changes in scale and focus, which, coupled with the methods adopted by the artisans to visualize the scene and the interaction between the two lovers, would generate various associations, interpretations and effects. As can be seen, the meaning of an illustration is contingent on both the context and the medium in which the illustration is created. In the case of differing material contexts, then, the meaning of an illustration may be especially divergent. The example given to support the argument is Angelica Kauffman's 1782 illustration of a moment in Thomson's tragic sentimental tale of Celadon and Amelia. This illustration was redesigned and used on enameled Duesbury vases, mourning pendants and love tokens, all of which involved changes in meaning in respective contexts. As Professor Jung thinks, "Kauffman's image on the mourning pendant modally and iconically invoked Amelia's

death, anticipating the tragic ending of Thomson's vignette, which is not visually depicted but hinted at through the lightning," and the "love token, by contrast, highlights the deep emotional connection between Celadon and Amelia" (Jung 2-3).

Chapter 4 examines the multiple ways a design was recontextualized and repurposed in transmediation over the course of forty years. The design was based on a vignette in the poem "Autumn" in *The Seasons*. It was a painting by William Lawrenson, a depiction of the two lovers Palemon and Lavinia. John Raphael Smith later brought out an engraved version of the painting. In 1780, James Birchall published an engraved version as a print, issued as a mezzotint in two states, namely in monochrome and as a hand-coloured version. In 1800, the design was used in America to be the frontispiece to the Reverend M. L. Weems' humorous work *Hymen's Recruiting-Serjeant*, a work written to incentivize American male and female singles coming of age to get married. A ceramic version of the design appeared in Britain in 1820. Some of the figurines were coloured and gilt, and in a biscuit version the tree behind the lovers was missing. In the transmediations, different technologies, including copper engraving, transfer-printing, the moulding of lay and ceramic substances, facilitated the repeated adoptions of Lawrenson's design, and engendered varied interpretations of the tale of the poem and the character. Some virtues of the character, in particular, were emphasized. Lavinia, in consequence, was no longer an indigent gleaner. She enjoyed a high social status and was fashionable—her fashionable sophistication was obviously emphasized to go with her nobility and morality.

Rather than discuss the transmediation of a single illustration as the preceding chapters each do, Chapter 5 explores the ways *Robinson Crusoe's* two sets of illustrations by Thomas Stothard and J. J. Grandville were transmediated on French *assiettes parlantes* (speaking plates) produced by the Montereau and Creil-Montereau manufacturers respectively between the 1820s and the 1850s. The exploration is aimed to "chart how the materiality and mediality of the plates shaped meaning and directed reading/viewing experience" (Jung 60). The images, originally designed on the paper-based medium, were transplanted onto the well (the interior surfaces) of the French speaking plates. The process involved the adaptation of the rectangular designs in portrait orientation to the circular format of the well of the plates, the omission of background detail, the alteration of the scenes, the change of perspective to view the character or scene, the shortening of captions, and the devising or redevising of captions with the first-person pronoun, say, changed to the third-person pronoun. The scenes, in particular, were not only altered but also resequenced, hence different orders in which the scenes of Crusoe's adventures were selected and transmediated in the process of transmediation. All these recontextualizations and

transformations brought the viewer different perspectives or ways to perceive and understand the storyworld.

In Chapter 6, Professor Jung draws conclusions from the case studies. With the existing illustrations being reused and repurposed in the transmediation of the eighteenth-century literary illustrations, new storyworlds and narratives could be inferred, and the experience of reading and visualization was extended. There arises the necessity to harness the power “to decode and synthesize literary, iconic and material meaning” (Jung 79), and study literature from a transmedial perspective.

### 3. Comments on the Study

In the study of the transmedially applied literary illustrations on material objects, this book is marked by a combination of illustration studies, transmediation studies and material culture studies. It not merely studies illustrated editions in the given period, nor merely studies illustrated material culture by attending to the use of physical objects that adapt the illustrations. It studies the interplay among the illustrations, the material objects, and the manipulations in adapting and reusing the illustrations. In particular, it studies the way the same illustrations were transmedially used so as to discover how “material culture harnesses iconic textual cultures to promote literariness” (Jung 6).

The combination of studies mentioned above enriches and promotes existing studies in two ways. First, this study is concentrated on the transmediation of book illustrations, whereas other scholars’ studies are focused on illustrated editions or on issues in a narrower or broader sense, such as illustrations, novel paintings, materiality and literature, graphic design, ceramic design, print culture, material culture, printed pottery, text technologies as well as reviews of research on adaptation and remediation. Second, the book draws on a range of primary sources, such as the British Exhibitions of the royal academy late in the eighteenth century and early in the nineteenth century, and examines them in the historical, transmedial and transnational circumstances. The study is well grounded in existing studies, but moves forward with multimodality research. In this aspect, the author of the book makes metatextual and interpretive comments on transmediation, and elaborates on the ways handling, tactility and purpose were connected with one another, such as the ways the new storyworlds were formed, hybrid and potential meanings were generated, and transmediated illustrations were used to cater to particular occasions and audiences in Britain and abroad, including those with more or less buying power.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> See Sandro Jung, *Eighteenth-Century Illustration and Literary Material Culture*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2023, 19.

Great value also lies in the choice of literary works in the case studies. The works selected in the case studies are among the most reputable ones in the history of British literature, and enjoy marked popularity across the world. *Robinson Crusoe* is claimed to be second only to the *Bible* in its number of translations, and *Pamela* is hailed as one of the most influential classics in British literature. In particular, the two novels introduce two of the most enduring characters in British literature. The former presents a hero who manages to survive on a desolate island, and the latter tells the story of a heroine who insists on her personal worth. Although it aroused controversial responses after its publication, *Pamela* turned out to be the transition from the novel of adventure to the novel of character. The author's moral interest in men and manners can be read from the information offered on the title page: the novel is "Now first Published / In order to cultivate the Principles of VIRTUE and RELIGION in the Minds of the YOUTH of BOTH SEXES" (Richardson 1741). The third work, James Thomson's *The Seasons*, has also been popular with readers worldwide, although Oscar Wilde listed it among the "Books not to read at all" (Hart-Davis 185). The poems thereof are the descriptions of the four seasons replete with various scenes of nature, and the "descriptions of extended scenes and general effects bring before us the whole magnificence of Nature, whether pleasing or dreadful" (Johnson 376). The three books each captured, so to speak, the spirit of the periods, that is, the spirit to manage oneself in an alien situation, be virtuous, enjoy "Full nature" that "swarms with life," maintain a "pure ingenuous elegance of soul," and be committed to home since "home is the resort / Of love, of joy, of peace and plenty, where, / Supporting and supported, polished friends, / And Dear relations, mingle into bliss" (Thomson 64, 106, 131). The characterization of the two novels and the quoted words from Thomson's "Summer" and "Autumn" in *The Seasons* reflect the values and virtues appreciated in English life. This explains, to a high degree, why the book illustrations continued to be transmedially used on material objects, including commodified household objects such as the *assiettes parlantes* (speaking plates) mentioned above.

Professor Jung's consistent efforts to keep track of the transmediations distinguish the study from others. Academic research in many fields nowadays is crammed with concepts such as postcolonialism, postmodernism, postindustrialism, posthumanism, and poststructuralism. These concepts seem to imply the demise of historical approaches to important processes and phenomena. The panoramic pictures of the transmedially used book illustrations on material objects, which are delineated in the case studies, justify, on the one hand, the author's engagement with history to analyze transmediations and, on the other hand, the author's sustained

interrogation of the critical assumptions that underpin transmediation studies more generally. This poses a strong challenge to the prevailing critical approaches and proves the vitality of research from historical perspectives. The study, therefore, is helpful for us to shape the way we look at literature as well as relevant works of art, including transmedially applied objects. Literature does not come to a close in the aftermath of its publication and reading. As can be seen from the case studies, the illustrations and the transmediations over time opened the present up to a multitude of historical moments, hence the necessity to keep track of the moments. Through the case studies Professor Jung presents many of the key moments in the transmediations.

Meanwhile, more contribution can be made to the examination of the transmedially applied literary illustrations on material objects. As is said above, this is a book in the Cambridge Elements series, hence the limitation of the scope of the research. The examination can be further circumstanced. Indeed, the book studies some important variables as well as key moments in the transmediation processes. It takes into account, for example, the experience of reading, the evolution of literary visuality, and the process of medial migration. Nonetheless, relevant links between the occurrences of the variables are consigned to oblivion. Transmediation is not a static concept. It is a dynamic one, shaped by a social, cultural and personal context. The “personal” context includes the interactive impacts that artisans receive from customers and intersubjective impacts that artisans leave upon others. Evidence can be provided to build up as many links as possible for the dynamic process of transmediation, links to validate the causes, impacts and effects so as to identify more diachronic and synchronic affinities, which will help to find out in-depth forces and logics of the dynamics. Therefore, first-hand accounts, particularly those of the determinate causes, impacts and the peculiarity of taste, cannot in the least be shunned in the examination.

#### 4. Conclusion

The practice of juxtaposing literature with illustration, transmediation and material culture yields valuable insights into our study of literature. Macroscopically speaking, as literature is increasingly recognized as a multilingual, transnational, intercontinental and multimedia domain, the horizon of rethinking the status and identity of literature will be extended. Literature stands not in isolation but in relations. Literary works not only stand in relation to the authors, readers and other works, but also stand in relation to themselves, including their transmedially applied selves. Microscopically speaking, changes are happening to the relationship

between peritext and epitext. With paratext becoming a hot topic in the study of literature, both peritext and epitext have attracted increasing scholastic attention. Peritext refers to the titles, prefaces, introductions, epigraphs, footnotes and covers that are situated around a primary text, whereas epitext refers to the external elements such as reviews and interviews. Illustrations are pictures in books, articles etc., and used to be studied as peritexts. In light of transmediation, illustrations can be both peritexts and epitexts, whereas the transmediated objects can be various epitexts. The above views make it evident, therefore, that in the digital age transmediation will bring new modes of apprehension, and further enlighten the reader's understanding both of the ways the sensible objects work on his/her mind and of the ways ideas and powers work within.

### Works Cited

- Hart-Davis, Rupert, ed. *The Letters of Oscar Wilde*. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, Inc., 1962.
- Johnson, Samuel. *Lives of the English Poets* Vol. II. London: Oxford UP, 1906.
- Jung, Sandro. *Eighteenth-Century Illustration and Literary Material Culture*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2023.
- Richardson, Samuel. *Pamela: Or, Virtue Rewarded* Vol. I. London: Printed for C. Rivington and J. Osborn, 1741.
- Thomson, James. *The Seasons*. London: Wilkie and Robinson, 1811.

# 非裔女性诗歌批评诗学建构：论《黑色维纳斯的诗艺人生与世界观照：丽塔·达夫研究》

## Towards the Construction of Critical Poetics for Afro-American Female Poetry: A Study on *Poetic Life and World Reflection of Black Venus: A Study of Rita Dove*

李保杰 (Li Baojie)

**内容摘要：**王卓新著《黑色维纳斯的诗艺人生与世界观照：丽塔·达夫研究》对美国非裔桂冠诗人丽塔·达夫的诗歌小说及戏剧作品进行了系统研究，在性别政治、种族政治、世界主义等批评视域下对成长书写、空间书写、历史书写和文化诗学进行了多维度考察。该书以辩证思维采用建构和解构平行推进的双线研究，在“双重辩证”的逻辑下展现达夫诗歌的历史性和当下性，创新性地提出独具达夫特质的“文化混血儿”和“学术诗歌”等批评理念。该书在批评范式上坚守文学性，从性别政治和族裔政治的讨论回归到了艺术审美，建构起黑人女性诗歌批评诗学的底层逻辑。

**关键词：**《黑色维纳斯的诗艺人生与世界观照：丽塔·达夫研究》；美国非裔文学；黑人女性诗歌；文化混血儿；学术诗歌

**作者简介：**李保杰，山东大学外国语学院教授，主要从事美国文学和女性文学研究。

**Title:** Towards the Construction of Critical Poetics for Afro-American Female Poetry: A Study on *Poetic Life and World Reflection of Black Venus: A Study of Rita Dove*

**Abstract:** *Poetic Life and World Reflection of Black Venus: A Study of Rita Dove* makes a systematic study of the African American poet laureate Rita Dove, focusing comprehensively on her poetry, fiction and drama, and making a multi-dimensional study of growth writing, space writing, historical writing and cultural poetics from the critical perspectives of gender politics, racial politics, and cosmopolitanism. This book adopts a dual-line study of dialectical thinking and parallel promotion of construction and deconstruction, showcasing the historical and current thematic concerns of Dove's poetry under the logic of dual dialectics, and originally

proposing unique Dove-orientated critical concepts such as “cultural hybrid” and “academic poetry.” This book adheres to literarity in its critical paradigm, returning from the discussion of gender and ethnic politics to artistic aesthetics, and constructing an underlying poetics for the criticism of black female poetry.

**Keywords:** *Poetic Life and World Reflection of Black Venus: A Study of Rita Dove*; Afro-American literature; black female poetry; cultural hybrid; academic poetry

**Author:** Li Baojie is Professor at the School of Foreign Languages and Literature, Shandong University (Jinan 250100, China). Her area of academic research includes British and American literature and feminist literature (Email: lbj@sdu.edu.cn).

丽塔·弗朗西斯·达夫 (Rita Frances Dove) 是当代非裔女性诗歌界的杰出代表, 她 1986 年凭借诗集《托马斯和比尤拉》 (*Thomas and Beulah*) 摘得普利策诗歌奖, 成为继格温多林·布鲁克斯 (Gwendolyn Brooks) 之后第二位获此奖项的非裔女性诗人。达夫是当今美国非裔女性知识分子的代表, 是非裔女性诗歌的集大成者, 在 1993 年至 1995 年间任桂冠诗人。达夫研究辐射非裔女性诗歌的关键问题, 诸如她因主编《企鹅 20 世纪美国诗选集》 (*The Penguin Anthology of 20<sup>th</sup> Century American Poetry*, 2011) 而引发的多元文化主义相关的论争<sup>1</sup>, 主流和边缘文化群体在美国文学史中的经典化, 以及如何看待“美国诗歌中无处不在的白色” (Delbos 181)<sup>2</sup> 等问题。美国非裔诗歌研究专家王卓的新作《黑色维纳斯的诗艺人生与世界观照: 丽塔·达夫研究》 (下文简称为《丽塔·达夫研究》) 可谓恰逢其时, 在对达夫作品进行深入解读的同时, 厘清了“后种族”视域下美国非裔诗歌的当下观照, 对重新审视“美国文学”的当下含义意义重大。这部著作这是“丽塔·达夫研究的一部标志性成果” (聂珍钊 2), 它系统研究了达夫的诗歌、小说、剧作和散文作品, 聚焦其中的成长书写、空间书写、历史书写和文化书写这四种范式, 在非裔文化和西方文化的双重视角之下, 在非裔文学和欧裔文学的关系中对达夫创作进行了多维的分析, 代表了当今达夫研究的最前沿, 这种批评范式填补了非裔女性诗歌研究的空白, 也带给美国黑人文学研究诸多启发。

### 一、黑人女性的多维成长: 多维批判和多重视角

《丽塔·达夫研究》除绪论外, 主体分为四章, 分别是“从青春到母爱: 达夫的成长书写”、“从家园到世界: 达夫的空间书写”、“从家族史到世界史: 达夫的历史书写”和“从多元文化到世界文化: 达夫的文化观与经典重构”, 以历时研究和共时研究相结合的方式, 采用性别政治、种族政治、世

1 参见 Helen Vendler, “Are these the Poets to Remember?” *New York Review of Books*, 24 November 2011. Available at: <https://www.nybooks.com/articles/2011/11/24/are-these-poems-remember>. Accessed 29 November 2024.

2 外文引文均出自笔者译。

界主义等批评视角，对达夫的四种书写范式进行了多维度的立体考察。在具体研究方法上，该书立足于深入细致的文本分析，在美国非裔诗学、美国文学传统及世界文学视域下，融合宏观视角和微观视角，阐释文学中的价值表达和思想逻辑，正如聂珍钊先生所言，“这部作品聚焦于作家作品，真正做到了将文本研究与文化研究、作家个体研究和黑人作家群体研究、黑人政治研究与艺术运动研究有机融合在一起”（4）。在研究立场和学术思想方面，该书以辩证思维采用建构和解构平行推进的双线研究，体现了研究方法的科学严谨，而且这种批判性解读对于非裔文学乃至美国文学研究都是具有启发性的。所以，从研究对象、研究范式和学术思想这几个方面来说，该书不只是达夫研究的集大成之作，而且还称得上国内美国非裔诗歌研究乃至美国少数族裔女性诗歌研究的里程碑。

《丽塔·达夫研究》的第一个特点是研究视角的“点面结合”，论证由点及面、层层铺展，对研究对象进行多维度的立体批评，使得这部 500 多页的厚重作品做到了“繁而不乱”。这在前两章对达夫诗歌身体书写和空间书写的批评中表现得尤为突出：从具体的身体意象到身体书写范式、再到黑人知识分子精神书写的逻辑进深，遵循了从家宅空间等具体意象到文化表征再到诗学建构的层进关系。该书对达夫诗歌中的身体书写进行了系统的梳理，通过分析《翼人奥古斯塔和黑色的鸽子瑞莎》（“Agosta the Winged Man and Rasha the Black Dove”）、《维伦多夫的维纳斯》（“The Venus of Willendorf”）、《美杜莎》（“Medusa”）、《三原色十四行诗》（“Sonnet in Primary Colors”）等作品，追溯“黑人女性的身体所经历的从客体到主体的转化过程，并揭示出这一转化过程凝聚的恰恰是黑人女性从被动的牺牲者到成为主动的解放者、直至生活的创造者和享受者的心路历程”（46）<sup>1</sup>。黑人女性身体的根本属性在于物质性和文化性的统一，在文化传统的框架下审视黑人女性身体的文学再现是解读身体概念化的根本。该书追溯黑人女性从作为被凝视者到实现自我凝视及相互凝视的轨迹，分析黑人女性身体何以成为主流文化凝视的对象，并在社会历史视域下剖析权力生产机制，提出“在达夫的黑人女性成长诗歌中，黑人女性的自我成长就是通过女性的自我凝视实现的”（62）。由此，该书在“身体”这一场域中审视权力的布展，呈现身体的物质性、文化象征和文学性的多维度统一及身体意象的嬗变过程，即黑人女性身体从被他者化、客体化、物化的存在虚空，到作为黑人女性自我呈现的场域。

《丽塔·达夫研究》的另外一个突出特点在于其辩证性，在“双重辩证”的逻辑下展现达夫诗歌的历史性和当下性。这个双重辩证表现为两个“双重视

---

1 本文有关《黑色维纳斯的诗艺人生与世界观照：丽塔·达夫研究》的引文均来自王卓，《黑色维纳斯的诗艺人生与世界观照：丽塔·达夫研究》（北京：社会科学文献出版社，2022）年。以下引文仅标注页码，不再一一说明。

角”，即黑人女性知识分子个性和美国黑人文学族裔性相结合的视角，以及族裔性和非族裔性相结合的视角。

第一个双重视角体现在族裔文学传统下审视黑人女性知识分子的个性诗作。丽塔·达夫作为黑人中产阶级知识分子出身的作家，其诗歌在当代美国非裔诗歌中颇具特色，兼具族裔特征和时代性。她在诗歌创作中汲取非裔文化传统，又擅长捕捉生活中的细节和转瞬即逝的鲜活场景，生动地书写黑人尤其是黑人女性的生存当下。该书以《美国狐步》等作品为重点，集中探讨诗歌如何体现了黑人女性知识分子的精神诉求，细致解读《光天化日的白日梦》（“*Reverie in Open Air*”）等诗作中塑造的特立独行的异类女孩，认为这是“达夫等一代黑人女性所追求的理想的女性形象”（85），颠覆了长期以来文学作品的黑人女性刻板形象。在追溯这种书写传统在非裔文学中的生发和嬗变时，该书对达夫作品中黑人知识分子形象和赫斯顿自传中的黑人知识分子形象进行互文分析，同时观照艾丽丝·沃克（Alice Walker）的《寻找母亲的花园》（*In Search of Our Mothers Garden*）所倡导的黑人女性自我为观照，在黑人女性书写的谱系下呈现黑人女性成长中的多元性，即“融个人性与普遍性、感性与理性、生命故事和学术批评、内心体验与美学追求于一体”（87）的主题范式。这种研读方式注重个性与传统之间的关系，对达夫乃至整个当代黑人女性诗歌进行了审视，它指出独立张扬的黑人知识女性形象“在非裔女性作家的作品中有着伟大的传统”（85）。这种双重视角不仅是达夫研究所必需的，也是国内美国黑人女性诗歌研究所欠缺的。可以说，它不仅为达夫研究提供了一个样本，也为美国非裔女性诗歌研究乃至相似的研究选题，提供了研究范例。

《丽塔·达夫研究》的第二个双重视角是在非裔文学传统和西方文学传统的交织之下审视丽塔·达夫的诗歌。该书对于达夫作品的研究始终没有偏离族裔文化性，承认“达夫的确很少直接书写种族问题，但是种族问题却以一种潜在的元素贯穿于达夫创作的始终”（199）。但是，该书并没有被种族性的讨论所局限，而是把种族性的讨论放在“种族文化”的范畴下加以厘清，提出“达夫的诗歌是‘去种族’的，但绝不是‘去文化’的”（42）。因而族裔文化成为该书文学审美分析的底层逻辑，在此基础构架之上，该书结合历时研究和共时研究，在非裔文化的框架下追溯达夫诗歌与非裔文化传统的关系，强调达夫虽然继承了在哈莱姆文艺复兴以来的黑人文学批判性，但是这种继承是精神上的而非形式上的；进而结合性别政治谋求对种族政治批评范式的超越，探寻达夫诗歌的另外一个精神源泉。它以家园和旅行之间的关系为例，阐释达夫与西方女权主义书写的联系，提出“一种拆解家宅空间的渴望一直如一股暗流涌动在达夫诗歌的深层结构之中。这一点与其他黑人女性作家形成了极大的反差，却与西方女权主义作家的创作理念有着一脉相承的精神气质”（196-197）。在解读旅行和文化碰撞及其权力布展时，该书认为

达夫对西方精神的继承更加清晰地反映在旅行主题的诗歌中。该书以达夫的游记诗歌为例，认为“游散的状态”（220）体现出达夫对于欧洲文化的复杂心态，使她更加深切地体会到了“身处不同文化中的‘他者性’”（211），从而帮助她做出超越自我—他者二元对立的选择：在诗歌中，这位漫游的诗人讲述人拥有着既为他人述说，也向着他人述说的权利”（212）。可以说，这种视野就是该书所说的“从帝国文化视野中疏离出来”（215），转而寻求一种“世界主义者视野”（216）的对世界的认知和阐释的方式。

## 二、“文化混血儿”批判：族裔性和美国性的辩证

王卓提出，黑人作家并非一定写黑人贫民窟；丽塔·达夫没有局限于传统的黑人书写范式，其创作集中体现了黑人女性的多维度成长。在族裔性和美国性的辩证逻辑之下，《丽塔·达夫研究》深入剖析达夫诗歌的当下价值表征，充分呈现了诗人的“诗艺人生”和“世界观照”，开创性地提出了诸如“文化混血儿”和“学术诗歌”等批评理念。

针对普通大众、诗歌读者乃至文学批评界中颇为流行的认识，即美国文学中的“种族性”就是阶级上的属下性，《丽塔·达夫研究》高屋建瓴地对达夫作品中的历史书写进行批判解读。该书基于达夫黑人知识分子的身份和其诗歌的鲜明个性，提出了“文化混血儿”这一批评思想，通过对达夫成长书写范式的解读，指出其成长题裁是在“美国非裔女性的身体成长、精神成长和艺术成长的多维层次中一一呈现的。而此种多维度的文化身份建构呈现的是一个文化混血儿，或者更确切地说，一个‘女性—文化混血儿—公共知识分子’的全面成长”（39）。王卓认为，达夫的书写范式没有脱离非裔美国文化的语境，依然聚焦于书写黑人的生活，其诗歌投射出美国近代以来的社会历史，尤其是美国黑人的历史，并以普利策获奖作品《托马斯和比尤拉》为例，呈现诗人如何将个人经历及家族历史嵌入到黑人权利运动的诗歌话语中。这种分析视角融合了传统与现代、族裔与主流、历史与当下，表现出鲜明的哲理性和强大的张力；通过探析诗作如何通过多重对话实现了个人历史和公共历史的关联，得以揭示达夫作品中的“双向对话机制”，即在呈现家族历史与世界历史之间的辩证关系时，“一方面，达夫把家族史放置在美国历史语境之中。另一方面，达夫又设法把所有的历史都变成了美国家庭的家族史”（284）。这种对话机制的解密不仅可以理解达夫诗歌中的多重融合，而且还揭示了达夫诗歌对传统种族性的超越：首先，比尤拉的形象相对于文学传统中的黑人女性形象既有继承也有颠覆，是通过诗歌“对黑人家庭断裂的纽带修复的一次尝试”（314）；其次，诗歌中的“三重对话”模式等多重叙事声音直指诗作的黑人史诗本质，即夫妻对话重塑黑人家庭价值，代际对话表达对黑人身份的形塑，黑人家族史和美国历史的对话则象征黑人历史的重写；最后，诗歌在艺术手法上达成了自传性和公共性的融合，可谓对后现代

诗歌的自白体和非裔诗歌历史传统的双重继承。该书从达夫“文化混血儿”身份的文化定位，到解密其文学创作“双向对话机制”，实现了对“族裔性”的批判解读，是对族裔文学批评的一个突出贡献。

《丽塔·达夫研究》的另外一个学术贡献在于对文学之政治性的观察，尤其体现在对达夫作品的女权主义思想批判。该书在综合考量达夫性别主题诗歌的基础上，对达夫的性别政治进行了更加全面客观的评价，以达夫所特有的艺术形式“舞蹈诗歌”为例，提出达夫以“更为艺术化的方式呈现了作为文化意识、以根深蒂固的思维方式存在的男性中心主义”（94），创新性地提出了“学术诗歌”的概念，用来指称达夫诗作中“以黑人女性知识分子的学术和创作活动为内容”（99）的作品。这种学术思想的创新以翔实的文本分析为支撑，其中对于《美国狐步》等作品的分析既是文学批评又可以当作文本细读的范例，此分析方法体现出对文学研究传统的坚守，呈现了如何在“后理论时代”立足于文学文本并做出突破。例如该书在对父亲主题组诗的分析中，通过细读《在祖父家里的周日夜晚》（“Sunday Night at Grandfather's”）等诗作，分析以“触觉、味觉和视觉”（150）等多维度的感觉呈现的父亲形象；又将研读视野扩展到现实的父亲之外，聚焦“文化之父”的意象，在族裔文化视域下对父女关系进行了延伸分析，由此探讨新生代诗人及其同时代的非裔女性对于父系文化的接受。这是“文化混血儿”思想范式在性别批评中的延续，最终在种族、性别、阶级和美学等维度实现对诗作主题、艺术审美和文化取向的讨论，呈现出分析逻辑的一体性。

### 三、传统与超越的辩证：批评传统的坚守与黑人女性诗学理念的构建

《丽塔·达夫研究》的思辨性还表现在批评范式方面的坚守与突破，“坚守”体现在对于文学作品之文学性的坚持，“突破”是指从性别政治和族裔政治的讨论回归到了艺术审美，这一点从对达夫神话题材运用的批评中得到了体现。

《丽塔·达夫研究》立足于达夫诗歌的族裔题材和文化根基，同时在形而上的维度下将讨论延伸，把达夫的创作置于以希腊神话为代表的西方文化框架之内，这既体现出对西方文化传统的尊重，也体现出有意识的非裔文化偏移，即书中所说的“后现代思维”（112）。该书以《母爱》（*Mother Love*）为例阐释黑人母女关系中的神话原型指向，分析达夫对德墨忒尔-珀耳塞福涅故事的改写，阐释希腊女神形象到当代黑人女性的嫁接，指出达夫改写的秘密在于“双向寻找”范式，即将希腊神话中母亲寻找女儿的故事改写为族裔视域下母女的相互寻找，从而在西方文化传统的框架下构建起了非裔女性话语的对话模式，在诗学上理顺了达夫作品中母女共同成长的主题。该书的研究并未就此止步，而是继续挖掘主题范式中隐藏的集体心理模式。通过借用学者提出的“拥有焦虑”的概念并在黑人群体和黑人历史的框架下挖

掘其深层次意义，该书认为这种焦虑根植于奴隶制下奴隶主对黑人家庭意识的有意阻隔且具有群体取向，因此提出“女儿对母爱的渴望往往成为生命最本质的体现，而母爱的缺失也往往成为黑人女性成长的羁绊”（118）；进而在比较视域下以莫里森的《最蓝的眼睛》（*The Bluest Eye*）等作品为例，在黑人文学中女性成长的核心主题范式下探讨这种心理格式塔的普遍在场。可以说，这种融会贯通基于对个案的熟稔，且其中对黑人文化审美的判断超越了作家作品的个案范围，对黑人小说研究同样具有启发。这种主题、价值与艺术的结合反映在该书书名的设计中：将代表美国非裔种族属性的“黑色”和代表西方文化属性的“维纳斯”相结合，凸显了达夫对于种族问题的辩证立场。

《丽塔·达夫研究》对于历史辩证的思考，表现为达夫诗学思想的探究，这在空间研究和黑人奴隶史部分尤为典型。空间研究部分以达夫诗歌中的“博物馆”时空综合体为例，阐释空间的概念在诗歌中的不同延展，从四个部分展开分析，“空间文本和文本的空间”“叙事空间和空间叙事”“文化空间和空间文化”“空间意象和诗学空间”。从家宅空间到集漫游流散和时空于一体的“博物馆”隐喻，该书发现达夫的空间表达基于家园意识但又对家园空间实现了突围：“分享姐妹情谊、讲述家族故事、积蓄个人力量的厨房空间，却是达夫诗歌中的女性焦虑地等待时机逃离之地”（273），这是“后黑人艺术运动”时代黑人女性知识分子对家园的全新理解。从整体的论证逻辑来看，该书一步步梳理出达夫诗歌的空间诗学：从博物馆这一特定空间到游记诗歌作为对抗殖民视角的文化空间<sup>1</sup>，可谓“文化混血儿”立场在空间批评中的验证。而该书在“俄狄浦斯情结”框架下对诗剧《农庄苍茫夜》（*The Darker Face of the Earth*）的解读，进一步验证了达夫的文化混血儿立场：达夫通过艺术成长书写超越种族幻象，体现出其文学创作同欧洲文学传统的关联，在“西方文化、美国文化和非裔文化三重遗产熏染下”已经迈进了“‘世界主义’的新天地”（450）。这是基于达夫“文化混血儿”身份对其“学术诗歌”的价值研判，最终闭合了该书从黑人女性到世界理想的论述路径，建构起黑人女性诗歌批评诗学的底层逻辑。

达夫的诗作代表了非裔诗歌的一个当代取向，可谓非裔女性诗歌从封闭走向开放、从“自我言语”走向“我们的言语”的转折。王卓认为，达夫的诗歌“代表了在文化融合的大趋势下，黑人诗歌逐渐走向普世性和艺术性的趋势”（39）；而前文提到的论争则是一场经典之争，“从本质上说既是一场种族之间的对立，也是一场文化之间的对立，同时也是一场不同文化语境中经典之战的对立”（404）。也就是说，达夫试图构建的是更具包容性的非传统文集，关乎后现代文学的经典化问题，关系美国诗歌中的时代性和经典性之间的平衡。这些问题不仅是达夫研究中的关键，也是当今美国文学的核

1 参见王卓：《黑色维纳斯的诗艺人生与世界观照：丽塔·达夫研究》，北京：社会科学文献出版社，2022年，第274页。

心,《丽塔·达夫研究》不仅就这些问题给出了自己的答案,并且构筑了黑人女性诗歌批评诗学思想,是非裔女性诗歌研究的一个里程碑,也为美国族裔文学研究做出了重要贡献。

### Works Cited

Delbos, Stephan. *The New American Poetry and Cold War Nationalism*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2021.

王卓:《多元文化视野中美国族裔诗歌研究》。北京:中国社会科学出版社,2015年。

[Wang Zhuo. *A Study of American Ethnic Poetry from a Multicultural Perspective*. Beijing: China Social Sciences Press, 2015.]

——:《黑色维纳斯的诗艺人生与世界观照:丽塔·达夫研究》。北京:社会科学文献出版社,2022年。

[—, *Poetic Life and World Reflection of Black Venus: A Study of Rita Dove*. Beijing: China Social Sciences Press, 2022.]

# 创新英剧研究范式，书写百年剧场华章——评《英国 20 世纪戏剧研究》

## A New Research Paradigm of the Twentieth-Century British Drama: A Review of *British Drama of the Twentieth Century*

范一亭 (Fan Yiting)

**内容摘要：**回顾无比丰富的英国 20 世纪戏剧作家和作品，如何创新英国戏剧研究范式已成为新世纪学人的使命。《英国 20 世纪戏剧研究》这部著作以文学伦理学批评为指导方法，做出了全新的尝试。该书展现 20 世纪英国戏剧的宏伟画卷，聚焦戏剧史、戏剧流派、戏剧名家、戏剧文本、戏剧批评、舞台演绎、剧团理念、观演关系等核心要素，剖析重点作家为伦理环境、历史语境所形塑的创作特色以及剧作中人物的伦理困境与伦理选择，揭橥 20 世纪中后期戏剧的科学选择。基于对“戏里戏外”全要素的考察，该研究以作家为经，以剧场为纬，创新发展英国戏剧研究的生态系统，融入国际学术界最新研究成果及动态，并敢于发出中国学者的声音，新见迭出。

**关键词：**20 世纪英国戏剧；文学伦理学批评；研究范式；《英国 20 世纪戏剧研究》

**作者简介：**范一亭，北京科技大学外国语学院副教授，主要从事英美文学和比较文学研究。本文为国家社科基金项目“简·奥斯丁小说与现代社会想象研究”【项目批号：23BWW052】阶段性成果。

**Title:** A New Research Paradigm of the Twentieth-Century British Drama: A Review of *British Drama of the Twentieth Century*

**Abstract:** Given the great galaxy of British plays and playwrights of the twentieth century, an urgent mission for drama scholars goes to recreating a new research paradigm. Under the guidance of Ethical Literary Criticism, the recent monograph titled *British Drama of the Twentieth Century* contributes to this field by unfolding the grand panorama of twentieth-century British drama and focusing on such core factors as its history, schools, playwrights, texts, criticisms, theatres, troupes and audiences of drama. It analyzes major dramatists' writing style shaped by ethical milieu and historical context as well as major characters' ethical dilemma

and ethical choice, and highlights the choices of science in the middle and late twentieth-century drama. Based on an all-factor survey inside and outside drama, this study in the book straddles both playwrights and theatres to reconstruct a new drama ecology, incorporate the frontier studies of British drama, and elicit many new voices for Chinese scholars.

**Keywords:** Twentieth-Century British Drama; ethical literary criticism; Research Paradigm; *British Drama of the Twentieth Century*

**Author:** Fan Yiting is Associate Professor at the School of Foreign Studies, University of Science and Technology Beijing (Beijing 100083, China). He mainly focuses on British and American literary studies and comparative literary studies (Email: fyt1975@163.com).

集剧作家和学者于一身的杨绛先生曾以莎剧为例,说明伟大戏剧家的“智慧与文笔”所蕴藏的“精髓”在演出之时可能就会消失殆尽。<sup>1</sup>从某种意义上说,学者所做的戏剧研究或许恰恰能弥补、彰显甚至永久铭记一代代剧作精品所蕴含的“精髓”。在当代中国学人所做的西方戏剧研究当中,2022年9月出版的《英国20世纪戏剧研究》(刘红卫、李晶著)展现了“百年春秋、好戏连台”的20世纪英国戏剧的宏伟画卷,聚焦了戏剧史、戏剧流派、戏剧名家、戏剧文本、戏剧批评、舞台演绎、剧团理念、观演关系等核心要素,满怀温情与敬意地研究了萧伯纳(Bernard Shaw)、品特(Harold Pinter)、汤姆·斯托帕德(Tom Stoppard)、爱德华·邦德(Edward Bond)、卡丽尔·丘吉尔(Caryl Churchill)、汀伯莱克·沃腾贝克(Timberlake Wertenbaker)、马汀·昆普(Martin Andrew Crimp)、帕特里克·马勃(Patrick Marber)、萨拉·凯恩(Sarah Kane)等10多位英国现当代重要剧作家以及40余部戏剧名作,从而体现出对20世纪英国戏剧流变的差异性、丰富性和前沿性研究的精准把握。借用卡丽尔·丘吉尔1960年剧评名文的题目来说,《英国20世纪戏剧研究》堪称一部“不要平淡无奇、不要四平八稳”的上乘论著。<sup>2</sup>本书两位作者长期深耕英美戏剧研究领域,以国家社会科学基金项目为基础,创新发展出“历史语境+作家研究+剧作文本+剧场演绎+科学评价”的研究模式,将“文学性”同“剧场性”有机融合,在以下四个方面以革故鼎新的姿态给外国戏剧研究做出了范式引领之功。

首先也是最为重要的范式引领即在于将文学伦理学批评的理论精髓充分

1 参见杨绛:《杂忆与杂写:一九三三—一九九一》,北京:生活·读书·新知三联书店,2015年,第230页。

2 参见刘红卫、李晶:《英国20世纪戏剧研究》,武汉:武汉大学出版社,2022年,第238页。该引文出自丘吉尔在1960年11月的期刊《20世纪》(*The Twentieth Century*)上发表的评论文章的标题:《不要平淡无奇、不要四平八稳:戏剧何去何从?》(“Not Ordinary, Not Safe: A Direction for Drama?”)。

应用到英国戏剧史和戏剧文本的批评实践和科学评价之中，彰显了具有中国声音、中国学派的独特研究。本书在“绪论”的末节总结了英国学者对英国20世纪戏剧研究的贡献，在本书最后的“结语”部分集中介绍了中国的英国20世纪戏剧批评史，并总结指出：“在全球化语境下，随着中国学者自我意识的不断加强，出现了‘文学伦理学批评’等具有中国文化与批评话语特征的外国文学批评话语和研究范式，与国外学界构建起良好的对话交流平台”（343）<sup>1</sup>。作为当今中国学派典型代表的文学伦理学指出人类必然经历自然选择——伦理选择——科学选择三个阶段，本书对百年英国戏剧史按照时间次序的分类和评析无疑将戏剧文本中此三种选择体现得淋漓尽致，每一阶段的20世纪英国戏剧均阐释了人类伦理选择的纠葛，后半叶的戏剧更多聚焦伦理选择同科学选择的互动关联，而戏剧无疑最能弘扬聂珍钊教授所强调的文学的道德关怀：为人类提供从伦理角度认识社会和生活的道德范例，为人类的物质生活和精神生活提供道德指引，为人类的自我完善提供道德经验。<sup>2</sup>从英国19-20世纪之交的“新戏运动”、20-30年代的“工人戏剧运动”、50-70年代的当代英国戏剧“黄金时代”，到世纪末的新生代戏剧革新潮流，现代社会的伦理指向与道德律的嬗变始终贯穿其间，戏剧舞台上男男女女无一不因复杂的伦理身份而身陷伦理困境，面临艰难的伦理选择，观众被多姿多彩的戏剧话语引领穿梭在伦理环境或伦理语境当中，从而在文学、现实与自我之间建构复杂且高效的沟通。本书在应用文学伦理学批评实践方面驾轻就熟，屡屡一语中的：比如指出1960年代“有关婚姻、性、爱情及自由等方面的伦理观念创造了导致剧中人物婚姻出轨、追求享乐的原始欲望产生的伦理环境”（159）；认为当代剧作家丘吉尔的代表作《优秀女子》（*Top Girls*, 1979）成功揭示了彼时的“英国伦理环境”以及主人公“在不同的伦理环境之下做出不同伦理选择的结果”（257）；而世纪末克隆主题的戏剧更是呼应了文学伦理学的下述核心论断——“克隆人最后是否能够成长为真正意义上的‘人’，是需要通过伦理教诲，做出伦理选择，获得伦理意识才能够得以实现”（269）。正是在这个意义上，刘红卫教授指出，中国学者在英国20世纪戏剧批评领域取得了长足的进步，“极大丰富和拓宽了对英国现当代戏剧的相关研究”（15）。

这部英国20世纪戏剧研究论著的第二个鲜明特色在于将马克思主义的辩证唯物主义与历史唯物主义分析同当代文化研究进行有机的结合，在某种程度上亦实践了陈寅恪先生“文史互证”的史学方法。辩证唯物主义强调考察“事物内部各种力量的作用以及它和其它事物的相互联系”（艾思奇 67）。在对

1 本文有关《英国20世纪戏剧研究》的引文均出自刘红卫、李晶：《英国20世纪戏剧研究》（武汉：武汉大学出版社，2022年）。下文只标注页码，不再一一说明。

2 参见Nie Zhenzhao, “Ethical Literary Criticism: A Basic Theory,” *Forum for World Literature Studies* 2 (2021): 189-207; Nie Zhenzhao, “Ethical Literary Criticism: Sphinx Factor and Ethical Selection,” *Forum for World Literature Studies* 3 (2021): 383-398.

戏剧大家萧伯纳的论述中，作者一方面肯定了国内外学界关于萧氏属于现实主义作家的论断，充分讨论了萧伯纳对当时西方资本主义内部矛盾的深刻认识，但同时辩证地提出“萧氏观念喜剧”这一概念，指出“绝非仅仅是‘观念剧’加上‘喜剧’并烙上‘萧氏’特色的印记”，而是其“艺术风格和戏剧创作特征的有机归纳”（38），具体包含了“萧氏幽默”“英国喜剧的特色”“思想家的艺术”（39-40）等主要规律。对50年代“愤怒的青年”作家群体的分析精彩地展现了辩证性原则：一方面这一群体填补了英国文坛在现代派退潮之后留下来的空白，令文学生态焕然一新；另一方面，本书作者直言不讳地指出这一流派的局限性：“对于社会的看法和观点缺乏深度和广度。尽管他们向社会喊出了心中的不满和愤怒，但究竟对什么不满，他们在作品中并没有进行深层的揭示，而且对于如何改善他们自身的地位，他们自己也没有清晰的概念”（103）。

“不同历史时期的文学有其固定的属于特定历史的伦理环境和伦理语境”（聂珍钊，《文学伦理学批评导论》265）。基于经济基础与上层建筑的辩证关系，本书着力探讨了英国政府的经济政策对戏剧盛衰的重要影响，尤其分析认为90年代世纪末英国经济的衰退导致普通大众的文化消费能力的衰减，结果“戏剧对于地方社会的价值——特别是作为民主因素的价值——已经被个性化消费行为所带来的暧昧的享乐取代了”（277-278），但正是在这样的时代语境下，诸如“交际文化”戏剧、“直面戏剧”等反过来又促进了“治愈文化”的兴起以及人们对手机、互联网等经济全球化的新物质形态加以反思。这一辩证分析可谓切中肯綮、绵密又均衡。与此同时，本书讨论了30年代之后英国戏剧面临电影和广播的强有力挑战，在研究艾略特（T. S. Eliot）的诗剧时分析了现代“空心人”的现实表征，指出二战后左翼戏剧作品的文学性和戏剧性的此长彼消的辩证关系，探析了当代女性剧作家的崛起同六七十年代女权主义运动和西方女性主义文化理论的兴起密不可分。书中多次论及戏剧对历史现实的形塑意义，比如高尔斯华绥（John Galsworthy）的剧作《正义》（*Justice*, 1910）影响到邱吉尔（Winston Churchill）政府对监狱改革方案的推进，以及邦德的《被拯救》（*Saved*, 1965）促成了1968年戏剧审查制度的废止，这些都典型地体现出作者对文化研究方法的熟稔及精准运用。本书尤其辟出专章评述二三十年代的英国“工人戏剧运动”，可以说成功呼应了伊格尔顿（Terry Eagleton）关于“工人阶级创作运动”的论断：“工人作家的运动几乎是不为学术界所知的，而且也从未真正受到过国家文化机构的鼓励；但它却标志着与占统治地位的文学生产关系的一种重要决裂”（218）。

再次，本书创新发展了英国戏剧研究的生态系统，全面融入国际学术界最新研究成果和动态。这部百年英国戏剧史的考察以作家为经，以剧院和剧场为纬，以时代的历史社会维度分析为语境，难能可贵地将戏剧研究提升到一个综合的生态系统层面——历史语境+作家研究+剧作文本+剧场演绎+

科学评价。所聚焦的内部因素“既包含文本研读，也深入分析剧作的剧场演绎，注重剧团、剧场、导演、演员、观众等的异同性”（1-2），外部因素则包括“历史语境、文化传统、政治环境、伦理环境、意识形态、经济政策、市场需求”（1），因此在本书作者看来，“戏剧研究只有将这些‘戏里戏外’的各种因素结合起来，方能将其无穷的艺术魅力释放出来”（1）。比如对50-70年代英国当代戏剧“黄金时代”的研究不仅有细致的文本分析，更是探究了皇家宫廷剧院对一大批本土剧作家的扶持、《愤怒的回顾》（*Look Back in Anger*, 1956）的革命性意义、邦德的戏剧同审查制度的关系、“左翼”戏剧的“反文化”倾向等外部关联；这些分析深刻揭示了英国戏剧如何同20世纪后期的伦理环境、政治经济状况彼此之间互为形塑——资本主义社会经济急速发展的同时，功利主义泛滥，“为社会创造财富的同时，也带来了过于强调个人利益而走向极端利己的倾向”（聂珍钊，《英国文学的伦理学批评》504）。尤其让人耳目一新的是，对《愤怒的回顾》首演之后两极化剧评现象的梳理迅速将“戏里戏外”的诸般因素勾连在一起，还原了当时的历史情境，从而突显出该剧作为“革命”先锋的艰难处境。同理，对品特的研究首先强调其演员经历对戏剧创作的重要意义，继而指出贝克特（Samuel Beckett）的影响，最后详述何为“品特式”戏剧的内核——以爱恨纠葛和家庭伦理为基础的“现代社会的伦理指向和道德嬗变”（134）。遍观20世纪英国戏剧史百年浮沉，不难发现，伟大的剧作家同他们笔下的剧中人物别无二致，亦是在其身处的伦理环境中恰好做出了最具适应性、进化性的伦理选择，因而能够立于历史和文学史的潮头，甚至得到永久的演绎和传唱。正是在这个意义上，本书并未过度强调文学和戏剧流派的更替，而是以作家剧作为中心，将历史关怀同文本细读、戏内戏外紧密结合，实践了拉图尔（Bruno Latour）意义上的戏剧共同体和网络及其自身的运作机制：英国20世纪的百年戏剧史稳定的内核似乎亦在暗示“我们从未现代过”（89），历史或许只是“无穷无尽而又变动不已的关系网络，没有高潮，没有巨大的断裂，没有突变”（89），因为剧作家、剧评家与观众都只属于罗蒂（Richard Rorty）所论的两类思想者——一类试图“去理解现实以保护自己”（103）（以及批判现实），而另一类则是“在浪漫的空想中构建出一个更美好的未来”（103）。

在此基础上，本书始终将每个论题的国内外最新研究成果和前沿动态放到中心位置。首先，在难以尽数的剧作家名单上，本书作者做出了艰难而勇敢的选择，坚持重点作家的经典性、进化性、伦理性原则，以专章的形式重点讨论和细读了萧伯纳、品特、斯托帕德、丘吉尔和凯恩（三位男性和两位女性，且经典性和当代性兼具）。对萧伯纳的论述涵括了国内学者关于“讨论”艺术的研究思路；对品特的论述充分融入了文学伦理学批评的前沿解读；对斯托帕德的研究聚焦了学界最新关于“文人剧”的界定和分析；对丘吉尔的讨论则特别关注英美学者新世纪以来对其作为戏剧革新典范的论述；对凯

恩的探讨既将不同译本背后的知识图谱纳入考察，更是用较长的篇幅细致探究了剧场里极端暴力的呈现同宗教仪式、文化无意识的内在沟通。此外，戏剧与经济的共生关系，“毛姆问题”（the Maugham question），纠正 50 年代“戏剧的荒原”定位，邦德与布莱希特（Bertolt Brecht）的比较，“左翼”戏剧的边缘地位，拒绝给斯托帕德贴上“荒诞派”标签，当下国际女性学者努力构建英国女性戏剧系谱，沃腾贝克身份的杂糅性，丘吉尔的跨界创作，西方女性主义理论的发展，等等——本书对所有这些最新的研究领域与相关动态均进行了探究。

最后但也是颇为重要的亮点所在：全书凸显问题意识，聚焦前沿问题，敢于直接同国际戏剧学术界对话并提出身为中国学者的新见解，可谓新见迭出。两位作者依次就“萧氏观念喜剧”、艾略特的“诗”“剧”之间的关系、斯托帕德的“后现代文人剧”、被忽略的英国当代女性剧作家群体、八九十年代英国的伦理环境、20 世纪后期英国戏剧的文学伦理学阐释路径等论题提出了自己的独特理解。比如，将斯托帕德的创作风格定位为“后现代文人剧”，并借助伊格尔顿的作为“一种基本的政治实践”（190）的概念来定义“后现代”，从而彰显出剧作家对西方资本主义知识体系合法性的质疑。又如，在别具心裁地专论英国当代女性剧作家的同时，重点爬梳了六七十年代女权运动、女性主义理论及女性戏剧团体的历史状况。而在全书末尾评论凯恩的暴力书写时，作者给出了掷地有声的论断：“凯恩试图用暴力谴责暴力，用残酷对抗残酷，用分裂缓和分裂，用混乱超越混乱”（342）。可见本书作者尤擅在论述过程中将史料、史论、史识融于一炉。

综上所述，在文学伦理学批评方法指导下，《英国 20 世纪戏剧研究》内容丰富，资料扎实，论证严谨，思想深厚，体例设计新颖，可谓“创新英剧研究范式，书写百年剧场华章”。作为一部英国 20 世纪戏剧研究的宏论，全书亦语言表达精湛，时有赏心悦目又发人深思的哲理性论断，如“英国各地的剧院成为[“一战”之后的英国年轻一代]逃避现实的理想场所”（74）；“《阿卡狄亚》是一部关于寻求的戏剧，最突出的主题就是人类对知识文明的不懈追求”（203）；“‘爱’被过度消费之后，每个人都是牺牲者”（242）。纵观全书，受到专著篇幅的客观限制，未来修订版可以考虑动态调整各章节内容，融入以下戏剧新元素：一则，补充少数族裔尤其非裔、亚裔剧作家、剧团的介绍；但随之而来的有趣的问题便是，汉译萧伯纳戏剧、1934 年 11 月在伦敦小剧场成功公演英语话剧《玉宝川》（*Lady Precious Stream*）、被称为“中国莎士比亚”的熊式一（已成为近年来研究热点）能否进入英国剧场史和翻译戏剧史。二则，虽然书中强调的凯恩自杀于 1999 年 2 月 20 日这一事件的确象征着英国 20 世纪戏剧史告一段落，但“后凯恩”及至新世纪已飞逝而去的廿载中所涌现出来的戏剧新趋势值得加以适当简介；加强对跨世纪英国戏剧图景的介绍将有助于从 20 世纪出发贯穿并洞察新世纪英国戏剧发展新态势

(例如剧场技术维度的嬗变进程), 尤其需要回应近期英国学者所提出的“当代剧场规避剧作家”(Lane 2)的新动向。三则可以适当增加某些流派和重点作家之间的比较研究。另外, 与“二战”相比较而言, “一战”这个20世纪初期重大历史事件在戏剧史的后景之中似乎过度“隐身”。此外, 20世纪戏剧中“英国性”的嬗变值得稍作探讨; 而附录一个英国20世纪戏剧史的年谱或大事记或许能给青年戏剧研究者提供极大的便利。末了, 掩卷长思, 当我们跟随这部跌宕起伏的百年英国戏剧专论, 徜徉于戏里戏外的曲水流觞和声电光影之间, 或许更能感悟到戏剧乃是文学中同日常生活互动最为密切的门类, 因此让我们牢记歌德(Johann Wolfgang von Goethe)的格言——“别忘记生活”(Gedenke zu leben)(阿多3)。

### Works Cited

- 艾思奇编: 《辩证唯物主义 历史唯物主义》。北京: 人民出版社, 1978年。
- [Ai Siqi, ed. *Dialectical Materialism, Historical Materialism*. Beijing: People's Press, 1978.]
- 特雷·伊格尔顿: 《20世纪西方文学理论》, 伍晓明译。北京: 北京大学出版社, 2007年。
- [Eagleton, Terry. *Literary Theory: An Introduction*, translated by Wu Xiaoming. Beijing: Peking UP, 2007.]
- 皮埃尔·阿多: 《别忘记生活: 歌德与精神修炼的传统》, 孙圣英译。上海: 华东师范大学出版社, 2015年。
- [Hadot, Pierre. *N'oubliez pas de vivre: Goethe et la tradition des exercices spirituels*, translated by Sun Shengying. Shanghai: East China Normal UP, 2015.]
- Lane, David. *Contemporary British Drama*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2010.
- 刘红卫、李晶: 《英国20世纪戏剧研究》。武汉: 武汉大学出版社, 2022年。
- [Liu Hongwei and Li Jing. *British Drama of the Twentieth Century*. Wuhan: Wuhan UP, 2022.]
- 聂珍钊: 《英国文学的伦理学批评》。武汉: 华中师范大学出版社, 2007年。
- [Nie Zhenzhao. *An Ethical Criticism of British Literature*. Wuhan: Central China Normal UP, 2007.]
- 。 “Ethical Literary Criticism: A Basic Theory.” *Forum for World Literature Studies* 2 (2021): 189-207.
- 。 “Ethical Literary Criticism: Sphinx Factor and Ethical Selection.” *Forum for World Literature Studies* 3 (2021): 383-398.
- 。 《文学伦理学批评导论》。北京: 北京大学出版社, 2014年。
- [——. *Introduction to Ethical Literary Criticism*. Beijing: Peking UP, 2014.]
- 理查德·罗蒂: 《筑就我们的国家: 20世纪美国左派思想》, 黄宗英译。北京: 生活·读书·新知三联书店, 2006年。
- [Rorty, Richard. *Achieving Our Country: Leftist Thought in Twentieth-Century America*, translated by Huang Zongying. Beijing: SDX Joint Publishing Company, 2006.]
- 杨绛: 《杂忆与杂写: 一九三三——一九九一》。北京: 生活·读书·新知三联书店, 2015年。
- [Yang Jiang. *Memories and Essays 1933-1991*. Beijing: SDX Joint Publishing Company, 2015.]



Published by  
Knowledge Hub Publishing Company Limited  
Hong Kong

ISSN 2520-4920



9 772520 49 2245 04